

Action Item: Improving the Development and Transmission of Minority Reports by D. Kubly

*Background*

A recent TWG minority report on the draft GCDAMP Monitoring and Research Plan ([http://www.usbr.gov/uc/rm/amp/amwg/mtgs/06dec05/Attach\\_07e.pdf](http://www.usbr.gov/uc/rm/amp/amwg/mtgs/06dec05/Attach_07e.pdf)) was delivered at the AMWG meeting and placed in front of AMWG members in violation of the standard operating procedures of the AMWG to deliver materials in advance of the meeting. The authors of the minority report are not identified and it is not clear from the report whether or not all six minority report group members were involved in development of the document. In response to the minority report, the AMWG passed the following motion:

AMWG approves the Monitoring and Research Plan (MRP) as a working document to help guide preparation of the FY08-09 workplan and budget; and recommends to the Secretary of the Interior the GCMRC be charged with (1) addressing the concerns listed in the TWG Minority report in a final FY07-11 document, and (2) bringing that document to the AMWG for further consideration in summer 2007.

GCMRC responded to the AMWG motion by consulting independently with three TWG members they believed had been responsible for developing the minority report. No other dissenting TWG members were consulted, and issues raised by those members were not addressed.

This is a failure of the intended protocols for development and transmission of minority reports.

*Proposal*

To improve the development and transmission of minority reports, the TWG should consider clarifying and modifying its operating procedures. Several changes should be considered:

- (1) All dissenting members to a vote of the TWG that passes by a required majority should be offered the opportunity to be included in the development of a minority report
- (2) The minority report group should elect a chair who will be responsible for communication with other minority group members and with the TWG Chair
- (3) Minority group members who participate in the development of the minority report and who agree with its provisions should be clearly identified in the report
- (4) The minority report should be transmitted to the AMWG through the TWG Chair or Co-Chair in the timeframe and manner identified in AMWG operating procedures
- (5) When action is required of GCMRC or any other GCDAMP group to satisfy the provisions of a minority report included in a motion by AMWG, that group should ensure that it communicates with the minority group as a whole and not individually
- (6) Majority group members should be given an equal opportunity to draft a report and submit it through the TWG Chair to identify what they consider to be the strengths of the proposal sanctioned by the majority