



Place, Time and Consciousness in the Glen Canyon Dam Adaptive Management Program

Session Summary

By

Kurt Dongoske

Pueblo of Zuni



Place, Time and Consciousness in GCDAMP

- ▶ Place – more than geographical location. Relationship with the Earth as a long-term relationship with a living soul. Embodies sense of stewardship to the land and all living things = ensoulment.
- ▶ Time – human construct employed to understand linear succession and duration of past, present and future events. Many indigenous people understand time as an organic circular or cyclical dimension.
- ▶ Consciousness – sentience or awareness of internal or external existence broadly defined. Consciousness afforded plants, animals, rivers and mountains. All entities of nature have conscious ways of interacting with one another = “Spiritual Ecology.”



Place, Time and Consciousness in GCDAMP

- GCDAMP – federal sponsored and managed institution
- Places authority and validity in GCMRC and information produced by scientists
- GCMRC defines the Colorado River “ecosystem” based on a constructed “reality”
- GCMRC is not objective and unbiased; Western science is, in part, a cultural, legal and political construct
- Scientists and land managers decide what does and does not constitute life; which life forms can exist and which are undesirable

What does science do?

A disparate dance of states of affairs and cartographic events

Dr. Giorgio Hadi Curti

- Adjunct Professor and Lecturer, San Diego State University
Departments of Geography and American Indian Studies
- Project Director, Senior Ethnographer, and Socio-cultural Geographer and co-owner of Cultural Geographics Consulting (CGC)

- Science is considered the best way of knowing, understanding, communicating, and living the world.
- All scientific practice is socially, culturally, politically, and metaphysically imbued.
- Many specters of scientific racism that feed through the rules and logic of Enlightenment “rationality” remain with us today.
- Scientists role in the long-term perpetuation of the absenting of Native people from Indigenous lands through reliance on the latent event of Enlightenment thinking that underpins and guides scientific rules of logic and method.
- Need to excavate, confront, and reconcile the cartographic phantasmagorias and assumptions of the Enlightenment with honesty and integrity to develop an accountable science.



**Reform Parks – Earth Matters,
Indigenous Lives Matter**

Edward
Wemytewa

Tobacco clan and
child of Crow clan.

Storyteller, artist,
activist and former
tribal councilman

- Zuni River, Zuni Heaven, Little Colorado River and a spring have been adversely impacted.
- These indelibly connect to Glen/Grand Canyons. They deserve life and the capacity to live.
- Plants and animals are also social/familial parts of a Zuni way of life.
- There is ongoing environmental racism born from Western Christian values and practices that continue to negatively impact Zuni.
- Result is continuing inter-generational post traumatic stress disorder



Place, time, and consciousness in the implementation of science and adaptive management

Lucas Bair

Emily Palmquist

Charles Yackulic

Grand Canyon
Monitoring and
Research Center

- ▶ People experience ecosystems in different ways, including scientists with different backgrounds, interests, and personalities.
- ▶ Their roles as scientists doesn't preclude them from imagining and acknowledging that reality is a much richer truth in which place, time and consciousness are woven together more thoroughly.
- ▶ While inextricably linked, it is useful in science to simplify linkages among place, time, and consciousness, in order to understand and communicate observations.
- ▶ To better integrate stakeholder perspectives into adaptive management they recommended an awareness of assumptions in scientific monitoring and research concerning time, place and consciousness.
- ▶ They also recommended the efficient implementation of adaptive management to increase the opportunities to align actions with stakeholder values.



Territory, Values, and Justice: Displacing Indigenous Peoples and Local Communities by Hydropower Development in the Amazon

Dr. Simone Athayde, Associate Professor with a joint appointment in the Department of Global and Sociocultural Studies and the Kimberly Green Latin American and Caribbean Center at Florida International University. Amazon Dams Network.

- Environmental Anthropologist and Interdisciplinary Ecologist
- 20 years of work in Amazon supporting indigenous peoples and local communities' self-determination and sustainable livelihoods, as well as biocultural and territorial rights.

- Damming the Amazon and displacing indigenous peoples.
 - 30% of indigenous lands affected
 - Threatens unique socio, cultural and biological diversity
- Indigenous peoples, dams and socio-environmental justice
 - Unfair compensation; sacred sites and values cannot be compensated
- Lessons Learned



Indigenous Australian Notions of Place, Time and Consciousness

Dr. Claire Smith, College of Humanities, Arts and Social Sciences, Flinders University, South Australia.

- Archaeologist specializing in decoding patterns in human behaviors to interpret the past, understand the present and envisage the future.
- Dr. Smith has worked with the Aboriginal community of Barunga, Northern Territory, since 1990 and with Ngadjuri people in South Australia since 1998.

- Western notion of linear time versus Indigenous notion of circular/spiral time
- Indigenous notion that the past is never past
- Western notion of 'sites' to be managed versus Indigenous notion on inter-connected cultural landscape
- The idea of a living landscape, redolent with power and dangerous to traverse without the proper protocols
- Implications for cultural heritage management practices and long-term sustainability of the land



Discussant

Dr. Rebecca Tsosie, Regents Professor at the James E. Rogers College of Law at the University of Arizona.

- Yaqui Descent
- Faculty member for the Indigenous Peoples' Law and Policy Program at the University of Arizona
- Published widely on sovereignty, self-determination, cultural pluralism, environmental law and cultural rights.
- Member of Arizona Bar Association and the California Bar Association
- Supreme Court Justice for Ft. McDowell Yavapai Nation

- ▶ Next era of "public" lands/water resources management should involve the collaborative management of tribal Nations, as the longstanding and original Nations associated with these lands.
- ▶ The United Nations' Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples highlights the continuing presence of Indigenous peoples on their territories and calls for Nation-states to engage in consultation (in some cases, requiring their "free, prior and informed consent") prior to taking action.
- ▶ The UNDRIP also calls for coordination with them in their capacity as "peoples" with a right to self-determination, inclusive of the right to "cultural integrity."
- ▶ Cultural sovereignty and political sovereignty, are important to understanding the longstanding connections of Indigenous peoples to their lands.
- ▶ The political sovereignty of federally-recognized Indian tribes offers a more robust platform for collaborative management of lands/waters and this should be operationalized throughout the federal agencies charged with this responsibility.

Future Directions

- Continue to consider and explore humanist sentiments associated with the Grand Canyon and Colorado River in annual reporting meetings
- Look to GCMRC to provide the leadership and direction in this effort
- Necessary for scientists and land managers to unpack and confront the implications and explication of their own worldviews and what they bring to the program; do not place that burden solely on the Tribes
- Inform the development of the cultural sensitivity training stipulated in the 2017 LTEMP programmatic agreement
- Clarification of the Secretary of the Interior's trust responsibility to the five tribes with respect to the GCDAMP
- Strive to adopt and realize Articles of the UNDRIP
- Build in related measures of review and accountability

Place, Time and Consciousness in the Glen Canyon Dam Adaptive Management Program
Adaptive Management Work Group Meeting Presentation
Power point Notes

Slide 1

- Read Title of presentation
- Annual reporting meetings present results of scientific monitoring and research in quantitative and detached terms. Disparately small amount of reporting that presents monitoring and or research in terms of humanist sentiments or values associated with natural resources, broader Colorado river ecosystem and the Grand Canyon.
- Five Tribes have an association of living with and in, knowing and living the Grand Canyon as part of their cultural landscapes since time immemorial prior to the arrival of the U.S. government in the mid nineteenth century.
- Serious consideration of these five distinctly unique ontologies, their respective knowledge of the Colorado River ecosystem and how this program can benefit from this traditional knowledge is rarely acknowledged, let alone meaningfully included.
- The GCDAMP's insular adherence to Western science unintentionally disenfranchises the five tribes by diminishing the effectiveness of tribal voices and by devaluing non-Western perspectives and indelibly connected values commensurate levels of validity or consideration.
- What are the moral and ethical responsibilities of scientists and land managers to Native American communities in the management of an environment that is significant, equally sacred, and fundamental to a traditional community's collective identity and material capacities to persevere, as a people?
- The session designed to attempt to address this question by initiating a conversation by examining three metaphysical concepts (place, time and consciousness) that are seldom considered or critically examined within this program and are too often taken for granted by members of Western societies that employ the scientific method as a common form of knowledge production.
- The invited speakers were provided the session abstract and asked to contribute through whatever unique, critical, productive and illuminative insights they may offer.

Slide 2

- Place – is much more than a geographical location or the physical and biological features that distinguish it, this is especially true when it is indelibly tied to human attachments and practices of identity, purpose, connection and grounding.
- Time – is a human construct that is employed, through various means of measurement, to understand linear succession and duration of past, present, and future events in material reality or in the conscious experience. For many indigenous people, time is understood and experienced as an organic circular or cyclical dimension rather than a linear measure; it is characterized by repetition and alternation, and past, present, and future may enfold and be co-existent in the ever-present. Connecting back to their on-going relationships to place as both a coordinate location and sense of enduring cultural identity.
- Consciousness – the concept of consciousness, sentience or awareness of internal or external existence, is intended to be broadly explained. It is often presumed to include some kind of experience, cognition, feeling or perception. For many Native Americans, consciousness is afforded plants, animals, rivers, mountains with a sentient essence, including realization of when they are being treated well or poorly. This form of consciousness is not equivalent to the consciousness that humans experience.

Slide 3

- GCDAMP's insular adherence to Western science unintentionally disenfranchises the five participating tribes by diminishing the effectiveness of tribal voices and contributions by not affording non-Western perspectives and connected values commensurate levels of validity or consideration.
- Program places authority and validity in GCMRC and the information produced by GCMRC scientists. GCMRC defines the Colorado River ecosystem "reality" to which this program responds, often by designing management actions based on this constructed reality, rendering the Colorado River ecosystem a pseudo and artificially bounded laboratory of reductive scientific realism.
- The reality defined by GCMRC is not objective and not unbiased; the reality that Western science typically studies is in fact a cultural, legal and political construct. These cultural, legal and political constructs shape and direct scientists and land managers to decide not only what does or does not count as life, but which life forms are permitted to exist and which life forms are undesirable.

Slide 4 -Dr. Giorgio Hadi Curti

- In this program (and throughout Western society) science is considered the best way of knowing, understanding, communicating, and living the world.
- Dr. Curti reminds us that all scientific practice is socially, culturally, politically, and metaphysically imbued, and all policy that seeks to usurp the role of Native philosophy and science by privileging Royal scientific functions and propositions to cartographically map any given event of place is an exercise in ultracrepidarianism (the habit or act of giving opinions on matters outside the scope of one's knowledge) and many specters of scientific racism that feed through the rules and logic of Enlightenment "rationality" remain with us today.
- Dr. Curti draws our attention to the role that scientists play in the long-term perpetuation of the absenting of Native people from Indigenous lands through reliance on the latent event of Enlightenment thinking that underpins and guides scientific rules of logic and method and the perpetuation of this through little more than opinions reproducing "epistemological errors" embedded in artificial dichotomies of humans distinct from nature and ecosystems.
- Dr. Curti cautioned us that the uncritical acceptance of these Enlightenment foundations, and the latent permissions of their operationalizations identifies the very same privileges of Whiteness guaranteed by the State that allowed the events of January 6th to develop and unfold. Racialized Enlightenment logics and grand narratives are granted privilege and allowed to wholly violate rules to which Other (Native/Indigenous) ontological and epistemological systems are forced to adhere for any semblance of consideration or inclusion by the State.
- Without first excavating, confronting, and reconciling the cartographic phantasmagorias and assumptions of the Enlightenment with honesty and integrity, accountable science—and scientists who practice science as a vocation with integrity; that is, scientists who hold themselves accountable for what they *do and can do*—must be readily aware of and attentive to the ongoing violence of ultracrepidarianism in the treatment and management of places of traditional religious and cultural importance to Native peoples as part of any productive adaptive management policy.

Slide 5 – Edward Wemytewa

- Zuni River, Zuni Heaven, Little Colorado River and a spring have been adversely impacted.

- These indelibly connect to Glen/Grand Canyons. Grand Canyon is homeland for the Zuni and through time the religious pilgrimage trails have eroded, leaving a vague notion of it in the minds of Zuni. They deserve life and the capacity to live. Yet, the Canyons have been commodified and managed under an aspect of scientific scrutiny.
- Plants and animals are also social/familial parts of a Zuni way of life.
- Who benefits from the science? It hasn't been about preserving undisturbed land but cultivating it to bring mega-economic value by way of a dam.
- What rights do the Colorado river and Little Colorado River have to the water? These sacred wetlands—blood veins of Mother Earth-- is secondary, even tertiary to receiving water. Indigenous Peoples' worldviews and survival has been brought to an endangered level where there isn't any sovereignty.
- There is ongoing environmental racism born from Western Christian values and practices that continue to negatively impact Zuni.
- Result is continuing inter-generational post-traumatic stress disorder. How do we create a discourse beyond nation/state policies that governs the Glen and Grand Canyons? The National Park Service interprets the landscape but the narrative is still under the purview of the government. So, who owns this narrative?
- Indigenous Peoples have been reticent, mainly because the laws/courts have never been "Indian Friendly".

Slide 6 – Lucas Bair, Emily Palmquist and Charles Yackulic

- People experience ecosystems in different ways, including scientists with different backgrounds, interests, and personalities. They illustrated how scientists interact with a place on a personal level, described how scientists interact with the ecosystem in their professional roles, and discussed how well-implemented adaptive management can be a framework to integrate multiple ways of knowing and existing within an ecosystem.
- The emphasized their roles as scientists doesn't preclude them from imagining and acknowledging that reality is a much richer truth in which place, time and consciousness are woven together more thoroughly.
- While inextricably linked, it is useful in science to simplify linkages among place, time, and consciousness, in order to understand and communicate observations. In scientist roles in adaptive management, it is important to identify how scientific simplifications can determine and constrain concepts of place, time, and consciousness.
- To better integrate stakeholder perspectives into adaptive management they recommended an awareness of assumptions in scientific monitoring and research concerning time, place and consciousness. Accomplished through a two-step process. First is transparency and/or explicit identification of assumptions in the design and implementation of scientific monitoring and research. Second is improved engagement with tribal stakeholders to better understand the full set of possible assumptions that may guide scientific monitoring and research.
- They also recommended the efficient implementation of adaptive management, evaluating the full set of alternative management actions to achieve a shared environmental management goal. Considering a full set of management actions increases the opportunity to align actions with stakeholder values. However, in a program with budget constraints, it is necessary to deprioritize monitoring and research with little to no value in informing management in order to evaluate a broader set of management alternatives.

Slide 7 – Simone Athayde, Amazon Dam Network

- Damming the Amazon and displacing indigenous peoples.
- 30% of indigenous lands affected.
- Threatens unique socio, cultural and biological diversity
- Indigenous people, dams and socio-environmental justice; unfair compensation; sacred sites and values cannot be compensated
- Lessons learned

Slide 8 – Claire Smith, Flinders University, Australia

- Western notions of linear time versus indigenous notion of circular/spiral time.
- Indigenous notions that the past is never past.
- Western notion of “sites” to be managed versus indigenous notion of inter-connected cultural landscapes.
- The idea of a living landscape, redolent with power and dangerous to traverse without the proper protocols.
- Implications for cultural heritage management practices and long-term sustainability of the land.

Slide 9 -Rebecca Tsosie

- Next era of "public" lands/water resources management should involve the collaborative management of tribal Nations, not merely as stakeholders, but as the longstanding and original Nations associated with these lands.
- The United Nations’ Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples highlights the continuing presence of Indigenous peoples on their territories and calls for Nation-states to engage in consultation (in some cases, requiring their "free, prior and informed consent" prior to taking action).
- The UNDRIP also calls for coordination with them in their capacity as "peoples" with a right to self-determination, inclusive of the right to "cultural integrity." Tacitly, the UNDRIP recognizes indigenous peoples as humans; a recognition that they have not been afforded for 500 years. Consultation is not merely "procedural," but is a substantive exercise that validates Indigenous knowledge, along with western "scientific" models of management. Indigenous knowledge has its own "science" and also has an ethical dimension that is missing from Western policy.
- Cultural sovereignty and political sovereignty are important to understanding the longstanding connections of Indigenous peoples to their lands. Bio-cultural diversity is also recognized in the Convention on Biological Diversity (8j), which also calls for respectful partnerships with Indigenous peoples.
- The political sovereignty of federally-recognized Indian tribes in the US offers a more robust platform for collaborative management of lands/waters and this should be operationalized throughout the federal agencies charged with this responsibility.

Slide 10 –

- Continue to consider and explore humanist sentiments associated with the Grand Canyon and Colorado River in future Annual Reporting meetings.
- Look to GCMRC to provide the leadership and direction in this effort.

- Necessary for scientists and land managers to unpack and confront the implications and explications of their own worldviews and how that influences what they bring to the program; do not place that burden solely on the Tribes.
- Inform the development of the cultural sensitivity training stipulated in the 2017 LTEMP programmatic agreement.
- Clarification of the Secretary of the Interior's trust responsibility to the five tribes with respect to the GCDAMP.
- Strive to adopt and realize articles of the UNDRIP.
- Build in related measures of review and accountability.