PUBLIC LISTENING SESSION ON THE FUTURE OF THE
NAVAJO GENERATING STATION (NGS)

Phoenix, Arizona
May 15, 2017
1:00 p.m.

REPORTED BY:
Janice Gonzales, RPR, CRR
AZ Certified Court
Reporter No. 50844
PUBLIC LISTENING SESSION

commenced at 1:00 p.m. on May 15, 2017, at the Heard Museum, 2301 North Central Avenue, Monte Vista Room, Phoenix, Arizona 85004, before Janice Gonzales, RPR, CRR, Arizona Certified Court Reporter No. 50844.

* * *

APPEARANCES:

Scott Cameron, U.S. Department of the Interior
David Palumbo, Bureau of Reclamation
Kristin Darr, Moderator
MS. DARR: All right, folks, good afternoon. There are still a couple of empty chairs in case you want to find them. Do you have an empty chair next to you anybody? Anybody want to sit down? Okay. It is 1 o'clock and we are going to get started. All right. Everybody ready?

Welcome. My name is Kristin Darr and I am your third-party neutral moderator for this session so here's what my job is. The Department of Interior is here to listen to you. It's my job to make sure that they are able to hear you and that if you want to speak, you are able to be heard. Okay? So that means a couple of things. I have to be really tough and try to keep us to three minutes because we have way more speakers than we can accommodate in three hours. Okay? So if you can even be quicker, you'll be my best friend. All right? My job is to make sure that they hear you. Okay?

So before we start with the listening session, I want to make a couple of introductions. They -- these gentlemen to my left here, Mr. Dave Palumbo -- Dave, could you stand up? He's with the Bureau of Reclamation and he's deputy commissioner
for operations.

MR. PALUMBO: Welcome.

MS. DARR: Thank you. And Scott, would please stand up? Now, Scott Cameron is with the Department of Interior. Scott is the deputy assistant secretary for water and science. He's going to provide you with a short presentation and then turn it back over to me and then we'll start doing our listening session. All right? Scott?

MR. CAMERON: Thank you very much, Kristin, and thank you everybody for coming out today. It's great to see that there's a lot of interest in this topic and some of the issues that are going to be dealt with over the next few weeks, the next few months. So I want to welcome you all and I'm very glad to have you here. This is not the only listening session that we're going to be having in Arizona over the next several days. As you can see, there will be other opportunities around the state. Three other opportunities for people to talk about the Navajo Generating Station and what they think the future will be. So I want to make sure everybody was aware that this is not the only opportunity today.

So the purpose for our listening session
is to provide you folks an opportunity to share your views regarding the future of the Navajo Generating Station with the Department of the Interior officials. David is one of the senior career executives at the Bureau of Reclamation. I'm relatively new. I'm a political appointee in the office of the secretary and we're both very interested in what you all have to say today.

So the process -- hopefully you've already experienced some of this process already. There are speaker cards at the sign-in table when you came in. So if you did want to have an opportunity to actually present, please make sure you filled out one of those speaker cards. As Kristin already mentioned, we've got a lot of people so we're going to have to make sure that we speak three minutes as opposed to five minutes and give as many people as possible an opportunity to talk today.

You can submit written comments, if you'd like. There's a website -- rather a web address that we published up there, an e-mail address. So you should feel free to e-mail us comments either in addition to what you might be saying verbally today, or if you're not speaking today, you can certainly send us an e-mail and tell us what you think. To
give as many people as possible an opportunity to
talk today, David and I are not going to be answering
questions. We're not going to be responding to
comments because that would just chew up the time of
other people who want to have the opportunity to
share their views with us.

Kristin you've already met. And in order
to make sure that we capture what folks are saying
today so we can potentially reflect on later on, we
have a court reporter here. So if for some reason we
can't hear clearly what you're saying, the microphone
is right there, Kristin is going to say, "Speak
louder" or "Get closer to the mic" so the court
reporter can actually capture what you're saying.

Okay. So a little bit more background.
I suspect most, if not everyone, in the room already
know this, but Navajo Generating Station is a rather
large coal-fired power plant. It's located on Navajo
tribal land near Page. There are three separate
generating units and the current lease expires
December 22nd of 2019.

There are some active and I think
potentially very fruitful discussions underway that
will keep generation and coal production going on
through 2019, but we can talk about that at another
time. The coal is provided from the Kayenta Mine which was dedicated solely to the Navajo Generating Station. Peabody Energy operates that mine. There was -- as everything is true of the federal government, you don't do anything without going through the process of impact statements. So over the course of the decades, there have been several series of Kayenta environmental reviews associated with the Navajo Generating Station, and most recently there was activity in 2014 and 2016. Some of that will be affected by what we hope will be some fairly good news over the next several weeks.

So in terms of the owners or participants in the Navajo Generating Station, it's a variety of organizations, as you can see. The Salt River Project and the Bureau of Reclamation approve it, and likewise the United States are involved in all characters of public service and parties that you can see here in the pie chart. Okay. The nonfederal owners, meaning the owners other than the Department of the Interior, Bureau of Reclamation, had indicated that past 2019 they are not interested in continuing to operate the Navajo Generating Station. So it was their decision on their part -- that position on their part that is one of the reasons that we're here
today to try to figure out a path forward for the mine, for Navajo Generating Station, for the Central Arizona Project, for the CAP tribes, and everyone who has a stake in the Navajo Generating Station and the Kayenta coal mine.

So for the last three or four months, it seems to be going through a process of having discussions among the owner, the discussion among other stakeholders about what might the future look like for the Kayenta Mine, for the Navajo Generating Station. The most impressing, most intense, most current discussions are about continuing having a two-year lease extension for the Navajo Generating Station that would allow production to go on through 2019. And I would think in the matter of the next week or two or three it will become clear how those discussions are going to be resolved. Really that involves the Navajo Nation and the Salt River Project negotiating a lease extension.

The Department of Interior has a number of goals here. We want to protect the jobs of the people who work at the Kayenta Mine and who work at the Navajo Generating Station. We'd like to see coal remain a significant part of not just Arizona or the Southwest but of the nation's energy mix. We also
realize that the path forward needs to be economically viable. Any decision that makes -- that is made that involves dollars and cents has to make sense economically. So we are facilitating a process of many stakeholders to address rather large and complex issues around what the future might look like for NGS and the Kayenta Mine. Some of these issues will take six months or a year to resolve, others have a much shorter fuse on them like the two-year extension, for instance.

Okay. That is really the main piece -- the main content I wanted to deliver this afternoon. I'm very pleased to be here representing the Trump administration and we care about this region and the wide variety of interests that people have and really look forward to the opportunity to listen to you all today and hear what you think the future ought to look like so thank you very much. Kristin, I'll pass it back to you.

MS. DARR: All right. Let's do this. Let's turn our cell phones down just so that when people are talking they don't feel interrupted or anything. Okay? So, again, I told you my name's Kristin and my job is to make sure that these folks here are able to hear from all of you in the next
three-hour period. So if you would like to speak, you should have filled out a speaker card and given it to Sandy here to my right. Anybody else want to turn in a speaker card?

And we're going to start with our elected officials and I have several of you that did fill out a card, and if I miss any, just let me know, but we'll start with Congressman Tom O'Halleran. After him will be Representative Mark Finchem, state legislature. Okay. So I'm going to give you kind of the on-deck so that we can be ready and kind of keep moving through, and we're trying for three minutes, right, Congressman? I'm a tough cookie.

MR. O'HALLERAN: You just give me a second and I'll stop talking.

Good afternoon, everybody. I want to thank the Bureau of Reclamation for being here and listening to this issue. The principals involved in the contract resolution hopefully of this issue and everybody that's here today. My district takes in not only the northern area that is a problem as it relates to Hopi and Navajo, but as Governor Lewis knows and others that the southern tribes also are a part of my district and I have very great concerns about each and every one of them and the other people
who live within the area.

My concerns are fairly straightforward. We have to first of all think of families in the communities of which this impact is going to be felt.

It's a quick cycle here. We're going to go from getting notified less than six months ago basically to now and trying to put together what is the economic process of being able to continue economic development in the area, or it's a longer-term process to have an eventual transition, and then we have all the other issues in between.

I know that there's a hope for a process where some people would be employed somewhere else, but that does not deal with the cultural issues. It doesn't address the families that have to move off the reservation where they have lived. It's their historical homeland. And it also does not address the long-term power needs as I've seen to the Southwestern United States and Arizona.

I would caution that if go through this so that you allow the principals to do their job in negotiating in a fair way transparently eventually, we want to make them not have the contractual obligations and also be able to identify the overall needs of all these communities. I don't know -- I
don't think six months is enough time. July 1st is  
not enough time and I would hope that reasonable  
people can come forward and identify the entire  
process not only from where we're at today, but where  
we can be in 10 or 50 years from now. And this short  
cycle is not helping with that -- with our  
longer-term planning that is needed. So with that  
I'll let more people talk and thank you very much.  

MS. DARR: Okay. Representative Finchem  
and then Andy Tobin and then President Begaye.  

MR. FINCHEM: Thank you for the  
opportunity to comment on the future of the Navajo  
Generating Station and we understand the consequences  
that a premature decommissioning of this power  
generating station would draw. I'd like to make four  
points. Public debt and associated promises, state  
power and infrastructure security, survival of the  
Hopi Tribe and many Navajo communities, economic  
impact to the state of Arizona, Coconino County, and  
the City of Page as well as many others.  

Point number one: NGS is not paid for  
yet. Not paid for yet. With over $1.1 billion yet  
to pay off the construction of the power plant, NGS  
promises to be as big a burden on the taxpayers as  
the lender fraud has been because Interior and EPA
has not included all of the cost impacts that both
our power plants and communities serve. Replacing
clean coal with solar only doubles the price of energy.

If you close the coal plants, pay the
miners' benefits who are now employed, you also pay
for the new solar. The TWG Agreement expects the
plant to run until 2030, but NGS owes Interior debt
out to 2044. So the debt service doesn't just go
away even though the plant might. The matter of
seeking power security for both Arizona and the
surrounding states that draw on our baseload, we do
not know when coal power will eventually be
permanently replaced with natural gas, but there are
a few fundamental flaws with the premature retirement
of NGS. If the community is to depend on natural
gas, gas has a role to play, but it's a balancing
resource not a baseload resource. Consider that that
is part of the energy security plan.

Point number three: The Hopi Tribe has
relied on coal production from the Black Mesa deposit
for centuries. There's been no realistic plan put
forward that would replace such a dramatic reduction
in work for this people group. It is no secret in
the energy production community that Chesapeake
Energy gave $22 million to the Sierra Club to act as
their surrogate in the privateers' war on coal. I might add, this resembles a great deal the Carnegie U.S. Steel shell that put the others out of business kind of attitude. The evidence of this attempt is bottlenecking at its worse indeed, herein, as I have some attachments that I'll leave with you.

Ben Bennett, the Navajo Council delegate, is advocating for continued operation of both enterprises. Keep the Navajo people employed, fed, sheltered, and clothed. His remarks are combined herein as Attachment No. 3. State of Arizona, Coconino County, and City of Page, Arizona stand to lose far more than just the transaction privilege tax dollars that are generated by coal sales which amount to approximately $17 million annually than the Navajo Generating Station --

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Three minutes.

MS. DARR: You're at three minutes. You may continue. You are at three minutes.

MR. FINCHEM: I'll just say I have comments that I will leave with you along with proofs from W.P. Carey School of Business. They conducted an economic study of this. Arizona stands to have a multibillion dollar hole in our economy if this plant is shut down. Thank you for the opportunity to
MR. TOBIN: Thank you very much. Unlike my dear friend Congressman O'Halleran, I probably won't be on time, but it's good to see you, Congressman, and I couldn't be in more agreement. The about-face of SRP that began from October when they were telling everybody that this is a long-range plan to maintain the Navajo Generating Station to just a short two months later to say we're closing it isn't -- first off, it doesn't even land in the area of duty of a business, but I know this from an Arizonan and I know this is how you feel that that is not being a good neighbor. That is not being someone who's come out and reached out and talked about how we can make this work together.

I have been to Washington on two separate trips -- two separate visits to sit in meetings to see if we could find ways to make this extension work. We are six weeks away from what SRP considers basically a padlock on Navajo Generating Station. So don't get me wrong. I don't argue that we shouldn't have less expensive, safer, maybe more healthier
climate. This is about, are we doing business right here in Arizona? This is about, should somebody who has no regulation under our authority at the Corporation Commission be able to say that we are closing this plant? This is about some company who after 40 years gets to decide in six months that they're going to change the trajectory of Arizona's energy security.

Just so you're aware, SRP is already in sale for a $100 million facility to burn this new power. Ken Morgan was just in our office last week to spend $375 million more over a five-year period to have gas storage. At some point in time, all those pieces have to be counted into the difference between what coal costs and what natural gas costs. The Navajo have come to the table. The Hopi have come to the table. Folks are trying to make this balance fit. It doesn't fit when you have a gun to your head telling you that you only have six weeks left.

Where's the agreement today? Where's the confusion coming from in this room? I don't see any. You're good and decent Arizonans who just want to work. I think you expect and should get more than six weeks to decide whether you're going to have a job or not.

So I would ask that -- and I think it's
important that we have these when speakers come up --
that you're having to ask -- five years is what I
propose to this commission through the Bureau of
Reclamation. I'm disappointed they voted to close
this facility. So I ask this board to reconsider two
things. Number one, as Congressman O'Halleran said,
we need to go to at least October so we have more
negotiation time, and number two, we should be
considering a five-year phase-down that is more
appropriate than two years when many of you don't
realize in the two-year phase-down, they actually
start closing in October anyway. This gives us more
time to adequately -- not just prepare our workforce,
but to find out is the pricing that's out there -- is
the market pricing going to stay what it is today. I
would argue that the most unstable power source we
have right now is natural gas. Coal is the most
stable. So let's give it some time. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Okay. Next we have President
Begaye from the Navajo Nation followed by Mark Lewis
and Jamescita Peshlakai, state senator.

MR. BEGAYE: All right. We will keep the
coal -- the NGS running till 2029. That is our goal
and that's what will need to happen. We have an
agreement. We will drop legislation on the 18th of
this month -- May 18th, which is Thursday. It will be voted on and we will be ready to go July 1 to extend it through 2019 so we have time to find new owners to find ways to keep the generator running and the mine open and operating. That is our goal and we have even this morning we'll be meeting, tonight, and tomorrow.

We've been going at it 24/7 trying to get things in structure and we do have, I believe, an agreement. All the issues that we've been dealing with has already been resolved. So it's just some minor tweaking. It's now left and so we are confident that on Thursday we'll have all of it together completed and on Friday we will have a vote on it and I will sign it as president of the Navajo Nation so this NGS will continue and the mine will continue operating.

So as it has been said is that we worked hard to overcome clean power plant, which we did, and then we went and we were told Nevada didn't want to sign and we dealt with Nevada. They said they're ready to sign, and then APS tells us they're not going to sign, and so it's been one thing after another. Every challenge that's come before Navajo Nation, we have met those challenges, and today we
continue to meet those challenges and we will keep the mine open. We will keep NGS running. That is our commitment and that's what we plan to do.

And so we're -- like I said, the agreement's done. We're ready to move forward and now we're looking for new owners, new buyers to run it through 2029. That is our goal and that's what we plan to do. So, again, thank you for the opportunity.

MS. DARR: Mark Lewis?

MR. LEWIS: Hi everyone. Thank you for the opportunity for us to speak. For the record, my name is Mark Lewis. I'm the most senior member of the Central Arizona Project Board of Directors and I'm grateful for Interior having this meeting here in my district. I represent the 4 million people of Maricopa County, and every one of those folks here in this county has a beneficial interest in the Navajo Generating Station.

We made an agreement for the Boulder Canyon Project Act with the United States to build Central Arizona Project. It included a $4 billion ditch and a billion dollar power plant, and that was the deal we made with the United States to provide water to Central Arizona and the 5 million people in
the two major cities. We've been paying $50 million a year in payments to the United States to pay that off. We still owe the United States $1.1 billion on the power plant and the canal. Our payments run $50 million a year through 2044, and our challenge today is the Interior's participation as our beneficiary for the operation of the power plant. Our plan is for that to continue to 2044 when the debt expires.

As part of the debt restructuring in our last lawsuit with the United States, we sued each other and we spent millions and millions of dollars and we settled on a debt agreement that left us with 1.1 million in payments. The deal we made with the United States includes that power plant. Of the debt that we owed you, $369 million is attributable to the Navajo Generating Station. There is no reason that we should close a power plant that we still owe the United States $369 million. It's crazy. That power plant is perfectly operational. It's provided 93 percent of the power for 5 million people for the water supplies and 10 tribes -- the 5 million people, the cities, the farms, and the environmental mitigation that we do. That's part of our deal with the United States. And if you're going to get my vote to continue to make those payments, we need to
have an agreement that that asset will continue to be available through the term of our debt, and that's my three minutes of comments. Thank you.

    MS. DARR: Thank you, sir. You are actually 15 seconds ahead of time so thumbs-up.

    All right. Next up we have State Senator Peshlakai followed by Michael Curtis of the Arizona Municipal Power User's Association. Thanks.

    MS. PESHLAKAI: Thank you.

    (Speaking in native tongue.)

    Thank you to the Department of Interior and all of those that are here from CAP, Navajo Generating Station, SRP, and all of the mine workers and employees in the area, and thank you for being here, our tribal leaders, and all who are in this room. My name is Jamecita Peshlakai. I'm the state senator for the area around the Navajo Generating Station and I just wanted to step up here for a moment just to say that my part in this is to listen here at this listening session, and then also to speak to what I know of the area and the history of the Navajo Generating Station. There's so many lives that are dependent upon the future of Navajo Generating Station and our families and generations to come. Also there's some folks here -- having been
born and raised in the area, I know there's a broad
spectrum to those that have lived around the Navajo
Generating Station, and I want the conversation to
remain open and for all of us to be cognizant of the
area -- of the tribal people around the area.

There's people that have had decades to
live and to work and to make a living around the
Navajo Generating Station and Peabody coal mine, but
there's also people that never saw a dime of that.
And the rest of the world has continued on
prospering, evolving, and growing into the century,
but there's some people and some families that remain
in the 1930s, '40s, and '50s. There's people that
live right next to the generating station that don't
have running water or electricity and yet we have --
we have generated and made the Valley here in Phoenix
one of the most prosperous areas on the face of this
earth and we need to remember that somebody
sacrificed something for that. Maybe not the people
that live here in the Valley, but the people that
have become sick, have passed away, have died because
of uranium, cold, the loss of water.

I was raised in the area -- born and
raised so I know exactly what it's like. And I want
everybody to know that as we go forward and plan, we
need to plan responsibly for the equity and social just treatment of every single person not only in the NGS region, Coconino County, Arizona, the Southwest, but for everybody that will continue on. And with that I want to say that let's continue planning for not just 50 years which was -- 50 years ago we knew this day would come. We need to start now. Use this as an opportunity to plan for a great industry for 50 years from now, 100 years from now that all of us will be in the same boat together and not leave other people behind. Thank you.

(Speaking in native tongue.)

Thank you.


MS. CODY: I'd like to say thank you or good afternoon and thank you to all the people who are here, and also I'd like to introduce myself. My name is Myrata Cody and I'm a provider at Kayenta Mine. I've worked in the coal industry for 37 years. I've eventually -- been there when the mine started. Back then there was nothing there. Vegetation was very poor and now you see the big difference. Now we have roads and we have a community there that we use.
And then to make things easier, the mine has helped us and has changed our lives there. So in that way, you know, just working there, providing for my kids, I was able to educate them and further their education. They have bachelor's degrees and they're on their own now and I wish this for the younger kids that are coming in. I want them to have this. The reservation, the economy is very -- it's going to go down if we don't continue with the NGS and the Kayenta Mine.

So I'd like to ask all of you who are listening in to really think about this and try to find a solution to continue this for the younger generation. I truly believe that it can be resolved, and I know we can work together and try to find a way to keep NGS going and Kayenta Mine going. This will be my comment for now. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you. Okay. I need to do my job better. I need to read three names so you know you're on deck. The next name I have is Jessica Keetso followed by Dru Bacon and Robert Burns. Jessica? No Jessica? Dru? Are you Jessica?

MS. KEETSO: I'm Jessica.

You're up.

MS. KEETSO: Jessica Keetso.

(Speaking in native tongue.)

I live near Black Mesa and Kayenta Mine with my family. We're one of the many families who still practice our traditional way of life. We still farm and raise livestock and we don't receive any benefits from the mine. We practice a lot of our traditional -- our traditional life ways, and that way of life is being jeopardized by the mine because they use a lot of our water and nobody ever talks about that aspect. It's always about revenues and about jobs, but without water, none of us would be able to survive.

And I'm asking the Department of Interior to live up to your trust responsibilities for not only the workers but for the people who live there who aren't employed by the mine. And I propose we find an alternate approach -- or an alternate solution and we diversify our economy. That's all I have to say. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you, Jessica. We've got Dru and Robert and then Nadine and I am going to mess up your name. Nadine, you know who you are. Your last name starts with an N. I'm so sorry. I'm
afraid of butchering it. Okay. Hopefully you know who you are. Dru?

MR. BACON: Thank you for the opportunity to speak. My name is Dru Bacon, D-r-u B-a-c-o-n. I live in Goodyear, Arizona and my community in Goodyear has 4,625 houses. 1,000 -- more than 1,300 of those have rooftop solar. Homeowners like the option to invest directly in generating their own electric power and power that benefits the nonsolar neighbors. My community and hundreds of others across the state and across the nation are examples that the U.S., and indeed the world, is in a rapid transition from polluting fossil fuels to clean renewable energy.

Profound poverty on the Navajo Generating Station, as opened by your state representative, existing before Navajo Generating Station, and the way we're going, it will exist long after the Navajo Generating Station and the Kayenta Mine are closed down. There are more than 300,000 indigenous Americans living on the Navajo and Hopi Reservations. It's an insult to the dignity of these people to justify keeping NGS in operation for a few years based on employment of a fraction of 1 percent of the population. Poverty and health care for all
residents of reservations needs to be addressed independent of NGS. I hope that will happen.

I refer you to May in 2017, a report of the institute for energy, economics, and financial analysis. The report concludes that operation of NGS through 2019 will require subsidies of $414 million. That amount of money is sufficient to put rooftop solar on more than 50,000 tribal homes. Providing rooftop solar to a large percentage of reservation residents would be a better use of $414 million than keeping a fraction of 1 percent of residents employed for two years.

The report also concludes that keeping NGS open through 2030 would require $3.4 billion in subsidies. $2.4 billion would put rooftop solar on the roof of every tribal home and build a large utility stable solar plant. Building such a solar farm at the NGS site would be the best choice for the tribes and for energy generation. A utility stable farm would take advantage of existing transmission infrastructure. I'd refer you to the utility report of May 15, 2017. Utility Dive reported that a combined gas plant bankrupt -- is now bankrupt because -- built in 2012 is now bankrupt because the plant cannot compete with low cost wind and solar and
cannot meet its bills.

MS. DARR: Thanks. Can you wrap up, please.

MR. BACON: Yes.

MS. DARR: Thank you.

MR. BACON: We often hear government officials say that we should not pick winners and losers and that decision should be left to the marketplace. In the case of coal, the market has spoken. Coal has lost and renewable energy has won. I read about the tribe of indigenous Americans who have a tenant in their governance that all decisions should consider the impact of their decisions on the next seven generations. I hope this decision will keep that wisdom in mind.

MS. DARR: Thank you, sir. Okay. Did I find Nadine? Yes. Okay. You're after this gentleman and then Thorson. There we go. Okay.

MR. BURNS: Good afternoon. I am Bob Burns and I am one of the five elected Corporation commissioners here in the state of Arizona. The closing of the Navajo Generating Station is obviously a very serious issue for the Navajo Nation and the Hopi Tribe as well as the whole Page community. I am hopeful that as many options as humanly possible will
be examined to solve this major problem for our Northern Arizona community.

As a utility regulator, though, my primary concern and responsibility is the ratepayers of the regulated utilities. If subsidization becomes part of the solution, I object to any mandatory above-market power rates which would create a subsidy basically singling out our ratepayers. The ratepayers served by the regulated utilities are concentrated in the metropolitan centers being served by Central Arizona Project. If part of the solution creates a mandatory rate increase, which I have heard talked about for power, these ratepayers could end up being double taxed, if you will, with a higher power and a higher water cost combined.

My point is that this is not a problem to be solved by the ratepayers of our regulated utilities. This problem needs to be solved by the federal government and the federal and state governments, if necessary, working together. Thank you for the opportunity to speak.

MS. DARR: All right. Nadine and then Thorson and then Ronald Roedel. Okay. Gotcha. All right.

MS. NARINDRANKURA: (Speaking in native
My name is Nadine Narindrankura. I live in the Black Mesa region and I am very concerned about this issue. If NGS stays open a day longer, the Navajo people of Black Mesa will be denied their basic rights to water. My sister Jessica stated earlier, we practice a lot of our traditional life ways and a lot of our life ways depend on the health of the land. The health of the land determines the health of the plants which our livestock rely on which we use for wild -- we forage wild food, we harvest the plants to dye our wool that we use to make rugs and all of our -- this is our traditional economy and it uses water, but we no longer have our springs and seeds.

My grandma used to tell us that she would be able to herd sheep to a nearby spring, but now we haul water, and the water that we haul, the wildlife drinks from those watering holes. And so if I want to remain on Black Mesa -- if I want to raise my daughter there, we need to change the direction of our energy. If Navajo Nation wants to stay in the energy market, they need to diversify. There are better ways of doing business and the Department of Interior has historically made business rules that
have harmed entire indigenous communities and not just my community.

So I'm asking you, DOI, please, uphold your responsibility not only to us residents on Black Mesa, not only to the residents that benefit from the CAP -- the native communities that benefit from the CAP, but please remember the constituents, the wildlife, the plants, the earth, the air, the water, the sky. Everything. Not just the jobs. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you. Let's see here. Thorson and then Ronald -- I've got eye contact with you -- and Jim Dublinski. Gotcha. Okay.

MR. KEWENVOYOUMA: Good afternoon, ladies and gentlemen. My name is Thorson Kewenvoyouma. I'm from the village of Moenkopi Village. I've been working for Peabody coal for 30-plus years and I have experience of Black Mesa mine and other reservations. Fortunately I was called to Kayenta Mine to continue my employment for Peabody. Its employees of Peabody who have put in many years of hard labor not only to earn a paycheck, but to start the production of community for the Southwest and earning financial sources for both the Hopi and Navajo tribes.

Through our hard work, both tribes have benefitted. People in the Southwest -- people of the
Southwest don't have to leave their home. All they have to do is click on the switch to get energy called electricity. There are people who want NGS to close and there are those who are against this closure. This is a complex issue that is not easy to tackle nor is it simple. The state holds -- produces pollution or destructive to the land.

Pumping natural gas from the earth causes fracking, using solar energy is great, but think of the useless material that is left behind in the works. More sites need to be developed at the use of these resources. Not one group or person can say what's best for everyone. The closure of NGS may minimize pollution by a small fraction, but pollution will continue by other sources.

It will unemploy not only for us coal miners, but also for many people who benefit from the company. Owners of NGS have benefitted the most from the plant and the coal miners on the reservation. Their decision to close the plant will not only disrupt the lives of the employees at that site, but also the infrastructure entities that's helped it become a productive company. As future plans come about NGS, don't forget, you also need to think of the men and women who have labored years and hours
generating a heating source for you to enjoy. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you, sir. Ronald Roedel and then Jim Dublinski and then Ivan Sidney. Where are you? Oh, gotcha. Okay.

MR. ROEDEL: Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Ron Roedel. I'm a professor at ASU. I've taught solar energy physics and engineering for the last 35 years and so I'm an advocate for solar energy, and in general, I am in favor of replacing fossil fuel facilities with renewable, nonpolluting electricity generation, but I'm also very socially conscious, I think, and I'm very concerned about the impact of closing a facility as large as NGS and the Kayenta Mine.

But I would like to point out that Andrew Needham wrote this fabulous book in 2014 called "Power Lines" and he has written powerfully that in very large measure, the entire enterprise of NGS and the Kayenta Mine has been to successfully transfer immense amounts of treasure and energy and resources from a relatively poor portion of Arizona to -- from a relatively rural portion of Arizona to the bulk of the rich urban regions in Arizona as Senator Peshlakai has pointed out.
Now, I think it would be even more
disastrous if we shut NGS and Kayenta and didn't
think about what would be left in its wake. I don't
mean the environmental devastation of the mine
itself. I mean, what will be -- how can we make the
Navajo Nation whole again? How can we keep all the
hardworking people at the mine and NGS healthy and
wealthy and wise? We have to have a plan that --
something about this that we cannot neglect everybody
in this room because I do believe they're no longer
going to need NGS and the mine will close. Don't
know on what time scale, but we must count on all of
our authorities having jurisdiction to help everybody
in this room. Thank you very much.

MS. DARR: Okay. Jim and then Ivan in
the back and the next one is Marie Justice. Where's
Marie? Hi. Okay. Jim?

MR. DUBLINSKI: Thank you for allowing me
to talk today. The market forces for Navajo
Generating Station are uncompetitive. In 2016 alone,
$38 million --

AUDIENCE MEMBER: Can't hear you.

MS. DARR: Yeah, you need to put that
right up there. There you go.

MR. DUBLINSKI: 2016 alone, CAP has
overpaid $38 million in energy costs versus to the open market rate. That's a CAP estimate. That's a subsidy and something that we can change forward, that's assuming municipalities are mitigating their risk. Their money is not moving toward coal. They're moving toward renewable. So where do we go? That's the key question. I believe renewables are an answer. The sooner we move to renewables is better for not only the state and the country and the community, but to conserve a principle that's risk mitigation.

As a whole, the coal industry's struggling. Coal bankruptcies, cleanups, water issues, black clouds. Jobs have been declining since the 1950s. This is primarily due to market forces, automation, and health issues. Renewables are economic sovereignty and jobs. Solar alone in the United States is a larger employer than gas, coal, and oil combined. Renewable's approach is a fiscally responsible move that where investment mines flow, jobs are there. Solar alone is growing 12 times faster than the economy.

The price for storage, solar, and wind continues to fall. The price of clean energy over coal continues to grow. We don't want to be on the
wrong side of this. Many states have already --
meeting their clean energy goals, completing their
timelines. There's another path forward. Renewables
globally is a $4 trillion opportunity. It's also
renewables in the mine, the future, and economic
sovereignty. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you. You guys are doing
great, by the way, on the three minute thing. So
Ivan, you got it, okay, and then Marie and James

MR. SIDNEY: Thank you. Good afternoon.
Honored to be here with the Native Americans on this
very important day. Let me first say my name is Ivan
Sidney. I'm here representing traditional affiliate
of First Mesa Consolidated Villages, but first to say
we are people of many broken promises. We don't have
a treatise, but yet we have survived up to today.
Judge Carol, a federal judge in one of those
hearings, one of the things we mean was that we have
been here since memorial. And yes, we have suffered
through the history of burning Peabody coal and all
facing the environmental issues.

I was chairman in 1981 through '89
working with my friend Chairman Peterson Zah when he
renegotiated the royalties. I thought that was to
show that you can work together in good faith. That such leases have a term if we sit down and work together. We have for years seen transmission lines come here to Phoenix without our people benefiting. We don't have irrigation on our land but that water comes here. We're still today with the Lower Colorado River adjudication for what? Water again. All we want is an opportunity. I'm currently the chairman of the school for Hopi Junior-Senior High School. I look at those children today. What are they going to do when their parents no longer have jobs? Because the only royalties that benefit Hopi Tribe comes from the mine creating jobs.

Also what are we going to do in the future when we are neglected? Our village has a proposal today and has had one for the past year for a solar farm renewable energy, but no one pays attention to us. I'm here saying this knowing for a fact we are the only village that do not receive allocation from the Hopi Tribal Council. Yet every other village receives that funding, but I am here today because of our judicial leaders, not the American future for our people.

We are survivors, however, if we just put our differences aside as native people and work
together and it works. This America is our land. We're going to remain here. We'll be here. So I believe there is a future if we can all work together. Bureau of Indian Affairs signing those leases has an obligation to look out for our future so let's begin a strong beginning today.

    MS. DARR: That is the perfect three minutes. You, sir, have practiced.

    James Corbin and then Ben -- Hopi tribal member.

    MS. JUSTICE: Thank you for being here. My name's Marie Justice. I am a truck driver at Kayenta Mine. I have worked there for 29 years. I am also the local union president of the United Mine Workers of America, Local 1924. I represent the men and women that work there and I'm charged with looking after their welfare and their safety on the job. I am also a member of the Lechee chapter where the NGS sits. In fact, I played there as a child before they built that plant. I am also a sheepherder, a sheep rancher within the shadows of NGS, and from there I had the opportunity years ago.

    And in this day and age when I was getting a job, I couldn't get a job as a woman to make the same amount of money as a man does in my
community. I went to Kayenta Mine. I wanted to work there. I was given a level playing field as a woman and a native woman and it has provided me a job for all these years. This is my story. But we have a lot to talk about with our mines. We're very proud of our jobs. We're very proud of what we do. The men and women there are very, very proud people, and we have provided energy for NGS for all these years. We did our part. We worked safely. We did some very excellent things in reclaiming of the lands. We are talking about elk, deer, fox, hawks, bald eagles flying in our area because of what we have reclaimed. What is there has provided that for the wildlife where you can go out there in the evening, they're out there in the fields. This is what we provided there with the reclaimed lands that we have.

We also have an area where Peabody has made an attempt with the local medicine man to provide only traditional plants that are used for medicinal purposes and they're growing there and they're there. So this is what we have to be proud of for us as miners. And the other thing is safety is our first value and core to our mission. We deliver a strong safety rate for our people and it is a very, very safe mine. Safer than most industries.
And we have 325 skill jobs out there from virtually everyone, like has been said before, is Native American, Navajo, and Hopi. And we do make good money. I am probably a middle-class person, but we're disappearing. If we do away with this, we're gone.

So in addition, our miners themselves donated $96,000 last year to help our communities, our children. We really help our students. We make the time to help our kids to do better than what we're doing and that is something that we're really proud of. We help our communities. So the other is that four years ago we lobbied the Navajo Nation to give SRP what they wanted to 2044. We went out there. These people that are here, they were there. We talked to our delegates. We got it done. The Navajo Nation signed, but guess who didn't sign. The owners walked away from it. We gave them that opportunity. To me they stabbed us in the back when they did that. We worked. We did our part. For them, they're walking away just because of profit. They have an opportunity to do the right thing. They didn't do it. And we have given our land all that time for them to be there and make money and to provide everybody that sits now here and turns on a
faucet, we provided that for you and now you want to
do it cheaper and walk away from all of us? I don't
think that's right. This is where you have a trust
responsibility as the Department of Interior to do
the right things -- for industry to do the right
thing for our people. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you. James Corbin and
Ben, and I can't say your last name and I'm very,
very sorry about that, and Brice Brown. Where are
you? Okay. I see you. All right. Go ahead.

MR. CORBIN: Thank you for the
opportunity to speak and thank you to the Bureau of
Reclamation and Department of Interior for taking the
time to do this. Marie is right. It's all about
money and it's all about cheaper. The gentleman that
left, the solar industries is mostly heavily
subsidized industry in the United States. And in the
state of Nevada when they ceased the subsidies, the
solar energy stampeded out of the state of Nevada.
So what they're doing now currently at the federal
energy regulatory commission, there's a company
called Hunt Power out of Texas. They're building a
transmission line to Mexico so they can build a coal
plant down there to put all these people out of work.
What you have to do is file as an intervenor at the
federal energy regulatory commission. You have to file as an intervenor at the Department of Energy. You have to get a place at the table. You've got to be heard. You also have to go against these companies. Out of one side of their mouth they're telling you this plant can't be supported. On the other side of their mouth they're building a plant in Mexico to put a coal burner down there. And by the way, the federal power in Mexico is 100 percent federally owned and subsidized. So you have to fight smart and you've got to stand against this.

President Trump when he was elected, he said he was going to protect American jobs. Let's hold him to his word.

MR. NUVAMSE: Good afternoon. Thank you very much for being here. My name is Ben Nuvamse. I am former chairman for the Hopi Tribe. I want to acknowledge Sidney, former chairman as well, and Vern Masayesva, wherever he sat. I saw him walking in. But thank you very much for the opportunity, David and Kevin. Congressman, good to see you here. I wanted to talk about a couple things. One is the history of coal mining at Black Mesa and talk about the impacts. We've heard a lot about that already, and then I'm going to talk about a possible solution.
And to the point -- at the risk of being brutally honest, what I want to say is in the mid-'60s Hopi people were -- the word I use is "hoodwinked" into agreeing with a coal basis in the mid-'60s and there was also an infamous attorney, John Boynton who said, "I'm going to work for you. I got a better deal for you." But we also found out that he was at the same time representing Peabody coal company, and so a lot of things were accomplished.

We had a full tribal council at that time and who was actually -- a tribal council was actually formed to -- for the sole purpose of approving the coal uses. Since the mining started, there have been many impacts and some people have already talked about it. So our people are suffering from respiratory illnesses. Some even died. Our original water was heavily pumped and particularly during the time that the coal was supported to Mohave Generating Station. Okay. And our springs have been contaminated. Our wash is contaminated and these are the sacrifices that we're talking about -- that people are talking about.

These are the sacrifices that the Hopi people -- the Navajo people had to put up with so you
can have free cheap electricity here. You have swimming pools, running water to your farmlands. These are the sacrifices that we have suffered. We were told that coal mining would be there forever. The federal government and attorney created a monopoly for Peabody coal. We did not have a chance to go out and market our coal to the highest bidder. We were told that's what we are stuck with. So our economic sovereignty was determined for us. We didn't determine that for ourselves. So there's a lot of things that happened to us.

We have also for a -- measly royalties to our travel hours. But, however, the impending closure of Peabody coal and NGS provides an opportunity -- an opportunity to transition to renewable energy. And once that happens, yes, we have jobs here, but you can have those jobs at that new plant. Let's have the times for Navajo and Hopi to play a key part in this new joint venture, and only then can we see economic sovereignty and environmental justice. That's what I believe is owed to us, but I think we -- the longer we delay this -- the longer we keep kicking the can down the road, the more devastation we will see. So we need to also remember that NGS and Peabody coal, the federal
government has its responsibility to make sure that
our land is healed. That it's reclaimed. So I say
take a look at the -- we have a new -- a pending
environmental impact statement. That should help or
is a good way to decide. If not, or if it hasn't
been put aside, then we get a new EIS, but there is a
provision in the current EIS. It talks about
renewable energy option and tribal energy option, and
I urge your revelation to choose those options so
that our tribes can be at the table when these
critical decisions are made because I believe that
the federal government, Peabody coal, NGS owes this
to us for our tribes for abuse, misuse, overuse of
our resources. Only then can we see economic justice
and environmental justice. (Speaking in native
tongue.)

MS. DARR: Thank you. Brice in the back
and then Matthew McKean and Sandy Bahr. Okay. Brice
then Matthew then Sandy.

MR. BROWN: Good afternoon. My name is
Brice Brown. I'm probably the only paramedic in this
building. So if there's an emergency, please walk
quietly to the exits.

I've been employed by Peabody. I work at
the Kayenta Mine and I'm a 24-hour paramedic. I've
been there about five or six years and I've gotten to
know these fine people that work up there. I got to
know what brotherhood is. After I left the power
services in two cities, all my work has all been on
the Navajo station. I've been in the EMS field for
approximately 24 years. I took care of these men and
women that work at the mine. Got to know them
closely by first name basis. Care about them.
Sometimes they even remember my birthday when I
forget.

Not only did I work up there and keep the
mine safe so my job is pretty easy, but that doesn't
mean I sit around and wait for something to happen.
We do a lot of training. We do a lot of health care
every year. We do vaccinations for the local
residents. We do a lot of support for Navajo Nation,
EMS services, fire departments, rangers, national
monument. Rangers come up and train with us and give
out our training. We have nothing but experienced
instructors if you want some help. So that's what we
provide for the locals around the communities. So
for this, Mr. Interior and ladies and gentlemen, I
support keeping the -- my brothers' and sisters'
jobs. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you. Mr. McKean, Sandy
MR. McKEAN: Good afternoon, congressman.

Nice seeing you. I have a very different topic than most of the people are sharing today to talk about. What I'd like to say to you is that there is a solution for Navajo Generating Station and the solution is technology. I want you to think back to the 1970s. There was a period of time in the 1970s when the experts in the world told us we had 30 years worth of oil based upon the automobile and the amount of gasoline consumed. And then not long after that, the fuel injector displaced the carburetor doubling the fuel efficiency in the automobile and in effect doubling the amount of oil in the world.

Our company, we've done case studies on Navajo Generating Station. We have patents all over the world and we have developed a new category called "solid carbon fractionation" and what I'm going to tell you today is your jobs aren't in jeopardy. Your jobs are actually going to be more valuable than they ever were before because we will actually use coal to its full potential. Coal is a gift. The United States is the Saudi Arabia of coal. The next closest country to us is Russia which has 50 percent of the accessible coal that we have. But I will say to you,
the way we are using coal right now can be better.

    Not only to polarize ourselves on different sides of the aisle -- some of us are pro-coal, some of us are anti-coal, some of us are green. I like the environmentalists because they've chosen and they've chosen a way and they've forced us to become better. What we can do with our technology is we can process coal prior to it ever being burned at the power plant through our process which is a continuous feed, scaleable technology. We can extract water demoisturizing the coal, but more importantly we can extract the valuables, transportation fuels in large volume. It devolitizes the coal, removes the carcinogens like arsenic and mercury, removes 99 percent of the sulphur, and we are left with a clean coal product that burns as clean or cleaner than natural gas.

    The difference is most environmental technologies cannot stand alone without a government subsidy attached to it. And our technology called "solid carbon fractionation" we can offset the cost of purifying coal with transportation fuel recovery making your coal far more valuable, and in effect producing clean coal as cheap or cheaper than natural gas. Matthew McKean. Thank you for your time today.
MS. DARR: Thank you very much, sir.

Sandy Bahr, Percy Deal, and then Melvin Taylor.

MS. BAHR: Thank you for the opportunity to speak today. My name is Sandy Bahr. I'm the chapter director of Sierra Club, Grand Canyon Chapter. That's the Arizona chapter. Sierra Club supports ending the burning of coal at the plant in 2019, developing renewable energy, and increasing energy efficiency to replace the plant's power and economically benefit the effect to the tribe and investments in tribal economic diversification while hoping to ensure jobs at the coal plant and mine.

It's time for Arizona to repay the debt of using this plant to pump water uphill to Phoenix and Tucson. It's time for Arizona to look at investing in tribal economies and protecting the workers. It will mean cleaner air, less carbon pollution, and a more sustainable future for all. It is clear that market forces are at work at Navajo Generating Station and it's not the only one. We have seen coal plants retire around the country.

Rather than throwing away a billion dollars or more subsidizing the plant, it would be a better idea to find a long-term solution that invests
in a fair transition for workers, communities, and tribal economies. I think someone earlier mentioned the Institute for Energy, Economics, and Financial Analysis report that talked about it would cost hundreds of millions of dollars in subsidies just for the short-term to keep the plant going let alone the long-term.

Recently Peabody Energy presented at the Arizona Corporation Commission -- it was just a couple days out of bankruptcy, I would add, in an attempt to make an economic case for the plant, energy economics actually found more than $2 billion of faulty assumptions in their presentation, or you heard about the fact that the CAP estimated it would have saved about $38 and a half million in 2016 had it bought energy on the market instead of from NGS.

It really is time to seize this opportunity to transition. Coal is costly for a number of reasons: for our health, for the future of the planet, and there are great opportunities. Clinging to coal means Arizona and all of our communities will fall behind places like Nevada and Colorado where clean energy growth continues to save money and create jobs. We look forward to having a good discussion and moving forward with a clean
transition that doesn't just benefit Phoenix or Tucson or L.A., but benefits the people who have been experiencing the most significant impacts from NGS and Kayenta mine. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you.

Percy and then Melvin and then Doug Pitts.

MR. DEAL: I'd like to call these guys that wear blue -- it reminds me of water and that's exactly what I'm going to talk about. My name is Percy Deal. I live in Black Mesa, big mountain, which is located just south of the mine. In 1969 when the agreement was signed, the people in my area and everywhere else, they were never told how much water was going to be included. Today by my calculation written in the agreement, the agreement says NGS can have up to 34,100 acre-feet a year. Peabody can have up to 6,400 acre-feet a year. You add those two, 40,500 acre-feet a year, you times that by 50 years, you come up with over 2 million acre-feet a year.

Now, at the same time, there's thousands and thousands of family -- Navajo family and Hopi family. We don't have water. We do not have water. All of our water that we could be using is dedicated
to these two industries. They are claiming water. Nowhere else in the country something like that would be allowed.

At that time, before 1969, the people were never told how much water was going to be involved. They were never told that this was going to have an impact on their lives. They were never told that it was going to have an impact on their environment. Today the health impact talks about respiratory, asthma, heart and lung disease, and the list goes on and on. There is no study done. And then there is in the agreement -- the environmental impact talks about the plants and the herbs that we use for food, medicine, and ceremonies. These are very important to us. I know that the Hopi uses these in their ceremony. So do we.

In the agreement it says nothing in this agreement shall be construed as a waiver of water, and I think everybody needs to read that agreement. So that's why we feel that that water is ours. And the sooner we reclaim it, the better. In Navajo there is no prayer that is connected to coal. No ceremony, no prayer, no song. The same is true on the Navajo, but all of our ceremony is connected to water. Water is life.
We ask that the owners do us all justice. Do the local people justice. Do the two tribes justice. Do the workers justice by giving them a fair retirement, transfer, health insurance, retraining, whatever is needed so that they can carry on their lives. You know, in this state, it's not a surprise. It was -- the line was strong almost 50 years ago. So they knew -- everybody knew that this was coming. We want to be involved. Whatever the result is, we're going to end up living with it. We want to be involved.

We understand or we hear that there's negotiation going on on the future of NGS by the Navajo leadership and the partners. The Navajo leadership has not gone out into our community to ask for our input, our comment. Instead these are the agencies doing all of their work trying to get comment and recommendation from the local people. We want our mother earth to be treated right and taken care of. We need to take care of her first so that she can take care of us.

There are cleaner ways to help everybody help each other to provide jobs and revenue and caring for our land. There's no other land waiting for us. There's no other water waiting for us so we
have to take care of this. After all, we are -- all
of us -- after all, you know, we are partners,
neighbors, Navajos, and the Hopi. We have to survive
together and this is what I wanted to mention and we
also want a clean clean-up, decommissioning unlike
this one here. This is Kayenta or Black Mesa poverty
line. It went away almost 50 years ago and
everything is still there. We don't want a repeat of
this so we want a clean decommissioning, a clean
clean-up. (Speaking in native tongue.)

MS. DARR: Okay. Melvin Taylor you're
next, but we're going to have to steal a little time
check with you all. We've got this room for about 90
more minutes and I have about 30 cards. So
seriously, if we can stick to three minutes or under,
we can get everybody that I have a card for. So
let's all work together to do that. We've got Melvin
Taylor and Doug Pitts and then Vincent Yazzie.
Gotcha. Okay. Sir?

MR. TAYLOR: Good afternoon. My name is
Melvin Taylor. (Speaking in native tongue.)

I voted for Peabody coal mine for the
last four years. I'm a laborer. I'm a heavy
equipment operator and plant mechanic. I've been
employed at Peabody for four years. Before that I
was employed with another coal mine for 31 years. And this is like the 11th hour asking for a reprieve of a death sentence of Peabody coal and NGS station. We are all appealing for the two industries to remain open for the benefit of the two tribes and economics of Arizona. We are asking policy leaders to come together with a common sense solution to keep the plants operating for the benefit of our state and tribes and the residents of the area. The closure of the two industries will affect the Navajo tribal budget by about 22 percent and the Hopi Tribe by about 85 percent. I imagine it slowly will also affect Arizona economics.

Both Kayenta Mine and Navajo Generating Station are a powerful economic engine contributing vital jobs and revenues for the Navajo Nation and Hopi Tribe. With the Navajo Nation protecting the mine which generated an estimated 5.9 billion in labor and nearly $13 billion in gross for Navajo Nation between 2020 and 2044 based on an ASU study for the Navajos and for the remainder of the operations.

Kayenta Mine employs about 325 workers and 99 percent of the workers are Native Americans. Navajo Generating Station delivers affordable power
that moves CAP water across the state creating energy, diversity, and security of supply. The Navajo Generating Station also uses Arizona energy and resources supporting steel jobs and billions of dollars in economic benefits.

Before I worked for Peabody coal, I worked for Chevron coal company at McKinley Mine and it's in New Mexico. I worked there for 34 years. That mine closed in 2012 and I was laid off in 2009 due to economics. After I was laid off, I got some education in heavy equipment operations and got a CDL. I used my job skills as a plant mechanic to get jobs as a professional mechanic. I worked in a couple mines and other places that are involved with mining, but to work other places means to be further away from home. This is a hardship for my wife, kids, and family members. My wife had to do both jobs as a parent. Family members also depend on me to come close to home. Family and my health. I'm working hard here. Sometimes six days a week. Most of that is 10-hour days.

Then one day I got a call from Peabody coal and was offered a job as an operator. I could be closer to home than two and a half hours. I have a baby. That is why I'm asking to keep Peabody
generating station open, get the kids educated and go
to college, and also this will help me prepare for
the future for another job. I've got training as a
first responder, and that means I can put a Band-Aid
on safely, and training in industrial firefighting
and also industrial rescue which means I can make a
better zipline.

I am a second-generation coal miner. My
grandfather started a small mine in Arizona. If we
would allow the transition to shut down, we won't
feel that ripple effect. It should not close.
Gallup, New Mexico felt that effect. Stores were
closed, businesses closed. Need to find a better
solution and transition slowly into renewable energy
and closing this mine. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Shorter. Okay. Work with me
here. All right. Mr. Pitts and then I've got
Vincent Yazzie there and Benny. Okay.

MR. PITTS: I'm Doug Pitts and I was
going to lead off by saying I was on the startup
group for the Black Mesa coal, but when I saw the
picture of it still being up there, the only
consolation I had is I'll probably outlive them. I
want everybody to know though that that Black Mesa
coal pipeline was a first of a kind technology in the
world. It was a major, major milestone, and it
turned out the only way to be able to expand and
develop the Kayenta coal resource and the economic
development that came with it. So it was a huge,
huge win for everybody involved with it.

The other thing I want to mention also is
a colleague Matt spoke much, much better about our
frontier applied sciences technology than I could so
I won't go into that, but I did want to say that
that's technology too that will be first of a kind
and it can introduce the same kind of economic
benefits to the Northern Arizona area, Navajo Nation,
and the Hopis that happened to the Black Mesa coal.
So I'd encourage you to keep technology in mind.

New technology's tough. It's hard to
develop. It's hard to get people to fund the
development work that you need to develop new
technologies. The Black Mesa coal pipeline had 10
years to development before it actually developed.
One thing I wanted to appeal to the Department of
Interior and also make contacts with the Department
of Energy as well is I would encourage them to work
with some methodology on increasing the funding for
new technology development that really makes sense
because that would be very helpful to us and very
helpful for all of you.

But one thing that Matt did not mention that I'd like to say is that we have potential for long-term industrial expansion too. If we were able to dewater the Black Mesa hole and eventually Navajo Generating Station began to decline in production, we could export that coal because it's now a very competitive export commodity. So there's a great deal of new business opportunities that could grow from implementing a new technology. So keep hope. We think we've got something that's going to work. We're going to be working hard to do it and we'll hopefully be talking to you more about it as time goes on. Thank you very much.

MS. DARR: Okay. Vincent and Benny and Jimmie Jones. Is that you? All right. Here. All right.

MR. YAZZIE: Hello. My name is Vincent Yazzie. I need to do a lot of research and I'd like to have NGS nationalized by the Navajo Nation as discovered. CAP, Bureau of Reclamation, Central Arizona Conservation District finalized a wheeling agreement plus the owners decided to pull out so that sounds suspicious. But I will call that the Bureau of Reclamation's final solution to implement 6,411
Transcript of Proceedings - 5/15/2017

1 acre-feet for the Navajo Nation throughout the state of Arizona as per Arizona CAP water agreement for 2004, that's only 6,411 acre-feet of water for Western Navajo -- all the Navajos there. So that's quite a stealing of water.

In 1957, even now in the Ninth Circuit, the U.S. government says they do not have the infrastructure to deliver the water to the Colorado River, the Navajo, but even plans on delivering water to Jack's Canyon. So I find these lies just horrible. People are dying with no water up there. Move them away, no development. That's why I support nationalizing NGS. Something that Navajo miners says NGS can be -- burn natural gas.

So Bureau of Reclamation says coal -- natural gas is $3.50 per million of BTU, but then you check it out and you find out Peabody coal is burning at $2 per million BTU so that doesn't fit right. And then you find out the spot price of natural gas drops down to $1.50 per million BTU. Here I haven't even heard of an SRP contract that says that they're going to implement this lower swap price. Some sort of scam to implement the final solution. I support solar and renewables and closing natural gas plants.

MS. DARR: Benny, Jimmie Jones, and
Gerald Clitso.

MR. MELOVIDO: Hello. Good afternoon --
good evening, gentlemen. Thank you for coming from
D.C. My name is Benny Melovido. Real name is
Benedict, but it's kind of a hard name to say. I
know it's a hard name for this lady to say so that's
why I just got up. I've been an employee of Peabody
for about five years. I was an active duty Marine
for 22 years. I went to war twice for this country.
Came back to the res to visit, fell in love, and I
always stayed.

Part of this job is what makes me proud
of being here is to work with my fellow workers to
make money for my family. I have a 1-year-old baby.
I'm kind of old to have a 1-year-old, but it just
happened, and I've got to provide for that baby and
provide for all my other children. I see this mine
as being a place where we can carry ourselves into
the future. I remember somebody telling us they
wanted to make this nation great again. Please take
my word to him and say that we need to make this
Navajo Nation great by keeping this mine open. A lot
of people are dependent on it. I don't want to be on
the road. I already was overseas so many times. I
don't want to be away from my family again. It's
hard. I've seen things in my life I don't want to
ever see again. That's why I came back.

   My mother left. I grew up in California.
I was stationed in different places out there.
They've got natural gas out there and if you go to
L.A. today, you still can't see those mountains.
Now, if they want to say this plant is making it
dirty, when I first came out here, I could see 60
miles. And if you go to California, you can't even
see six. That just tells me one thing, somebody was
selling some stuff out there. They're smoking
something.

   If he could do it, the Department of
   Interior secretary or else even President Trump,
   please pass my word to him that I will fight to
defend this country again as long as he's behind us,
and that's why I'm up here talking to you guys,
especially for you two to come out here to listen to
all this. These people have got families out here,
and this lady here is going to kick me out of here,
but I know my time is up but thank you gentlemen for
your time.

   MS. DARR: All right. Jimmie Jones,
Gerald Clitso, and then Mark Davis.

   MR. JONES: Yes, my name is Jimmie Jones.
Thank you for coming out to see us. I've worked with the mine for 31 years. Retired for the weekend, come back, and now a temporary employee for two years. So what I do at the mine is I work with the water system, which you heard about. Peabody is doing their best to keep the dust down and also now there's construction going on in that hub. They're tapping into the Peabody waterline into the local communities. It goes to Phase 4. They're working on Phase 1 now and the water they're talking about, all the water, being paid for. Everything's pumped out of their reservoirs they're being paid for to the tribe. This is some information.

And then talk what Peabody does. Peabody does -- being a coal miner, as we talked about, no kids left behind. The buses they come around -- three buses come around 5, 6 o'clock in the morning to pick up kids up there. They bus the kids probably about 60, 70 miles just to go to school and Peabody maintains the roads to the local people. That's why the roads are smooth and it's a bus route. That's what Peabody does and there's two walking points for people to get water free. They don't have to pay for it. I get water from there for my home use. I put it in my own system, put the water in the tank.
That's all I use. So there's a lot of people like that on the reservation. They put the system in.

So I thank Peabody for what it's doing, what you're doing, maintaining the roads. They do a lot for the community. There's always a down talk about Peabody. They do a lot. So I'm very grateful for Peabody giving me a job for 33 years. I raised my family. Through that I raised two boys. They got out of school. They're out on their own. Now I've got grandkids and stepkids that I support. So I'm very grateful for what Peabody's doing. And that mine, there's no coal dust. It's not dusty. It's nice and clear and clean. Everything's good so I've got nothing to worry about. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Okay. Gerald then Mark Davis and Avery Pavinyama. All right. Okay.

MR. CLITSO: Thank you for giving me the time today to say a few words. Good afternoon. For all the officials that came down from Washington state, officials for the Navajo Tribe Commission. I just want to say that I'm a third-generation coal miner. My grandfather mined coal and then my dad did. We all mined coal, but during World War II, my grandfather and my late dad mined uranium. Our country needed uranium and we served this country.
well. We pay our taxes and there's a term out there that my late parents used and it's out there on -- (speaking in native tongue) -- about staying healthy -- (speaking in native tongue) -- and that's what I use.

And this mine has been good to me. Raised my two kids, educated both of my kids, put them through college, put a roof over our heads and provided transportation, provided peaceful living, and that's what Peabody does a lot more than people give credit to Peabody for. They're a good neighbor. Just like Jimmie said, they provide fresh potable water so people can haul water to their homes. It's drinkable and they provide coal that you can haul back to your home for keeping your household warm in the wintertime. And it's not just for local people, it's throughout the Navajo Nation and the waters that people come to Peabody and haul coal and low premium costs, and Peabody has been a good neighbor to a lot of people there and to the schools and give it to the local chapters. They provide refurbished equipment to them. How many companies do that? Peabody's been out there. They've been setting a good example to me. I'm proud to say that 40 years I lived in -- Peabody coal has been good. It's been a good run and
I hope to run another 40 years. I don't want it to stop.

And I just want to say that there's a lot of kids going off to college. There's a lot of graduations going on right now. Kids coming out fresh out of high school, college, junior colleges, universities. They want to work up there. Let's give them all the chance. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Mark then Avery and then Walter Haase.

MR. DAVIS: Okay. See if I can adjust this thing. Can anybody hear me? Okay. My name's Mark Davis. I actually work for a company -- we provide services to and equipment to the power plant, so thank you for the forum and thanks for the opportunity to make a public comment on the future of Navajo Generating Station and the Kayenta Mine. I just want to start off with a brief timeline. 1974 NGS Unit 1 opens and brings a clean reliable source of energy to the Southwest. According to the environmental lobby, we're on the verge of extinction of all birds, like the ones I saw around my feeder this morning, and a new ice age.

The late 1980s, the ice age isn't happening for whatever reason, but global warming
Transcript of Proceedings - 5/15/2017

sure is. That and the ozone layer is going away so we're all doubled in. NGS is still generating clean reliable energy for the Southwest. Late 1990s global warming is now joined by water problems. The world's going dry. We're all going to die. NGS is still generating clean reliable energy for the Southwest. The late 2000s, the evidence hasn't supported global warming, global cooling, giant drought, or the end of the ozone layer. Maybe people will buy the name of medicine inspector of global climate change if we repeat it. NGS is still generating clean reliable energy for the Southwest.

Notice a pattern? Vague threats, predictions worthy of chasing and a 40-year temper tantrum versus clean reliable power. That's what the dispute around NGS and the Kayenta Mine comes down to. NGS and the Kayenta Mine play very important roles in the economy and social fabric of Arizona and the Four Corners area. These facilities provide reliable affordable electrical power as well as thousands of good-paying jobs. A win for everyone involved.

Peabody's Kayenta coal is the kind of coal we want. Some of the cleanest in the world. Low in sulphur, mercury, and other pollutants. It's
been mined by native people since the 1300s for cooking, heating, and other uses. There's enough Kayenta to power Arizona's economy for many decades to come.

Coal power helps thousands of people in Arizona's economy with jobs that help people in rural areas live the good life that they want to while raising their families with benefits and income comparable to what they'd have to have -- what they'd have to have by moving to a city. Miners, chemists, and engineers and business professionals and laborers all have good paying jobs while keeping precious family and successful ties that would be lost if they had moved to find comparable work. Just going to wrap up and say I can tell you that being an Eco tour guide or a hotel janitor in Page doesn't pay $44 an hour plus union benefits and vacation but being at NGS does.

MS. DARR: Okay. Avery then Walter and then Kenneth Wilson.

MR. PAVINYAMA: All right. Thank you for this opportunity to speak. I'd like to thank the people from Washington for coming to hear our voices. We are the people that run the Kayenta Mine. I'm a second-generation coal miner. My father worked at
the Black Mesa Mine and the Kayenta Mine. He was at
the mine site for 41 years, and my uncle and my
nephew have been up here for about 38 years, so coal
mining is deep down in our blood. Now they're
retired. They're enjoying life and it feels good
that I worked with a lot of guys that my father's
worked with under their wings.

We are strongly supportive of keeping NGS
open, keeping our jobs. And our family sponsors the
rodeo for our community and on Thursday, that's when
this next session will be taking place is at our
hometown. And I worked with the Hopi Tribe for about
15 years with the water resource program so I did a
lot of water collection, data. And with all the
media talking about how Peabody's depleting our
water, when I look at the data, that's very untrue.
A lot of it has to do with misconceptions of what
people put in the newspapers and medias. And working
at the mine, I started up there with the -- working
alongside Steve Jones there, and Barrett took me
under his wing and I learned a lot from him also and
a lot of the other guys that I worked with. I'm very
thankful that they took me under their wing, but now
I got transferred to the Temple site so I supervise a
lot of the guys up there. About 25 people that I
supervise and I'm probably the only one up there that's a supervisor.

But I'd like to advocate that, you know, we know that a lot of things are based on money. A lot of things nowadays, everything runs on money. You know, happiness, you want to provide your family the kind of lifestyle you live. And these jobs up there that we work at, we make pretty good money. A lot better than some other people, but I want to just say, you know, that the government looks at all the economics and try to, like Ben said, keep America great. Let's take that message back to the president of the United States and support the tribes.

They say that the revenue royalties, that 35 percent of the Hopi Tribe's budget and that's gone to health care, education, just stuff like that that the tribe runs on. So I want to say let's try to keep doing whatever it is you have to take to keep NGS open and coal miners working. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Okay. Thank you. Walter and then Kenneth Wilson and Kerman.

AUDIENCE MEMBER: He left.


MR. HAASE: My name is Walter Haase. I'm
the general manager of Navajo Tribal Utility Authority. We strongly support the continuing --
operation of the mine and NGS. We lost 1,000 jobs --
direct jobs and 3,000 total jobs is going to have a
disastrous effect on the Navajo Nation's economy and
the Hopi Tribe's economy and the Northern region of
the state of Arizona. It's going to impact the City
of Page, Winslow, Holbrook, and even Flagstaff. Our
people travel there all the time and spend their
dollars there. It's also going to affect my
customers. I take care of the Navajo Nation's
electric, water and gas and communications and waste
water, and the loss of the mine's income to us is
going to result in a 12 percent rate increase across
the board for electric customers. The mine now
provides a reduction in our costs that we pass
directly on to mostly our elders and our customers --
residential customers and that's going to have a
strong impact on us.

What I want to say is the current
situation most people don't understand or know, but
we have about 180- to 190,000 Navajos that live in
Navajo Nation and we have a 48 percent unemployment
rate right now. 38 percent of our people live below
the poverty line. Our per capita income is $10,700 a
year. The rest of the United States enjoys $48,000 a  
year. We're already in a very economically depressed  
area in the region.

With that said, instead of hurting our  
local economy, we need to actually improve our local  
local economy and let it grow and help our people. So with  
that said, Department of Interior needs to keep in  
place and go forward with their water and power.  
We've traditionally had it at the Navajo Generating  
Station. It needs to continue on. It needs to grow  
beyond just Navajo Generating Station. The Navajo  
people and the Hopi Tribe numbers have some great  
resources available for all the United States to take  
advantage of. I recently discussed the best solar  
assets in all the United States. We have good  
resources in the Green Mountain. We also had the  
opportunity to firm that up if we expand our horizon  
and think about this. There's Quest Star power line  
out there that power up about 169 watts of natural  
gas plant that can help the reliability of an area.

In addition to that, we need to make sure  
that transition access is available to the Navajo  
people. Without that renewable plan, it does not  
move forward and nothing else will move forward with  
natural gas either. In addition to that, we believe
that we should have a multi-year construction plan
for solar projects so that we can keep our people
working in a continuous fashion. What do I mean by
that? A five-year plan, 100 megawatts a year to
employ 250 to 300 people on a construction site and
provide permanent jobs afterwards just like a natural
gas power plant will, just not as many. Most
importantly we need to create an incentive plan that
allows people to develop in this region. Thank you.

MS. DARR: We've got Kenneth Wilson,
Anthony Curley, then Annie Walker.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: (Speaking in
native tongue). But the thing is, I really want to
introduce Ken, a young man. His concerns -- what it
means to this whole thing. I work for Caterpillar
and we sell and service a lot of equipment to these
companies. Thank you.

MR. WILSON: My name is Kenneth Wilson.
I'm a student at Pepperdine University. I'm here
just to discuss this issue. It really hits home with
me. I grew up on the Navajo Nation and basically I'm
here to talk about climate change, I guess. We
cannot deny that climate change is a thing, and right
now we have a president who doesn't believe in that
and this is a serious issue. The current fact is
that we should go about producing energy by burning fossil fuel is inefficient and we need to find alternate ways to do this.

Also value to our community by jobs, by surveillance. That's incredibly crucial. In an area the reservation is now surpassed by poverty. It's a serious issue. We need jobs. Even if this mine closes, we need to have new business opportunities on the reservation to support these people and their jobs. Earlier showed me the factory that wasn't properly shut down and we need to make sure if we shut down a plant, we need to shut it down properly. There's no repercussions for future generations. New opportunities on the reservation and explore the ways we use solar or we can do different ways to make faster coal to get the resource out of there and make sure that these jobs stay on reservation. Okay.

This mine may not be the best thing for the environment. Okay. So if it isn't shut down, the process in which we do things afterwards, we need to make sure it's clean and make sure we keep the jobs on reservation and that our economy can prosper. The economy is based on two things. We need jobs and we also need to make sure that these jobs are doing the right thing. Make sure progress stays on the
reservation leaning on the cutting-edge of technology. We need to be on the cutting-edge of technology, make sure that the Navajo are getting jobs in these industries that affect foundation. Climate change isn't going anywhere and we need to make sure that we are taking responsibility for that and doing something about that. We'll all survive this and get other jobs. Thank you so much.

MS. DARR: Thank you. Anthony then Annie and then Alexander Osif.

MR. CURLEY: Good afternoon. My name is Anthony Curley from Tuba City, Arizona. That's about 70 miles from Black Mesa where I travel every morning to work to make a living for my family. I'm here to discuss my thoughts on the possible closure of the Navajo Generating Station and the Kayenta coal mine. I've been employed with Kayenta Mine for six years as a first class welder. Previously I traveled for work mostly out of state. Most jobs lasting weeks at a time. Nothing permanent which kept me away from my home living in and out of motels away from my wife and two kids. While working on the road I got involved with substance abuse which led to many losses in my family. Away from home, it didn't allow me to be the father I wanted to be to my kids and a
husband to my wife. That all changed six years ago
when I was hired by Peabody. I am home every night
to spend evenings with my family. I'm able to attend
my kids' sporting events. My wife has a partner to
raise my two kids.

My son is graduating from Tuba City High
School this Saturday and plans to attend Fort Hills
College. With this job I'm able to pay for his way
through college. My daughter is a 7th grader at a
boarding school where she excels at in academics and
sports. For me personally I think this job has given
me balance and stability in my life to be a better
person for me and my loved ones. I've been sober for
four years now and I think my job has a lot to do
with my sobriety. Substance abuse could have taken
my family from me which I think is very common on the
reservation where substance abuse is a problem.

At home my family depends on me a lot. I
am sure a lot of families depend on people employed
at NGS and Peabody. I deliver coal to my extended
family, my wife's grandparents, my grandparents to
keep warm through the winter. They don't have the
clothes and they don't have the sources. They can't
flick a switch where they stay warm during the
winter. You know, we have to take care of it and I
do my part for that. I do my own part for that.

Peabody has also contributed many donations to many families for funerals, you know, trips for kids. When family members are sick or anything like that, you know, they have donations sheets going around and all of these employees, they just take money out of their check and give it to them. My daughter is headed to Hawaii for a basketball tournament, and a lot of my fellow employees, they're contributing money to help her attend this basketball tournament which she loves to do.

But all in all one thing I really noticed about Peabody, around Peabody the grazing area, it's like a buffet to these animals. You know, I live in Tuba City and I drive through there. It's like going through Iraq. Peabody takes care of the land. They're reclaiming it really good and they care about the environment. Thank you for your time.

MS. DARR: All right. Annie Walker then Alexander Osif and then Vern -- it starts with an H.

MS. WALKER: (Speaking in native tongue.) I lived in a community that was located at the base of Black Mesa on the west side springs. And when I was a child up north in that area, early in life I
became aware of such energies as the wind, the sun, the water before I even became aware that coal provided those -- also provided energy. And in the morning -- I did my run every morning. I was told about things that were out growing in the morning and then even at noon and in the evening. And in the evenings, it was stories about the different things that lived with us. And so I was told that I needed to be out among them in order to live a beautiful life.

And then later on on the way to school, and of course I went on with my life and eventually I started a family. My two children when they were really small used to go out and play among them -- among the landscape where people have come and built up coal to take home to cook their meals or to keep warm because their maternal grandparents live there, but eventually as time went on, we were told that the Peabody area extended throughout where they live and soon they have to move and now that land is desecrated. We visit there about two or three years ago and we couldn't recognize the land future and going back to the west side to the base of Black Mesa our water ran dry. We couldn't even -- the water that our livestock needs and now the water is
contaminated with arsenic.

When a person from the area dies, usually they die of cancer. And so to me, Peabody did not benefit me at all. None whatsoever. And, you know, I hear about all these beautiful stories about what Peabody did for them but not in my case. So that being said, you know, I would suggest that our tribe do everything possible to go in the direction of using alternative energy. Like I mentioned at the beginning of my testimony, you know, there's wind, sun, water. You know, those are the kinds of energy we have for thousands of years and our ancestors depended on. So that's my statement and thank you for providing this opportunity for me to say what I have to say.

MS. DARR: Okay. Alexander then Vern then AG Martin. Oh, AG. I'm trying to read this. Okay.

MR. OSIF: I have to look at my clock and see what time it was. 3 o'clock. Thank you for an opportunity to talk to your Department of Interior. And, again, welcome everybody to the Navajo and Hopi and the surrounding nations here. I am Navajo, Hopi, and Pima. Wow. I'm an employee of Peabody Coal Company. I'm currently a truck driver. I drive the
big hauling trucks that haul coal which provides many
precious things that you have really in this
building. The clothes we wear, factory that have to
turn electricity on to. You guys, Peabody is good.
NGS is better. Okay. Like I said, I'm born for the
Hopi clan. The concerns with the plant closure, you
know, I've been employed for Peabody for over 35
years. Just hit my 35 mark and you look at these
hands and it can tell you a story. It can tell you a
story of the safety for the mine, the unions. I
guarantee you when the company side hears my name
coming down the hallway, they kind of have a tendency
to sit up in their chair and listen. That as a union
that we have that relationship that we have in
monitors.

The problem with the NGS is look who's
here. Look who's in this room. All the blue shirts.
That's what we represent is a lot of variety and the
union will not go down for that. But, again, my
concern's for the closure of this plant and the coal
mine. Let's look at a great option that we can take.
Let's continue this work between the two and provide
for the southern tribes down here the water. I love
going down here because my boys are all down here. I
love to play golf on the Peabody golf course over
there and I enjoy it. Thank you for the short time we had. Thank you very much.

MS. DARR: Thank you. Yes it's a little short. We're going to hear from everybody. That's more than we thought we were going to do. Vern and then Mr. Martin and then Vernon.

MR. HOUGEUR: My name is Vern Hougeur and I work at Peabody Black Mesa operations for 30 years until I retire and today's service consult with the past Peabody's liaison for us. I want to take this opportunity to thank the Department of Interior for holding this meeting today. We appreciate being able to speak to you today about the Navajo Generating Station and it's importance to the Hopi and Navajo tribes and the entire state of Arizona. I'd like to focus my comments on importance of the power plant and the mine operations too.

Let me start by emphasizing that the Hopi are well -- are self-sufficient and really very resilient. Hopi remain among the oldest living civilization preserving our religion and culture for centuries, the land and its resources. One of Hopi's important resources for more than four decades, the Hopi have used their energy resources for the benefit of our people. As you know, Hopi and Navajo own
coal, fuels the power plant in Page. In turn, the
mine and power plant operations provides central
revenues representing approximately 85 percent of the
Hopi's annual general fund. These funds are viable
for government services and jobs at Hopi, and at Hopi
the vast majority of tribal jobs are within the
government.

In addition to revenues primarily used
for government services, the operation also provides
annual scholarships which include $205,000 for Hopi
students this year. For Hopi ensuring that
opportunity -- that educational opportunities is part
of the traditional teachings. Secures also funds.
The Hopi Education Endowment Fund, one of the most
remarkable programs of its kind in the United States
was put in place to make sure that every Hopi student
can achieve the dream of a college education. The
endowment was established in 2000 using seed money
from the mining operation. It is designed in a
savings account with the intention it will last
forever. Only this income earns them more principal
than untouched. It has been very, very successful
and remains a model for other tribes.

Of course all of this is at risk if the
Navajo Generating Station is forced to shut down
prematurely. If the chief source of funding is lost, Hopi would face very heavy burden. Navajo is also facing enormous hardship. This is why we must work together toward solutions to keep the Navajo Generating Station operating many years into the future. I urge the leadership here today to find common ground that will enable us to achieve this very important goal. Thank you for the opportunity to speak to you here today. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you.

What is your name, sir?

MR. MARTIN: Alan George Martin.

AG Martin.

MS. DARR: Okay. Thank you. I did read it right. And then Vernon over here and then Eugene Platero. Gotcha. All right.

MR. MARTIN: Okay. My name is Allen G. Martin and I'm a greater man at Black Mesa. I came to work there at Black Mesa mine site in 1976 and my dad said there's something going on up there. Go up there and go to work. I was out on the road doing jobs away from my family like people are saying and sleeping alone at night, you know. Miss that and then the kids too. So I went up to the mine and I got hired. This one old man, he really liked the way
I ran the equipment and he said, "Hey, one of these days you're going to retire from here." And so I've got to live up to that.

And what I'm saying is I enjoyed my years at Black Mesa and Kayenta now and I've raised my family like all the rest of my coworkers have said. I have five kids and they have went on. One time they asked me -- they wanted to be like me and I tell them "No." I said, "No, I want you guys to be educated. Go out and have -- get educated in something that you will help in society."

So one went out and became a military man. Retired now. One went out and became a physical therapist and the others became teachers. So they're helping society as a whole on the reservation and helping as a nation as a military person. So I'm very thankful for that and I got the opportunity to raise them with the money I get from working at Peabody. And also I live in Lechee where NGS is. When you say that these days, they'll think you have another woman.

Anyway, I appreciate this. I live in Lechee where NGS is and they wouldn't give me a job. I had to go out on the road and to Black Mesa. Me and my little momma there, Marie, are present. We
had to drive 90 miles one way to get to work. I've been doing it for 42 years and she's right behind me about 38 or something like that. So I want NGS and the mine to stay open so when I retire, somebody's still working so they can pay for my pension. Look at it that way. And also I want it to stay open for the benefit of the young people coming up from -- that are coming in that are getting into the mining business here at Kayenta Mine.

Also these guys are the best. The best people, the best workers. They are professional people. Their mental stabilities, their determination to learn to be overtop of incoming new equipment that are computerized that are joysticks, the whole works. Even drag lines are like that. You have to be -- almost have a masters and college degree to run these things but they do it. They are simply the best people to work for and I'm very proud to be associated with them and I'm one of them and they accepted me and they -- I have to fix the road for them. I run graders. Keep them from going down the lumpy roads and hauling coal. Going down the road, mechanics having a nice smooth road to be on. So I'm proud of these guys and I want the mine and NGS to stay open for as long as possible. All this
technology, renewable energy, the technology of it has not come up to snuff to be equal to coal.

    MS. DARR: Okay. We need to move on.

    MR. MARTIN: I'll just say thank you very much people from Washington and from the state and from Hopi and Navajo Tribe and all of us here appreciate and thank you and that's it.

    MS. DARR: Thank you. I do not want to cut anybody off. I'm really trying to get through all of these cards because I want everybody to be able to speak and we do have a limit on how long we can stay in this room. Okay? So next up is Vernon Masayesva and then Eugene. Where's Eugene again? And then John Begay. Okay. All right. Three minutes. Okay.

    My name is Vernon. I'm not going to tell you my last name. It's too long. I've got three minutes to talk. I saw former chairman. I came all the way here at my own expense early this morning. No one chartered a bus for me or rented a limousine for me to bring here. I had to pay for it, me, so I'm going to say a few things. I have a written statement I will submit with the records -- with the records.

    In 1970 our world was thrown into chaos.
Our world turned upside down. Our sacred lands destroyed. Dynamite started exploding. Water wells sucking up precious water from underground. The most pristine water in the world all coming out. It's still coming out. After close to 50 years, the pumps are still going. The dynamite are still going. Our sacred lands. Our burial grounds, remains of our ancestors blown apart. Our ancestral villages blown apart. Is that right or for what purpose? To bring water here. Water, water, water. You've got to have water to grow a business. That's exactly what happened with Central Arizona Project.

Since CAP started, the gross economic product of the state of Arizona grew by over a trillion dollars. $1 trillion. How much of that went to Hopi and Navajo? Zero. Not one penny, zero. If you add to that the benefits from NGS and the coal mining, my God, we must be -- we must be given the credit for bringing up the world's economic product probably by over a third. And I think it's time for economic justice. We're not asking for charity. We together, all of us, need to come together.

Black Mesa Trust was founded in 1998 to save water for future generations. That was our singular purpose. With that we had to end the coal
mining. We're close to it. Now with Navajo shutting
down, it's going to shut down. It's a dying horse.
Let's accept that. We are not celebrating. Finally,
our umbilical cord is going to be cut. We're going
to get an opportunity to do things differently. All
right? Differently. Chaos has been created, but out
of chaos can come a miracle and that we have -- we
were gifted with the mine, the hands, ability to
communicate by the creator. Let's put that to work.
Let's quit fighting. Come to work and together.
Together. All of us. Cannot only bring economic
justice, preserve our culture, but we can become a
model for the whole world of how utility, energy,
tribes can work together. Together we can be miners.
We're not taking away your jobs. We are looking for
future jobs, better jobs, and we have a plan to do
that and I will submit that for the record for anyone
who wants to read it. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Thank you very much. Okay.
We have Eugene here and then John Begay on deck and
then Jarvis Williams. Okay.

MR. PLATERO: Good afternoon people from
Washington state and Hopi Tribe, Navajo Tribe. My
name is Eugene Platero. I'm a welder, also a drag
line operator, and also I'm a father, a husband,
grandpa and make at -- with the wage I make at Peabody coal, I support my community Kayenta and other communities also and also we bring some of our wages down here when there's PDRs, George Strait concert, Suns game, Cardinals, but I'm a Cowboy fan. But anyway, I support NGS because it's done a lot for me. I've been at the mine 30-plus years and my kids, taking them to school and I was on the road also before I came to Peabody and I guess there's a lot of traveling. There's no benefit. You have to buy your own insurance, but at Peabody we have insurance. We have a package that's been good to us. And being there involved in family activities, birthday parties, graduations, all this and that, you know. But if you travel, you don't have that. You're away from your family three months, four months. So I'm proud to be a father and I'm proud to be a miner and work for Peabody and I'm supporting the continuation of the coal mine and NGS. Thank you.

MR. BEGAY: Hello, my name is John Begay. I'm going to start before she starts my clock. It kind of really hurts when you get to speak last. You've got to say -- the only thing you have to do is introduce yourself. That's it and you're out of here. People said what you're going to say already,
right? Okay. I worked out of state for quite a while, three years, and it's hard working out of state. It really is hard. Your family, you only come back a few days, 12-, 16-hour drive back home and spend one night. That's it. Next day you're on the road again back to work and that's hard. Okay.

When I came to work for Peabody, I learned a lot of things. I learned how to drive equipment, all kinds of equipment, loaders, dosers, graders, big multimillion-dollar machines. Okay. This has given me the opportunity to do that. If an accident happened right now, you guys would be in safe hands. We've got top-rate first responders here, fire rescue, firefighters, rope rescue, highly trained by the best. Trained by Ted Corky, educated. He's top-notch. One of the best guys I know. Okay.

My family -- what this job has given me is a chance to hug my family every day. That's what it's given me. Close to home. Just right there. Good roads. A lot of people benefit. I benefit. My mother benefits. My wife benefits. My son benefits. My daughter benefits. I'm talking from the heart. This is what you're going to take away if you close the mine down and a lot of these younger people. I'm close to retirement age. So I hope you take that
back to Washington.

And I know that the Peabody has helped all kinds of people even though they say they've never been helped. The road is maintained, wide open roads are maintained, highways are up there, water. We get water anytime of the night, 24/7, and the people that have lived there -- it was just trees, mountains, uneducated sheep herders, they benefitted from that. These are people that run multimillion-dollars right off the sheet -- right off the rate sheet. People that were uneducated running million-dollar equipment. That's what Peabody has given. Thank you very much.

MS. DARR: Three minutes exactly.
MR. BEGAY: I started early.
MS. DARR: I have a gentleman I believe named Dale with the last name starting with "S" representing the Hopi Tribe. Gotcha. Okay. You'll be after Jarvis and then Audrey. Audrey starts with an R. I got the timer.

MR. WILLIAMS: Good afternoon everybody. My name's Jarvis Williams. (Speaking in native tongue). My father's side are from Black Mesa so I spent years up there and am a second-generation miner, and so I've been to Peabody twice so this is
my second time around. I've been to Peabody for a
total of seven years. I've been acting, like, the
last three years as their tribal relations manager.
Thank you to the Department of Interior for holding
this important meeting today. I do appreciate being
able to speak about the Navajo Generating Station and
its importance to the Navajo and Hopi people and to
the entire state of Arizona.

As the discussions focus on ways to keep
NGS running well into the future, we must also think
about the mining operations, what our mining
operations mean for our community. I know several of
my fellow miners here have touched upon the community
benefits and I'll just echo some of those same
statements. Peabody has long embraced the good
neighbor policy with the area residents. They
contributed thousands of dollars to in-kind benefits
that have improved the quality of life for its
residents. Many of the services are essential. I'd
like to share a few of them. Free potable water. As
mentioned, there's two water stands out there that
people can pull water from and sometimes we deliver
water for livestock or home use. Someone mentioned
the lack of water. Right now there's many -- what
they call a many mules waterline project. This is a
waterline distribution project that's in its first stage this year. They'll turn the water on and it will serve 41 homes. There are four other phases that will follow totaling about 25 million which Peabody will contribute about 15 million of that. So there are a lot of those things in the pipeline. I still have 35 seconds left.

We operate the only medical plant for miles with a paramedic onsite. First responders. I think we stopped a wildfire there before it got bad and that's because we had mine personnel trained, qualified to handle that particular situation and it worked. We have free coal for home heating. We have a gravel project that we call the "Red Dot Partnership" to partner with the county, the Navajo Department of Transportation, DIA. And so we bring gravel to roads that need maintenance. So there are over 173 miles of roads that we maintain on a daily, weekly basis.

So Peabody does contribute and we are acting as a good neighbor and we try to provide these benefits the best we can because we all are from those same communities and we serve those same people. So with that, I will close and I do support the continued operations of NGS and I hope you all do
your best to work and do those efforts.
Mr. President, I do hope you do that as well. I will hold you to those words that you mentioned earlier. We do appreciate you being here and taking time out of your busy schedule to share your thoughts. Thank you very much.

MS. DARR: All right. After this speaker we have Audrey and then Robert Williams and Randy.

MR. SINQUAH: Good afternoon. My name is Dale Sinquah from the village of First Mesa, council representative and I'm representing Hopi Tribe. I'll do my best to stay to the -- first of all, I'd like to thank the Department of Interior for hosting these listening sessions. We understand that the Navajo Generating Station is an important issue not only for the tribes but also for the whole state, and one of the things, it's complex. There's many stakeholders here and all of that has to be taken into account when we're dealing with this situation here. We want everyone to understand what Hopi has at stake here. The Hopi Tribe is highly relied on -- relies on the Navajo Generating Station. The funds that are given to it for that and the Hopi Tribe is isolated. We're landlocked. It's hard to get economic development out there. We lack just very simple infrastructure.
One of the things that we're trying to get is water regulation for arsenic and we're having problems meeting that requirement. These are some of the funds that are being used for projects such as that. For basic human subsistence is what we're looking at. One of the things that was mentioned earlier was that President Trump had made a pledge to save coal jobs and he also mentioned trying to help tribal tribes. And he's the president of the United States and we thank him for his work, and this is an opportunity that he can stand by this instance right here to do the best that he can, to have his departments to work as hard as they can to find solutions to save coal jobs and also to create subsistence -- economic opportunity for the two tribes by working hard and trying to find ways to continue the lifetime of the Navajo Generating Station. We understand from the Hopi point of view that Hopi -- the U.S. government has a responsibility which we hold -- we understand that the federal government, just like anything, a commitment.

I too was -- I am a veteran and I served in the military and I retired from the military and I came home to help benefit people, but I also made a commitment to the United States. And at that point,
this is where the Hopi Tribe feels that it can just
be explained by a supreme court decision where it
describes the obligation to the U.S. government to
the tribes and the decision is that a nation versus
the United States -- and I'm going to quote where the
federal government declared that the government has
charged itself with a moral obligation of the highest
responsibility and trust for tribal nations.

The trust responsibilities is a sacred
obligation and duty. And for many people who serve
the United States government in many capacities,
that's a personal oath and it means a lot. However,
we understand that the federal government trust
responsibilities is kind of unique here in NGS in
that where it's a partial owner. Almost a quarter of
the ownership in NGS and it gives it an opportunity
here to make a judgment and what it has to do, it has
to balance it being a partial owner for economic
reasons and also to trust responsibility to the two
tribes and that's a tough thing to shoulder and we
hope that you weigh these things out and one will
right the other.

And the federal government has put itself
in that situation and we expect them to fulfill it.
One of the things that the Hopi Tribe will just not
settle, if I understand the economics of it all. However, one thing that's not being factored in is the devastation that's going to happen to the Navajo and Hopi Tribe people that are there. That has to be put into the formula. The considerations of how these tribes use these funds to Hopi, for instance, our tribal government when we fall short on federal funds, we use those funds to shore it up -- new projects to pay personnel. To pay -- give services to our villages to the people. That's where the funds go. It's not a profit that's being made -- so we don't own any golf courses. We don't have any casinos. It's not a luxury for us. It's basic human needs that we're satisfying out there and economic needs too. And if this continues and our pieces -- our economy, the impact to the two tribes isn't taken into account, it's easy to write it off as just a purely economic decision made for business, but I don't think that's what the federal government is all about. It's not just straight dollars. It's about people and that's what we're worried about here, that our people are not going to be taken and put into this solution to find out, to lessen the impact that this thing has.

The Hopi Tribe suffers from about 60
percent unemployment. If this is taken away, it's going to hit our tribal government, and our tribal government is one of the primary employers on our reservation. We're going to have people without jobs. We're going to have to downsize and it's going to have an effect on the local economy. I don't buy my car on the reservation. I just bought a brand-new vehicle. I bought it in Show Low. We travel 2- to 300 miles to make purchases. You go to your local grocery store. I travel 80 miles one way to go buy groceries and where do I buy it at? Flagstaff. I just purchased over $300 just to provide a meal for Mother's Day for all the mothers that I know. So it will impact the local economy.

The Kayenta Mine for the Hopi Tribe has recently -- approximately 200 million in direct economic benefits in 2015 and 800 million have been direct and indirect benefits. This included dollars for royalties, business payments, taxes, water fees, wages, benefits, out services, scholarships, and major income. Also, Arizona State did a study and in their study they say that the state stands to lose 18 million in gross state product if NGS closes, if it doesn't continue till 2044. In addition, Arizona will lose 679 million in adjusted state tax revenues.
leading up to 2044. The fact is you hear from the owners and you hear the impact it has to them and it's a little less -- they can make -- they can give you -- they can operate for less, but it's not taking into account the full impact that it's having to everyday people here, and the miners did an excellent job of representing how it affects a person. How it affects their family. What good comes from the operation of this mine.

And in closing, again, I would like to thank everyone for coming here. And I think if you can see, we all have different issues that we've addressed here and it's going to take every bit of us to come up with a solution for this and I will not discount anyone who opposes because they have a reason, but they need to be at the table too because it's going to affect everyone and this is really what it's going to take. This should not end here in listening sessions. It should continue on into work sessions in how we're going to build our economy out on the reservation. It's going to impact the state of Arizona. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Audry, Robert Williams, and then Randy Lehn.

MR. RAPPLEYECA: Hello. My name is Audry
Rappleyea. I'm the general manager at Kayenta Mine in Black Mesa. First of all, I'd like to thank the Department of Interior for hosting this excellent effort. I want to recognize the miners. They did a great job representing us here today. I have 25 years of experience in the coal mining industries. I've been in my current role at the Kayenta Mine for five years. That's been my goal for 25 years is to have an operation and run it, and it's been a great honor for me to work on the reservation and be part of an operation that contributes so much to the Navajo Nation, the Hopi Tribe, and the people of Arizona.

I think we all understand what's at risk here. The impact to the Hopi Tribe is 85 percent of their revenue for their budget. 22 percent for the Navajo Nation. More importantly, you know, if you look at the people here wearing blue shirts, they represent about 20 percent of our workforce at the mine. Currently we have about 319 folks and we brought about 65 of them down here to convey the message.

I want to set a couple things straight. Kayenta Mine is a world-class operation. We have a strong track record in safety, environmental...
compliance, and sustainable practices. Last year we reclaimed over 500 acres and we reclaimed 5 acres for every one acre we disturbed. This year we're going to exceed 500 acres of reclamation and it's going to be 12 acres reclaimed for every acre disturbed. The land that we leave behind, Myrata talked about it early on. She grazes her sheep up there. That land is 10 times more productive than the land before we got there.

As far as water consumption, our water consumption dropped about 20 percent last year. We went down to about 1,200 acre-feet and that was about 250 acre-feet less than the year prior. I want to emphasize that Peabody believes NGS will continue to be competitive with natural gas and other coal-fire plants over the long-haul. We've come to the table with other stakeholders to help make NGS the most competitive place on the planet and the region. I don't know about you, but my 401(k) is diversified and I think that's what we need to look for is common sense solutions and there's no reason that this plant can't continue to run for decades to come. There's over 200 million tons of reserves left of world-class low sulphur high BTU coal.

Last month we released a study by
Navigant consulting we commissioned to review plant economics. The study was based on Peabody's reduced price fuel and a long-term comprehensive energy outlook versus prices that others have used to evaluate the plant. In 2014 we sold 8.2 million tons and it's progressively gone down. Last year we did 5.7 million, but over that time we've been able to maintain a consistent flat price and that's due in large part to the increased productivity and efficiencies that these miners have done.

So on behalf of all of us at Peabody, I can assure you we'll keep working towards solutions to keep the plant operating for the long-term as intended when this historic project was developed.

Thank you.

MS. DARR: All right. Up next we have Chairman Honanie from the Hopi Tribe.

MR. HONANIE: Good afternoon everybody. I'm certainly privileged and honored to be here this afternoon and I just want you to take everybody here that's -- well, that's here. I presume that everybody that's in the room has got to be reflecting how positive. Just like our guys in blue on the streets. You know, different kind of blue out there. But I know that the closure of the mine has been
sitting on our minds for the past few months and it's
one situation that came upon us really, really fast.
A lot of us weren't prepared. A lot of us weren't
expecting it and a lot of us just didn't hear of it
at all because in prior years, prior months, there
was never no mention of the mine ever shutting down.
There's no plan as far as we were told. And
basically it all came about one day and said based on
economics and based on other factors, it was time for
the closure of NGS by the owners.

So since then and up till now, here we
are today speaking our voice, speaking our respective
voice with respect to the operation of the mine. As
chairman of the Hopi Tribe, I cannot see the NGS
closing at this time. I think we all know that the
life of the mine had been slated for 2044 and here we
are midpoint and we are being told that it's going to
close. There's still resources of coal on the
reservation. Unfortunately, the situation is such
that NGS is the only provider of our coal, both Hopi
and Navajo. But I think Hopi especially is going to
be hurt the most, if I can say that. 85 percent of
our budget comes from royalties for tribal
government. So when we eliminate 85 percent of the
royalty in our budget, you can imagine what's going
to happen. Our already 60 percent unemployment rate is going to go up. Government services will be curtailed. Many of the programs probably will not be funded again, and of course we have 12 villages across the reservation who receive annual allocations from annual budgeting that's probably going to really, really go down if not be eliminated totally, but I know they're going to put up a fight and there's always a need for the villages. They want the delegation so it's going to be tough negotiations if we were to do that.

And like someone else said, our people are going to be hurt very much. I said before that other places that, you know, this is about survival or not. This is really about survival. Unfortunately the situation that we face today on the reservation is that we are so isolated. We can't even so much as depend on tourism. The reality of it is it's just what was stated a while ago. Many of us have to go to towns for goods and services. That's going to be even greater hardship especially for those people who are unemployed at this time.

We have about 250 employees within the tribe who work for the tribal government and I can't imagine if they were all to be laid off. Maybe not
all of them, but a good percentage of them are going
to be subject to that. And their children, their
families, it's going to be a real hardship. But, you
know, again, Navajo is going to get hit with it.
Navajo is going to have a hard time with it, but I
also think about the state. Because the state right
now requires and gets a certain amount of taxes from
the coal operations. So this is not going to be a
regional localized Hopi or non-Hopi.

We were up in Page a few weeks ago. A
lot of business owners, a lot of employees for the
private sector, but the state is going to lose a
certain amount of revenue for the next years. So
really you're here advocating on behalf of the
continued operation of NGS. I join you. The tribe
joins you. We feel that this Page hearing, several
local businesses were there and they held the
hearing, they sponsored the hearing and mutually
attended. Several of us attended it and my message
to them is it was good to see them there and I hope
there's somebody here from the state legislature
because we need to get them involved. We need to get
the government of Arizona involved because the state
itself is going to impact.

So I hope that many messages are going to
be sent and will continue to be sent to the state legislature for the state and of course to the owners and everyone else that are here. We need to keep this plant going. So I really want to thank you all for being here. I know that there's going to be another hearing on Thursday, and I think I'll be able to speak a little longer but I just wanted to be here.

In Tuba City they had a graduation there this morning and driving while I was coming down, my grandson was one of the graduates and so were about 100 other students. And, you know, constantly leaders, parents, everyone else always harking about education. Get that education so you can get a job. Get that education so you can come back to the reservation and take on employment, take on teaching, take on schooling, counseling, whatever profession, but they need that education with our funding and with our ability to provide scholarships. Keep your support up, keep your voices heard, and I hope that we can turn things around. Thank you very much.

MS. DARR: All right. Our time is up. Now, I have 13 more cards. Okay. And I know you all want to speak, but they are literally going to kick us out of here so I've got to have our next speakers
be brief. Okay? Otherwise, the people at the end
will not get to speak because we won't be able to
stay. Okay? So next is Robert Williams who got
bumped for the chairman very graciously and then
Randy and then Steven.

MR. WILLIAMS: Good afternoon all my
community members and the Department of Interior and
all the Arizona delegates that are here and thank you
for being here. And I was invited to speak on behalf
of my coal mining department and Navajo Generating
Station, keep it going, keep it open, and keep it in
operation. Peabody, you know, we can say a lot about
Peabody. And, you know, we can tell a great story
about Peabody, what it does, and what it did. You
know, this is a great history and which is -- you
know, there's -- you know, we could go on and on just
like for myself. Peabody was real good to me. It
did a lot of things for me and, you know, which is --
I was -- I got on that job in 1978.

In 1978 when I got on the mine, I got
hired over at Black Mesa, the first mine that got
shut down, I was there for six months. And at the
time that I got there, there was nothing. The roads
were all dirt roads. It was hardly graded, nothing.
There was no paved road, nothing. And then I checked
around and there's a community and other access road to the mine. There was nothing. You know, there were old lots and, you know, there wasn't anything graded.

So up to this day, you know, I see the Peabody grow and help the community to reach out and help the community so I can see a lot of things different than what Peabody did. So I give a big honor to the Peabody company. What it did for the community and what it did for the workers just like for me. You know, I took -- my kids all went to school down in Kayenta and which is a 1978 or -- the school burned down. The high school burned down. Peabody stepped in and helped them rebuild that high school and lot of our kids went to school there and graduated from there, and from there they graduated and moved on with their higher education which is -- you know, and then from there, you know, we had the best at that school and gymnasium and whatnot.

You know, so we had the -- so we had a routine that came out of the Valley. So when they came down to the state and, you know, took us -- took a lot of trophies and whatnot. So that's what -- we give the credit to Peabody. So there's a lot of things that we can talk about. A lot of these
workers they said a lot of things about Peabody and
other delegates too. Thank you for listening and
running this session. Thank you. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Steven Clitso and then Leonard
Bailey.

MR. LEHN: My name it's Randy Lehn and
I'm with Peabody. I've been with them for 32 years.
I started out in 1985. There's been a lot of
discussions about studies, 5 million plants. As we
know that Peabody's done a study with Navigant and it
shows the plant was economically viable. We've also
heard counters from the Sierra Club that it states
that it is not and also a study by NREL. So all
these studies are all based on one factor and that
factor is natural gas pricing.

Last week natural gas pricing went up 10
percent in one week. Our coal pricing hasn't
fluctuated by that much in four years. That plant
needs to continue to operate just so the state of
Arizona has consistent reliable diversified fuel and
that's all I have to say. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Leonard Bailey and then
Lawrence Oliver.

MR. CLITSO: Good afternoon. I'm an
Indian man from the Kayenta Mine. When I started in
'78 I was a high school senior when Peabody gave me a chance to hire me on, and when I started I was a laborer and Peabody gave me the chance to learn on the job. So I learned doing the trade within that 38 years third shift and I thank Peabody. They partnered with NGS and I strongly encourage you guys, the Department of Interior -- Department of Interior guys that you keep NGS going for years to come. And when I raise my family, I got the paycheck to pay for my own home for my kids to go to school and then finish school and then go on to colleges and universities and then I have a couple boys that went on to do other schooling, but one of my sons, he's a star just like me. Once he got out of high school, he started working. So I just ask that you guys carefully with everybody keep NGS going. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Leonard and Lawrence and then Joe Malala.

MR. BAILEY: Good evening. I'd like to thank the Department of Interior for being present here for our session here to listen to us and what kind of person we are, and I'd like to thank our -- my fellow workers and my employer and all the leaders that are present here. Speaking of leaders, I went to school in St. Johns, Arizona. The individual that
was mentioned in this project that was formed back in the early days in the late '50s which is a legislator Morris Udall and also Stewart Udall. They went to school in St. Johns, Arizona and they became a great leader. Not just for this country, but for also the Native Americans and the individual which was a legislator that he went and passed on 92 years of age, Carl Hayden. And to this day, they gather us here. The project that was formed and that's part of the history that I remember. And so I'm glad I went to that school in St. Johns, Arizona. There's some great leaders that are here.

And also this project at NGS that put -- which will supply the coal to generate electricity and to this metropolitan area here in Phoenix, Arizona and the whole Southwest United States. So I'm delighted to be part of this and I've been with Peabody western coal company for 43 years and I'm the No. 3 man in the seniority and I helped build Kayenta Mine and I stuck with one job for 43 years and never got in trouble.

So this issue about the -- a lot of things that came about, the employment, the benefits, jobs, the unemployment, federal programs, state programs, the native nations program, some of these
are an alarming rate that the unemployment rate is
past 60 now and the crime rate. We see that every
day. The crime rate has alarmingly passed a national
average. Nationally, Baltimore is number one now and
we're in there.

So the revenue is declining, programs,
education, that's the number one source that we rely
on. But the revenues are here, that's declining. We
can't afford it. We raise our children. We raise
our family and these are the leaders from these
stations we'd like to express and beg for keep it up.
Keep this generating station running and also Peabody
western coal. All in all, let's work out a solution,
get the economy in line. And this new administration
from our federal government, the president of the
United States, we'd like to work with him too. Thank
you.

MS. DARR: Lawrence and then Joe and then
Grace Johnson.

MR. OLIVER: Good evening. My name is
Lawrence Oliver and I'm a coal operator at the
Kayenta Mine and also an experienced miner for over
30-plus years and I'd like to thank the DOI. Asking
to express our support for the continued operation of
NGS. Thank you. And I'm with the reservation. We
do around 40 acres per month that we reclaim, topsoil, reseed, and a lot of education, also traditional plants that go into it and do a really good job one because there's some topsoil that we do that we're putting topsoil where there wasn't any topsoil. So we do a really good job with that on the reservation.

And right now we do believe that we usually have basic challenges. Right now try to continue the plant right now and, of course, the shutdown. Lobby hoods and the communities, you know. I'm new at the Kayenta Mine, but I've been there just about three years and come from a mine that closed down five years ago and it's pretty much a burden to most employees. When a mine shuts down, it impacts businesses and the communities. They have a spouse, work members that turn to alcohol and something that you don't want to see and experience. So some have gone through a mine shutdown already with the Mohave plant decommission shut down. The Black Mesa mine was shut down and a lot of these workers have to go out and find jobs. Some of them were fortunate enough they came over to the Kayenta Mine, and right now it seems like they'll be facing another one -- another shut down.
So SRP has been preparing for this for the last 10 years. You know, they've been buying plants, investing in plants in the millions of dollars. And right now I believe they're saying, hey, put that over here and I'm sure they will be over there with the customers. So we do continue. Yes, we had to review our financial plans, business plans for the customers and all that. But if it closes, it does. Well, if it does close down, then do we let it set idle or do we dismantle it? What happens if there's enough surge in gas prices for natural gas?

There's also alternative energy sources that have been part of these conversations. Demand power there and the requirements, it's very minimal under these conditions. Something that nobody wants to hear is that we do come short, you know. Where arrangements are coming, we're going to be placed with employees, financial assistance, low wage loans for refinancing, counseling, retraining. Who's going to be the responsible agency that's going to take care of that? These are the issues that we build under these circumstances and should be something that the interested parties are considering in these continuing debates. So that's something I wanted to
bring across.

I know a lot of people don't want to hear, but as far as President Trump's initiative on buy American and also buy U.S. products, I think that extends to the power from native lands, you know, because we have an obligation to Native America, you know, trust responsibility so I believe that should be priority and extended out to power to Native Americans and Native American lands. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Okay. Joe and Grace and Marie Shepherd.

MR. MALALA: Good evening everybody. I'm Joe Malala. I represent coal miners. My story is the life of the coal miner. Every day when we wake up, we kiss goodbye to our family and we go to work, we don't know if we're going to come back or not. I don't know if the owners of NGS that are leaving realize what we do every day. It's all about blood, sweat, and tears we put into for them to make a lot of money. A lot of money. I don't know if they understand the magnitude. If they close this company and the other company closes too, where are the employees at? It's going to be a ripple effect.

All our kids go to school, our tax money, the tax money from all this company to pay these
teachers, the hospital, everywhere. And believe me, I bet they never thought what they're going to do to the rest of the people up north, you know. We need that money for everybody to survive up north, you know. Both companies really benefit, but these owners are really sad about what they're doing because it's a disgrace for the hardworking people up north. And I hope Trump penalizes them for what they're doing because it's not right. Their decision-making is all about money. I guess that's all the business they're looking at. They don't care about the regular -- the little man. The little man and his family. I hope you guys take it to Donald Trump and explain what these individual owners are doing to us. Thank you for your time. Appreciate it.

MS. DARR: Grace, Marie Shepherd, and then Curtis Yazzie.

MS. JOHNSON: Good afternoon. My name is Grace Johnson and I am from Black Mesa, Arizona. I am a resident near Kayenta Mine. I have been employed as a contractor for Peabody for 16 years and 2 and a half for Peabody. I do appreciate the Department of the Interior holding a meeting for us today and listening about the Navajo Generating
Station and its importance to the Navajo and Hopi people and also the state of Arizona.

I also would like to thank Peabody for giving us the opportunity to be here. What we do at Kayenta Mine is an important part of the success of the Navajo Generating Station. We are proud to be miners. I am -- we are about our jobs and we focus on safety and operational excellence in our areas of work. We also recognize the importance of the power we help create for families and businesses and the power that moves the Central Arizona Project water across the state for the benefit of other tribes and agriculture users.

I wanted to talk about the operational side first and then get to a little bit of the personal. Kayenta Mine has operated for decades under lease agreements with the Navajo Nation and Hopi Tribe. We shipped 28 million tons of low sulphur coal to the Navajo Generating Station this past year. As you know, we are the sole fuel provider for the plant. Safety is Peabody's first value and core to our mission. We deliver a strong safety rating. 0.88 incident per 200,000 hours worked last year. In fact, it is safer to work at Peabody mine than at most major industries.
The Kayenta Mine injected nearly 430 million in direct and indirect economic benefits into the economy last year. This also includes approximately 455,000 in scholarships for Navajo and students from the mining power plants. Based on respect for the land and tribal cultural ways, Peabody agreed to restore mine lands on Black Mesa. Even before the law required it, reclaimed lands are as much as 10 times more productive for livestock grazing and native range and have nutritional value.

Restoration programs and community outreach activities on Black Mesa have been recognized by the U.S. Department of the Interior for good neighbor practices and Reclamation excellence.

Just for the community and as a local resident there, you know, like we talk a lot about water issues and I am a resident there and we -- you know, we do haul water. We should be getting water soon. But we get 24/7, 365 days a year, we can get water and it's just a few miles down the road and these are even open on holidays. And roads again, mentioned earlier, you know, are maintained for the residents. School buses -- school bus routes, they're out early in the morning. At 5 o'clock in the morning we see them on the road, you know.
And you know, like there's violence in the area where we have security onsite in the mine area. So we do have security in the area and we do have, like, ambulance, child service. We do have the paramedic and even, you know, personal experience from that. I have a nephew who was run over by a van and he's still with us today because of the paramedic there onsite who took him to the clinic and he is still with us to this day.

I am a daughter of a coal miner. We lost him several years ago, but my mother is a survivor and she has great benefits and we owe to my father what he has left for her. I am a single parent and I do have children who I have raised, you know, because with the job I have there. I have a home there and I'm not only asking just for myself but for the younger generation. There's a lot of young people out there. So that's who -- I hope, you know, NGS stays open for the kids, my children. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Marie, then Curtis, then Larry Mallahan. Let's try to keep them to, like, two minutes because we're going to get kicked out and I really want to get everybody in here. So out of respect to other people, because some of the people out there are telling me I'm letting you go too long,
so it's hard to cut you off.

MS. SHEPHERD: Marie Shepherd.

(Speaking in native tongue.)

Peabody -- I'm the senior environmental manager at Peabody. I have worked there for five years, and prior to that I have -- including my years at Peabody, I have 22 years of experience in mining. I've been born and raised on the Navajo Nation and I understand a lot of the issues out there. One of the key items that I work is in the area of environmental management. Respect for the air, water, and land is part of my culture and heritage. It is important to me as a member of the Navajo Nation to make sure we are managing resources in a respectful and sustainable way that will leave a lasting legacy for the next generation. I have extensive training in engineering environmental and I am proud that we mine coal at Kayenta Mine in an environmentally respectful manner.

Our mine has earned many awards for reclaiming mine lands in a way that is -- that also preserves cultural -- our cultural ways. I'd emphasize that all of our activities are done in the best way for the tribes. More than 8 percent of the land we have mined have been reclaimed thus far. We
use state of the art technology and seed makes us to return land to conditions that took place 10 times more productive for livestock raising than the range prior to us mining it.

So we have mined over -- reclaimed -- over 15,000 acres have been restored for raising wildlife habitat and plant cultural cultivation to date. Last year we reclaimed at a ratio of 5 to 1 as mentioned by other folks here versus the land we have disturbed. Many of the locals say they can tell which lands are reclaimed because they are the greenest and the hardiest. We collaborate with area residents to promote good range management practices and work with them to restore lands available for grazing their livestock.

Our team has established award-winning programs to restore cultural plant use for municipal uses and ceremonial needs. This is an important program to preserve cultural practices. Again, I would like to -- in closing I'd like to thank the department for being here to listen to our voices, and there's always folks that say -- that talk a lot about the destruction that might be associated with mining, but there is a back end there, that we have a lot of people working at the restoration end and
making sure that we restore the land better than when
we first arrived. So thank you for your time.

    MS. DARR: Curtis Yazzie, Larry Mallahan,
and Daryl Long.

    MR. YAZZIE: Good evening everyone. My
name is Curtis Yazzie. I've worked at Kayenta Mine
for six years now and I'm from Black Mesa. I live
right where they started mining back in 1970, early
'70. When I was a little kid, I used to ride my bike
out there. Big mining equipment, gotten used to
that. It was a dream of mine to work at the mine and
six years ago was able to do that, get a job with
Peabody.

    And as a father -- I have three children
and it's my responsibility to provide for them. With
the job I have, I'm able to do that. I have a son in
college. I have two younger daughters that are going
to school. I am encouraging them to pursue higher
education and I'd like to work close to where I live.
And it fills my heart with joy when I'm able to see
my children's every single need and that I'm able to
attend their school activities and to attend their
sporting events and raising some future Valley
Mustangs.

    And I'd like for you guys to really
consider keeping Navajo Generating Station in operation for many years to come. And I got hired with some Navajo people and they're currently very good workers and I've learned a lot from them. My fellow brothers and sisters and our Hopi brothers. They said they need to keep the generating station open. Also they're dependent on it and so are we are. We support our families. They do a lot for our community because I live there local. Right there where the mine's at. They keep the roads clear during the winter. They plow roads early in the morning. The reclamation people do a good job. They put gravel on the roads to keep -- prevent accidents. Also, all the local people get their roads graded. We get water up there. We have access to drinking water for ourselves and for the livestock, and I'm beginning to get back into livestock that my parents used to do. And I really enjoy teaching my children and hopefully in the future they can come back and take over for me once I get old and my life changes, retirement at Kayenta Mine. Thank you for your time.

MS. DARR: Larry then Daryl Long then Irwin Smith.

MR. MALLAHAN: Good afternoon. I'd like
to thank the Department of Interior for allowing us
to have this listening session or inviting the
employees to come out here. Just a couple of things
I'd like to cover. The benefits from mining at this
current, but in the past we have a lot of money going
into the general fund. 22 percent, 85 percent.
Those are money that goes into service.

My question is, if the mine shuts down
and NGS shuts down, who's going to come up with that?
Who's going to cover that void for the services for
our people? You've heard here already the benefits
that we want as workers, but what about the rest of
the tribe? Where is that money going to come from?
If this generating station shuts down this year or in
two years, who's going to cover that? That's taking
a quarter of all the services for the Navajo Tribe
and just shutting it down. 85 percent for the Hopi
Tribe. Who's going to cover that? Time is of the
essence here to make that decision to say we need to
keep that generating station going and Navajo
Generating Station is an efficient power plant. It's
different than other power plants. It's a super
critical power plant. It's more efficient.

You know, some of the benefits from coal
mining, the scholarships have benefitted from that.
We talk about technology. How are our kids going to fix that technology if there's less money in scholarships? NGS, Peabody, they contribute to that. Knowledge, you can't put a price on that. Education, you can't put a price on that. We need to keep that mine open, that power plant going. That's what I'm asking. Time is critical. It's a short time. You better make that decision. I realize there's a lot of different thoughts that came. That's democracy. Thank you for the opportunity to speak our minds. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Daryl and then Irwin Smith and then Andrew Lane.

MR. LONG: Yeah, I've been sitting here long. The miners at Kayenta Mine are the very fabric of the Navajo Nation. Most of us don't have a traditional four-year college degree, no masters, no doctorate. We do what we have to do and we work hard for it. Hard work is engrained in our DNA. For whatever reason, the Navajo people gravitated to vocational trades such as welding, iron working, operating, carpentry, masonry, and mechanics, and often general labor.

I'm not saying that we all specialize in formal fields because we also do that, but it is not
the secret about the workforce impact that we have on 
construction industrial workforce. I represent the 
younger generation at Kayenta Mine. We're 
outnumbered but we are still around and more to come. 
I am 27 years young and I want to live on my land in 
the sacred mountains. I am in the process of 
building my future. Let us build our future. Give 
us enough time to build. I am a second-generation 
coal miner. I am also a second-generation mechanic. 
Maybe one day I'll be a second-generation solar and 
turbine operator, but until then, we mine it and we 
mine it good. Thank you.

MS. DARR: Irwin and then Andrew.

MR. SMITH: Hi, good afternoon. I'm 
Irwin Smith. I'm with Peabody coal company. I've 
been in the coal mining industry for the past 27 
years and I've been working various departments in my 
career and I have learned to -- technologies in 
different areas during my career and I'd love to see 
Peabody coal and this year for our future keeping the 
power plant open and the continuation to have our 
jobs there for us 20, 30 years from now. As far as 
the younger generation goes, they can benefit a lot 
from, you know, this whole company and power 
generation plant.
I did have an opportunity to work there at NGS also and both sides of the world to give me that experience and I know how, you know, it affects a lot of people without no jobs. I have the opportunity and I realize how important it is. There's people here -- you know, you hear all day their effects on the economy and their livelihoods and we don't want to travel a long ways having to go out and look for work. We'd like to be stable where we're at another 20, 30 years. Thank you for listening to us. We appreciate your time.

MS. DARR: We have one more comment and then we all need to get out of here because we're getting texts from people, "Get out of our room." So one more. Andrew?

MR. LANE: My name is Andrew Lane, U.S. Army Reserve. Most just recently graduated from Arizona State University with a master's degree in sustainable solutions. I want to thank everybody. First off the Department of Interior for letting us come speak to our elected officials. In this case, the representatives thereof. I've been in Iraq and Afghanistan where people there wouldn't even dream about such an occasion without losing their limbs or their life. The Army understands climate change as
does the Navy and Air Force and the Pentagon. Even
under our current president, General James Mattis, he
talks in the senate confirmation hearing about
climate and reality and taking climate action because
it's going to save troops' lives when they're in
combat and in training.

I'm all about keeping the Navajo
Generating Station open as well with wind and solar.
The last thing we need to do is burn coal. It's a
simple matter of science. If I can go back for a
second, first off referring to Navajo, hearing Navajo
actually on the air is humbling for me. One because
I vote for the Native Americans in every movie I've
ever seen because I believe a white man has screwed
the Native American so many times. And I would say
Peabody coal might be a British company. I don't
know. Might happen again, but I associate with the
language of Navajo. That's how we defeated -- one
critical ingredient how we defeated the Japanese
because they couldn't figure out -- Navajo and yep,
there she went.

So I want to talk a little bit about
Tesla. The islands of Hawaii and the island of Kauai
has installed 13 megawatts of solar with battery
storage. That's 100 percent electricity, baseline,
night line, whatever. It's there. And that's about
1.6 million gallons of diesel fuel that Hawaii no
longer needs in their electricity. Arizona State is
soon to be 150 percent powered by the sun. It's all
about solar. In fact, if you listen to him on
climate change, he says if we don't change where
we're going, we're going to be enforcing agony.
There are far more jobs in clean renewable energy,
far safer jobs. Take a moment and go to OSHA's web
page and look for fatalities in the workplace.
You'll find one for coal once in a blue moon, you'll
find a couple in Detroit from General Motors or Ford,
but mining, not necessarily your mining, but oil and
gas is extremely dangerous as well. We can easily
find those guys and the ladies and the deaths.
Whereas renewables, I can't find any and I've looked
for a year or two. Can't find any in a year.

The ocean scene is simplified. It's not
rocket science. We take carbons down in one of the
earth's crust for millions of years, we burn it and
put the residue back in the atmosphere, that is
fractionally acidifying the ocean and warming the
planet. If we continue to acidify the ocean, we can
go ahead and forget about any and all shellfish that
live there. That includes fish and any and all
creatures that interact with the shellfish, predator or prey. If you like seafood, and there's about a billion people on the earth who depend on the ocean for their protein.

For people who are challenging the climate science, I've explained the kids' version of it, go to YouTube and look at Emily Schwart in the fifth grade talking about carbon dioxide as greenhouse gas and its effect in temperatures in your kitchen. Coastal cities are already feeling this. Miami and Baltimore in particular are feeling this. You can see it in the recent documentary of years of living dangerously. You know, Norfolk, Virginia is having a hard time with it because it's starting to cause bad trouble.

If we don't get renewables, India and China will feed us and we will be back here -- not to make fun of you guys but -- playing with coal. It's not good. Most of you came here in gas cars. I came in an electric car -- electric car. We need electricity. We can generate electricity in a myriad of ways. And this is my final statement. I deeply respect Native Americans. I'd kiss all of your feet. Literally, I will, your hands. But they say they make their decisions thinking about generation seven
-- generations down the line. And so I'm going to ask everyone here to think about the following generations because this means clean coal because of the things I've said. Thank you.

MR. CAMERON: I'd like to thank everyone for coming out today. That was our last speaker, I think. A couple points I would like to make before they lock the parking lot on us here. First of all, Secretary Zinke has had a great relationship with Indian tribes in Montana. He feels very strongly about wanting to extend a positive relationship with the Navajo, with the Hopi, with the Central Arizona Project tribes. The Department is doing everything we possibly can, pulling out every stop, being as creative as we can to think of ways to keep the Kayenta Mine at NGS operating. I want to let you know that.

Finally, there were a lot of fathers and mothers talked today about how important the Kayenta Mine, Navajo Generating Station has been to the ability to provide for their families. I'm a father myself. I really appreciate those remarks. And Benny, good luck with your 1-year-old.

(The proceedings concluded at 4:47 p.m.)
STATE OF ARIZONA 
) 
) ss.
COUNTY OF MARICOPA )

I HEREBY CERTIFY that the foregoing was taken before me, JANICE GONZALES; that all proceedings had upon the taking of said hearing were recorded and taken down by me on a steno machine as backup and thereafter reduced to writing by me; and that the foregoing pages contain full, true, and correct transcript of said record, all done to the best of my skill and ability.

WITNESS my hand this 25th day of May 2017

Janice E. Gonzales
Certified Court Reporter No. 50844
for the State of Arizona