Second Mesa, Arizona
May 18, 2017
11:11 a.m.

REPORTED BY:
DANIELLE C. GRIFFIN, RPR
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50296

PREPARED FOR:
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF INTERIOR

(Original)
TRIBAL COUNCIL LISTENING SESSION was taken on May 18, 2017, commencing at 11:11 a.m. at the Veteran's Memorial Center, Second Mesa, Arizona, before DANIELLE C. GRIFFIN, a Certified Reporter in the State of Arizona.

APPEARING:

AS MODERATOR:

CENTRAL CREATIVE
By: Ms. Kristin Darr
24 West Camelback Road
Suite A-479
Phoenix, Arizona 85013-2529

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR
BUREAU OF RECLAMATION
By: Ms. Leslie A. Meyers, P.E.
Ms. Sandra Eto
Mr. Kevin L. Black, Sr.
6150 West Thunderbird Drive
Glendale, Arizona 85306-4001

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR
BUREAU OF RECLAMATION
By: Mr. David M. Palumbo, P.E.
1849 C Street, Northwest
MS-7069-MIB
Washington, D.C. 20240-0001
Joanna Austin-Manygoats
Navajo Language Interpreter
MS. KRISTIN DARR: Good morning, everybody. We're going to start a little late, just because we switched locations. So we'll get some people signed in, and then we'll get started.

Remember that if you'd like to speak, you need to fill out a card that looks like this, and they're at the front desk. And then you turn it into them, and then they'll get it to me. Okay? So a card if you'd like to speak. We'll get started in a little bit.

(Brief recess.)

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. To start off, good morning, everybody. My name is Kristin. I'll introduce myself later, but Chairman Honanie was going to make some welcoming remarks.

CHAIRMAN HERMAN HONANIE: Good morning, everybody. First of all, a lot of thanks and appreciation to the civic center staff for quickly being able to accommodate us. It was at the last minute. So where is Ice? Take a bow, Ice, and your staff.

(Native language spoken.)

And I want to welcome everybody here this morning for this hearing regarding the NGS. It's an important matter. It's a significant matter, and I can judge by everybody's interest, concern, and just maybe wanting to learn more about what the discussions are with
regard to the NGS.

And I think this is going to be the third of a series of hearings that the folks up here in the Department of Interior are holding across the region. Tomorrow may, as I understand, be the final one in Window Rock. So if you have the drive and the time and the energy to drive to Window Rock, feel free to do so. They had one a couple of days in Phoenix at the Heard Museum and now and then, I believe, yesterday at Page.

But this is an opportunity for you all to come forth and voice your opinion. Voice your concerns or questions. And as I stated, to learn about the situation and the matter. So the DOI and the Department of Interior, the folks up here are here to listen. They want to learn firsthand from you, the people, who you feel you're indirectly impacted positively, negatively or in between.

But it's been very interesting. I attended the Phoenix session a couple of days ago, and it was very, very interesting to hear what many people said.

As you can see, all the guys wearing T-shirts that are blue are miners from the Kayenta mine, and obviously they have a certain perspective and a certain interest in this whole matter. And I think I'd like to say that as far as Hopi is concerned, NGS is a bloodline for us when it comes to revenue. And I think some of us will
probably express that, expound on that more and more
because that bloodline is our source of livelihood as far
as tribal government is concerned.

As far as sharing of resources to the village
is concerned, as far as the employment is concerned. So
there's a far reaching effect with this matter and the
concerns arising in that capacity.

So but I wanted to just welcome you all.
Welcome to Kykotsmovi who are out of the town, to our
Navajo friends. And welcome and take part in the hearings,
say your piece, say your mind. The floor is open, and
we'll go ahead and get started.

So I'd like to call on you to go ahead and
continue. So (native language spoken). Thank you for
being here.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you, sir.
Okay. Once again, my name is Kristin Darr.
I'm an independent contractor. And I am here to be your
third-party neutral moderator for this session. So many of
you are old friends of mine now, because this is our third
hearing, our listening session together.

But I want -- for those of you who don't know
me, my job is to make sure that these people from the
Department of Interior get to listen to you. And that
means that each and every one of you who wants to speak
within the time frame that we've allotted. And we're going
to give preference, obviously, to people who we haven't
heard from yet, but I'm sure we'll hear from some of you
again, and we'll welcome that.

Before we get into that listening session,
David Palumbo with the Bureau of Reclamation is going to
give a presentation. And then this is Leslie Meyers also
with the Bureau of Reclamation. So Dave's going to give a
short presentation, and then we'll start.

So remember that if you want to speak, to
fill out, please, a speaker card and hand it and there at
the front entrance there. That helps us keep everybody in
order and keep things moving so we can hear from as many of
you as possible.

One more thing. We have interpreters from
the Navajo language and the Hopi language. So if you'd
prefer to speak to us in your native language, then they
can provide the English translation to the court reporter.
And they'll do that after you speak upon your -- if you
would like that. So they are here. Joanna is our Navajo
interpreter, and Clark our Hopi interpreter.

Okay. So don't forget we've got that
available to you.

Okay. Dave?

MR. DAVID PALUMBO: Thank you, Kristin.
Thank you, Chairman Honanie, for your opening remarks.

My name is David Palumbo. I'm a deputy commissioner for operations for the Bureau of Reclamation within the Department of the Interior. And Leslie Meyers is a Phoenix area office manager for the Department of the Interior that has responsibilities for many things, including to these Navajo Generating Station and the Central Arizona Project.

We're very pleased to be here with you to listen. As the chairman indicated, we want you to speak your mind, to speak your piece, as the chairman indicated, and share that with us.

I'm going to go over a couple of process points in just a minute, and I'll identify an email address that you can use to send in your comments, if you wish to do that in writing, to supplement what you say, to substitute what you say, in lieu of saying anything, however you'd like to communicate that with us, we are more than welcome and eager to get that feedback.

Let's go to the next slide.

So as was indicated earlier, this is the third of four listening sessions. Obviously we're in Kykotsmovi, and thank you for the hospitality for us being here. Tomorrow we'll be in Window Rock for the last listening session.
Again, the purpose here is to hear from you. We're not going to be answering questions today but we want to hear from you. We want to have that part of the record. And so that's very important. We want to optimize the time that you have here with us today to speak to us.

So a few items on process, most of which have been covered already. Fill out a speaker card if you wish to speak. We're going to be limiting the comments to three minutes without interpretation, six minutes with interpretation today, so we can get as many folks in as possible.

Again, I have already indicated the email the address. It's very simple, NGS@USBR.gov. And maybe just to punctuate, we have a court reporter here, thank you, working extremely hard to record everything that's said so we can reflect on it.

Leslie and I will be taking notes, but we'll be able to refer to the record that's created here today as well as other leadership within the Department of the Interior.

So a little bit of background. I know most folks know all of these facts that are on the screen, and I'd like to go over them with you just to make sure.

Navajo Generating Station is a 2,250 megawatt coal fire power plant. There's three units there, three
stacks that operate outside of Page, Arizona, on Navajo Nation trust lands.

The current lease was originally signed in 1969. It was for a 50-year term. That term ends December 22nd, 2019. There -- I'll talk about the EIS here in just a minute.

The coal for the Navajo Generating Station is supplied exclusively by Kayenta mine operated by Peabody Coal. It's roughly 80 miles away from Navajo Generating Station. The coal is transported via an electric railroad. And that mine is located on Navajo Nation and Hopi tribal lands.

In 2014 we began an environmental impact statement process to extend the lease from the end of 2019 to the end of 2044, 25-year lease extension. That was built into the original lease. And we call that a discretionary extension. So we had to go through an environmental impact statement process. Late last year we published a draft environmental impact statement as a result.

A little bit about the Navajo Generating Station participants. There are six participants, including the Bureau of Reclamation. We have a 24.3 percent stake in Navajo Generation Station. Salt River Project is the operator of the facility. They own
our share for the use and benefit of the United States.

And as you can see there, the other owners are listed and
their percentages of their entitlement are included there
as well.

So current status. Current status is really
that in February of this year the non-U.S. owners, those
that were listed on the previous slide, decided that they
would not continue with the Navajo Generating Station post

They indicated that they would operate the
facility through the end of 2019 if certain agreements
could be reached that would allow for the decommissioning
of the facility after 2019. There's ongoing activities
that I'll get to on the next slide with respect to getting
to 2019 as well as getting past 2019.

So after that announcement in February, the
Department of the Interior got together. We decided we
would begin a stakeholder and outreach process. So May 1st
we had our first meeting, and we embarked on what I would
call three parallel paths, that aren't mutually exclusive.

The first parallel path that we embarked on
is getting to 2019 as I indicated. That's principally an
agreement between the Navajo Nation and the Salt River
Project, again, to operate the facility all the way until
the end of 2019 and allow decommissioning thereafter. So
we're working very hard with that. The Department of Interior is helping with that process. We have folks working on it as we're speaking, so trying to get to that point where we can operate the facility post 2019.

Then there's an initiative to look at economic ways to operate the facility post 2019, looking at the economics at the plant, at the mine, elsewhere, factors that are impacting the economics at the facility. Folks, including the Department of Interior are working on that, we're looking -- working with the stakeholders identifying potential new owners we well as potential new customers.

That's the second parallel path that's ongoing.

The third parallel path is -- and it's a path that we've been on for quite some time -- is how can we minimize any negative impacts to those who currently receive benefits from Navajo Generating Station when it closes irrespective of the time, whether that's 2044 or 2019 or somewhere in between.

Also, an extremely important initiative that we're undertaking at the Department of the Interior with stakeholders to, again, identify ways for economic development to minimize negative impacts.

And with that, again, is the email address for you to send in written comments.
Turn it back over to Kristin, and we'll get started.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you, Dave.

Let's see. So once again, we are -- I'm going to be timing -- I know you all call me the three-minute girl. I know this. I heard it. And that you were glad I wasn't in line at the bathroom today.

So but in all seriousness, the reason that I do that is to try and get as many of you to be able to speak as possible. So let's all work together on that.

What I'm going to do is I'm going to call a name, and then I'm going to call a second name. And the first name I call will come up and speak. I'll indicate to you when you've hit your three-minute mark. The second name that I call is our on deck speaker. Okay?

So the first name is Leonard Selestewa.

Okay. And then the second name is Cliff Balenquah. Okay. Right there. All right.

And you get to test the microphone. Is it working? Okay. I'll come help you.

MR. LEONARD SELESTEW: Okay. Good afternoon, everybody. My name is Leonard Selestewa. I come from the Village of Lower Moenkopi up here in northern Arizona near Tuba City, my neighbors to the north.

I'm here representing our stakeholder
thoughts on the closure of Navajo Generating Station and how it impacts our village allocations, but also brief comments to be made in regards to where it all began and where we all find ourselves today.

I grew up in the Moenkopi area all my life. I'm a farmer, and I'm an artist. That's been my bread and butter most of my life. I've called my village my home for over 54 years.

But how this all began in terms of the history of our area known as the Black Mesa region, coal and water, our natural resources, water being the most precious of all with the closure of Mohave, at least it kept our homeland intact.

Now, we have a precious resource also found in coal. And over these many, many years, the State of Arizona and the departments of the federal bureaucracy in Washington have allowed mining to -- of this coal, of this natural resource to produce electricity for basically the energy needed to pump water uphill known as the CAP.

Now, this has gone on since you mentioned, 1970. Now, when you look at the history of it all, it's roughly almost 40 years that others have benefited. They have benefited from Native American people. So I'm not really here to talk about necessarily where the negative impacts began and where they lie now.
I think that with all this time that the state and the federal departments in Washington in allowing this to go on and at this stage of the closure, we seem to be forgotten. I need the Department of Interior to understand that some of this goodness and kindness and the work involved in utilizing our natural resources has to at some point reciprocate back to us tribes.

My neighbors who surround us, the Navajo and especially the Hopi, we're looking at development, yes, but not on the grand scale that our neighborhood tribe is looking at.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: You're at three minutes, sir.

MR. LEONARD SELESTEWA: Okay.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

MR. LEONARD SELESTEWA: So in whatever we look at in terms of possible replacement of energy development on Hopi, I'm hoping that the Department of Interior looks at their rights on transmission lines that are located close to my village and close to our tribal lands be looked at in a manner that it is fair to both tribes.

I say this not in pleading and begging anyone here today in terms of hoping that this will be looked at in terms of how things can be fairly shared by both tribes.
Anyway, I appreciate this little short time that you gave me, but my village is in the process of trying to assess the impact that is going to be coming our way. So I'm hoping that you can also lend some assistance in technical help in developing energy development on a known piece of land on Hopi as known as the Moenkopi Island. And that's where I hail from, and that's where my comments are from. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Cliff. Okay. And then Lewis Pavinyama.

MR. CLIFF BALENUUAH: Good morning, everyone.

(Native language spoken.)

I thank you for this opportunity. First I'm going to say there is a trust responsibility that is very prominent here. The Bureau of Reclamation and the U.S. government has put us into this situation, not the only the Hopi tribe, but our surrounding Navajo tribal members.

I saw up in the screen about minimizing economic effects that it's going to have. I'd like to see these listings -- or those listings that you do have because these are going to be very unique to Hopi as you can tell by our remote situation. We must travel a hundred miles to Flagstaff, 80 miles to Winslow for any of our supplies that we do need.

Not only that, but the biggest effect is
going to be on our children. We do have students here. We
do have a lot of people here that really want to have a
good solid American life. And I believe that once this
closure happens, this just going to really, not only put
the Hopi people in a the bind, but also surrounding
neighbors and user. Not only these tribes, but also the
State of Arizona.

I'm looking at probably almost 700 million
plus in state tax. And I know the Hopi tribe, we used to
get about 200 billion, and I'm sure it's more than that.
And you can imagine that. I can't even speak what a
hundred dollar bill looks likes, much less think about
numbers in those sizes. So everything that is happening at
the mine is going to be devastating.

Now, I say this with a little bit of effort,
because again, there is a trust responsibility that the
federal government has to American Indians. You came, you
saw, you want, you dug, you made your money off of our coal
and water and now you're going to leave us like this? I
really don't think so.

There is more responsibility from you all
that we need to have. This country, this country here -- I
don't have to go into that, but this country knows what
this is all about. We already know. Yes, like a mother,
we can nurse from our -- like a child, we can nurse from
our mother.

But on the other hand, we can't leave it just like that. And if you know what I'm talking about, I don't think it's going to take anymore than that.

But the other thing is that economic development at this level, at our level, would have to be something that's going to be viable, sustainable. We have plenty of coal here on Hopi. And I think there's some ideas, and as a matter of fact, technology that BOR has that you can come in and implement.

These are some things that we can't always say we can do it now simply because of technology and funding.

Outside of that, I want to thank all of you for coming and giving us the opportunity. And I trust that the United States government will not let down the Indian tribes again, primarily Hopi. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Okay. Lewis, and then Cliff Kaye.

MR. LEWIS PAVINYAMA: (Native language spoken.) Just like to say that I retired from the mine two years ago now. It was a happy feeling. And today it was almost like a family reunion to see all my workers here with me or used to work for me.

I just like to point out that today or when
we were growing up, we were taught, we were told by our parents, "Look both ways before you cross. Look up and down. Look up and look down." But I learned from that as of today that when we look to the side, where are we going? When we look at this side, is there a greener grass there? We have to take our pick. We can't just look back and forth all the time.

When we look up, we look at you, our government, the United States of America. You're still holding us. We trust in you. We trust you that you will make things better for all Native American Indians throughout the world. When we look down, we look at our kids, our grandkids, kids that are still coming to see what kind of world they're coming to.

Every one of us benefit from electricity. Today I don't think our grandkids can't go without watching TV, playing video games. Those are the days when we used to sit in the dark.

My people, they benefit from this coal. Every village that is on this Hopi reservation benefits from it. During ceremonies that's the only thing that will keep us warm.

Today, elders, I come from village of Kykotsmovi. Our community workers even go up there to get coal for the elderlies just to keep warm. So we're asking
everybody that today is benefiting from this. And I would really ask you to reconsider, but it's really up to us as Native Americans to how are we strong about these issues.

One last member, like I said, just like a family reunion. When I used to work, we talked about teamwork, work together. Communication is the key to work success. Thank you.

(Native language spoken.)

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Cliff Kaye, and then Edith Simonson. Edith?

Where is Edith? Great. Thank you.

MR. CLIFF KAYE: Good morning.

(Native language spoken.)

My name is Cliff Kaye. I come from the village of Moenkopi. I'm here on behalf of our village of lower Moenkopi representing our village government and our jurisdictional interests that we have in that area.

Our village, the Village of Moenkopi, is right next door to Tuba City, and it's the closest Hopi village to NGS.

And the gentleman right before spoke to we've all the benefited from electricity. Yes, that's true, but not in our whole lifetime. I grew up in a household with no running water, no electricity. And all my life I've traversed back and forth between my village and the
village -- or it's not a village it's a city, going to Phoenix. And there's all these power lines that go down that way.

And when I was growing up, I didn't know what that was. You know, and it's not until later that we realized that because of Hopi coal, Hopi water, that our urban areas in our state, outside of our state have been benefiting off of all of that. And we go back to our communities. We're right next door. We don't have any of those benefits. Nothing has come.

And when it's talking to these points of your trust responsibility, where is your presence? The only presence we have is when something like this comes about, where, you know, we're running into a problem.

We've had all these areas, and you don't come to our communities. So what I'm saying is, we're glad you're here, but it's been a long time in coming to have that communication like the gentleman had said.

So with that said, going forward to minimize and mitigate the economic impacts that are going to be had, our village desires for those points to be really relayed to us and provided to us in terms of how those impacts -- you know, how that energy all that water, all those things, how is that going to be supplemented? How is that revenue going to be supplemented?
And to have our village have an active role in possible energy development, because energy plans, whatever we can do in terms of the existing infrastructure that is abutting right next to our land.

So that's really the message that I want to convey here, at least, that our village is aware of this situation, and we'd appreciate continued communication from your agencies. We've already had Mr. Kevin from BOR come out to us, and we've heard a brief presentation on some of the planning that the forethought that's coming out.

So just so you're aware that our village is interested to hear more about those plans.

(Native language spoken.)

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Okay. Edith, and then Cal Johnson, Colonel?

Cal? Johnson?

Is it Cal? Caleb. Okay. Thank you. All right.

MS. EDITH SIMONSON: (Navajo language spoken.)

THE INTERPRETER: My name is Edith Simonson. I am Navajo. I live -- I live at Big Mountain area. I'm a mother. I'm a grandmother. I was born and raised upon the Black Mesa area. I still live there. I have grandchildren and grandchildren to come in the future.
I always think, what are they going to -- how are they going to live? What are they going to strive to make a good life for themselves? I don't work. I've been living the old ways that I was taught by my parents. I live on the traditional ways of raising livestock. Off of the livestock the wool is used for rugs, making rugs and supporting my children. That is how I have been a mother. I don't get any handouts or assistance from the government.

I am now thinking about the next generation. I don't just think about myself. Most precious of all is water. We've wasted a lot of water on the mesa. We've dug up our Mother Earth, and she is suffering.

I want to continue to teach the old ways of life because that is how I strive in today's world. Some of our children will never come back to living the old ways, but there is life in these teachings.

On a daily base, the coal are burning. They ignite and cause health problems. I've seen a lot of risk and health problems in my days.

Living in the old ways is not the same. Everybody has outgrown that. The world has become crazed with -- with ill struggles of life. Nobody heeds to the teachings anymore. We're like a bait. We get thrown out there, and we suffer the consequences.

If you want to keep the NGS open, do not
touch our coal resources or the water resources. Leave that for us. You can get your energy and economics parallel from other places. I do not want to have our coal and our water used if NGS is to continue.

My animals, my livestock, all the way down to the insects is suffering. They've been here. They've been here with us, but now they're suffering.

For an example, I haul water that costs me money. Every time I pour -- I put the water out for the livestock, the deer come in to drink. Other animals come in to drink that same water that I have bought.

That is my comment, and I thank you for giving me this opportunity to speak. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

Caleb Johnson. And then Spencer Pavinyama.

MR. CALEB JOHNSON: Deputy commissioner, tribal chairman, to me this presents a great opportunity for the Navajo tribe. USBR or Navajo or the power plant that's located on the Navajo property. So the Navajo tribe has a great opportunity at this particular time.

My opinion is that they should take up this opportunity and buy the plant and run the plant for us as long as they are capable. The only question I have is whether they have the capability to run the power plant, but I think that's the best option that is presented here.
The second thing that needs to happen is that the mining operations by Peabody should phase out and let the tribes do that process of mining.

And, finally, the third option is to build a railroad up to the mine and transport the coal to Japan. Japan has expressed an interest in this coal, Hopi coal, because of its low sulfur and high Btu. That's the kind of coal that they are looking for.

There will always be a need for electricity. There will always -- and we all -- and there are millions of tons of coal up here in that area.

So the only question that is before us today is whether that plant should continue to operate. And like I suggest, my recommendation is that the Navajo tribe buy that plant, manage it, operate it, so that it will continue while other phases of this program continue to be explored.

I think that's the best option that I can see. I've read all the articles in this situation, and it seems to me that the best option that I can see is that the Navajo tribe buy the plants, manage the plants for as long as they can, and provide employment for their people.

As far as the Hopi tribe is concerned, about 90 percent of the income comes from the royalties of the coal. We don't get much of that royalty from the plant. But if the plant shuts down, we will not be able to get the
royalties that we need to operate the tribal government.

Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Spencer, and then Melvin George?

MR. SPENCER PAVINYAMA: Good morning, everybody. Good sign. This is the sign I use when I was working at Peabody. It's going to be just like a safety meeting for me, what I do with my employees when I was a supervisor at Peabody. I worked for Peabody for 37 years. And I was one of the lucky ones. And I had a chance to retire from Peabody.

When we look at all of these issues that goes on, I'm glad that the people, the employees at the mine, they're the voices of people and going around talking. If we just sit home and talk about this, nobody will ever hear us, what we want.

We all know we got resources underneath us to benefit the Native American Indians. That is ours. And when we see ours, in this all these issues that's coming about, it's got us advantages, disadvantages.

These are the things that we need to put aside and go after what's going to be good for the people, our children, our grandkids, kids that are not here yet for the future. This is already been taught a long time ago. That's why they said you will receive from your left. You
give from your right.

Your mother brought you into this world. She made you, put you down and lowered yourself. That way you will have ground to stand on. Ground to be eating from is Mother Earth, the Creator that we all talk about. Whoever created us set all this already for us.

Our teachings, us, we're complaining. If we keep complaining, that's what we're going to get, us people, society, we think backwards. If we think bad, it's going to be bad. If we going to look ahead and think good, we're going to be good. We're going to get things good. We are here. Things that is going to be given to abundance.

It's like Thanksgiving day for everybody. Every day we're lucky we're still walking on Mother Earth, and we're still speaking. If we go against it, if we go against each other, we ain't going to go nowhere. Just like Mr. Johnson said, there's opinions out there. We need to talk. We need to speak.

All these things were proposed way before railroads, water stations. Everything that the people will benefit from, all this has been spoken before. And when we came to this earth, we were all prepared. We were given of what you going to do? You're put here not just to fill up a space. You're here for a reason. And this is what we
need to think.

   And I want to say again, we should be like
these employees at the mine. They're the ones that are
feeding, working for us just like this morning, cold
morning, I bet people still went and picked up that pieces
of coal, burned it to stay warm. These are all ours that
is given to your footsteps, and yet we still argue what we
want and what we don't want.

   In closing, I'm going to say, Good job,
Kayenta Mine, Black Mesa mine people. I was part of it,
and I am still going to be part of it. And I'm going to be
behind you all the way. Thank you.

   MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

   Melvin George, and then Audrey with the
really long last name that starts with the N. Okay.

   You're next after Melvin.

   MR. MELVIN GEORGE: Good afternoon. My name
is Melvin George, and I'm from Village of Kykotsmovi. And
my comment to the NGS closure is this: The Hopi tribe has
never benefited from this plant. Now, NGS power plant and
Peabody coal mine are different subjects, but they also
work hand in hand. Most of the power from NGS goes down to
a power turbines that pump water out of the Colorado River
into the CPS that goes down to the Phoenix and Tucson area.

   As far as I know, our tribe, the Hopi tribe,
has never benefited from NGS. Like the Navajo tribe, they have not benefited either through electricity or otherwise.

Yes, there was provided employment.

Back in 2013, a technical work group agreement was signed by the Navajo tribe, the Gila River tribe, and the Tohono O'odham Nation to continue the water that was being pumped to CPS and benefiting, not only the city of Phoenix, Tucson, but also these tribes, the southern tribes.

And as you know, the secretary of interior still have control over our lands. All across the United States, the secretary of interior have control. And I would say if the Hopi tribe was to be provided electricity from Navajo Generating Station, then yes, I would say keep it open. Keep people employed.

The white people are businesspeople. And if they don't make any money out of something that is provided, and they will close it. Just like Ford Motor Company here announced lately, they're going to be closing a plant and eliminating at least 2,000 jobs. But that's their way of business. They're businesspeople.

Here, we depend on other companies to bring us income. And I hope that if Navajo Generating Station can be eliminated, then let it be. We don't have much control over it. Like I say, there are businesspeople
running these things. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Okay. Audrey, and then Chermayne Etsitty.

Chermayne? Okay. Hi.

MS. AUDREY NARINDRANKURA: Hey, my name is Audrey Narindrankura. I am from Hard Rock. And I'm currently living in Polacca. And I prepared a statement here.

The Navajo and the Hopi health have been sacrificed in the name of providing water and power to the rest of Arizona. Cancer, asthma, and other illnesses are far more common than they used to be as a result of the air and water pollution from NGS and Kayenta mine. The owners must provide funding and assistance for the local communities for long-term study of health impacts and health care costs resulting from the operation of NGS and Kayenta mine.

We should not be forced to choose between jobs and the health of Diné and Hopi people. Like I said, I currently reside in Polacca where we have running water, but we can't drink the water. I drive to Hard Rock and buy water from Hard Rock chapter for my family to consume.

And I think this is an issue. And I think this is a big concern. And I would like NGS to back off the mine, to back off on our water, so we can continue to
use our water for our children and our future.

And I also, you know, do small farming, and
I'm learning how to do greenhouse farming here. And I know
that a lot of -- there's a lot of farmers here and a lot of
people grow their own foods. And for me and my family,
that's the way of life that I want to teach my children and
my grandchildren.

And with that said, I'd like to thank the
Department of Interior for listening and putting up this
listening sessions for our communities.

(Native language spoken.)

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

Chermayne, and then Nick Ashley.

Nick? Got you. Okay, thanks.

MS. CHERMAYNE ETSITTY: Hello. My name is
Chermayne Etsitty. I am a first shift driller shooter up
at the mine. I'm also a resident at the mine. I literally
live in the middle of -- well, before when Black Mesa mine
was there, I lived in the center of them. All I can say is
I am healthy. My parents are healthy. My grandparents are
healthy. Everyone has been healthy that I know of. If you
want to say that you have asthma, then yeah, we don't.

We use the water. We use everything for our
animals. The fields are perfect out there. Our animals
are living great. And I use the money that I have to help
out my family for working -- from working up there.

So I don't know -- just keep NGS open. I
would love to retire there, or I'm going to retire there.
I know it's going to continue because coal is everything.
It provides, it burns. Everybody who has electric.

And just thank you for listening for
everything.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

And Nick, and then Elena Etsitty. Elena?

Okay.

MR. NICK ASHLEY: (Native language spoken.)

My name is Nicholas Ashley, and I prepared a
little bit statement here.

So roughly 6 million people in the central
and southern Arizona benefit from the destruction of Black
Mesa. The NGS complex, which includes the Kayenta mine's
operation is heavily anchored in the misuse of Navajo and
Hopi water. The aquifer has been depleted by 35 years of
pumping. This is billions of gallons of pristine ice age
water that can never be replaced.

The Navajo were required to waive to 50,000
acre-feet of water for NGS since 1969. The Navajo and Hopi
need this water for economic development that is culturally
aligned with our traditions. I am asking for the
Department of Interior to support the Navajo and Hopi's
transition from an extractive economy to a more sustainable and restorative economy that is based on the Navajo and Hopi do like farming.

I am also asking for the Department of Interior to advocate for full reclamation at the NGS site and Kayenta mine with an emphasis on the reclamation of the Navajo aquifer. Please uphold your trust responsibility to the Navajo and Hopi people. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Next is Elena, and then Layna or Lena Henley.

MS. ELENA ETSITTY: Everybody from the Hopi tribe and those of us that came from K mine, we're all here. And some of us are for the Navajo Generating Station and the coal mine. But if you think about it, it's buildings that Navajo Generating Station is one issue. But then it comes down. You need to remember that everything has a start and a finish.

And no matter what we think, the Navajo Generating Station that the closing of that plant will actually impact everyone. We're not just talking this area, that area, we're talking a tremendous -- it's going to impact on everybody. Yeah.

But I am for keeping that plant open because, not only do I work there, it helps provide for my parents, and also my extended family, relatives, it doesn't matter.
And then also a lot of what we do directly goes into a lot of what -- what a lot of us wouldn't do. We put your daily lives on the line to go after this coal to keep you warm, to help supply this coal need, electricity, water.

Times have changed. And if you look at from the beginning of when it started, yes, there was all these health impacts and things. But if you look at it from then to now, we've come a long way. Coal has been burning a lot cleaner. Reclamation is gone a lot further. I mean, look at it. It's not just one thing, but another.

And also, as far as the water issue, it's something that will always be there. No matter whether or not it's taken from this area, that area. It's from everywhere, that's the impacts of global warming. It's also impacts of everything. Not only as times have changed, but we are looking forward to the future.

I'm a third generation coal miner. My grandparents who are no longer with us now, also worked there and retired. My parents work at the coal mine, and they do still to this day.

I was very fortunate enough to get on. I worked as a vendor onsite with Peabody, but I also worked my way up. So as far as -- some days, I would come home clean. Some days, I would come home dirty. And all you
see is the pupils of my eyes sometimes, but that's what I do. And I want to keep that going.

Because future generations will need the jobs and also we also want to keep the lights on and to help provide for our families. And it's just not that, but we also help our community. There is a lot of issues going on, but we need to remember it starts with the Navajo Generating Station for right now.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Elena, we're a little bit over.

MS. ELENA ETSITTY: Oh, I'm sorry.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: No, no, no. As long as you've got your -- you said what you want to say.

MS. ELENA ETSITTY: As introduction, yeah, I'm a third generation miner. I was born and raised there on the mine site. And I've gone off to go to college. I came back, because there was no funding to go to school. So I had to pick up my pace and go to work. And that's pretty much what I did.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thanks.

MS. ELENA ETSITTY: Yep.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: We'll move on. Thank you very much.

Lena and then Dan Herder.

MS. LENA HENLEY: (Native language spoken.)
THE INTERPRETER: I didn't write down all her names. She's Lena Simonson Henley.

Greetings. And then she introduced herself by clan. And she lives -- I live in Hard Rock, and my children are the organization of 20 (native language spoken). I'm 70 years old. I've lived in the area on Black Mesa before NGS came to being, before Peabody, Kayenta mine and Black Mesa mine started mining the coal up there.

I used to herd sheep in the area between Oraibi Wash and Dinnebito Wash, and there was a lot of water. There was small creeks and stream from the water shed where I remember. There were a lot of birds and a lot of wildlife. I miss a lot of those that have become extinct or have gone other places, especially the birds.

We, the five fingered, used to walk upon the earth. We used to ride our horses until the wagon came, and then the vehicles, but there were not that many vehicles around. Even the elder mens and the elderly women used to walk or they rode horses. They must have been very strong. And there was a few people that even talk about health issues. These issues that they talk about were very minor.

Today there's a lot of people with different ailment, respiratory problems, cancer, a lot of health
risks. These are the larger topics that people talk about these days. We had a healthy stand of vegetation. They were strong, versus today our vegetations are really poor. They too need water. I remember my parents. They used to have a large cornfield growing corn, melon, squash and other vegetables.

Today we see smaller farms that don't produce very many -- that don't produce a variety of vegetable that we used to see in the old days.

It's enough just to feed a family, maybe an extended family. I, too, haul water in the Hard Rock area, and I have to pay for the water. I recently received the electricity into my home, but I don't have running water. But I don't miss it. It's been a long time that I've -- that I had to haul water.

Today's topic of NGS, we're sitting here listening to its closure. I understand that there is many owners, and some of the owners are leaving. Why are we asking them to continue operation if they're not going to make the same amount of money that they're making? I don't understand that. I'm saying what I've just said because I -- I think about my grandchildren and many more grandchildren's generation of grandchildren to come.

I'm asking because I think about the animals and the vegetables. They too need water. If we dig out
all the coal from the mesa and use up all the water, where
are we going to get that water?  Where -- how are we going
to reestablish those aquifers?  That is my question and
that is my worry and my concern.

And that is all I'm going to say today.

Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR:  Okay.  Thank you.

Dan Herder.  And then Dewayne Young.

MR. DAN HERDER:  (Navajo language spoken.)

THE INTERPRETER:  Dan Herder.  Greetings, and

you know my name now.  And he addressed his clans.  This
topic that you're all talking about here, the plant,
there's a lot of pollutants that rise out of the plants as
smoke.  I've worked there before.  There are a lot of
risks, health issues as well as environmental issues that
are fatal to our people.

All these contaminants have probably seeped
into the earth, penetrated the earth as well as the air
pollutants.  I've seen it when I was working there.

I know that they increased the emission or
the release of these deadly pollutants at night.  In the
morning you would see the haze, the brown haze that lay on
top of the plant.

They even showed me how they release these
deadly contaminants and pollutants into the air.  And
water, water is so precious. Are we going to use up all our groundwater aquifers? What are the animals and our children going to use in the future? Are they even studying these animals that live, that have habitats in the area. Just like us, their lungs are probably getting worse with layers of fine coal.

People that work there, they go for the prescription every day, it seems. And they get prescribed different types of medication. I'm saying this because I've worked there. I've seen people.

Yes, in the old days our elders and our people were strong. They were healthy. They even rode horses. We've been through many different types of mental anguish that our government do not see. It seems like they're clashing people together against each other because of coal mining, the plants.

But what about the pollutions? How do we address that? Many years ago people talked about the risk, the health risks of uranium. Now, it's probably the ash, the different contaminants that make up a power plant.

That's all I have to say. And I thank you for allowing me to speak.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: All right. Thank you.

Dewayne Young. Okay. And then Ed Seaton?

Ed? Okay.
MR DEWAYNE YOUNG: Hello, everybody. My name is Dewayne Young. My clans are Bitter Water, (native language spoken), mountain spoke tobacco clan on the Hopi side. I'm also of the yucca fruit clan, salt clan. I'm telling you Diné, Hopi, Spanish and Anglo.

I thank you, Mr. Interior, and the board, the Hopi chair, new chair, our president. I'm from Black Mesa. They call me the Stone House northwest of the regional Forest Lake. Top of the world I would say.

I've done all these things that these people talk about. Sheep herding, ranching, farming. I've done all that in my days. As I've got older, I graduated from high school. Met my high school sweetheart. We've been married for 34 years, to be exact 37 years. We have two daughters, Nicole and Tiffany. I have nine grandkids. I'm the fourth generation of coal miner, copper miner and uranium.

My daughter is the fifth generation coal miner. And my sons, I have two, they've served in the armed forces. They've done eight tours. I'm dealing with a lot of problems that they have, PTS, alcohol, drugs, et cetera.

I'm not asking for any help. They have to clear these things for themselves. I've been very fortunate. I've been employed with Peabody 30 years. I've
also been with the UNWA 30 years. Thank you, union
brothers and sisters, Local 1924 and 1620.

I'm very dedicated to my job. I'm missing
birthdays, anniversaries, all family events, just like I
say, I'm married to my job, too. But that's my number one
priority. My grandpa and my grandma they used to say, this
is your mother and your father brings food to the table.

As we all are in one in this room, it brings
food to the table. It pays bills, et cetera. To cap it
off, were NGS should stay alive, it's been studied that the
plant can operate up to 2044. And the financial deficits
that the Navajo tribe and the Hopi tribe will be devastated
if it were to close.

As you know, in this room we will all lose,
and we look upon eye to eye at each other, are you going to
call your partner a loser? I want to be a winner. I've
always been a winner.

And Navajo Nation will be devastated with
24 percent, and the Hopi tribe will end up losing
55 percent.

Do you people really realize what devastation
that it's going to happen? Because we're all in one and
one for all. I thank you much.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Ed, and then Lorraine Herder.
MR. ED SEATON: (Native language spoken.)

I was going to do my statements in Hopi, but then I don't know if Louie and Spencer taught me enough so I better just do it in my English. Okay. Thank you.

I worked with for Peabody for over 30 years and I retired in 2006. The other thing is I'm a local recording secretary for Local Union 1620, the UMWA. And I've been fortune to work with a lot of the Hopi people and seeing some old friends are retired and other people that I went to school and high school and elsewhere. So I've been running with the Hopis for quite a while.

And how many years are the state champs, what's the streak now for Hopi? 29 years. That's Hopi strong. That's what I expect.

Okay. Let's hear a story, so let's back up a little bit. And you see where I'm from is from Black Mesa, because my grandma was born on Black Mesa. My uncles, my aunts, they were all born there. My mom was born there. And I kept hearing these stories about how waters used to flow all over the place on the mesa.

Let me tell you the reason my grandfather took my grandma to Skeleton Mesa is that's where the real water is, that's where the Navajo aquifer, you know, recharges. That's why we ended up on Skeleton Mesa, and that's where I grew up.
The other thing is, think about this: As you look around this building, you see the United States flag of America. That means there are 50 states. We're all united. And that means no one person gets a hundred percent of the pie. We all have to share.

So when I think about that, I envision when our forefathers that went in and fought in World War II, they were the ones that were the leaders. They made the decision to have the coal mines on the Navajo reservation.

You have one in Black Mesa. They used to have one in Gallup, and Navajo mine, and some of them are still there. And they were the ones that fought the world war to get us those rights. That's why I handed to the code talkers and the others that served in WW II. They were the ones that laid the groundwork for us.

So if the U.S. government decides that we're going to pull back, you're going to be making a big mistake because you nullified the oath that those people took, and they go ahead. We're going to defend our country, and we're going to defend it for America.

They do not say, you guys have rights we're not going to give you. That did not happen. So as you think about that, I think we need to have an area where we need to have these people keep working. Because they have given us blood, sweat and tears to advance our economy on
this, you know, like, Navajo Nation and the Hopi reservation.

The other thing is, after I retired from Peabody, I worked as a federal mine inspector. I was working the metal on metal. We -- we were stationed in Vacaville in California. Northern California they have over 500 mines. And most of the places that I went to for inspections, most of them were locked. This was in 2008. So I can just see what's going to happen.

And a lot of those areas, they closed them because the federal government says you're not going to operate or you got all these regulations that they were funneled into. I've been out in West Virginia. I've covered all the United States because I served as a representative for the coal miners, and I traveled all over.

These guys sitting here, they sent me all over the country. We want you to attend this conference. We want you here. I did that, and I've been all over. So I know in the back area, the rural areas. They are the ones that are getting hammered. So we need to help them. We need to help them because you got to say, hey, you know, there's some livelihoods. People have to work because they share the United States of America.

We're not alone in this. And the other thing
that you have to think about is all the people that receive help, they're complaining. They don't know it indirectly every one of them benefited, at the schools, the clinics, the hospitals, the roads. There was nothing out there. When I used to work out there in Black Mesa in the 1960s.

Navajo and we were working for the Indian Health Service, and we used to do what they call the shuttle out there. People were making their own wells, that's how they were putting the waters in there to have pump, that they could pump the water to use.

So I was there long before the mines started.

And, like I said, my mom and all those who, of course, at that we actually called the Forest Lake, that's where they're from. I think that whole area has been mined up. But so I have my roots there, and I understand that I went back and I looked at it through the years.

So I've spent a lot of time out there. I've spent time out there before it was even developed, and I started working for Peabody during any summer jobs. So I think I've seen quite a bit. And a lot of times people when they talk, they don't really address those areas.

The help that they receive or else indirectly receive. That's why I think the mines have to keep going. NGS has to keep going, too, because whether they're sitting over here or not, all the money that the taxes are paid,
that's what drives the economy.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

MR. ED SEATON: Because there is nothing out here. I've driven through this area before, and it's a lot better before. Okay. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you. Thank you.

We're going to move on to our next speaker.

Lorraine Herder, and then Herman Honanie, who specifically asked not to have any preference. So he's in the shuffle here. I just wanted you all to know that, so it wasn't me.

MS. LORRAINE HERDER: (Native language spoken.) It seems like we're being center of attack here. The number one is the, like we're here saying that, you know, the way our living is here, and the miners are over here. And I don't like it, you know, when entertain people, entertaining each other.

So Interior Department, you are the one that has trust responsibility for our resources and keep that in mind.

(Native language spoken.)

The quality of the wool, it's not there because of the environment because of the vegetation.

(Native language spoken.)

The forage that we have.
(Native language spoken.)

Drought resistant.

(Native language spoken.)

Because I'm out there every day.

(Native language spoken.)

These flowers.

(Native language spoken.)

Wildlife have to compete with them.

(Native language spoken.)

Sugar diabetes.

(Native language spoken.)

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

THE INTERPRETER: Lorraine Herder.

Greetings, my people that are here. And rename herself.

She's from Big Mountain. And she spoke a little bit in the

English language.

I have the livestock, the cherished sheep of

our tradition that was brought into the Navajo people from

the beginning. And that is my livelihood.

They used to have quality wool that I used to

make rugs. But I've seen recently, more recently, a few

years ago that the vegetation that they feed on or the

forage that they use on a regular basis has been getting

poor. A lot of the plants out in my area are drought

resistance.
The better forage, the better grasses that provide the nutrients are getting less and less. We don't see it every year. We used to have a lot of different vegetation, forage or grasses, and the wool would be very -- of a qualitative product.

And we used to also use the plants to color or dye our yarns. The flowers that were used to make dyes are gone. Most likely, all of them are going to be gone pretty soon.

Those same plants, or some of the plants that we use for food. We dig roots or we gather the plants, and we used to eat that. And we were pretty healthy. The wild plants to eat were very plentiful. But today they are sparse. The livestock and us are competing for those plants that are edible.

I don't have to buy meat because I use my livestock to use as meat for my family. We dig roots. We still dig roots. We still use the plants when we find them. We have a garden, so we try to stay healthy.

You hear a lot about different health risks that are associated with these types of mining and the power plants. Today there are a lot of people that have diabetes.

Yes, those streams and creeks, the seeps, they were there. That's where our animals drink their
water. But I have to haul water these days, and it costs me.

I don't have running water at home. That is the reason I use -- I haul water.

I'm sorry. I can't read my own handwriting.

I don't use the coal to heat my house as well. So we're all talking about NGS and its closure. Let them close the plant. There is a lot of health problems associated with NGS just as well as the relocation of the Navajo-Hopi issue.

We've lost a lot of people. We've seen the detriments. We've seen the mental anguish to our people who have moved to relocate. And there are a lot of people that have suffered other ways.

And that's all I have to say. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

CHAIRMAN HERMAN HONANIE: (Native language spoken.)

Before I read my statement, I just want to say a couple of things. I'm hearing a lot of people talk about what I call the human element, the humanity, as I termed it the other day in Phoenix when I spoke. And that's what's very important. I think you people who are talking about the risk to our health and to the people.
But just as important and just as significant are all the miners that are here who are fearing the loss of their jobs, the loss of support for their family, the loss of support for their grandchildren and so on and so on.

So we do have a lot at stake, and that's people. Not the corporations. Not the companies. Not the power companies, but they need to all think of us who are sitting here, the villages, the communities in northern Arizona across the region who benefit from the operation of NGS and the selling of our coal.

But I wanted to just say that because for me that's how I partly view it, too, and that the continued operation of NGS needs to go. And I just thought of a new term for NGS. It's just my own witty way of saying Not Going Soon. Okay. So let's remember that.

Thank you. So again, good afternoon. I'm Herman Honanie, chairman of the Hopi tribe, and I'm honored to speak today on behalf of the Hopi people and honored to be among you all.

I'd like to thank the Department of Interior for hosting this meeting and thank you for traveling here to listen and to better understand the significance of the Navajo Generating Station to our people. And I wanted to just emphasize there is no better way to understand than to
have you all visit this country, because you're hearing
directly from the people today and this morning and
hopefully tomorrow.

And so for more than four decades the Hopi
have offered our land and energy resources to fuel the
Navajo Generating Plant Station. We've used the bounty of
our energy to provide for Hopi people, and we are proud
that the benefits of our energy is spread far beyond Hopi
mesas. We are pleased that Hopi energy brings benefits to
the families across the entire state.

When NGS was developed, it was a project like
no other, envisioned by Congress to create affordable
electricity and power to move water across the desert
landscape. Looking back, we are humbled by the vision of
the leaders who understood that coal from Black Mesa would
be instrumental in the growth and prosperity for the region
and for the tribes.

May I remind us, the plant was always
envision to run through 2044 at least. Yet today we find
ourselves in the situation that is far different than when
the early promises were made. We question the owners of
the Navajo Generating Station in their decision to stop
operating the plant in as little as two years' time.

This message has come to Hopi without warning
and is decades too soon. So we question why so suddenly do
the owners want to move away from coal?

We believe the coal, the plant creates energy
diversity for the state. It also shields against volatile
price swings or disruption of the energy supply. We also
believe that running the plant will be far more cost
effective than early retirement.

We are glad to see that some of the partners
are coming together or to the table with solutions. The
recent study of Navajo planning economics reinforces, I
believe, that the plant can be competitive well into the
future. At the same time we also recognize that there are
many other issues to resolve to keep the plant operating.

The risk of plant shut down and the
supporting Kayenta mine come at a time when the Hopi have
60 percent unemployment. This swift closure and loss of
revenues, which provide for about 85 percent of our general
fund for the Hopi tribe will most certainty resolve in
severe curtailment of Hopi government functions, loss of
revenues and resources to the community and, of course, an
increase in spike in our unemployment rate.

So there's no doubt that early closure of NGS
could carry a heavy burden on Hopi and many others. The
Navajo too stand to lose thousands of jobs and billions in
economic benefits. So make no mistake the Hopi understands
that if NGS shuts down prematurely, the residents of
Phoenix and Tucson ultimately will get their power another way. Yet, the Hopi faces a long difficult economic journey.

NGS was developed and ultimately authorized as the best power plant economic development solution for the Hopi, Navajo, central Arizona tribes, and the state.

So maintaining these vital assets for the greater good of this region is a promise that needs to be kept on behalf of the Hopi people. So I encourage all of us to continue engaging in real dialog to advance this goal.

But in closing, and in closing, I just really want to extend my appreciation to everybody that's here, even if you're just here to listen and learn. But those of you have spoken and will speak after me, I appreciate your thought. I appreciate your support in this matter in keeping the NGS open because it's very, very important to us.

You know, folks in Phoenix and Tucson and the other cities down south, they have the luxury, as someone has said, many have said that they're operating at our luxury, they're operating as we sacrifice the resources that we have. They're enjoying the life. They're enjoying especially swimming pools. They're enjoying the abundance of water, but yet we're trying to fight for our main
survival. When we were the first people here, when we've been here long, long, long time. And the last comer comes comes and takes, as someone said.

So I need to remind us all that let's band together. Let's support one another and hope that solution that eventually come about will eventually benefit us in the long haul. Again, we have a future to think about. We have your grandchildren and our grandchildren's grandchildren. We have educational benefits and scholarships to think about.

Tonight we're going to have a graduation at the Hopi High School. Last night there was an eighth grade graduation. And I just can't help but think about my own grandchildren that they need to be and are eligible and have a right to these scholarships just like any other individual with Hopi and Navajo across this region.

(Native language spoken.)

Thank you very much for your attendance, everybody.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

The next speaker is Daryl Melvin. Followed by Marvin Yoyokie. Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry.

THE INTERPRETER: (For Chairman Herman Honanie). Thank you, my people. I want to say to you all that this is a very huge, difficult issue. We must
address this from all sides of our parties whether we're involved in it as just listeners, people that have jobs, or we as people in the political realm must look at this difficult issue and stand together and address our concerns to the people here.

We know we were promised that this generating station was made to stand until 2044. We are not even at the halfway point. And for some reason, we have these questions here that are not being told to us of why they are shutting the mine down and also NGS. We benefit from this as far as revenue, the education, the scholarships, and also to the villages here.

What do we benefit from this? Let's think about this thing in a positive way and see what is the best resolve for all the people, not just here on Hopi or our neighbors, but who actually benefits from this in a greater way is people from down south of where we are at.

We benefit in the form of revenue, but yet, let's think about it in the future, for the future of our people, of our children, and let's stand together.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Very good. Thank you. My apologies for that. So thank you for correcting me.

Daryl Melvin and then Marvin Yoyokie.

MR. DARYL MELVIN: (Native language spoken.)

My name is Daryl Melvin, and I'm from the
Roadrunner clan, and I'm born for the Coyote Pass clan. I've worked most of my professional career for Indian people on behalf of Indian people. And I wanted to mention that as a healthcare leader, as an executive, as a professional engineer, as an officer in the uniformed services, and today as a business owner of a consulting firm, that my family on both sides have grown up in these communities without basic services: Water, sewer, phone, infrastructure. And it's through this lens that I want to share my comments with you.

I believe that closure of the Navajo Generating Station as well as the Peabody mine is in the best interest of the Hopi and Navajo people for both tribes, for the environment for our health, and in many ways I feel that it has impeded the development and the growth of both our nation and that we have an opportunity in terms of how we develop, diversify and work on our economy.

However, in the near term, I believe that the Department of the Interior and federal agencies have a right and maybe even an obligation to look out for those individuals who worked and have contributed toward the energy production in this country. And those are the miners, those are the individuals who work at the generating station.
I would like the agency to ensure that there's transparency and disclosure for those benefits that these employees are entitled to. Whether it's through work retraining, whether it's through job relocation and replacement and certainly for those individuals who are eligible for early retirement or those individuals who are currently retired that, perhaps, legislation needs to be proposed to ensure that there's a trust fund so that any of these public entities, whether it's Peabody Coal mine or whether it's Salt River or other entities, that they not go out of the business. That a trust fund be established so that the benefits to these employees are continued and ongoing, and they are looked after and protected for the work that they've done in ensuring, again, that energy was provided for this country.

Next I'd like to know about how these sites are going to be used, both the mine and the Navajo Generating Station. How it would be reused. Currently the Navajo Generating Station is a hub for transmission lines. Rather than work and rely on a 20th century energy production of coal, there's much discussion in the country about renewables. The transmission lines allow and afford an opportunity for renewables, whether it's solar or it's wind.

There are other options, though.
MS. KRISTIN DARR: You're running just a
little bit long.

MR. DARYL MELVIN: Okay. I'm sorry.

Energy storage is key. So whether it's high,
new technology like, air compression, those are options
that should be considered and brought forward. Also,
currently today, the administration has talked about an
infrastructure bill.

In this current year and certainly within the
next year the opportunity exists for infrastructure dollars
to be provided to local communities to both tribes to
develop road systems north and south, whether it's water
systems or phone communication systems.

And so to the guest here from the interior
that drove out, if you try to use your cell phones and were
able to keep a call, you know what I'm talking about. Even
if you got a call through, probably your teeth were
chattering as you went over the bumpy road.

We can start working on the replacement of
current road systems, current infrastructure and to provide
these capable employees, these workers in these mines jobs
today by simply directing hundreds of millions of dollars
in infrastructure to our current communities. So thank
you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.
Marvin. And then Cecil. It starts with a B.

Cecil.

Okay. Go ahead.

MR. MARVIN YOYOKIE: Good morning. I'm here in support of the Navajo Generating Station to continue to operate and to have the Peabody Coal mine to support it. I am in support of the indirect benefits that the tribes receive from coal mining, both from the local communities up at the mine, and the Hopi tribe receiving revenues from coal mining.

Comparing to other coal mines in the United States, the mines up at the Kayenta and the Black Mesa in the past are low sulfur coal with high Btus. And the tribe has received royalty benefits from that and have improved the life and government of the tribe tremendously.

In talking about the economic benefits that the tribes received, our communities have increased in many ways economically. And the use of water that the Peabody, or Black Mesa mine used to use has stopped now. But the continued use of coal by our communities is of great benefit.

I am aware of the history of royalties that our tribe received from coal mining, and these royalties have helped our tribe tremendously in moving forward in the 20th Century and into now. In employment our government
has grown. Scholarships have increased tremendously, and our students have benefited indirectly from the revenues that the coal mining have given. Many maybe do not, are not aware of where the money comes from, but indirectly they have received these benefits.

Our economic situation on Hopi is -- is -- has been in a very -- in a very poor state. I have not seen any economic development on Hopi other than in the early 19 -- around 2000 when the housing started at the healthcare center and our Moenkopi development. But since then, we have not had any economic development that would contribute revenues to our tribe, and we have depended quite a few -- a large percentage of our revenues from royalties being paid from Peabody Coal mine.

And I would be very concerned on how our tribe is going to be operating when the coal mining ceases. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

So for those of you who -- I'm getting to some speakers that have walked in recently. And just a reminder, we're trying to stay at three minutes. And we are going to be moving into speakers who have already spoken, so those will definitely want to try to keep it short.

But Cecil. Did we find Cecil? Okay, there
you are.

And then Representative Descheenie will be next. I know he's around here somewhere.

Okay. Go ahead.

MR. CECIL BIZAHALONI: Thank you. Good afternoon, DOI and everybody else that's here.

(Native language spoken.)

My clan is (native language spoken) and my clans are (native language spoken), yucca fruit. And then on the Hopi side, I'm a member of the rain people and the Eco clan. That's what they call us.

So I've worked for Peabody for 40 years, 41 years to be exact up to this year. And I do as well support Peabody Coal Company, because I've been employed there for four decade and a safe mine. And the people there are very professional, the job they do. And I would like to see it continue.

And then I'm hearing a lot of stories about what our younger generation is going to do after the mining closed or if the mine should shut down, you know, then I'm going to be kind of a little bit concerned. But I want to save my breath for tomorrow in Window Rock, but I think I should say something here. So I just put my name in, and so...

And also I'm hearing things about the
To Nizhoni area up there in Forest Lake. And on my dad's
side they're from that area, so and then my nieces and
aunts they still live out there.

And up there back way back in 1960, I was
only like a ten-year-old, something like that, we used to
go up there where the mining area -- where they're actually
mining right now. They call it J28, J19 and J21 right
there in that same area.

On my grandma's side, my
great-great-grandfather resided there. Their name was
Many Mules and the son of Many Mules, too. And then on the
east side of that is my other on the (native language
spoken) side, they call it (native language spoken) in
Navajo it's cashcholie, and then cashcholie begets or the
son of Escholie. So I am the great-great-grandson from
that area.

So there was a time before the mining and all
these stories that I'm hearing that that area was, nobody
lived in that area because of those coal fires. They had
coal fires all over the place in the area in the valley,
and they had smoke that's why they do agree to mine that
area.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. And you're at three
minutes.

MR. CECIL BIZAHALONI: So they want to get
rid of that coal so it can be safe for people to live
there. And then just recently when the mines starts
opening people started moving to the areas, you know. So
if they mine this coal out, and then it will be safer for
people to live there. Even the water's going to be safe.

So that's what I want to bring up today, so
thank you for your opportunity. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you. And we'll see
you tomorrow, I guess.

Representative Descheenie. Are you ready to
speak? Arizona House of Representatives Legislative
District 7. After that will be Ken Lomayestewa. Ken?

Okay, Representative.

REPRESENTATIVE ERIC DESCHEENIE: Yes. Thank
you very much.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: You're welcome.

REPRESENTATIVE ERIC DESCHEENIE: To all of
you thank you for coming out here and visiting and holding
these hearings. I understand you all are in Phoenix and
other places and Page, here and, of course, the Window
Rock. And I have to express my appreciation to the Hopi
people, the Hopi tribe for hosting this. I'm a visitor
here and as a member of the Navajo Nation.

But I'm also a representative of these
respective communities in the Arizona House of
Representatives. I represent Legislative District 7.

Obviously, I've been paying close attention to this issue. Not just over the course of the last several months, you know, leading up to the decision by Salt River Project to sell or to get out of this business, given the economy for what it is, they've stated their reasons rooted in expert opinions, observations of facts. They have already made these decisions. But I've also been watching this for several years, and for many of us we've been watching this for a lifetime.

So my comments are largely expressed with as much understanding and sympathy for everyone involved, but also that same sympathy and understanding needs to be lent towards the future. The future that includes our lives, virtually everyone in this room and then, of course, our children, our grandchildren, and so on and so forth.

It's -- it can't be overstated enough that Salt River Project has already made their decision. They've made expert observations about the economics, about the industry, about this reality that we're having to confront before us today.

I'm a little disheartened that it was done relatively abruptly creating a sense of urgency, a sense of scare amongst our people, amongst the tribes. Certainly the Hopi tribe stands to endure a great challenge if this
shut down transpires in the next few months. And then, of course, the Navajo Nation will certainly feel the experience.

But these are tribes, tribal governments. Our hearts have to acknowledge the life of our people as well as the life of the land. If the plant shuts down this year, December, it will leave a lot of our people in great, very great difficulty -- difficulty for obvious of reasons.

My advocacy seeks to keep the plant open for the next two years so that our people, the workers themselves, their families, have an opportunity to make sense of this reality and make the necessary steps to transition in a healthy manner.

But to keep the plant open the way it is, the status of what it is beyond 2020, as indigenous peoples, we have a responsibility to life, not just of our own, but also to the land. We have to be the forefront, at the forefront. We have to be the leaders of having an environmental conscious.

But it goes beyond just having an environmental conscious. We maintain an indigenous truth that goes back to time immemorial. We honor life beyond the five fingered people. We know this. It is irrefutable.

So for us to cast a blanket of black and
white that this plant and the mine must maintain its
current status indefinitely is irresponsible as it relates
to being indigenous.

For practical reasons, the plant ought to
stay open for two more years, so that the workers -- and my
heart very much goes out to the workers. I've sat down
with some of the miners, and I've sat down with some of the
employees of the plant.

Their identity, some upwards into 40 and 50
years of blood, sweats and tears has shaped who they are.
We cannot take that away from them as it relates to their
pride, as it relates to their legacy, as it relates to what
they have provided for their families. And that is the
reason why this plant cannot shut down immediately, meaning
this year.

But like I said, we have to find ways to
usher in renewable energy. And I know for many of us
renewable energy is a four-letter word. But what we knew
two years ago, the technology, the capacity to actually use
it to generate energy as well as jobs, probably not the
amount of jobs that we have now, but a significant amount.

My discussion with the experts on this
particular subject matter maintains what we knew two years
ago is not the case today. There are viable options. And
it's incumbent upon us to embrace those to the fullest
And I'm going to finish with this: I don't know of any other peoples other than our own who demonstrate on a daily basis as well as generationally and intergenerationally the meaning of resilience. We are resilience. And if it means we have to endure a little bit more to be advocates for the world, then I think that's an order. It's a standing order that we express amongst ourselves and really to the world over.

Thank you very much.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Ken Lomayestewa. I'm doing better than I was on Monday. You got to give me that. All right. Thank you. And then Raina Silver after Ken.

MR. KEN LOMAYESTEWA: Good afternoon, everybody. My name is Ken Lomayestewa. I'm the director of the Hopi Renewable Energy office. So we have been looking at several options here, which I'm sure that Navajo is doing the same thing, trying to look at alternative resources for energy production.

And we have been looking at what available technologies are out there. We've been looking at what kind of land we have. We find that we have a lack of infrastructure on our lands. Those lands that are potentially usable do not have any water lines, water
piping, electrical transmission, rail. We don't have those
infrastructure in place, which makes it really hard for us
to do our planning.

We also are -- we also looked at other areas
where there is transmission available, and we have a 500 KV
line that runs through both Hopi and Navajo land, but we do
not have access to those lines. And those lines could be
directly available for us to get on and produce our own
powers and send out transport for revenue base projects.
We don't have that.

We have other lines that are available off
the reservation, but we need assistance to get connected to
those lines. And that's where, I think, you all come in is
try to provide some kind of help in getting us to
interconnect to those lines, whatever infrastructure there
is. We're talking about water.

There's a water line that runs through
portions of our land, and we're trying to do planning to
get to those to access those lines as well. But we do need
federal help.

We have transmission lines that we don't have
access to. We do need the higher level, federal government
to help us, by either leaning on the utilities, the owners,
to give us some access to those lands so we can do
something with those lines. They have been running through
our areas for a long time, and we still don't have access
to them.

So this is our Tribal Backup Plan B, if you
will, call it. Navajo is doing the same thing. Hopi tribe
is doing the same thing. Other tribes are doing the same
thing, looking at their Plan B alternatives.

I haven't heard anything from the owners of
NGS or other plants proposing a Plan B for the tribes. How
are they going to assist in the replacement of energy and
what not? All I'm hearing is the closure aspect of it. So
we need to have a Plan B. We need to hear a Plan B.

What's -- how are the owners going to assist the tribes in
going to that Plan B.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: That's three minutes.

MR. KEN LOMAYESTEWA: Thank you. One more
last thing. Again, I'm going to plead we do need that
immediate help from the higher level. We do have some of
these infrastructure in place, but we don't have the
access. And we need to have that as well as federal
funding to get our projects going. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Okay. Raina Silver, and then

Hubert Lewis, Jr.

MS. RAINA SILVER: Raina. Any NGS closure
plan must include steps to ensure that the local workforce
is not left behind and forgotten. Now is the time to invest in job retraining and assistance to help the local communities to transition.

The decommissioning and clean up of NGS and its supporting infrastructure can be a source of job creation that helps transition the Navajo Nation to a far more sustainable clean, energy economy while taking care of workers from the plants and mine.

Navajo and Hopi youth need a future they can count on. It's time to think about the next generation and begin taking steps now to ensure that they have a sound economic foundation to build their lives on.

Clean energy provides that. Coal does not. SRP has said repeatedly that the reason for closing the plant is that coal supply could no longer compete with more affordable sources of energy. The world does not need coal and all the pollution that comes with it, but the world still needs energy.

There are investors here and around the world who would be interested in solar and wind projects on the Navajo Nation. Navajo and Hopi must secure rights to the transition capacity that will allow them to connect wind and solar projects developed on tribal lands to western energy markets.

The Navajo Nation has vast potential for
developing solar and wind power. A 2012 study by the
National Renewable Energy Laboratory looked at clean energy
alternatives to NGS and estimated that Navajo lands are
home to an astonishing 1.2 terawatts of potential
utility-scale solar, more than 500 times the output of NGS
and nearly 1,800 megawatts of wind resource.

Now is the ideal time to develop those
resources. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Okay. Hubert Lewis, Jr. And then
Dale Sinquah, are you here? Oh, okay. I didn't recognize
you with your hat on. Okay.

MR. HUBERT LEWIS, JR.: Hi. I am Hubert
Lewis, Jr. I am from Moenkopi. My subject today is money.
Seva (phonetic) or peso. When we didn't have it we were
living good. Back in the day when Hopi's didn't have
money, we all used to work for food. Everybody helped each
other for food.

Nowadays, money, or white man has introduced
money and that has thrown a rock into our culture. Since
money has gotten into our culture, we now living the white
man way. We cannot live without money.

But on the other hand, we are also keepers of
Mother Earth as an Indian people, native people. I know
that money is important to the white man and that the more
you spend, the bad it is.

They're trying to -- well, we live in the white man world now as natives. And if they close down the power plant and the coal mine, our economic infrastructure will go down. There are other ways for the tribe that could be making money and should be making money besides selling coal.

There is -- we have a lot of natural resources like water. We have a lot of water that we could sell, bottled water or maybe solar or wind energy. We're trying the cattle business, and I hear that's doing some of it a little bit to help our tribe make money.

But once you close this mine, our tribal government will suffer. People will have to stop living easily because people right now depend on money. And that's what buys food, buys gas, buys, I don't know, a truck to make life easier. Everybody is now living the easier life, and that's what they want.

Back in the day when people didn't have nothing, it was hard. But it was good.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: That's three minutes, so --

MR. HUBERT LEWIS, JR.: Okay. I'm sorry.

But in closing, I don't think it's very good to close the mine right away due to the tribe doesn't have
a backup plan or really have money coming in. They could
-- I wish they would do better economic development where
they could support themselves like maybe build stores, or
tourism.

And I know casino is the big thing, but
people don't want it and -- but also in our -- our job
searching, we're only limited in a small area. If you
wanted to make money, you have to go off the reservation.
And by going off the reservation, you're losing your
culture, because culture is what Hopi is and what we have
here. Because if you don't have culture, you don't have
anything.

I don't know -- I know the white man's
culture is money. That's what they're work for and build
for. But as a Native American, we try to keep the earth.
So.

I would like the generating station to close
in the future, but due to pollution and everything, but I
would also like the Hopi tribe to sustain themselves
without coal by doing economic development with other
infrastructures because people want to live easy now with,
like, cars and electricity, and everybody has cell phones
now.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

MR. HUBERT LEWIS, JR.: Oh, I'm sorry.
MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

MR. HUBERT LEWIS, JR.: Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Yes, thank you.

Okay. Dale Sinquah, and then Jarvis Williams.

MR. DALE SINQUAH: Hello. My name is Dale Sinquah. I'm a Hopi tribal council member, and I represent the village of First Mesa Consolidated Villages. There's a lot that came up here, and I'll do my best to keep to three minutes.

The first thing I want to bring up again is government trust responsibility, which I hold in high regard that the government helped create this mine, and how the water has been taken to the metropolitan areas. And so now they have to be part of the equation to solve this problem.

The jobs that are here -- the jobs just aren't at the -- that are affected are just not at the -- at the mine itself. I mean, of course, they're a big part of it. But we have jobs that are going to be impacted here on the reservation in the tribe itself and at the villages, which receive their money from the tribe to run their villages, so and not only jobs, but services that are going to be provided to the village itself and they're really basic services.
They're water. They're providing services to the youth and the elderly and the village itself for different functions.

There's been a lot of talk about tribes diversifying their economy. The -- the as I looked into transitioning out of a closure of a mine, I did do some research, and I find that that is the way to do -- to go is to diverse your economy. But the thing is, as this is closing, we -- that's what we're asking for. The tribe is asking for assistance with -- to diversify our economy.

We understand that there's an economic reason for the closure, but we also understand that we need help to move forward to provide a home life for our people here.

The economy here is not -- the reservation economy is not the only economy that this is going to impact. It's going to impact at some level the federal government economy at a lower level. But also it impacts the state through the taxes that they get from the -- from the sale of the coal.

And the economy, of course, here and the local towns here, such as Flagstaff, Winslow, Gallup, Holbrook, those economies, Page, they're going to also suffer their impact, too. And it's kind of odd that this is being looking as -- the lens is focused on SRP. And that's hard for me to understand that.
Finally, you know, can SRP really afford the prices that they say that they're going to suffer if they buy from NGS? And I believe they can, you know, some people depending on how well that they manage their money, how affluent they are, they can afford things that poorer people can't. And I don't feel that it's out of the question that they just cannot afford or come to some kind of resolution that we lower the numbers, that they can't afford the power that we're trying to sell.

Okay. We're talking about the economy shifting from coal. And I want to say that even electricity is being subsidized at some level by the U.S. government, the power generation no matter where it comes from.

The petroleum industry, the auto industry it's not out of the character for the U.S. government to pick an industry and shore it up. Because if it weren't, then the auto industry is struggling. And look what they did for them recently, in our recent history. They shored them up and helped them out, and they came out better.

The next thing is that it's going to take everybody here, everybody that's concerned, the U.S. government, the state government, the local community, and the people here that live on both reservations to work together to solve this problem.
And in solving this problem is we're going to move into diversify our economy, and believe me, the Hopi tribe has gotten the message. We are working as hard as we can to try and get to that level to where we're going to diversify our economy. But again, I'm going to say we need your assistance, and that's what we're asking for.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: You said finally like three points ago. You're messing with me.

MR. DALE SINQUAH: In closing --

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

MR. DALE SINQUAH: -- the water. You have to understand Hopi's position on water. We're not only talking about water usage here, but we're in a battle with the U.S. government, with the state government, and with the local -- the Navajo government over water. So you have to realize that this problem -- that this you're looking at is so much larger than just the NGS station itself.

So all of that gets thrown into the mix, and we're trying to solve this NGS things, but we have so many areas that we're dealing with. And I thank you for this time.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you, sir.

Jarvis, and then John Hawkins.

MR. JARVIS WILLIAMS: Okay. Good. Don't start the clock yet. Okay. I'm ready.
Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Jarvis Williams. I've worked at Peabody, Peabody Kayenta mine for seven years total. The last three years as their tribal relations manager.

I just wanted to say thank you to the Department of Interior and Bureau of Reclamation for being here and hosting this important meeting.

I also want to say thank you to the Hopi tribe and all your leaders here for hosting this particular meeting. You guys make a heck of a good sandwich and kept these guys full over here, and that's pretty hard to do so thank you.

I appreciate the initiative to speak about the Navajo Generating Station and it's importance to the Navajo and Hopi people and to the entire state of Arizona. It is a bit discouraging when my elected representative tells us to just deal with it.

Anyway, as the discussion is focused on ways to keep NGS running well to the future. We must also think about what the mining operations mean for our local community. Peabody has long embraced a good neighbor policy with it's area residents. Annually contributing thousands of dollars for mine benefits that improve the quality of life for its local residents. Many of the services are essential.
I'd like to share with you guys a couple of those. The first being free potable water with two wells that are always on, cared for by the miner, Kayenta mine, and are in use all the time. And they are free.

A water line distribution system that's being installed to over 40 homes. Right now we're in Phase 1. It should be completed by the end of the summer, and water put into those lines by the end of this fall. Phase 2 to begin, hopefully, within the next year. There are five phases for this particular project. Right now total cost is about 25 million, of which Peabody will pitch in about 15 million.

So it's a good thing we've got a lot of good things going up there. The Red Dog partnership which involves several entities, one of which is BIA, Navajo Department of Transportation, the Navajo County. There are 11 surrounding chapters, Peabody, that all contribute to the delivery of red scoria to local roads that need maintenance.

The other one, reclamation grazing. We have a grazing program that is part of our reclamation program. A few years ago we met with Navajo Department of Agriculture, the BIA, Office of Service Mining, the Navajo Nation Rangers, Navajo Nation Grazing officials to discuss how to best handle grazing practices moving forward.
Winter grazing has always been done and provided from October until April. This year we had at least 150 head of cattle and about 80 sheep on the reclaimed areas. Some of the improvements we've made we included this year: Herd health, which includes vaccination records; grazing education classes, additional grazing assessments to be done to measure the impact of grazing and those seven months that we have the animals on there.

And the goal is actually to have a high quality animal produced by local residents so that they can improve their quality of life. We want to express quality and not quantity as we realize that quantity has a great effect on the land as well. Finding that balance is somewhat difficult. Almost there. Just a few more seconds.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

MR. JARVIS WILLIAMS: Ranching is a lifestyle that residences must pursue. Perhaps the next step is the Navajo beef program to be installed in those reclaimed areas. They say, I've heard earlier that mining is a destruction of land. After looking at where I'm at and where I work every day, I say it's an enhancement of land, given that the reclaimed areas are ten times more productive than the non-disturbed areas.
And I just want to say thank you for that,
and that's all the messages that I wanted to bring to you all. Thank you very much.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.
John Hawkins, and then Nicole Horseherder.

MR. JOHN HAWKINS: Good afternoon. My name is John Hawkins. Some people say that I live in two worlds because I am not native, but the I have left one world and started a new life here. My wife is Hopi and my two daughters are Hopi. They are spider clan. And I manage a Hopi community, Yuwehloo Pahki, also known as Spider Mound.

Maybe I flatter myself to think I can do any good, but what am I if I don't try my very best every day? And I don't say this to speak about myself, but to relay those of you up there who are not from here, it is my hope that you take what you heard here today and at the other listening sessions and relay it to the other owners of NGS, to the government, politicians, and to the rest of the world.

We trust that you will do this and not just move on when you leave here today. We trust that you will do your very best for those who have spoken their hearts here today. Because who are you if you don't try your very best?

Maybe coal is not the best power source or
maybe it's not the most efficient power source. Maybe coal
ing mining is not healthy for our earth. But if NGS is to
close, it is too soon. Hopi and Navajo need more time to
plan, to plan how to replace the revenue, the jobs and the
economy, to plan how to move forward.

Even if closing is the right thing to do, it
is not the right time. Please take what you have heard
here today and speak for all of us. I know the separation
between here and the city. And I ask you to help bridge
these two worlds. The common message here today is that
closing NGS in 2019 or sooner is much too soon. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Nicole. And then David Billah.

MS. NICOLE HORSEHERDER: Thank you for
hosting these listening sessions. Oftentimes I wonder
if -- oftentimes I'm skeptical because I think that
listening sessions are just a way to rubber stamp something
and move it along. I've seen it a lot in the last 20 years
that I've been working on this issue.

My name is Nicole Horseherder. I'm
originally from Big Mountain area. I still live there. I
have a degree. I have a bachelor's degree from the
University of Arizona, a master's degree from the
University of British Columbia.

I'm a farmer out in my home just east of Big
Mountain, and I've lived there all my life except for the few times that I left to go to school.

So I just want to say that there's a lot of changes that have taken place. Almost my entire life I've lived there with the mining. The NGS operation began in 1971. So I live at the headwaters of the entire operation, the N-aquifer has been mined along with the coal for the last -- since 1971.

And a lot of our pristine water has been used to subsidize for the operation of the mining all these years. And it continues to be used in greater amounts than any of the communities -- any of the Navajo communities in the area that use the N-aquifer.

A lot of changes have taken place. A lot of the springs and the seeps are gone, and hydrologists tell us that it's going to be 20 years before we see the recovery. And every USGS report that comes out, I wait for it. I look to see what the changes are. I look to see how much recovery has taken place.

We live 7,000 feet on the northern end of Black Mesa and 6,000 feet on the southern end. No one's going to build CAP for us if we lose our water. The Bureau of Rec is not going do it. Peabody is not going to do it. The owners of NGS are not going to do it. And all the people that live there that make their livelihood not on
someone's payroll, not on NGS's payroll, not on Peabody's payroll, have no voice in this. Completely forgotten. And, you know, I know the Navajo Nation is in a critical situation, bringing water to the residents of Black Mesa.

Now, I know that there's a Many Mules water line that's going, but that's through the help of Peabody. And that's only going to serve people in the lease area. It's not -- I mean, those of us that live north of Hard Rock, we still don't have running water. And the point, I just want to be clear, the point is not that we get running water. The point is the aquifer needs to recover. And we can't be using pristine water for mining purposes anymore.

Just that alone should be the indicator everyone here to rally behind our renewal in the Navajo economy, a transition away from coal, a transition away from coal mining and away from coal burning as a way of energy production.

That water is too precious, and right now we don't have an answer as to how we're going to bring it back. If there's damages, how we're going to bring it back. Peabody doesn't even have right now a way to reclaim that water and they're supposed to. How can you stand behind an employer who has no way of bringing back water for the people that rely on it?

I wouldn't. I wouldn't stand behind my
employer if they were paying my paycheck but turning around and undercutting my neighbors and my people to do so. Have we -- we don't have a conscious anymore? I think -- the time is now. We have the opportunity one more time to all get together and decide how this nation is going to move forward into the next century for our kids.

Our kids are not going to be coal miners.

There's not enough coal there to mine for -- forever. And that water is limited. Even though we say it's a renewable resource, it is limited. It's a very limited resource.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. We need to move.

MS. NICOLE HORSEHERDER: We're mining it like we don't get just only 8 inches of rainfall a year. We're mining it like it's abundant. So I would like to say that much and thank you very much for listening to this.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

And thank you to my helper in the back keeping an eye on the time. I saw you.

Okay, David. Okay. And before you start, let me just let you all know that since we started late that's why I'm letting this run late. We're going to stay for the full three hours that we promised.

After David, we're back into speakers that have already spoken, so I'll get as many of you as we can in the next 20 minutes.
So David.

MR. DAVID BILLAH: Good afternoon.

(Navajo language spoken.)

THE INTERPRETER: Joanna. Greetings. Thank you for listening to us today. My name is David Billah. I've worked with Peabody Coal Company for at least 37 years. And by working for the companies -- for the company, we have helped contribute to the Navajo Nation and the Hopi Nation all of us as miners.

We take pride in these contribution that we make to help the economy.

When I was small, my father fought in the World War II, and he came back. He raised me with these instructions. He told me, "Take it upon yourself and others. You can do that. Only you can do that."

So today it has extended this far into the future to help the Navajo Nation and the Hopi Nation in some form, indirectly or directly. I have enjoyed the teaching that we've built up to this time. Everybody says that the water is gone. There is the San Juan River. It's one of the rivers that recharges the underground waters, and that is good.

I have livestock. I have a variety of livestock. When I'm off of work, I put my saddle on my horse, and I ride the horse up into the mountainous areas.
There is vegetation up there. And I don't see it as poor vegetation. There is water. I see water up there. So we can't say we don't have any water. The plants are green. They seem to be healthy, and I think we will have those vegetation into the future.

It is the future that we should look into. We cannot go back. It seems like we're just clashing against each others. Let's move forward. That is my -- my comments today. Let's move forward, not backwards. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: All right. John Muir followed by Norm Sneddy.

John?

Where his Norm? Okay. Got you.

MR. JOHN MUIR: Hello. My name is John Muir. I am (native language spoken), which is Red Running to the Water Mountain Tobacco people, and born and raised on the reservation. Born in (native language spoken), Utah, raised in Arrow Canyon. Learned how to raise livestock and farm.

Where I'm from is just on the other side of the mine, the north side of the mine. And we got water still running down our creek. It's no lower than Black Mesa is. Pretty much the same height. The highest part of the point of the mesa is the northern edge. That's the
only place you'll see alpine. Where I grew up, we got
alpines too.

I heard testimony say medicine man can't find
herbs, can't find traditional plants. We get all ours over
there. Fast forward today. I'm married on top of the
mesa. It's (native language spoken) Valley.

Peabody has contractors that helps out that
valley. Without them, we would have a washboard road,
potholes bigger than tires. Your truck comes apart faster
than anything else on an everyday commute.

That costs money. Without Peabody I wouldn't
be able to buy my parts for my vehicles to help my
community. That's what I do up there. Go to the chapter
meetings and whatnot. Lend a hand everywhere I can.

I don't only help Indian brothers, I also
help in Pinion, Whipoorwill. There is a lot of people out
there that don't have vehicles, can't haul wood. Peabody
helps us out, takes trees down. I go over there, harvest
it, bring it to the elders. The LDS even come to me, "Can
you please haul us a truckload of wood?" And I do it in my
off times, sometimes after work.

In the wintertime I'm out there in the mud,
rain, snow, shine doing that for my community. It's not
only me. I see lots of coal miners out there doing the
same thing. I'm also second generation coal miner. My dad
is Anglo and come from LA. He's half Mexican, Cherokee, Comanche.

He also done the same thing as I was growing up. He worked at Peabody pipeline. Retired. I'm in his footsteps doing the same thing for my in-laws, my people all the way into Whooorwill. Sometimes I branch out all the way to Cottonwood. There's a lot of people out there that rely on that coal.

Without coal, a cord of woods will not last a week. The coal helps. It burns slowly, and it brings lots of warmth to our houses and our homes.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. We're running a little over, so if you could wrap up.

MR. JOHN MUIR: And I'm in support of NGS. Let's keep our mine and power station going. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Norm, and then Marshall Johnson. And Marshall will be our last speaker.

MR. NORM SNEDDY: Greetings.

(Native language spoken.)

Good afternoon. Thank you for Interiors that are showing up and listening to our concern here. My name is Norm Sneddy. I'm from the tobacco clan too (native language spoken) side. I have worked for Peabody 30 years plus. I'm the second generation in mining, as a miner. I
want to thank Peabody and NGS for what it did for me.

Putting a roof over our heads, raised two kids, two beautiful grandkids, and also gave us an education to now where we stand. I'm not the only one that had the opportunity. It's everyone in my group that came with me today.

I'm proud to be a miner and the rec workforce for the last 20 plus years. We also grew up together and now it seems like. I retired, I was probably the youngest guy to retire out of Peabody. But I just fill in once in a great while now. I want to hand that torch to the young guys that came in.

We have a lot of young engineers, a lot of young workforce that would like to continue and contribute. Helping out both nation, the Hopi and the Navajos. That's not only helping out, also helping out the local chapter houses. And Peabody had done all that with the youth activities, plus giving out dollars on sponsorships, scholarships on and on.

And the mine really believes in safety. We take care of their customers. Without them we don't have jobs. The percentage on royalties to both nations and many more, the company has bent backwards for us for the last 40 years. And now we need to ask ourselves what can we do for the company, and our customers.
We need each other now. And to my Hopi brothers that I have worked with you and being there all the time, we continue helping each other. Again I would like to say thank you that you guys had came in listening to our concerns.

(Native language spoken.)

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.


Before you start, sir, I just wanted to let you all know if you submitted a card and you didn't get your name called, it's because we've already heard from you. And we're keeping track of that, and we're trying to get new people opportunities to speak.

So just know that we are -- we've been listening the whole time, and we've got everything on the record, but that's why.

Okay, sir.

MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: (Navajo language spoken.)

I am want to say to you, Mr. Interior, thank you for coming here, providing us the time, a little bit of time for a little bit of testimony. But we know that there has been an operation that has been in place since the '50s. And that it's premeditated how you are going to use the Indians against the Indians so you can prosper,
prosperity, so you can build billion dollar, trillion
dollar companies.

An operation that's going to mine our coal,
mine our water, that's going to produce electricity for
profit. That's going to provide water, running water, for
a population of 6 million people so they can have low cost
energy and power that they can profit from.

A so-called Central Arizona Project of one
annual year of trillion dollars that they profit from.
Even just from the industry of livestock and farming, USDA,
one billion dollars, that's how much they make. Don't tell
me that $4 billion price tag to the Central Arizona Project
has not been paid back. Don't tell me that. It's been
triple ten times. You're just playing with us. You're
playing with the livelihood of us.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: This is the time that
you can end this operation and pay for the damages. The
material damage that you've placed on our aquifer are the
same reasons why you built the Central Arizona Project in
Arizona. They have subsidence issues. They have earth
fissure issues. We're facing that here now.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. We need to wrap it
up.

MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: So you can honor that
for us, I want to say that to you Mr. Interior, David,
Mr. David Palumbo. I want to say that much to you. I want
to thank all of your staff. I want to thank the people
here too. And I hope --

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

Did you sufficiently provide your points in
English, or did you want the interpreter to also read what
you said in your native language?

MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: It's clear.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Pardon?

MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: It's clear.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

THE INTERPRETER: Joanna. Greetings, Mr. DOJ and those people that work for you, your staff and people
here. Thank you for voicing your comments. I live at -- I
was born and raised (native language spoken.) -- I didn't
quite hear it.

It's not running anymore. The water used to
run at the place where I grew up. And let me tell you,
we've used gallons and gallons of water. It seems like
without purpose, the water was used. And who for? You've
used a lot of water. The outside world has used a lot of
water, the white people.

And I do see a lot of places that are dry,
that have impacted. The impacts are visible. I'm a sheep
rancher, and I see all of this through my life. You've
taken this from us, and I appeal to you today: Why do it
more years? You've done it for 40 to 50 years now.

You've used the water wastefully. Yes, there
are a few people, a few native people that work for the
company. We don't all work at Peabody. And I know that
there is approximately 60 percent that live in poverty.
There are only a handful of people that have benefited from
the jobs at the mine and at the plant.

There is 50 percent unemployment. Sure, we
are with the union. I was reading, I was reading in the
newspaper that there are people looking for jobs in
Atlanta, in the Atlanta city. Our people work out there.

Please, look at our livelihood. Look at the
sheep that we've used to live a life that was sustainable.
The corn that we've grew that is used in the ceremonial
elements that are used as ceremonial elements. Have
respect for these valuable cultural traditional elements
that we have.

Try to understand us. Since you came here,
you've destroyed a major part of our livelihood. From my
eyes, through my lens, of course, it is a complex issue
this issue that is before us here. Thank you.

MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay, everybody. That's
the end of the session for today. So thank you all again.
And I guess, I assume I'll be seeing many of you again tomorrow.

So yes? Yeah, Chairman Honanie, do you want to say anything else? I'm sorry.

CHAIRMAN HERMAN HONANIE: Thank you. I know it's been two, three hours. And it's been a long afternoon, but I think that, you know, as I can sum it up in my own words that your concerns, your interests in this matter has been shown. It's been delivered by your remarks, and I appreciate that. I respect all of your remarks and your thinking, but this is why a session like this is being held to receive your thoughts.

And I do, like many of you stated, want to urge DOI, Palumbo and his superiors and on up the line to really take a look at this to really hear and read the words that you all have said because it's really, really important.

And, Mr. Palumbo, I do have a couple of other written statements which I would eventually like to submit because they were a bit too long for today's brief communication.

But we've got a long ways ahead. We've got a challenge before us. And I do agree with the statement that many of you have said that we're a resilient people, and we can live through the tough times, the hard times and
meet the challenges. But I think we all need to do it together. We all want the same outcome, and that is a good life, a long life, a happy life, a healthy life for ourselves, our offspring, our grandchildren and then the land.

And I guess that's the reason why I said a couple of days ago in Phoenix, maybe I've spent too many times around the smoking circle with the elders and learned from them and received and obtained the education that they spoke of, and how I would use it and apply it in my own personal ways as I go through life, be it farming, be it rancher, be it in my work, be it associating with people.

Many, many interesting lessons that I have learned throughout these years, and I credit my elders. I credit some of you. When I do talk to you, because some of you have expressed really, really great ideas. You all have great insight for this whole matter, and I commend you for that. I applaud you for that.

So I heard, you know, you all being educated through your experiences, through life, and in working and talking together, makes you some very dangerous Indians, but that's good.

Thank you very much. And we'll continue to do the ride. Thank you very much.

And thank you to Leslie, David, and everybody
here this afternoon. Thank you. And have a great weekend.

Bye-bye.

(Listening Session concludes at 2:39 p.m.)
CERTIFICATE OF CERTIFIED REPORTER

BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings were taken before me; that the witness before testifying was duly sworn by me to testify to the whole truth; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate record of the proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter reduced to print under my direction; that I have complied with the ethical obligations set forth in ACJA 7-206(F)(3) and ACJA 7-206 J(1)(g)(1) and (2).

I CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the parties hereto, nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof.

[ ] Review and signature was requested; any changes made by the witness will be attached to the original transcript.

[ ] Review and signature was waived/not requested.

[X] Review and signature not required.

Dated at Phoenix, Arizona, this 4th day of June, 2017.

[Signature]

DANIELLE C. GRIFFIN, APR
Certified Reporter
Arizona CR No. 50296

* * * * *

I CERTIFY that GRIFFIN & ASSOCIATES, LLC, has complied with the ethical obligations set forth in ACJA 7-206 (J)(1)(g)(1) through (6).

[Signature]

GRIFFIN & ASSOCIATES, LLC
Registered Reporting Firm
Arizona RRF No. R1005