

1 TRIBAL COUNCIL LISTENING SESSION

2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

Second Mesa, Arizona

May 18, 2017

11:11 a.m.

REPORTED BY:
DANIELLE C. GRIFFIN, RPR
Certified Reporter
Certificate No. 50296

PREPARED FOR:
U.S. DEPARTMENT OF INTERIOR

(Original)

1 TRIBAL COUNCIL LISTENING SESSION was taken on
2 May 18, 2017, commencing at 11:11 a.m. at the Veteran's
3 Memorial Center, Second Mesa, Arizona, before DANIELLE C.
4 GRIFFIN, a Certified Reporter in the State of Arizona.

5
6 APPEARING:

7
8 AS MODERATOR:

9 CENTRAL CREATIVE

10 By: Ms. Kristin Darr
11 24 West Camelback Road
12 Suite A-479
13 Phoenix, Arizona 85013-2529

14 U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR
15 BUREAU OF RECLAMATION

16 By: Ms. Leslie A. Meyers, P.E.
17 Ms. Sandra Eto
18 Mr. Kevin L. Black, Sr.
19 6150 West Thunderbird Drive
20 Glendale, Arizona 85306-4001

21 U.S. DEPARTMENT OF THE INTERIOR
22 BUREAU OF RECLAMATION

23 By: Mr. David M. Palumbo, P.E.
24 1849 C Street, Northwest
25 MS-7069-MIB
Washington, D.C. 20240-0001
Joanna Austin-Manygoats
Navajo Language Interpreter

1 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Good morning, everybody.
2 We're going to start a little late, just because we
3 switched locations. So we'll get some people signed in,
4 and then we'll get started.

5 Remember that if you'd like to speak, you
6 need to fill out a card that looks like this, and they're
7 at the front desk. And then you turn it into them, and
8 then they'll get it to me. Okay? So a card if you'd like
9 to speak. We'll get started in a little bit.

10 (Brief recess.)

11 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. To start off, good
12 morning, everybody. My name is Kristin. I'll introduce
13 myself later, but Chairman Honanie was going to make some
14 welcoming remarks.

15 CHAIRMAN HERMAN HONANIE: Good morning,
16 everybody. First of all, a lot of thanks and appreciation
17 to the civic center staff for quickly being able to
18 accommodate us. It was at the last minute. So where is
19 Ice? Take a bow, Ice, and your staff.

20 (Native language spoken.)

21 And I want to welcome everybody here this
22 morning for this hearing regarding the NGS. It's an
23 important matter. It's a significant matter, and I can
24 judge by everybody's interest, concern, and just maybe
25 wanting to learn more about what the discussions are with

1 regard to the NGS.

2 And I think this is going to be the third of
3 a series of hearings that the folks up here in the
4 Department of Interior are holding across the region.
5 Tomorrow may, as I understand, be the final one in Window
6 Rock. So if you have the drive and the time and the energy
7 to drive to Window Rock, feel free to do so. They had one
8 a couple of days in Phoenix at the Heard Museum and now and
9 then, I believe, yesterday at Page.

10 But this is an opportunity for you all to
11 come forth and voice your opinion. Voice your concerns or
12 questions. And as I stated, to learn about the situation
13 and the matter. So the DOI and the Department of Interior,
14 the folks up here are here to listen. They want to learn
15 firsthand from you, the people, who you feel you're
16 indirectly impacted positively, negatively or in between.

17 But it's been very interesting. I attended
18 the Phoenix session a couple of days ago, and it was very,
19 very interesting to hear what many people said.

20 As you can see, all the guys wearing T-shirts
21 that are blue are miners from the Kayenta mine, and
22 obviously they have a certain perspective and a certain
23 interest in this whole matter. And I think I'd like to say
24 that as far as Hopi is concerned, NGS is a bloodline for us
25 when it comes to revenue. And I think some of us will

1 probably express that, expound on that more and more
2 because that bloodline is our source of livelihood as far
3 as tribal government is concerned.

4 As far as sharing of resources to the village
5 is concerned, as far as the employment is concerned. So
6 there's a far reaching effect with this matter and the
7 concerns arising in that capacity.

8 So but I wanted to just welcome you all.
9 Welcome to Kykotsmovi who are out of the town, to our
10 Navajo friends. And welcome and take part in the hearings,
11 say your piece, say your mind. The floor is open, and
12 we'll go ahead and get started.

13 So I'd like to call on you to go ahead and
14 continue. So (native language spoken). Thank you for
15 being here.

16 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you, sir.

17 Okay. Once again, my name is Kristin Darr.
18 I'm an independent contractor. And I am here to be your
19 third-party neutral moderator for this session. So many of
20 you are old friends of mine now, because this is our third
21 hearing, our listening session together.

22 But I want -- for those of you who don't know
23 me, my job is to make sure that these people from the
24 Department of Interior get to listen to you. And that
25 means that each and every one of you who wants to speak

1 within the time frame that we've allotted. And we're going
2 to give preference, obviously, to people who we haven't
3 heard from yet, but I'm sure we'll hear from some of you
4 again, and we'll welcome that.

5 Before we get into that listening session,
6 David Palumbo with the Bureau of Reclamation is going to
7 give a presentation. And then this is Leslie Meyers also
8 with the Bureau of Reclamation. So Dave's going to give a
9 short presentation, and then we'll start.

10 So remember that if you want to speak, to
11 fill out, please, a speaker card and hand it and there at
12 the front entrance there. That helps us keep everybody in
13 order and keep things moving so we can hear from as many of
14 you as possible.

15 One more thing. We have interpreters from
16 the Navajo language and the Hopi language. So if you'd
17 prefer to speak to us in your native language, then they
18 can provide the English translation to the court reporter.
19 And they'll do that after you speak upon your -- if you
20 would like that. So they are here. Joanna is our Navajo
21 interpreter, and Clark our Hopi interpreter.

22 Okay. So don't forget we've got that
23 available to you.

24 Okay. Dave?

25 MR. DAVID PALUMBO: Thank you, Kristin.

1 Thank you, Chairman Honanie, for your opening remarks.

2 My name is David Palumbo. I'm a deputy
3 commissioner for operations for the Bureau of Reclamation
4 within the Department of the Interior. And Leslie Meyers
5 is a Phoenix area office manager for the Department of the
6 Interior that has responsibilities for many things,
7 including to these Navajo Generating Station and the
8 Central Arizona Project.

9 We're very pleased to be here with you to
10 listen. As the chairman indicated, we want you to speak
11 your mind, to speak your piece, as the chairman indicated,
12 and share that with us.

13 I'm going to go over a couple of process
14 points in just a minute, and I'll identify an email address
15 that you can use to send in your comments, if you wish to
16 do that in writing, to supplement what you say, to
17 substitute what you say, in lieu of saying anything,
18 however you'd like to communicate that with us, we are more
19 than welcome and eager to get that feedback.

20 Let's go to the next slide.

21 So as was indicated earlier, this is the
22 third of four listening sessions. Obviously we're in
23 Kykotsmovi, and thank you for the hospitality for us being
24 here. Tomorrow we'll be in Window Rock for the last
25 listening session.

1 Again, the purpose here is to hear from you.
2 We're not going to be answering questions today but we want
3 to hear from you. We want to have that part of the record.
4 And so that's very important. We want to optimize the time
5 that you have here with us today to speak to us.

6 So a few items on process, most of which have
7 been covered already. Fill out a speaker card if you wish
8 to speak. We're going to be limiting the comments to three
9 minutes without interpretation, six minutes with
10 interpretation today, so we can get as many folks in as
11 possible.

12 Again, I have already indicated the email the
13 address. It's very simple, NGS@USBR.gov. And maybe just
14 to punctuate, we have a court reporter here, thank you,
15 working extremely hard to record everything that's said so
16 we can reflect on it.

17 Leslie and I will be taking notes, but we'll
18 be able to refer to the record that's created here today as
19 well as other leadership within the Department of the
20 Interior.

21 So a little bit of background. I know most
22 folks know all of these facts that are on the screen, and
23 I'd like to go over them with you just to make sure.

24 Navajo Generating Station is a 2,250 megawatt
25 coal fire power plant. There's three units there, three

1 stacks that operate outside of Page, Arizona, on Navajo
2 Nation trust lands.

3 The current lease was originally signed in
4 1969. It was for a 50-year term. That term ends
5 December 22nd, 2019. There -- I'll talk about the EIS here
6 in just a minute.

7 The coal for the Navajo Generating Station is
8 supplied exclusively by Kayenta mine operated by Peabody
9 Coal. It's roughly 80 miles away from Navajo Generating
10 Station. The coal is transported via an electric railroad.
11 And that mine is located on Navajo Nation and Hopi tribal
12 lands.

13 In 2014 we began an environmental impact
14 statement process to extend the lease from the end of 2019
15 to the end of 2044, 25-year lease extension. That was
16 built into the original lease. And we call that a
17 discretionary extension. So we had to go through an
18 environmental impact statement process. Late last year we
19 published a draft environmental impact statement as a
20 result.

21 A little bit about the Navajo Generating
22 Station participants. There are six participants,
23 including the Bureau of Reclamation. We have a
24 24.3 percent stake in Navajo Generation Station. Salt
25 River Project is the operator of the facility. They own

1 our share for the use and benefit of the United States.
2 And as you can see there, the other owners are listed and
3 their percentages of their entitlement are included there
4 as well.

5 So current status. Current status is really
6 that in February of this year the non-U.S. owners, those
7 that were listed on the previous slide, decided that they
8 would not continue with the Navajo Generating Station post
9 2019. That's after December 22nd, 2019.

10 They indicated that they would operate the
11 facility through the end of 2019 if certain agreements
12 could be reached that would allow for the decommissioning
13 of the facility after 2019. There's ongoing activities
14 that I'll get to on the next slide with respect to getting
15 to 2019 as well as getting past 2019.

16 So after that announcement in February, the
17 Department of the Interior got together. We decided we
18 would begin a stakeholder and outreach process. So May 1st
19 we had our first meeting, and we embarked on what I would
20 call three parallel paths, that aren't mutually exclusive.

21 The first parallel path that we embarked on
22 is getting to 2019 as I indicated. That's principally an
23 agreement between the Navajo Nation and the Salt River
24 Project, again, to operate the facility all the way until
25 the end of 2019 and allow decommissioning thereafter. So

1 we're working very hard with that. The Department of
2 Interior is helping with that process. We have folks
3 working on it as we're speaking, so trying to get to that
4 point where we can operate the facility post 2019.

5 Then there's an initiative to look at
6 economic ways to operate the facility post 2019, looking at
7 the economics at the plant, at the mine, elsewhere, factors
8 that are impacting the economics at the facility. Folks,
9 including the Department of Interior are working on that,
10 we're looking -- working with the stakeholders identifying
11 potential new owners we well as potential new customers.

12 That's the second parallel path that's
13 ongoing.

14 The third parallel path is -- and it's a path
15 that we've been on for quite some time -- is how can we
16 minimize any negative impacts to those who currently
17 receive benefits from Navajo Generating Station when it
18 closes irrespective of the time, whether that's 2044 or
19 2019 or somewhere in between.

20 Also, an extremely important initiative that
21 we're undertaking at the Department of the Interior with
22 stakeholders to, again, identify ways for economic
23 development to minimize negative impacts.

24 And with that, again, is the email address
25 for you to send in written comments.

1 Turn it back over to Kristin, and we'll get
2 started.

3 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you, Dave.

4 Let's see. So once again, we are -- I'm
5 going to be timing -- I know you all call me the
6 three-minute girl. I know this. I heard it. And that you
7 were glad I wasn't in line at the bathroom today.

8 So but in all seriousness, the reason that I
9 do that is to try and get as many of you to be able to
10 speak as possible. So let's all work together on that.

11 What I'm going to do is I'm going to call a
12 name, and then I'm going to call a second name. And the
13 first name I call will come up and speak. I'll indicate to
14 you when you've hit your three-minute mark. The second
15 name that I call is our on deck speaker. Okay?

16 So the first name is Leonard Seleskewa.
17 Okay. And then the second name is Cliff Balenquah. Okay.
18 Right there. All right.

19 And you get to test the microphone. Is it
20 working? Okay. I'll come help you.

21 MR. LEONARD SELESTEWA: Okay. Good
22 afternoon, everybody. My name is Leonard Selestewa. I
23 come from the Village of Lower Moenkopi up here in northern
24 Arizona near Tuba City, my neighbors to the north.

25 I'm here representing our stakeholder

1 thoughts on the closure of Navajo Generating Station and
2 how it impacts our village allocations, but also brief
3 comments to be made in regards to where it all began and
4 where we all find ourselves today.

5 I grew up in the Moenkopi area all my life.
6 I'm a farmer, and I'm an artist. That's been my bread and
7 butter most of my life. I've called my village my home for
8 over 54 years.

9 But how this all began in terms of the
10 history of our area known as the Black Mesa region, coal
11 and water, our natural resources, water being the most
12 precious of all with the closure of Mohave, at least it
13 kept our homeland intact.

14 Now, we have a precious resource also found
15 in coal. And over these many, many years, the State of
16 Arizona and the departments of the federal bureaucracy in
17 Washington have allowed mining to -- of this coal, of this
18 natural resource to produce electricity for basically the
19 energy needed to pump water uphill known as the CAP.

20 Now, this has gone on since you mentioned,
21 1970. Now, when you look at the history of it all, it's
22 roughly almost 40 years that others have benefited. They
23 have benefited from Native American people. So I'm not
24 really here to talk about necessarily where the negative
25 impacts began and where they lie now.

1 I think that with all this time that the
2 state and the federal departments in Washington in allowing
3 this to go on and at this stage of the closure, we seem to
4 be forgotten. I need the Department of Interior to
5 understand that some of this goodness and kindness and the
6 work involved in utilizing our natural resources has to at
7 some point reciprocate back to us tribes.

8 My neighbors who surround us, the Navajo and
9 especially the Hopi, we're looking at development, yes, but
10 not on the grand scale that our neighborhood tribe is
11 looking at.

12 MS. KRISTIN DARR: You're at three minutes,
13 sir.

14 MR. LEONARD SELESTEWA: Okay.

15 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

16 MR. LEONARD SELESTEWA: So in whatever we
17 look at in terms of possible replacement of energy
18 development on Hopi, I'm hoping that the Department of
19 Interior looks at their rights on transmission lines that
20 are located close to my village and close to our tribal
21 lands be looked at in a manner that it is fair to both
22 tribes.

23 I say this not in pleading and begging anyone
24 here today in terms of hoping that this will be looked at
25 in terms of how things can be fairly shared by both tribes.

1 going to be on our children. We do have students here. We
2 do have a lot of people here that really want to have a
3 good solid American life. And I believe that once this
4 closure happens, this just going to really, not only put
5 the Hopi people in a the bind, but also surrounding
6 neighbors and user. Not only these tribes, but also the
7 State of Arizona.

8 I'm looking at probably almost 700 million
9 plus in state tax. And I know the Hopi tribe, we used to
10 get about 200 billion, and I'm sure it's more than that.
11 And you can imagine that. I can't even speak what a
12 hundred dollar bill looks likes, much less think about
13 numbers in those sizes. So everything that is happening at
14 the mine is going to be devastating.

15 Now, I say this with a little bit of effort,
16 because again, there is a trust responsibility that the
17 federal government has to American Indians. You came, you
18 saw, you want, you dug, you made your money off of our coal
19 and water and now you're going to leave us like this? I
20 really don't think so.

21 There is more responsibility from you all
22 that we need to have. This country, this country here -- I
23 don't have to go into that, but this country knows what
24 this is all about . We already know. Yes, like a mother,
25 we can nurse from our -- like a child, we can nurse from

1 our mother.

2 But on the other hand, we can't leave it just
3 like that. And if you know what I'm talking about, I don't
4 think it's going to take anymore than that.

5 But the other thing is that economic
6 development at this level, at our level, would have to be
7 something that's going to be viable, sustainable. We have
8 plenty of coal here on Hopi. And I think there's some
9 ideas, and as a matter of fact, technology that BOR has
10 that you can come in and implement.

11 These are some things that we can't always
12 say we can do it now simply because of technology and
13 funding.

14 Outside of that, I want to thank all of you
15 for coming and giving us the opportunity. And I trust that
16 the United States government will not let down the Indian
17 tribes again, primarily Hopi. Thank you.

18 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

19 Okay. Lewis, and then Cliff Kaye.

20 MR. LEWIS PAVINYAMA: (Native language
21 spoken.) Just like to say that I retired from the mine two
22 years ago now. It was a happy feeling. And today it was
23 almost like a family reunion to see all my workers here
24 with me or used to work for me.

25 I just like to point out that today or when

1 we were growing up, we were taught, we were told by our
2 parents, "Look both ways before you cross. Look up and
3 down. Look up and look down." But I learned from that as
4 of today that when we look to the side, where are we going?
5 When we look at this side, is there a greener grass there?
6 We have to take our pick. We can't just look back and
7 forth all the time.

8 When we look up, we look at you, our
9 government, the United States of America. You're still
10 holding us. We trust in you. We trust you that you will
11 make things better for all Native American Indians
12 throughout the world. When we look down, we look at our
13 kids, our grandkids, kids that are still coming to see what
14 kind of world they're coming to.

15 Every one of us benefit from electricity.
16 Today I don't think our grandkids can't go without watching
17 TV, playing video games. Those are the days when we used
18 to sit in the dark.

19 My people, they benefit from this coal.
20 Every village that is on this Hopi reservation benefits
21 from it. During ceremonies that's the only thing that will
22 keep us warm.

23 Today, elders , I come from village of
24 Kykotsmovi. Our community workers even go up there to get
25 coal for the elderlies just to keep warm. So we're asking

1 everybody that today is benefiting from this. And I would
2 really ask you to reconsider, but it's really up to us as
3 Native Americans to how are we strong about these issues.

4 One last member, like I said, just like a
5 family reunion. When I used to work, we talked about
6 teamwork, work together. Communication is the key to work
7 success. Thank you.

8 (Native language spoken.)

9 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

10 Cliff Kaye, and then Edith Simonson. Edith?
11 Where is Edith? Great. Thank you.

12 MR. CLIFF KAYE: Good morning.

13 (Native language spoken.)

14 My name is Cliff Kaye. I come from the
15 village of Moenkopi. I'm here on behalf of our village of
16 lower Moenkopi representing our village government and our
17 jurisdictional interests that we have in that area.

18 Our village, the Village of Moenkopi, is
19 right next door to Tuba City, and it's the closest Hopi
20 village to NGS.

21 And the gentleman right before spoke to we've
22 all the benefited from electricity. Yes, that's true, but
23 not in our whole lifetime. I grew up in a household with
24 no running water, no electricity. And all my life I've
25 traversed back and forth between my village and the

1 village -- or it's not a village it's a city, going to
2 Phoenix. And there's all these power lines that go down
3 that way.

4 And when I was growing up, I didn't know what
5 that was. You know, and it's not until later that we
6 realized that because of Hopi coal, Hopi water, that our
7 urban areas in our state, outside of our state have been
8 benefiting off of all of that. And we go back to our
9 communities. We're right next door. We don't have any of
10 those benefits. Nothing has come.

11 And when it's talking to these points of your
12 trust responsibility, where is your presence? The only
13 presence we have is when something like this comes about,
14 where, you know, we're running into a problem.

15 We've had all these areas, and you don't come
16 to our communities. So what I'm saying is, we're glad
17 you're here, but it's been a long time in coming to have
18 that communication like the gentleman had said.

19 So with that said, going forward to minimize
20 and mitigate the economic impacts that are going to be had,
21 our village desires for those points to be really relayed
22 to us and provided to us in terms of how those impacts --
23 you know, how that energy all that water, all those things,
24 how is that going to be supplemented? How is that revenue
25 going to be supplemented?

1 And to have our village have an active role
2 in possible energy development, because energy plans,
3 whatever we can do in terms of the existing infrastructure
4 that is abutting right next to our land.

5 So that's really the message that I want to
6 convey here, at least, that our village is aware of this
7 situation, and we'd appreciate continued communication from
8 your agencies. We've already had Mr. Kevin from BOR come
9 out to us, and we've heard a brief presentation on some of
10 the planning that the forethought that's coming out.

11 So just so you're aware that our village is
12 interested to hear more about those plans.

13 (Native language spoken.)

14 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

15 Okay. Edith, and then Cal Johnson, Colonel?
16 Cal? Johnson?

17 Is it Cal? Caleb. Okay. Thank you. All
18 right.

19 MS. EDITH SIMONSON: (Navajo language
20 spoken.)

21 THE INTERPRETER: My name is Edith Simonson.
22 I am Navajo. I live -- I live at Big Mountain area. I'm a
23 mother. I'm a grandmother. I was born and raised upon the
24 Black Mesa area. I still live there. I have grandchildren
25 and grandchildren to come in the future.

1 I always think, what are they going to -- how
2 are they going to live? What are they going to strive to
3 make a good life for themselves? I don't work. I've been
4 living the old ways that I was taught by my parents. I
5 live on the traditional ways of raising livestock. Off of
6 the livestock the wool is used for rugs, making rugs and
7 supporting my children. That is how I have been a mother.
8 I don't get any handouts or assistance from the government.

9 I am now thinking about the next generation.
10 I don't just think about myself. Most precious of all is
11 water. We've wasted a lot of water on the mesa. We've dug
12 up our Mother Earth, and she is suffering.

13 I want to continue to teach the old ways of
14 life because that is how I strive in today's world. Some
15 of our children will never come back to living the old
16 ways, but there is life in these teachings.

17 On a daily base, the coal are burning. They
18 ignite and cause health problems. I've seen a lot of risk
19 and health problems in my days.

20 Living in the old ways is not the same.
21 Everybody has outgrown that. The world has become crazed
22 with -- with ill struggles of life. Nobody heeds to the
23 teachings anymore. We're like a bait. We get thrown out
24 there, and we suffer the consequences.

25 If you want to keep the NGS open, do not

1 touch our coal resources or the water resources. Leave
2 that for us. You can get your energy and economics
3 parallel from other places. I do not want to have our coal
4 and our water used if NGS is to continue.

5 My animals, my livestock, all the way down to
6 the insects is suffering. They've been here. They've been
7 here with us, but now they're suffering.

8 For an example, I haul water that costs me
9 money. Every time I pour -- I put the water out for the
10 livestock, the deer come in to drink. Other animals come
11 in to drink that same water that I have bought.

12 That is my comment, and I thank you for
13 giving me this opportunity to speak. Thank you.

14 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

15 Caleb Johnson. And then Spencer Pavinyama.

16 MR. CALEB JOHNSON: Deputy commissioner,
17 tribal chairman, to me this presents a great opportunity
18 for the Navajo tribe. USBR or Navajo or the power plant
19 that's located on the Navajo property. So the Navajo tribe
20 has a great opportunity at this particular time.

21 My opinion is that they should take up this
22 opportunity and buy the plant and run the plant for us as
23 long as they are capable. The only question I have is
24 whether they have the capability to run the power plant,
25 but I think that's the best option that is presented here.

1 The second thing that needs to happen is that
2 the mining operations by Peabody should phase out and let
3 the tribes do that process of mining.

4 And, finally, the third option is to build a
5 railroad up to the mine and transport the coal to Japan.
6 Japan has expressed an interest in this coal, Hopi coal,
7 because of it's low sulfur and high Btu. That's the kind
8 of coal that they are looking for.

9 There will always be a need for electricity.
10 There will always -- and we all -- and there are millions
11 of tons of coal up here in that area.

12 So the only question that is before us today
13 is whether that plant should continue to operate. And like
14 I suggest, my recommendation is that the Navajo tribe buy
15 that plant, manage it, operate it, so that it will continue
16 while other phases of this program continue to be explored.

17 I think that's the best option that I can
18 see. I've read all the articles in this situation, and it
19 seems to me that the best option that I can see is that the
20 Navajo tribe buy the plants, manage the plants for as long
21 as they can, and provide employment for their people.

22 As far as the Hopi tribe is concerned, about
23 90 percent of the income comes from the royalties of the
24 coal. We don't get much of that royalty from the plant.
25 But if the plant shuts down, we will not be able to get the

1 royalties that we need to operate the tribal government.

2 Thank you.

3 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

4 Spencer, and then Melvin George?

5 MR. SPENCER PAVINYAMA: Good morning,
6 everybody. Good sign. This is the sign I use when I was
7 working at Peabody. It's going to be just like a safety
8 meeting for me, what I do with my employees when I was a
9 supervisor at Peabody. I worked for Peabody for 37 years.
10 And I was one of the lucky ones. And I had a chance to
11 retire from Peabody.

12 When we look at all of these issues that goes
13 on, I'm glad that the people, the employees at the mine,
14 they're the voices of people and going around talking. If
15 we just sit home and talk about this, nobody will ever hear
16 us, what we want.

17 We all know we got resources underneath us to
18 benefit the Native American Indians. That is ours. And
19 when we see ours, in this all these issues that's coming
20 about, it's got us advantages, disadvantages.

21 These are the things that we need to put
22 aside and go after what's going to be good for the people,
23 our children, our grandkids, kids that are not here yet for
24 the future. This is already been taught a long time ago.
25 That's why they said you will receive from your left. You

1 give from your right.

2 Your mother brought you into this world. She
3 made you, put you down and lowered yourself. That way you
4 will have ground to stand on. Ground to be eating from is
5 Mother Earth, the Creator that we all talk about. Whoever
6 created us set all this already for us.

7 Our teachings, us, we're complaining. If we
8 keep complaining, that's what we're going to get, us
9 people, society, we think backwards. If we think bad, it's
10 going to be bad. If we going to look ahead and think good,
11 we're going to be good. We're going to get things good.
12 We are here. Things that is going to be given to
13 abundance.

14 It's like Thanksgiving day for everybody.
15 Every day we're lucky we're still walking on Mother Earth,
16 and we're still speaking. If we go against it, if we go
17 against each other, we ain't going to go nowhere. Just
18 like Mr. Johnson said, there's opinions out there. We need
19 to talk. We need to speak.

20 All these things were proposed way before
21 railroads, water stations. Everything that the people will
22 benefit from, all this has been spoken before. And when we
23 came to this earth, we were all prepared. We were given of
24 what you going to do? You're put here not just to fill up
25 a space. You're here for a reason. And this is what we

1 need to think.

2 And I want to say again, we should be like
3 these employees at the mine. They're the ones that are
4 feeding, working for us just like this morning, cold
5 morning, I bet people still went and picked up that pieces
6 of coal, burned it to stay warm. These are all ours that
7 is given to your footsteps, and yet we still argue what we
8 want and what we don't want.

9 In closing, I'm going to say, Good job,
10 Kayenta Mine, Black Mesa mine people. I was part of it,
11 and I am still going to be part of it. And I'm going to be
12 behind you all the way. Thank you.

13 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

14 Melvin George, and then Audrey with the
15 really long last name that starts with the N. Okay.
16 You're next after Melvin.

17 MR. MELVIN GEORGE: Good afternoon. My name
18 is Melvin George, and I'm from Village of Kykotsmovi. And
19 my comment to the NGS closure is this: The Hopi tribe has
20 never benefited from this plant. Now, NGS power plant and
21 Peabody coal mine are different subjects, but they also
22 work hand in hand. Most of the power from NGS goes down to
23 a power turbines that pump water out of the Colorado River
24 into the CPS that goes down to the Phoenix and Tucson area.

25 As far as I know, our tribe, the Hopi tribe,

1 has never benefited from NGS. Like the Navajo tribe, they
2 have not benefited either through electricity or otherwise.
3 Yes, there was provided employment.

4 Back in 2013, a technical work group
5 agreement was signed by the Navajo tribe, the Gila River
6 tribe, and the Tohono O'odham Nation to continue the water
7 that was being pumped to CPS and benefiting, not only the
8 city of Phoenix, Tucson, but also these tribes, the
9 southern tribes.

10 And as you know, the secretary of interior
11 still have control over our lands. All across the United
12 States, the secretary of interior have control. And I
13 would say if the Hopi tribe was to be provided electricity
14 from Navajo Generating Station, then yes, I would say keep
15 it open. Keep people employed.

16 The white people are businesspeople. And if
17 they don't make any money out of something that is
18 provided, and they will close it. Just like Ford Motor
19 Company here announced lately, they're going to be closing
20 a plant and eliminating at least 2,000 jobs. But that's
21 their way of business. They're businesspeople.

22 Here, we depend on other companies to bring
23 us income. And I hope that if Navajo Generating Station
24 can be eliminated, then let it be. We don't have much
25 control over it. Like I say, there are businesspeople

1 running these things. Thank you.

2 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

3 Okay. Audrey, and then Chermayne Etsitty.

4 Chermayne? Okay. Hi.

5 MS. AUDREY NARINDRANKURA: Hey, my name is
6 Audrey Narindrakura. I am from Hard Rock. And I'm
7 currently living in Polacca. And I prepared a statement
8 here.

9 The Navajo and the Hopi health have been
10 sacrificed in the name of providing water and power to the
11 rest of Arizona. Cancer, asthma, and other illnesses are
12 far more common than they used to be as a result of the air
13 and water pollution from NGS and Kayenta mine. The owners
14 must provide funding and assistance for the local
15 communities for long-term study of health impacts and
16 health care costs resulting from the operation of NGS and
17 Kayenta mine.

18 We should not be forced to choose between
19 jobs and the health of Diné and Hopi people. Like I said,
20 I currently reside in Polacca where we have running water,
21 but we can't drink the water. I drive to Hard Rock and buy
22 water from Hard Rock chapter for my family to consume.

23 And I think this is an issue. And I think
24 this is a big concern. And I would like NGS to back off
25 the mine, to back off on our water, so we can continue to

1 use our water for our children and our future.

2 And I also, you know, do small farming, and
3 I'm learning how to do greenhouse farming here. And I know
4 that a lot of -- there's a lot of farmers here and a lot of
5 people grow their own foods. And for me and my family,
6 that's the way of life that I want to teach my children and
7 my grandchildren.

8 And with that said, I'd like to thank the
9 Department of Interior for listening and putting up this
10 listening sessions for our communities.

11 (Native language spoken.)

12 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

13 Chermayne, and then Nick Ashley.

14 Nick? Got you. Okay, thanks.

15 MS. CHERMAYNE ETSITTY: Hello. My name is
16 Chermayne Etsitty. I am a first shift driller shooter up
17 at the mine. I'm also a resident at the mine. I literally
18 live in the middle of -- well, before when Black Mesa mine
19 was there, I lived in the center of them. All I can say is
20 I am healthy. My parents are healthy. My grandparents are
21 healthy. Everyone has been healthy that I know of. If you
22 want to say that you have asthma, then yeah, we don't.

23 We use the water. We use everything for our
24 animals. The fields are perfect out there. Our animals
25 are living great. And I use the money that I have to help

1 out my family for working -- from working up there.

2 So I don't know -- just keep NGS open. I
3 would love to retire there, or I'm going to retire there.
4 I know it's going to continue because coal is everything.
5 It provides, it burns. Everybody who has electric.

6 And just thank you for listening for
7 everything.

8 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

9 And Nick, and then Elena Etsitty. Elena?
10 Okay.

11 MR. NICK ASHLEY: (Native language spoken.)

12 My name is Nicholas Ashley, and I prepared a
13 little bit statement here.

14 So roughly 6 million people in the central
15 and southern Arizona benefit from the destruction of Black
16 Mesa. The NGS complex, which includes the Kayenta mine's
17 operation is heavily anchored in the misuse of Navajo and
18 Hopi water. The aquifer has been depleted by 35 years of
19 pumping. This is billions of gallons of pristine ice age
20 water that can never be replaced.

21 The Navajo were required to waive to 50,000
22 acre-feet of water for NGS since 1969. The Navajo and Hopi
23 need this water for economic development that is culturally
24 aligned with our traditions. I am asking for the
25 Department of Interior to support the Navajo and Hopi's

1 transition from an extractive economy to a more sustainable
2 and restorative economy that is based on the Navajo and
3 Hopi do like farming.

4 I am also asking for the Department of
5 Interior to advocate for full reclamation at the NGS site
6 and Kayenta mine with an emphasis on the reclamation of the
7 Navajo aquifer. Please uphold your trust responsibility to
8 the Navajo and Hopi people. Thank you.

9 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

10 Next is Elena, and then Layna or Lena Henley.

11 MS. ELENA ETSITTY: Everybody from the Hopi
12 tribe and those of us that came from K mine, we're all
13 here. And some of us are for the Navajo Generating Station
14 and the coal mine. But if you think about it, it's
15 buildings that Navajo Generating Station is one issue. But
16 then it comes down. You need to remember that everything
17 has a start and a finish.

18 And no matter what we think, the Navajo
19 Generating Station that the closing of that plant will
20 actually impact everyone. We're not just talking this
21 area, that area, we're talking a tremendous -- it's going
22 to impact on everybody. Yeah.

23 But I am for keeping that plant open because,
24 not only do I work there, it helps provide for my parents,
25 and also my extended family, relatives, it doesn't matter.

1 And then also a lot of what we do directly
2 goes into a lot of what -- what a lot of us wouldn't do.
3 We put your daily lives on the line to go after this coal
4 to keep you warm, to help supply this coal need,
5 electricity, water.

6 Times have changed. And if you look at from
7 the beginning of when it started, yes, there was all these
8 health impacts and things. But if you look at it from then
9 to now, we've come a long way. Coal has been burning a lot
10 cleaner. Reclamation is gone a lot further. I mean, look
11 at it. It's not just one thing, but another.

12 And also, as far as the water issue, it's
13 something that will always be there. No matter whether or
14 not it's taken from this area, that area. It's from
15 everywhere, that's the impacts of global warming. It's
16 also impacts of everything. Not only as times have
17 changed, but we are looking forward to the future.

18 I'm a third generation coal miner. My
19 grandparents who are no longer with us now, also worked
20 there and retired. My parents work at the coal mine, and
21 they do still to this day.

22 I was very fortunate enough to get on. I
23 worked as a vendor onsite with Peabody, but I also worked
24 my way up. So as far as -- some days, I would come home
25 clean. Some days, I would come home dirty. And all you

1 see is the pupils of my eyes sometimes, but that's what I
2 do. And I want to keep that going.

3 Because future generations will need the jobs
4 and also we also want to keep the lights on and to help
5 provide for our families. And it's just not that, but we
6 also help our community. There is a lot of issues going
7 on, but we need to remember it starts with the Navajo
8 Generating Station for right now.

9 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Elena, we're a
10 little bit over.

11 MS. ELENA ETSITTY: Oh, I'm sorry.

12 MS. KRISTIN DARR: No, no, no. As long as
13 you've got your -- you said what you want to say.

14 MS. ELENA ETSITTY: As introduction, yeah,
15 I'm a third generation miner. I was born and raised there
16 on the mine site. And I've gone off to go to college. I
17 came back, because there was no funding to go to school.
18 So I had to pick up my pace and go to work. And that's
19 pretty much what I did.

20 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thanks.

21 MS. ELENA ETSITTY: Yep.

22 MS. KRISTIN DARR: We'll move on. Thank you
23 very much.

24 Lena and then Dan Herder.

25 MS. LENA HENLEY: (Native language spoken.)

1 THE INTERPRETER: I didn't write down all her
2 names. She's Lena Simonson Henley.

3 Greetings. And then she introduced herself
4 by clan. And she lives -- I live in Hard Rock, and my
5 children are the organization of 20 (native language
6 spoken). I'm 70 years old. I've lived in the area on
7 Black Mesa before NGS came to being, before Peabody,
8 Kayenta mine and Black Mesa mine started mining the coal up
9 there.

10 I used to herd sheep in the area between
11 Oraibi Wash and Dinnebito Wash, and there was a lot of
12 water. There was small creeks and stream from the water
13 shed where I remember. There were a lot of birds and a lot
14 of wildlife. I miss a lot of those that have become
15 extinct or have gone other places, especially the birds.

16 We, the five fingered, used to walk upon the
17 earth. We used to ride our horses until the wagon came,
18 and then the vehicles, but there were not that many
19 vehicles around. Even the elder mens and the elderly women
20 used to walk or they rode horses. They must have been very
21 strong. And there was a few people that even talk about
22 health issues. These issues that they talk about were very
23 minor.

24 Today there's a lot of people with different
25 ailment, respiratory problems, cancer, a lot of health

1 risks. These are the larger topics that people talk about
2 these days. We had a healthy stand of vegetation. They
3 were strong, versus today our vegetations are really poor.
4 They too need water. I remember my parents. They used to
5 have a large cornfield growing corn, melon, squash and
6 other vegetables.

7 Today we see smaller farms that don't produce
8 very many -- that don't produce a variety of vegetable that
9 we used to see in the old days.

10 It's enough just to feed a family, maybe an
11 extended family. I, too, haul water in the Hard Rock area,
12 and I have to pay for the water. I recently received the
13 electricity into my home, but I don't have running water.
14 But I don't miss it. It's been a long time that I've --
15 that I had to haul water.

16 Today's topic of NGS, we're sitting here
17 listening to its closure. I understand that there is many
18 owners, and some of the owners are leaving. Why are we
19 asking them to continue operation if they're not going to
20 make the same amount of money that they're making? I don't
21 understand that. I'm saying what I've just said because
22 I -- I think about my grandchildren and many more
23 grandchildren's generation of grandchildren to come.

24 I'm asking because I think about the animals
25 and the vegetables. They too need water. If we dig out

1 all the coal from the mesa and use up all the water, where
2 are we going to get that water? Where -- how are we going
3 to reestablish those aquifers? That is my question and
4 that is my worry and my concern.

5 And that is all I'm going to say today.

6 Thank you.

7 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

8 Dan Herder. And then Dewayne Young.

9 MR. DAN HERDER: (Navajo language spoken.)

10 THE INTERPRETER: Dan Herder. Greetings, and
11 you know my name now. And he addressed his clans. This
12 topic that you're all talking about here, the plant,
13 there's a lot of pollutants that rise out of the plants as
14 smoke. I've worked there before. There are a lot of
15 risks, health issues as well as environmental issues that
16 are fatal to our people.

17 All these contaminants have probably seeped
18 into the earth, penetrated the earth as well as the air
19 pollutants. I've seen it when I was working there.

20 I know that they increased the emission or
21 the release of these deadly pollutants at night. In the
22 morning you would see the haze, the brown haze that lay on
23 top of the plant.

24 They even showed me how they release these
25 deadly contaminants and pollutants into the air. And

1 water, water is so precious. Are we going to use up all
2 our groundwater aquifers? What are the animals and our
3 children going to use in the future? Are they even
4 studying these animals that live, that have habitats in the
5 area. Just like us, their lungs are probably getting worse
6 with layers of fine coal.

7 People that work there, they go for the
8 prescription every day, it seems. And they get prescribed
9 different types of medication. I'm saying this because
10 I've worked there. I've seen people.

11 Yes, in the old days our elders and our
12 people were strong. They were healthy. They even rode
13 horses. We've been through many different types of mental
14 anguish that our government do not see. It seems like
15 they're clashing people together against each other because
16 of coal mining, the plants.

17 But what about the pollutions? How do we
18 address that? Many years ago people talked about the risk,
19 the health risks of uranium. Now, it's probably the ash,
20 the different contaminants that make up a power plant.

21 That's all I have to say. And I thank you
22 for allowing me to speak.

23 MS. KRISTIN DARR: All right. Thank you.

24 Dewayne Young. Okay. And then Ed Seaton?
25 Ed? Okay.

1 MR DEWAYNE YOUNG: Hello, everybody. My name
2 is Dewayne Young. My clans are Bitter Water, (native
3 language spoken), mountain spoke tobacco clan on the Hopi
4 side. I'm also of the yucca fruit clan, salt clan. I'm
5 telling you Diné, Hopi, Spanish and Anglo.

6 I thank you, Mr. Interior, and the board, the
7 Hopi chair, new chair, our president. I'm from Black Mesa.
8 They call me the Stone House northwest of the regional
9 Forest Lake. Top of the world I would say.

10 I've done all these things that these people
11 talk about. Sheep herding, ranching, farming. I've done
12 all that in my days. As I've got older, I graduated from
13 high school. Met my high school sweetheart. We've been
14 married for 34 years, to be exact 37 years. We have two
15 daughters, Nicole and Tiffany. I have nine grandkids. I'm
16 the fourth generation of coal miner, copper miner and
17 uranium.

18 My daughter is the fifth generation coal
19 miner. And my sons, I have two, they've served in the
20 armed forces. They've done eight tours. I'm dealing with
21 a lot of problems that they have, PTS, alcohol, drugs,
22 et cetera.

23 I'm not asking for any help. They have to
24 clear these things for themselves. I've been very
25 fortunate. I've been employed with Peabody 30 years. I've

1 also been with the UNWA 30 years. Thank you, union
2 brothers and sisters, Local 1924 and 1620.

3 I'm very dedicated to my job. I'm missing
4 birthdays, anniversaries, all family events, just like I
5 say, I'm married to my job, too. But that's my number one
6 priority. My grandpa and my grandma they used to say, this
7 is your mother and your father brings food to the table.

8 As we all are in one in this room, it brings
9 food to the table. It pays bills, et cetera. To cap it
10 off, were NGS should stay alive, it's been studied that the
11 plant can operate up to 2044. And the financial deficits
12 that the Navajo tribe and the Hopi tribe will be devastated
13 if it were to close.

14 As you know, in this room we will all lose,
15 and we look upon eye to eye at each other, are you going to
16 call your partner a loser? I want to be a winner. I've
17 always been a winner.

18 And Navajo Nation will be devastated with
19 24 percent, and the Hopi tribe will end up losing
20 55 percent.

21 Do you people really realize what devastation
22 that it's going to happen? Because we're all in one and
23 one for all. I thank you much.

24 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

25 Ed, and then Lorraine Herder.

1 MR. ED SEATON: (Native language spoken.)

2 I was going to do my statements in Hopi, but
3 then I don't know if Louie and Spencer taught me enough so
4 I better just do it in my English. Okay. Thank you.

5 I worked with for Peabody for over 30 years
6 and I retired in 2006. The other thing is I'm a local
7 recording secretary for Local Union 1620, the UMWA. And
8 I've been fortune to work with a lot of the Hopi people and
9 seeing some old friends are retired and other people that I
10 went to school and high school and elsewhere. So I've been
11 running with the Hopis for quite a while.

12 And how many years are the state champs,
13 what's the streak now for Hopi? 29 years. That's Hopi
14 strong. That's what I expect.

15 Okay. Let's hear a story, so let's back up a
16 little bit. And you see where I'm from is from Black Mesa,
17 because my grandma was born on Black Mesa. My uncles, my
18 aunts, they were all born there. My mom was born there.
19 And I kept hearing these stories about how waters used to
20 flow all over the place on the mesa.

21 Let me tell you the reason my grandfather
22 took my grandma to Skeleton Mesa is that's where the real
23 water is, that's where the Navajo aquifer, you know,
24 recharges. That's why we ended up on Skeleton Mesa, and
25 that's where I grew up.

1 The other thing is, think about this: As you
2 look around this building, you see the United States flag
3 of America. That means there are 50 states. We're all
4 united. And that means no one person gets a hundred
5 percent of the pie. We all have to share.

6 So when I think about that, I envision when
7 our forefathers that went in and fought in World War II,
8 they were the ones that were the leaders. They made the
9 decision to have the coal mines on the Navajo reservation.

10 You have one in Black Mesa. They used to
11 have one in Gallup, and Navajo mine, and some of them are
12 still there. And they were the ones that fought the world
13 war to get us those rights. That's why I handed to the
14 code talkers and the others that served in WW II. They
15 were the ones that laid the groundwork for us.

16 So if the U.S. government decides that we're
17 going to pull back, you're going to be making a big mistake
18 because you nullified the oath that those people took, and
19 they go ahead. We're going to defend our country, and
20 we're going to defend it for America.

21 They do not say, you guys have rights we're
22 not going to give you. That did not happen. So as you
23 think about that, I think we need to have an area where we
24 need to have these people keep working. Because they have
25 given us blood, sweat and tears to advance our economy on

1 this, you know, like, Navajo Nation and the Hopi
2 reservation.

3 The other thing is, after I retired from
4 Peabody, I worked as a federal mine inspector. I was
5 working the metal on metal. We -- we were stationed in
6 Vacaville in California. Northern California they have
7 over 500 mines. And most of the places that I went to for
8 inspections, most of them were locked. This was in 2008.
9 So I can just see what's going to happen.

10 And a lot of those areas, they closed them
11 because the federal government says you're not going to
12 operate or you got all these regulations that they were
13 funneled into. I've been out in West Virginia. I've
14 covered all the United States because I served as a
15 representative for the coal miners, and I traveled all
16 over.

17 These guys sitting here, they sent me all
18 over the country. We want you to attend this conference.
19 We want you here. I did that, and I've been all over. So
20 I know in the back area, the rural areas. They are the
21 ones that are getting hammered. So we need to help them.
22 We need to help them because you got to say, hey, you know,
23 there's some livelihoods. People have to work because they
24 share the United States of America.

25 We're not alone in this. And the other thing

1 that you have to think about is all the people that receive
2 help, they're complaining. They don't know it indirectly
3 every one of them benefited, at the schools, the clinics,
4 the hospitals, the roads. There was nothing out there.
5 When I used to work out there in Black Mesa in the 1960s.

6 Navajo and we were working for the Indian
7 Health Service, and we used to do what they call the
8 shuttle out there. People were making their own wells,
9 that's how they were putting the waters in there to have
10 pump, that they could pump the water to use.

11 So I was there long before the mines started.
12 And, like I said, my mom and all those who, of course, at
13 that we actually called the Forest Lake, that's where
14 they're from. I think that whole area has been mined up.
15 But so I have my roots there, and I understand that I went
16 back and I looked at it through the years.

17 So I've spent a lot of time out there. I've
18 spent time out there before it was even developed, and I
19 started working for Peabody during any summer jobs. So I
20 think I've seen quite a bit. And a lot of times people
21 when they talk, they don't really address those areas.

22 The help that they receive or else indirectly
23 receive. That's why I think the mines have to keep going.
24 NGS has to keep going, too, because whether they're sitting
25 over here or not, all the money that the taxes are paid,

1 that's what drives the economy.

2 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

3 MR. ED SEATON: Because there is nothing out
4 here. I've driven through this area before, and it's a lot
5 better before. Okay. Thank you.

6 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you. Thank you.
7 We're going to move on to our next speaker.

8 Lorraine Herder, and then Herman Honanie, who
9 specifically asked not to have any preference. So he's in
10 the shuffle here. I just wanted you all to know that, so
11 it wasn't me.

12 MS. LORRAINE HERDER: (Native language
13 spoken.) It seems like we're being center of attack here.

14 The number one is the, like we're here saying
15 that, you know, the way our living is here, and the miners
16 are over here. And I don't like it, you know, when
17 entertain people, entertaining each other.

18 So Interior Department, you are the one that
19 has trust responsibility for our resources and keep that in
20 mind.

21 (Native language spoken.)

22 The quality of the wool, it's not there
23 because of the environment because of the vegetation.

24 (Native language spoken.)

25 The forage that we have.

1 (Native language spoken.)
2 Drought resistant.
3 (Native language spoken.)
4 Because I'm out there every day.
5 (Native language spoken.)
6 These flowers.
7 (Native language spoken.)
8 Wildlife have to compete with them.
9 (Native language spoken.)
10 Sugar diabetes.
11 (Native language spoken.)
12 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.
13 THE INTERPRETER: Lorraine Herder.
14 Greetings, my people that are here. And rename herself.
15 She's from Big Mountain. And she spoke a little bit in the
16 English language.
17 I have the livestock, the cherished sheep of
18 our tradition that was brought into the Navajo people from
19 the beginning. And that is my livelihood.
20 They used to have quality wool that I used to
21 make rugs. But I've seen recently, more recently, a few
22 years ago that the vegetation that they feed on or the
23 forage that they use on a regular basis has been getting
24 poor. A lot of the plants out in my area are drought
25 resistance.

1 The better forage, the better grasses that
2 provide the nutrients are getting less and less. We don't
3 see it every year. We used to have a lot of different
4 vegetation, forage or grasses, and the wool would be
5 very -- of a qualitative product.

6 And we used to also use the plants to color
7 or dye our yarns. The flowers that were used to make dyes
8 are gone. Most likely, all of them are going to be gone
9 pretty soon.

10 Those same plants, or some of the plants that
11 we use for food. We dig roots or we gather the plants, and
12 we used to eat that. And we were pretty health y. The
13 wild plants to eat were very plentiful. But today they are
14 sparse. The livestock and us are competing for those
15 plants that are edible.

16 I don't have to buy meat because I use my
17 livestock to use as meat for my family. We dig roots. We
18 still dig roots. We still use the plants when we find
19 them. We have a garden, so we try to stay healthy.

20 You hear a lot about different health risks
21 that are associated with these types of mining and the
22 power plants. Today there are a lot of people that have
23 diabetes.

24 Yes, those streams and creeks, the seeps,
25 they were there. That's where our animals drink their

1 water. But I have to haul water these days, and it costs
2 me.

3 I don't have running water at home. That is
4 the reason I use -- I haul water.

5 I'm sorry. I can't read my own handwriting.

6 I don't use the coal to heat my house as
7 well. So we're all talking about NGS and its closure. Let
8 them close the plant. There is a lot of health problems
9 associated with NGS just as well as the relocation of the
10 Navajo-Hopi issue.

11 We've lost a lot of people. We've seen the
12 detriments. We've seen the mental anguish to our people
13 who have moved to relocate. And there are a lot of people
14 that have suffered other ways.

15 And that's all I have to say. Thank you.

16 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

17 Chairman Honanie.

18 CHAIRMAN HERMAN HONANIE: (Native language
19 spoken.)

20 Before I read my statement, I just want to
21 say a couple of things. I'm hearing a lot of people talk
22 about what I call the human element, the humanity, as I
23 termed it the other day in Phoenix when I spoke. And
24 that's what's very important. I think you people who are
25 talking about the risk to our health and to the people.

1 But just as important and just as significant
2 are all the miners that are here who are fearing the loss
3 of their jobs, the loss of support for their family, the
4 loss of support for their grandchildren and so on and so
5 on.

6 So we do have a lot at stake, and that's
7 people. Not the corporations. Not the companies. Not the
8 power companies, but they need to all think of us who are
9 sitting here, the villages, the communities in northern
10 Arizona across the region who benefit from the operation of
11 NGS and the selling of our coal.

12 But I wanted to just say that because for me
13 that's how I partly view it, too, and that the continued
14 operation of NGS needs to go. And I just thought of a new
15 term for NGS. It's just my own witty way of saying Not
16 Going Soon. Okay. So let's remember that.

17 Thank you. So again, good afternoon. I'm
18 Herman Honanie, chairman of the Hopi tribe, and I'm honored
19 to speak today on behalf of the Hopi people and honored to
20 be among you all.

21 I'd like to thank the Department of Interior
22 for hosting this meeting and thank you for traveling here
23 to listen and to better understand the significance of the
24 Navajo Generating Station to our people. And I wanted to
25 just emphasize there is no better way to understand than to

1 have you all visit this country, because you're hearing
2 directly from the people today and this morning and
3 hopefully tomorrow.

4 And so for more than four decades the Hopi
5 have offered our land and energy resources to fuel the
6 Navajo Generating Plant Station. We've used the bounty of
7 our energy to provide for Hopi people, and we are proud
8 that the benefits of our energy is spread far beyond Hopi
9 mesas. We are pleased that Hopi energy brings benefits to
10 the families across the entire state.

11 When NGS was developed, it was a project like
12 no other, envisioned by Congress to create affordable
13 electricity and power to move water across the desert
14 landscape. Looking back, we are humbled by the vision of
15 the leaders who understood that coal from Black Mesa would
16 be instrumental in the growth and prosperity for the region
17 and for the tribes.

18 May I remind us, the plant was always
19 envision to run through 2044 at least. Yet today we find
20 ourselves in the situation that is far different than when
21 the early promises were made. We question the owners of
22 the Navajo Generating Station in their decision to stop
23 operating the plant in as little as two years' time.

24 This message has come to Hopi without warning
25 and is decades too soon. So we question why so suddenly do

1 the owners want to move away from coal?

2 We believe the coal, the plant creates energy
3 diversity for the state. It also shields against volatile
4 price swings or disruption of the energy supply. We also
5 believe that running the plant will be far more cost
6 effective than early retirement.

7 We are glad to see that some of the partners
8 are coming together or to the table with solutions. The
9 recent study of Navajo planning economics reinforces, I
10 believe, that the plant can be competitive well into the
11 future. At the same time we also recognize that there are
12 many other issues to resolve to keep the plant operating.

13 The risk of plant shut down and the
14 supporting Kayenta mine come at a time when the Hopi have
15 60 percent unemployment. This swift closure and loss of
16 revenues, which provide for about 85 percent of our general
17 fund for the Hopi tribe will most certainty resolve in
18 severe curtailment of Hopi government functions, loss of
19 revenues and resources to the community and, of course, an
20 increase in spike in our unemployment rate.

21 So there's no doubt that early closure of NGS
22 could carry a heavy burden on Hopi and many others. The
23 Navajo too stand to lose thousands of jobs and billions in
24 economic benefits. So make no mistake the Hopi understands
25 that if NGS shuts down prematurely, the residents of

1 Phoenix and Tucson ultimately will get their power another
2 way. Yet, the Hopi faces a long difficult economic
3 journey.

4 NGS was developed and ultimately authorized
5 as the best power plant economic development solution for
6 the Hopi, Navajo, central Arizona tribes, and the state.

7 So maintaining these vital assets for the
8 greater good of this region is a promise that needs to be
9 kept on behalf of the Hopi people. So I encourage all of
10 us to continue engaging in real dialog to advance this
11 goal.

12 But in closing, and in closing, I just really
13 want to extend my appreciation to everybody that's here,
14 even if you're just here to listen and learn. But those of
15 you have spoken and will speak after me, I appreciate your
16 thought. I appreciate your support in this matter in
17 keeping the NGS open because it's very, very important to
18 us.

19 You know, folks in Phoenix and Tucson and the
20 other cities down south, they have the luxury, as someone
21 has said, many have said that they're operating at our
22 luxury, they're operating as we sacrifice the resources
23 that we have. They're enjoying the life. They're enjoying
24 especially swimming pools. They're enjoying the abundance
25 of water, but yet we're trying to fight for our main

1 survival. When we were the first people here, when we've
2 been here long, long, long time. And the last comer comes
3 comes and takes, as someone said.

4 So I need to remind us all that let's band
5 together. Let's support one another and hope that solution
6 that eventually come about will eventually benefit us in
7 the long haul. Again, we have a future to think about. We
8 have your grandchildren and our grandchildren's
9 grandchildren. We have educational benefits and
10 scholarships to think about.

11 Tonight we're going to have a graduation at
12 the Hopi High School. Last night there was an eighth grade
13 graduation. And I just can't help but think about my own
14 grandchildren that they need to be and are eligible and
15 have a right to these scholarships just like any other
16 individual with Hopi and Navajo across this region.

17 (Native language spoken.)

18 Thank you very much for your attendance,
19 everybody.

20 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you, Mr. Chairman.

21 The next speaker is Daryl Melvin. Followed
22 by Marvin Yoyokie. Oh, I'm sorry. I'm sorry.

23 THE INTERPRETER: (For Chairman
24 Herman Honanie). Thank you, my people. I want to say to
25 you all that this is a very huge, difficult issue. We must

1 address this from all sides of our parties whether we're
2 involved in it as just listeners, people that have jobs, or
3 we as people in the political realm must look at this
4 difficult issue and stand together and address our concerns
5 to the people here.

6 We know we were promised that this generating
7 station was made to stand until 2044. We are not even at
8 the halfway point. And for some reason, we have these
9 questions here that are not being told to us of why they
10 are shutting the mine down and also NGS. We benefit from
11 this as far as revenue, the education, the scholarships,
12 and also to the villages here.

13 What do we benefit from this? Let's think
14 about this thing in a positive way and see what is the best
15 resolve for all the people, not just here on Hopi or our
16 neighbors, but who actually benefits from this in a greater
17 way is people from down south of where we are at.

18 We benefit in the form of revenue, but yet,
19 let's think about it in the future, for the future of our
20 people, of our children, and let's stand together.

21 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Very good. Thank you. My
22 apologies for that. So thank you for correcting me.

23 Daryl Melvin and then Marvin Yoyokie.

24 MR. DARYL MELVIN: (Native language spoken.)

25 My name is Daryl Melvin, and I'm from the

1 Roadrunner clan, and I'm born for the Coyote Pass clan.

2 I've worked most of my professional career
3 for Indian people on behalf of Indian people. And I wanted
4 to mention that as a healthcare leader, as an executive, as
5 a professional engineer, as an officer in the uniformed
6 services, and today as a business owner of a consulting
7 firm, that my family on both sides have grown up in these
8 communities without basic services: Water, sewer, phone,
9 infrastructure. And it's through this lens that I want to
10 share my comments with you.

11 I believe that closure of the Navajo
12 Generating Station as well as the Peabody mine is in the
13 best interest of the Hopi and Navajo people for both
14 tribes, for the environment for our health, and in many
15 ways I feel that it has impeded the development and the
16 growth of both our nation and that we have an opportunity
17 in terms of how we develop, diversify and work on our
18 economy.

19 However, in the near term, I believe that the
20 Department of the Interior and federal agencies have a
21 right and maybe even an obligation to look out for those
22 individuals who worked and have contributed toward the
23 energy production in this country. And those are the
24 miners, those are the individuals who work at the
25 generating station.

1 I would like the agency to ensure that
2 there's transparency and disclosure for those benefits that
3 these employees are entitled to. Whether it's through work
4 retraining, whether it's through job relocation and
5 replacement and certainly for those individuals who are
6 eligible for early retirement or those individuals who are
7 currently retired that, perhaps, legislation needs to be
8 proposed to ensure that there's a trust fund so that any of
9 these public entities, whether it's Peabody Coal mine or
10 whether it's Salt River or other entities, that they not go
11 out of the business. That a trust fund be established so
12 that the benefits to these employees are continued and
13 ongoing, and they are looked after and protected for the
14 work that they've done in ensuring, again, that energy was
15 provided for this country.

16 Next I'd like to know about how these sites
17 are going to be used, both the mine and the Navajo
18 Generating Station. How it would be reused. Currently the
19 Navajo Generating Station is a hub for transmission lines.

20 Rather than work and rely on a 20th century
21 energy production of coal, there's much discussion in the
22 country about renewables. The transmission lines allow and
23 afford an opportunity for renewables, whether it's solar or
24 it's wind.

25 There are other options, though .

1 MS. KRISTIN DARR: You're running just a
2 little bit long.

3 MR. DARYL MELVIN: Okay. I'm sorry.

4 Energy storage is key. So whether it's high,
5 new technology like, air compression, those are options
6 that should be considered and brought forward. Also,
7 currently today, the administration has talked about an
8 infrastructure bill.

9 In this current year and certainly within the
10 next year the opportunity exists for infrastructure dollars
11 to be provided to local communities to both tribes to
12 develop road systems north and south, whether it's water
13 systems or phone communication systems.

14 And so to the guest here from the interior
15 that drove out, if you try to use your cell phones and were
16 able to keep a call, you know what I'm talking about. Even
17 if you got a call through, probably your teeth were
18 chattering as you went over the bumpy road.

19 We can start working on the replacement of
20 current road systems, current infrastructure and to provide
21 these capable employees, these workers in these mines jobs
22 today by simply directing hundreds of millions of dollars
23 in infrastructure to our current communities. So thank
24 you.

25 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

1 Marvin. And then Cecil. It starts with a B.
2 Cecil.

3 Okay. Go ahead.

4 MR. MARVIN YOYOKIE: Good morning. I'm here
5 in support of the Navajo Generating Station to continue to
6 operate and to have the Peabody Coal mine to support it. I
7 am in support of the indirect benefits that the tribes
8 receive from coal mining, both from the local communities
9 up at the mine, and the Hopi tribe receiving revenues from
10 coal mining.

11 Comparing to other coal mines in the United
12 States, the mines up at the Kayenta and the Black Mesa in
13 the past are low sulfur coal with high Btus. And the tribe
14 has received royalty benefits from that and have improved
15 the life and government of the tribe tremendously.

16 In talking about the economic benefits that
17 the tribes received, our communities have increased in many
18 ways economically. And the use of water that the Peabody,
19 or Black Mesa mine used to use has stopped now. But the
20 continued use of coal by our communities is of great
21 benefit.

22 I am aware of the history of royalties that
23 our tribe received from coal mining, and these royalties
24 have helped our tribe tremendously in moving forward in the
25 20th Century and into now. In employment our government

1 has grown. Scholarships have increased tremendously, and
2 our students have benefited indirectly from the revenues
3 that the coal mining have given. Many maybe do not, are
4 not aware of where the money comes from, but indirectly
5 they have received these benefits.

6 Our economic situation on Hopi is -- is --
7 has been in a very -- in a very poor state. I have not
8 seen any economic development on Hopi other than in the
9 early 19 -- around 2000 when the housing started at the
10 healthcare center and our Moenkopi development. But since
11 then, we have not had any economic development that would
12 contribute revenues to our tribe, and we have depended
13 quite a few -- a large percentage of our revenues from
14 royalties being paid from Peabody Coal mine.

15 And I would be very concerned on how our
16 tribe is going to be operating when the coal mining ceases.
17 Thank you.

18 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

19 So for those of you who -- I'm getting to
20 some speakers that have walked in recently. And just a
21 reminder, we're trying to stay at three minutes. And we
22 are going to be moving into speakers who have already
23 spoken, so those will definitely want to try to keep it
24 short.

25 But Cecil. Did we find Cecil? Okay, there

1 To Nizhoni area up there in Forest Lake. And on my dad's
2 side they're from that area, so and then my nieces and
3 aunts they still live out there.

4 And up there back way back in 1960, I was
5 only like a ten-year-old, something like that, we used to
6 go up there where the mining area -- where they're actually
7 mining right now. They call it J28, J19 and J21 right
8 there in that same area.

9 On my grandma's side, my
10 great-great-grandfather resided there. Their name was
11 Many Mules and the son of Many Mules, too. And then on the
12 east side of that is my other on the (native language
13 spoken) side, they call it (native language spoken) in
14 Navajo it's cashcholie, and then cashcholie begets or the
15 son of Escholie. So I am the great-great-grandson from
16 that area.

17 So there was a time before the mining and all
18 these stories that I'm hearing that that area was, nobody
19 lived in that area because of those coal fires. They had
20 coal fires all over the place in the area in the valley,
21 and they had smoke that's why they do agree to mine that
22 area.

23 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. And you're at three
24 minutes.

25 MR. CECIL BIZAHALONI: So they want to get

1 rid of that coal so it can be safe for people to live
2 there. And then just recently when the mines starts
3 opening people started moving to the areas, you know. So
4 if they mine this coal out, and then it will be safer for
5 people to live there. Even the water's going to be safe.

6 So that's what I want to bring up today, so
7 thank you for your opportunity. Thank you.

8 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you. And we'll see
9 you tomorrow, I guess.

10 Representative Descheenie. Are you ready to
11 speak? Arizona House of Representatives Legislative
12 District 7. After that will be Ken Lomayestewa. Ken?

13 Okay, Representative.

14 REPRESENTATIVE ERIC DESCHEENIE: Yes. Thank
15 you very much.

16 MS. KRISTIN DARR: You're welcome.

17 REPRESENTATIVE ERIC DESCHEENIE: To all of
18 you thank you for coming out here and visiting and holding
19 these hearings. I understand you all are in Phoenix and
20 other places and Page, here and, of course, the Window
21 Rock. And I have to express my appreciation to the Hopi
22 people, the Hopi tribe for hosting this. I'm a visitor
23 here and as a member of the Navajo Nation.

24 But I'm also a representative of these
25 respective communities in the Arizona House of

1 Representatives. I represent Legislative District 7.

2 Obviously, I've been paying close attention
3 to this issue. Not just over the course of the last
4 several months, you know, leading up to the decision by
5 Salt River Project to sell or to get out of this business,
6 given the economy for what it is, they've stated their
7 reasons rooted in expert opinions, observations of facts.
8 They have already made these decisions. But I've also been
9 watching this for several years, and for many of us we've
10 been watching this for a lifetime.

11 So my comments are largely expressed with as
12 much understanding and sympathy for everyone involved, but
13 also that same sympathy and understanding needs to be
14 lended towards the future. The future that includes our
15 lives, virtually everyone in this room and then, of course,
16 our children, our grandchildren, and so on and so forth.

17 It's -- it can't be overstated enough that
18 Salt River Project has already made their decision.
19 They've made expert observations about the economics, about
20 the industry, about this reality that we're having to
21 confront before us today.

22 I'm a little disheartened that it was done
23 relatively abruptly creating a sense of urgency, a sense of
24 scare amongst our people, amongst the tribes. Certainly
25 the Hopi tribe stands to endure a great challenge if this

1 shut down transpires in the next few months. And then, of
2 course, the Navajo Nation will certainly feel the
3 experience.

4 But these are tribes, tribal governments.
5 Our hearts have to acknowledge the life of our people as
6 well as the life of the land. If the plant shuts down this
7 year, December, it will leave a lot of our people in great,
8 very great difficult -- difficulty for obvious of reasons.

9 My advocacy seeks to keep the plant open for
10 the next two years so that our people, the workers
11 themselves, their families, have an opportunity to make
12 sense of this reality and make the necessary steps to
13 transition in a healthy manner.

14 But to keep the plant open the way it is, the
15 status of what it is beyond 2020, as indigenous peoples, we
16 have a responsibility to life, not just of our own, but
17 also to the land. We have to be the forefront, at the
18 forefront. We have to be the leaders of having an
19 environmental conscious.

20 But it goes beyond just having an
21 environmental conscious. We maintain an indigenous truth
22 that goes back to time immemorial. We honor life beyond
23 the five fingered people. We know this. It is
24 irrefutable.

25 So for us to cast a blanket of black and

1 white that this plant and the mine must maintain its
2 current status indefinitely is irresponsible as it relates
3 to being indigenous.

4 For practical reasons, the plant ought to
5 stay open for two more years, so that the workers -- and my
6 heart very much goes out to the workers. I've sat down
7 with some of the miners, and I've sat down with some of the
8 employees of the plant.

9 Their identity, some upwards into 40 and 50
10 years of blood, sweats and tears has shaped who they are.
11 We cannot take that away from them as it relates to their
12 pride, as it relates to their legacy, as it relates to what
13 they have provided for their families. And that is the
14 reason why this plant cannot shut down immediately, meaning
15 this year.

16 But like I said, we have to find ways to
17 usher in renewable energy. And I know for many of us
18 renewable energy is a four-letter word. But what we knew
19 two years ago, the technology, the capacity to actually use
20 it to generate energy as well as jobs, probably not the
21 amount of jobs that we have now, but a significant amount.

22 My discussion with the experts on this
23 particular subject matter maintains what we knew two years
24 ago is not the case today. There are viable options. And
25 it's incumbent upon us to embrace those to the fullest

1 extent.

2 And I'm going to finish with this: I don't
3 know of any other peoples other than our own who
4 demonstrate on a daily basis as well as generationally and
5 intergenerationally the meaning of resilience. We are
6 resilience. And if it means we have to endure a little bit
7 more to be advocates for the world, then I think that's an
8 order. It's a standing order that we express amongst
9 ourselves and really to the world over.

10 Thank you very much.

11 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

12 Ken Lomayestewa. I'm doing better than I was
13 on Monday. You got to give me that. All right. Thank
14 you. And then Raina Silver after Ken.

15 MR. KEN LOMAYESTEWA: Good afternoon,
16 everybody. My name is Ken Lomayestewa. I'm the director
17 of the Hopi Renewable Energy office. So we have been
18 looking at several options here, which I'm sure that Navajo
19 is doing the same thing, trying to look at alternative
20 resources for energy production.

21 And we have been looking at what available
22 technologies are out there. We've been looking at what
23 kind of land we have. We find that we have a lack of
24 infrastructure on our lands. Those lands that are
25 potentially usable do not have any water lines, water

1 piping, electrical transmission, rail. We don't have those
2 infrastructure in place, which makes it really hard for us
3 to do our planning.

4 We also are -- we also looked at other areas
5 where there is transmission available, and we have a 500 KV
6 line that runs through both Hopi and Navajo land, but we do
7 not have access to those lines. And those lines could be
8 directly available for us to get on and produce our own
9 powers and send out transport for revenue base projects.
10 We don't have that.

11 We have other lines that are available off
12 the reservation, but we need assistance to get connected to
13 those lines. And that's where, I think, you all come in is
14 try to provide some kind of help in getting us to
15 interconnect to those lines, whatever infrastructure there
16 is. We're talking about water.

17 There's a water line that runs through
18 portions of our land, and we're trying to do planning to
19 get to those to access those lines as well. But we do need
20 federal help.

21 We have transmission lines that we don't have
22 access to. We do need the higher level, federal government
23 to help us, by either leaning on the utilities, the owners,
24 to give us some access to those lands so we can do
25 something with those lines. They have been running through

1 our areas for a long time, and we still don't have access
2 to them.

3 So this is our Tribal Backup Plan B, if you
4 will, call it. Navajo is doing the same thing. Hopi tribe
5 is doing the same thing. Other tribes are doing the same
6 thing, looking at their Plan B alternatives.

7 I haven't heard anything from the owners of
8 NGS or other plants proposing a Plan B for the tribes. How
9 are they going to assist in the replacement of energy and
10 what not? All I'm hearing is the closure aspect of it. So
11 we need to have a Plan B. We need to hear a Plan B.
12 What's -- how are the owners going to assist the tribes in
13 getting to that Plan B.

14 MS. KRISTIN DARR: That's three minutes.

15 MR. KEN LOMAYESTEWA: Thank you. One more
16 last thing. Again, I'm going to plead we do need that
17 immediate help from the higher level. We do have some of
18 these infrastructure in place, but we don't have the
19 access. And we need to have that as well as federal
20 funding to get our projects going. Thank you.

21 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

22 Okay. Raina Silver, and then
23 Hubert Lewis, Jr.

24 MS. RAINA SILVER: Raina. Any NGS closure
25 plan must include steps to ensure that the local workforce

1 is not left behind and forgotten. Now is the time to
2 invest in job retraining and assistance to help the local
3 communities to transition.

4 The decommissioning and clean up of NGS and
5 its supporting infrastructure can be a source of job
6 creation that helps transition the Navajo Nation to a far
7 more sustainable clean, energy economy while taking care of
8 workers from the plants and mine.

9 Navajo and Hopi youth need a future they can
10 count on. It's time to think about the next generation and
11 begin taking steps now to ensure that they have a sound
12 economic foundation to build their lives on.

13 Clean energy provides that. Coal does not.
14 SRP has said repeatedly that the reason for closing the
15 plant is that coal supply could no longer compete with more
16 affordable sources of energy. The world does not need coal
17 and all the pollution that comes with it, but the world
18 still needs energy.

19 There are investors here and around the world
20 who would be interested in solar and wind projects on the
21 Navajo Nation. Navajo and Hopi must secure rights to the
22 transition capacity that will allow them to connect wind
23 and solar projects developed on tribal lands to western
24 energy markets.

25 The Navajo Nation has vast potential for

1 developing solar and wind power. A 2012 study by the
2 National Renewable Energy Laboratory looked at clean energy
3 alternatives to NGS and estimated that Navajo lands are
4 home to an astonishing 1.2 terawatts of potential
5 utility-scale solar, more than 500 times the output of NGS
6 and nearly 1,800 megawatts of wind resource.

7 Now is the ideal time to develop those
8 resources. Thank you.

9 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

10 Okay. Hubert Lewis, Jr. And then
11 Dale Siquah, are you here? Oh, okay. I didn't recognize
12 you with your hat on. Okay.

13 MR. HUBERT LEWIS, JR.: Hi. I am Hubert
14 Lewis, Jr. I am from Moenkopi. My subject today is money.
15 Seva (phonetic) or peso. When we didn't have it we were
16 living good. Back in the day when Hopi's didn't have
17 money, we all used to work for food. Everybody helped each
18 other for food.

19 Nowadays, money, or white man has introduced
20 money and that has thrown a rock into our culture. Since
21 money has gotten into our culture, we now living the white
22 man way. We cannot live without money.

23 But on the other hand, we are also keepers of
24 Mother Earth as an Indian people, native people. I know
25 that money is important to the white man and that the more

1 you spend, the bad it is.

2 They're trying to -- well, we live in the
3 white man world now as natives. And if they close down the
4 power plant and the coal mine, our economic infrastructure
5 will go down. There are other ways for the tribe that
6 could be making money and should be making money besides
7 selling coal.

8 There is -- we have a lot of natural
9 resources like water. We have a lot of water that we could
10 sell, bottled water or maybe solar or wind energy. We're
11 trying the cattle business, and I hear that's doing some of
12 it a little bit to help our tribe make money.

13 But once you close this mine, our tribal
14 government will suffer. People will have to stop living
15 easily because people right now depend on money. And
16 that's what buys food, buys gas, buys, I don't know, a
17 truck to make life easier. Everybody is now living the
18 easier life, and that's what they want.

19 Back in the day when people didn't have
20 nothing, it was hard. But it was good.

21 MS. KRISTIN DARR: That's three minutes,
22 so --

23 MR. HUBERT LEWIS, JR.: Okay. I'm sorry.

24 But in closing, I don't think it's very good
25 to close the mine right away due to the tribe doesn't have

1 a backup plan or really have money coming in. They could
2 -- I wish they would do better economic development where
3 they could support themselves like maybe build stores, or
4 tourism.

5 And I know casino is the big thing, but
6 people don't want it and -- but also in our -- our job
7 searching, we're only limited in a small area. If you
8 wanted to make money, you have to go off the reservation.
9 And by going off the reservation, you're losing your
10 culture, because culture is what Hopi is and what we have
11 here. Because if you don't have culture, you don't have
12 anything.

13 I don't know -- I know the white man's
14 culture is money. That's what they're work for and build
15 for. But as a Native American, we try to keep the earth.
16 So.

17 I would like the generating station to close
18 in the future, but due to pollution and everything, but I
19 would also like the Hopi tribe to sustain themselves
20 without coal by doing economic development with other
21 infrastructures because people want to live easy now with,
22 like, cars and electricity, and everybody has cell phones
23 now.

24 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. Thank you.

25 MR. HUBERT LEWIS, JR.: Oh, I'm sorry.

1 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

2 MR. HUBERT LEWIS, JR.: Thank you.

3 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Yes, thank you.

4 Okay. Dale Siquah, and then Jarvis
5 Williams.

6 MR. DALE SINGUAH: Hello. My name is Dale
7 Siquah. I'm a Hopi tribal council member, and I represent
8 the village of First Mesa Consolidated Villages. There's a
9 lot that came up here, and I'll do my best to keep to three
10 minutes.

11 The first thing I want to bring up again is
12 government trust responsibility, which I hold in high
13 regard that the government helped create this mine, and how
14 the water has been taken to the metropolitan areas. And so
15 now they have to be part of the equation to solve this
16 problem.

17 The jobs that are here -- the jobs just
18 aren't at the -- that are affected are just not at the --
19 at the mine itself. I mean, of course, they're a big part
20 of it. But we have jobs that are going to be impacted here
21 on the reservation in the tribe itself and at the villages,
22 which receive their money from the tribe to run their
23 villages, so and not only jobs, but services that are going
24 to be provided to the village itself and they're really
25 basic services.

1 They're water. They're providing services to
2 the youth and the elderly and the village itself for
3 different functions.

4 There's been a lot of talk about tribes
5 diversifying their economy. The -- the as I looked into
6 transitioning out of a closure of a mine, I did do some
7 research, and I find that that is the way to do -- to go is
8 to diverse your economy. But the thing is, as this is
9 closing, we -- that's what we're asking for. The tribe is
10 asking for assistance with -- to diversify our economy.

11 We understand that there's an economic reason
12 for the closure, but we also understand that we need help
13 to move forward to provide a home life for our people here.

14 The economy here is not -- the reservation
15 economy is not the only economy that this is going to
16 impact. It's going to impact at some level the federal
17 government economy at a lower level. But also it impacts
18 the state through the taxes that they get from the -- from
19 the sale of the coal.

20 And the economy, of course, here and the
21 local towns here, such as Flagstaff, Winslow, Gallup,
22 Holbrook, those economies, Page, they're going to also
23 suffer their impact, too. And it's kind of odd that this
24 is being looking as -- the lens is focused on SRP. And
25 that's hard for me to understand that.

1 Finally, you know, can SRP really afford the
2 prices that they say that they're going to suffer if they
3 buy from NGS? And I believe they can, you know, some
4 people depending on how well that they manage their money,
5 how affluent they are, they can afford things that poorer
6 people can't. And I don't feel that it's out of the
7 question that they just cannot afford or come to some kind
8 of resolution that we lower the numbers, that they can't
9 afford the power that we're trying to sell.

10 Okay. We're talking about the economy
11 shifting from coal. And I want to say that even
12 electricity is being subsidized at some level by the U.S.
13 government, the power generation no matter where it comes
14 from.

15 The petroleum industry, the auto industry
16 it's not out of the character for the U.S. government to
17 pick an industry and shore it up. Because if it weren't,
18 then the auto industry is struggling. And look what they
19 did for them recently, in our recent history. They shored
20 them up and helped them out, and they came out better.

21 The next thing is that it's going to take
22 everybody here, everybody that's concerned, the U.S.
23 government, the state government, the local community, and
24 the people here that live on both reservations to work
25 together to solve this problem.

1 And in solving this problem is we're going to
2 move into diversify our economy, and believe me, the Hopi
3 tribe has gotten the message. We are working as hard as we
4 can to try and get to that level to where we're going to
5 diversify our economy. But again, I'm going to say we need
6 your assistance, and that's what we're asking for.

7 MS. KRISTIN DARR: You said finally like
8 three points ago. You're messing with me.

9 MR. DALE SINQUAH: In closing --

10 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

11 MR. DALE SINQUAH: -- the water. You have to
12 understand Hopi's position on water. We're not only
13 talking about water usage here, but we're in a battle with
14 the U.S. government, with the state government, and with
15 the local -- the Navajo government over water. So you have
16 to realize that this problem -- that this you're looking at
17 is so much larger than just the NGS station itself.

18 So all of that gets thrown into the mix, and
19 we're trying to solve this NGS things, but we have so many
20 areas that we're dealing with. And I thank you for this
21 time.

22 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you, sir.

23 Jarvis, and then John Hawkins.

24 MR. JARVIS WILLIAMS: Okay. Good. Don't
25 start the clock yet. Okay. I'm ready.

1 Good afternoon, everyone. My name is Jarvis
2 Williams. I've worked at Peabody, Peabody Kayenta mine for
3 seven years total. The last three years as their tribal
4 relations manager.

5 I just wanted to say thank you to the
6 Department of Interior and Bureau of Reclamation for being
7 here and hosting this important meeting.

8 I also want to say thank you to the Hopi
9 tribe and all your leaders here for hosting this particular
10 meeting. You guys make a heck of a good sandwich and kept
11 these guys full over here, and that's pretty hard to do so
12 thank you.

13 I appreciate the initiative to speak about
14 the Navajo Generating Station and it's importance to the
15 Navajo and Hopi people and to the entire state of Arizona.
16 It is a bit discouraging when my elected representative
17 tells us to just deal with it.

18 Anyway, as the discussion is focused on ways
19 to keep NGS running well to the future. We must also think
20 about what the mining operations mean for our local
21 community. Peabody has long embraced a good neighbor
22 policy with it's area residents. Annually contributing
23 thousands of dollars for mine benefits that improve the
24 quality of life for its local residents. Many of the
25 services are essential.

1 I'd like to share with you guys a couple of
2 those. The first being free potable water with two wells
3 that are always on, cared for by the miner, Kayenta mine,
4 and are in use all the time. And they are free.

5 A water line distribution system that's being
6 installed to over 40 homes. Right now we're in Phase 1.
7 It should be completed by the end of the summer, and water
8 put into those lines by the end of this fall. Phase 2 to
9 begin, hopefully, within the next year. There are five
10 phases for this particular project. Right now total cost
11 is about 25 million, of which Peabody will pitch in about
12 15 million.

13 So it's a good thing we've got a lot of good
14 things going up there. The Red Dog partnership which
15 involves several entities, one of which is BIA, Navajo
16 Department of Transportation, the Navajo County. There are
17 11 surrounding chapters, Peabody, that all contribute to
18 the delivery of red scoria to local roads that need
19 maintenance.

20 The other one, reclamation grazing. We have
21 a grazing program that is part of our reclamation program.
22 A few years ago we met with Navajo Department of
23 Agriculture, the BIA, Office of Service Mining, the Navajo
24 Nation Rangers, Navajo Nation Grazing officials to discuss
25 how to best handle grazing practices moving forward.

1 And I just want to say thank you for that,
2 and that's all the messages that I wanted to bring to you
3 all. Thank you very much.

4 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

5 John Hawkins, and then Nicole Horseherder.

6 MR. JOHN HAWKINS: Good afternoon. My name
7 is John Hawkins. Some people say that I live in two worlds
8 because I am not native, but the I have left one world and
9 started a new life here. My wife is Hopi and my two
10 daughters are Hopi. They are spider clan. And I manage a
11 Hopi community, Yuwehloo Pahki, also known as Spider Mound.

12 Maybe I flatter myself to think I can do any
13 good, but what am I if I don't try my very best every day?
14 And I don't say this to speak about myself, but to relay
15 those of you up there who are not from here, it is my hope
16 that you take what you heard here today and at the other
17 listening sessions and relay it to the other owners of NGS,
18 to the government, politicians, and to the rest of the
19 world.

20 We trust that you will do this and not just
21 move on when you leave here today. We trust that you will
22 do your very best for those who have spoken their hearts
23 here today. Because who are you if you don't try your very
24 best?

25 Maybe coal is not the best power source or

1 maybe it's not the most efficient power source. Maybe coal
2 mining is not healthy for our earth. But if NGS is to
3 close, it is too soon. Hopi and Navajo need more time to
4 plan, to plan how to replace the revenue, the jobs and the
5 economy, to plan how to move forward.

6 Even if closing is the right thing to do, it
7 is not the right time. Please take what you have heard
8 here today and speak for all of us. I know the separation
9 between here and the city. And I ask you to help bridge
10 these two worlds. The common message here today is that
11 closing NGS in 2019 or sooner is much too soon. Thank you.

12 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

13 Nicole. And then David Billah.

14 MS. NICOLE HORSEHERDER: Thank you for
15 hosting these listening sessions. Oftentimes I wonder
16 if -- oftentimes I'm skeptical because I think that
17 listening sessions are just a way to rubber stamp something
18 and move it along. I've seen it a lot in the last 20 years
19 that I've been working on this issue.

20 My name is Nicole Horseherder. I'm
21 originally from Big Mountain area. I still live there. I
22 have a degree. I have a bachelor's degree from the
23 University of Arizona, a master's degree from the
24 University of British Columbia.

25 I'm a farmer out in my home just east of Big

1 Mountain, and I've lived there all my life except for the
2 few times that I left to go to school.

3 So I just want to say that there's a lot of
4 changes that have taken place. Almost my entire life I've
5 lived there with the mining. The NGS operation began in
6 1971. So I live at the headwaters of the entire operation,
7 the N-aquifer has been mined along with the coal for the
8 last -- since 1971.

9 And a lot of our pristine water has been used
10 to subsidize for the operation of the mining all these
11 years. And it continues to be used in greater amounts than
12 any of the communities -- any of the Navajo communities in
13 the area that use the N-aquifer.

14 A lot of changes have taken place. A lot of
15 the springs and the seeps are gone, and hydrologists tell
16 us that it's going to be 20 years before we see the
17 recovery. And every USGS report that comes out, I wait for
18 it. I look to see what the changes are. I look to see how
19 much recovery has taken place.

20 We live 7,000 feet on the northern end of
21 Black Mesa and 6,000 feet on the southern end. No one's
22 going to build CAP for us if we lose our water. The Bureau
23 of Rec is not going do it. Peabody is not going to do it.
24 The owners of NGS are not going to do it. And all the
25 people that live there that make their livelihood not on

1 someone's payroll, not on NGS's payroll, not on Peabody's
2 payroll, have no voice in this. Completely forgotten.

3 And, you know, I know the Navajo Nation is in a critical
4 situation, bringing water to the residents of Black Mesa.

5 Now, I know that there's a Many Mules water
6 line that's going, but that's through the help of Peabody.
7 And that's only going to serve people in the lease area.
8 It's not -- I mean, those of us that live north of Hard
9 Rock, we still don't have running water. And the point, I
10 just want to be clear, the point is not that we get running
11 water. The point is the aquifer needs to recover. And we
12 can't be using pristine water for mining purposes anymore.

13 Just that alone should be the indicator
14 everyone here to rally behind our renewal in the Navajo
15 economy, a transition away from coal, a transition away
16 from coal mining and away from coal burning as a way of
17 energy production.

18 That water is too precious, and right now we
19 don't have an answer as to how we're going to bring it
20 back. If there's damages, how we're going to bring it
21 back. Peabody doesn't even have right now a way to reclaim
22 that water and they're supposed to. How can you stand
23 behind an employer who has no way of bringing back water
24 for the people that rely on it?

25 I wouldn't. I wouldn't stand behind my

1 employer if they were paying my paycheck but turning around
2 and undercutting my neighbors and my people to do so. Have
3 we -- we don't have a conscious anymore? I think -- the
4 time is now. We have the opportunity one more time to all
5 get together and decide how this nation is going to move
6 forward into the next century for our kids.

7 Our kids are not going to be coal miners.
8 There's not enough coal there to mine for -- forever. And
9 that water is limited. Even though we say it's a renewable
10 resource, it is limited. It's a very limited resource.

11 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. We need to move.

12 MS. NICOLE HORSEHERDER: We're mining it like
13 we don't get just only 8 inches of rainfall a year. We're
14 mining it like it's abundant. So I would like to say that
15 much and thank you very much for listening to this.

16 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

17 And thank you to my helper in the back
18 keeping an eye on the time. I saw you.

19 Okay, David. Okay. And before you start,
20 let me just let you all know that since we started late
21 that's why I'm letting this run late. We're going to stay
22 for the full three hours that we promised.

23 After David, we're back into speakers that
24 have already spoken, so I'll get as many of you as we can
25 in the next 20 minutes.

1 So David.

2 MR. DAVID BILLAH: Good afternoon.

3 (Navajo language spoken.)

4 THE INTERPRETER: Joanna. Greetings. Thank
5 you for listening to us today. My name is David Billah.
6 I've worked with Peabody Coal Company for at least 37
7 years. And by working for the companies -- for the
8 company, we have helped contribute to the Navajo Nation and
9 the Hopi Nation all of us as miners.

10 We take pride in these contribution that we
11 make to help the economy.

12 When I was small, my father fought in the
13 World War II, and he came back. He raised me with these
14 instructions. He told me, "Take it upon yourself and
15 others. You can do that. Only you can do that."

16 So today it has extended this far into the
17 future to help the Navajo Nation and the Hopi Nation in
18 some form, indirectly or directly. I have enjoyed the
19 teaching that we've built up to this time. Everybody says
20 that the water is gone. There is the San Juan River. It's
21 one of the rivers that recharges the underground waters,
22 and that is good.

23 I have livestock. I have a variety of
24 livestock. When I'm off of work , I put my saddle on my
25 horse, and I ride the horse up into the mountainous areas.

1 There is vegetation up there. And I don't see it as poor
2 vegetation. There is water. I see water up there. So we
3 can't say we don't have any water. The plants are green.
4 They seem to be healthy, and I think we will have those
5 vegetation into the future.

6 It is the future that we should look into.
7 We cannot go back. It seems like we're just clashing
8 against each others. Let's move forward. That is my -- my
9 comments today. Let's move forward, not backwards. Thank
10 you.

11 MS. KRISTIN DARR: All right. John Muir
12 followed by Norm Sneddy.

13 John?

14 Where his Norm? Okay. Got you.

15 MR. JOHN MUIR: Hello. My name is John Muir.
16 I am (native language spoken), which is Red Running to the
17 Water Mountain Tobacco people, and born and raised on the
18 reservation. Born in (native language spoken), Utah,
19 raised in Arrow Canyon. Learned how to raise livestock and
20 farm.

21 Where I'm from is just on the other side of
22 the mine, the north side of the mine. And we got water
23 still running down our creek. It's no lower than Black
24 Mesa is. Pretty much the same height. The highest part of
25 the point of the mesa is the northern edge. That's the

1 only place you'll see alpine. Where I grew up, we got
2 alpines too.

3 I heard testimony say medicine man can't find
4 herbs, can't find traditional plants. We get all ours over
5 there. Fast forward today. I'm married on top of the
6 mesa. It's (native language spoken) Valley.

7 Peabody has contractors that helps out that
8 valley. Without them, we would have a washboard road,
9 potholes bigger than tires. Your truck comes apart faster
10 than anything else on an everyday commute.

11 That costs money. Without Peabody I wouldn't
12 be able to buy my parts for my vehicles to help my
13 community. That's what I do up there. Go to the chapter
14 meetings and whatnot. Lend a hand everywhere I can.

15 I don't only help Indian brothers, I also
16 help in Pinion, Whipoorwill. There is a lot of people out
17 there that don't have vehicles, can't haul wood. Peabody
18 helps us out, takes trees down. I go over there, harvest
19 it, bring it to the elders. The LDS even come to me, "Can
20 you please haul us a truckload of wood?" And I do it in my
21 off times, sometimes after work.

22 In the wintertime I'm out there in the mud,
23 rain, snow, shine doing that for my community. It's not
24 only me. I see lots of coal miners out there doing the
25 same thing. I'm also second generation coal miner. My dad

1 is Anglo and come from LA. He's half Mexican, Cherokee,
2 Comanche.

3 He also done the same thing as I was growing
4 up. He worked at Peabody pipeline. Retired. I'm in his
5 footsteps doing the same thing for my in-laws, my people
6 all the way into Whioorwill. Sometimes I branch out all
7 the way to Cottonwood. There's a lot of people out there
8 that rely on that coal.

9 Without coal, a cord of woods will not last a
10 week. The coal helps. It burns slowly, and it brings lots
11 of warmth to our houses and our homes.

12 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. We're running a
13 little over, so if you could wrap up.

14 MR. JOHN MUIR: And I'm in support of NGS.
15 Let's keep our mine and power station going. Thank you.

16 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

17 Norm, and then Marshall Johnson. And
18 Marshall will be our last speaker.

19 MR. NORM SNEDDY: Greetings.

20 (Native language spoken.)

21 Good afternoon. Thank you for Interiors that
22 are showing up and listening to our concern here. My name
23 is Norm Sneddy. I'm from the tobacco clan too (native
24 language spoken) side. I have worked for Peabody 30 years
25 plus. I'm the second generation in mining, as a miner. I

1 want to thank Peabody and NGS for what it did for me.

2 Putting a roof over our heads, raised two
3 kids, two beautiful grandkids, and also gave us an
4 education to now where we stand. I'm not the only one that
5 had the opportunity. It's everyone in my group that came
6 with me today.

7 I'm proud to be a miner and the rec workforce
8 for the last 20 plus years. We also grew up together and
9 now it seems like. I retired, I was probably the youngest
10 guy to retire out of Peabody. But I just fill in once in a
11 great while now. I want to hand that torch to the young
12 guys that came in.

13 We have a lot of young engineers, a lot of
14 young workforce that would like to continue and contribute.
15 Helping out both nation, the Hopi and the Navajos. That's
16 not only helping out, also helping out the local chapter
17 houses. And Peabody had done all that with the youth
18 activities, plus giving out dollars on sponsorships,
19 scholarships on and on.

20 And the mine really believes in safety. We
21 take care of their customers. Without them we don't have
22 jobs. The percentage on royalties to both nations and many
23 more, the company has bent backwards for us for the last 40
24 years. And now we need to ask ourselves what can we do for
25 the company, and our customers.

1 We need each other now. And to my Hopi
2 brothers that I have worked with you and being there all
3 the time, we continue helping each other. Again I would
4 like to say thank you that you guys had came in listening
5 to our concerns.

6 (Native language spoken.)

7 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

8 Okay. Marshall Johnson.

9 Before you start, sir, I just wanted to let
10 you all know if you submitted a card and you didn't get
11 your name called, it's because we've already heard from
12 you. And we're keeping track of that, and we're trying to
13 get new people opportunities to speak.

14 So just know that we are -- we've been
15 listening the whole time, and we've got everything on the
16 record, but that's why.

17 Okay, sir.

18 MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: (Navajo language
19 spoken.)

20 I am want to say to you, Mr. Interior, thank
21 you for coming here, providing us the time, a little bit of
22 time for a little bit of testimony. But we know that there
23 has been an operation that has been in place since the
24 '50s. And that it's premeditated how you are going to use
25 the Indians against the Indians so you can prosper,

1 prosperity, so you can build billion dollar, trillion
2 dollar companies.

3 An operation that's going to mine our coal,
4 mine our water, that's going to produce electricity for
5 profit. That's going to provide water, running water, for
6 a population of 6 million people so they can have low cost
7 energy and power that they can profit from.

8 A so-called Central Arizona Project of one
9 annual year of trillion dollars that they profit from.
10 Even just from the industry of livestock and farming, USDA,
11 one billion dollars, that's how much they make. Don't tell
12 me that \$4 billion price tag to the Central Arizona Project
13 has not been paid back. Don't tell me that. It's been
14 triple ten times. You're just playing with us. You're
15 playing with the livelihood of us.

16 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

17 MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: This is the time that
18 you can end this operation and pay for the damages. The
19 material damage that you've placed on our aquifer are the
20 same reasons why you built the Central Arizona Project in
21 Arizona. They have subsidence issues. They have earth
22 fissure issues. We're facing that here now.

23 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay. We need to wrap it
24 up.

25 MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: So you can honor that

1 for us, I want to say that to you Mr. Interior, David,
2 Mr. David Palumbo. I want to say that much to you. I want
3 to thank all of your staff. I want to thank the people
4 here too. And I hope --

5 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Thank you.

6 Did you sufficiently provide your points in
7 English, or did you want the interpreter to also read what
8 you said in your native language?

9 MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: It's clear.

10 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Pardon?

11 MR. MARSHALL JOHNSON: It's clear.

12 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay.

13 THE INTERPRETER: Joanna. Greetings, Mr. DOJ
14 and those people that work for you, your staff and people
15 here. Thank you for voicing your comments. I live at -- I
16 was born and raised (native language spoken.) -- I didn't
17 quite hear it.

18 It's not running anymore. The water used to
19 run at the place where I grew up. And let me tell you,
20 we've used gallons and gallons of water. It seems like
21 without purpose, the water was used. And who for? You've
22 used a lot of water. The outside world has used a lot of
23 water, the white people.

24 And I do see a lot of places that are dry,
25 that have impacted. The impacts are visible. I'm a sheep

1 rancher, and I see all of this through my life. You've
2 taken this from us, and I appeal to you today: Why do it
3 more years? You've done it for 40 to 50 years now.

4 You've used the water wastefully. Yes, there
5 are a few people, a few native people that work for the
6 company. We don't all work at Peabody. And I know that
7 there is approximately 60 percent that live in poverty.
8 There are only a handful of people that have benefited from
9 the jobs at the mine and at the plant.

10 There is 50 percent unemployment. Sure, we
11 are with the union. I was reading, I was reading in the
12 newspaper that there are people looking for jobs in
13 Atlanta, in the Atlanta city. Our people work out there.

14 Please, look at our livelihood. Look at the
15 sheep that we've used to live a life that was sustainable.
16 The corn that we've grew that is used in the ceremonial
17 elements that are used as ceremonial elements. Have
18 respect for these valuable cultural traditional elements
19 that we have.

20 Try to understand us. Since you came here,
21 you've destroyed a major part of our livelihood. From my
22 eyes, through my lens, of course, it is a complex issue
23 this issue that is before us here. Thank you.

24 MS. KRISTIN DARR: Okay, everybody. That's
25 the end of the session for today. So thank you all again.

1 And I guess, I assume I'll be seeing many of you again
2 tomorrow.

3 So yes? Yeah, Chairman Honanie, do you want
4 to say anything else? I'm sorry.

5 CHAIRMAN HERMAN HONANIE: Thank you. I know
6 it's been two, three hours. And it's been a long
7 afternoon, but I think that, you know, as I can sum it up
8 in my own words that your concerns, your interests in this
9 matter has been shown. It's been delivered by your
10 remarks, and I appreciate that. I respect all of your
11 remarks and your thinking, but this is why a session like
12 this is being held to receive your thoughts.

13 And I do, like many of you stated, want to
14 urge DOI, Palumbo and his superiors and on up the line to
15 really take a look at this to really hear and read the
16 words that you all have said because it's really, really
17 important.

18 And, Mr. Palumbo, I do have a couple of other
19 written statements which I would eventually like to submit
20 because they were a bit too long for today's brief
21 communication.

22 But we've got a long ways ahead. We've got a
23 challenge before us. And I do agree with the statement
24 that many of you have said that we're a resilient people,
25 and we can live through the tough times, the hard times and

1 meet the challenges. But I think we all need to do it
2 together. We all want the same outcome, and that is a good
3 life, a long life, a happy life, a healthy life for
4 ourselves, our offspring, our grandchildren and then the
5 land.

6 And I guess that's the reason why I said a
7 couple of days ago in Phoenix, maybe I've spent too many
8 times around the smoking circle with the elders and learned
9 from them and received and obtained the education that they
10 spoke of, and how I would use it and apply it in my own
11 personal ways as I go through life, be it farming, be it
12 rancher, be it in my work, be it associating with people.

13 Many, many interesting lessons that I have
14 learned throughout these years, and I credit my elders. I
15 credit some of you. When I do talk to you, because some of
16 you have expressed really, really great ideas. You all
17 have great insight for this whole matter, and I commend you
18 for that. I applaud you for that.

19 So I heard, you know, you all being educated
20 through your experiences, through life, and in working and
21 talking together, makes you some very dangerous Indians,
22 but that's good.

23 Thank you very much. And we'll continue to
24 do the ride. Thank you very much.

25 And thank you to Leslie, David, and everybody

1 here this afternoon. Thank you. And have a great weekend.

2 Bye-bye.

3 (Listening Session concludes at

4 2:39 p.m.)

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

CERTIFICATE OF CERTIFIED REPORTER

BE IT KNOWN that the foregoing proceedings were taken before me; that the witness before testifying was duly sworn by me to testify to the whole truth; that the foregoing pages are a full, true, and accurate record of the proceedings, all done to the best of my skill and ability; that the proceedings were taken down by me in shorthand and thereafter reduced to print under my direction; that I have complied with the ethical obligations set forth in ACJA 7-206(F)(3) and ACJA 7-206 J(1)(g)(1) and (2).

I CERTIFY that I am in no way related to any of the parties hereto, nor am I in any way interested in the outcome hereof.

[] Review and signature was requested; any changes made by the witness will be attached to the original transcript.

[] Review and signature was waived/not requested.

[X] Review and signature not required.

Dated at Phoenix, Arizona, this 4th day of June, 2017.

Danielle C. Griffin
DANIELLE C. GRIFFIN, RPR
Certified Reporter
Arizona CR No. 50296

* * * * *

I CERTIFY that GRIFFIN & ASSOCIATES, LLC, has complied with the ethical obligations set forth in ACJA 7-206 (J) (1) (g) (1) through (6).

Janet A. Griffin
GRIFFIN & ASSOCIATES, LLC
Registered Reporting Firm
Arizona RRF No. R1005