

**Bureau of Reclamation Implementation Plan for
Federal-Tribal Government-to-Government Policy
June 4, 1996**

This plan is based on guidance provided in the February 24, 1995, memorandum from Ada E. Deer, Assistant Secretary--Indian Affairs, concerning Federal-Tribal government-to-government relationships.

A. Provide Employee Education

Reclamation shall identify employees working with Indians and provide them with appropriate information and training on principles of tribal sovereignty and the Federal-Tribal trust relationship, key Presidential, Secretarial and Reclamation Indian policy directives, and other mandates, policies, and laws affecting Reclamation's working relationship with tribes. This shall generally be the responsibility of the action office and shall be charged to the relevant program, project or other cost authority.

Reclamation's Native American Affairs Office (NAAO) and Regional and Area Office Native American program managers are available to offer advice concerning materials and training.

B. Respect Tribal Sovereignty

Reclamation shall identify whether their planned activities, undertakings, rulemaking, or other proposed actions will affect tribes, tribal rights, or trust assets, and shall insure that appropriate steps for interaction with tribal governments are taken. Each action office shall:

1. Insure that all staff working with tribes have some knowledge of tribal governments and processes generally.
2. When working with a specific tribe, insure that involved staff have adequate knowledge of that tribe's decisionmaking processes and pertinent tribal law, rules, and regulations. What constitutes "adequate" will vary with the nature and degree of tribal contact an individual has and the nature and degree of his involvement with matters potentially affecting the tribe.
3. Apply appropriate laws and regulations in "Indian country," including lands within Indian reservations, non-reservation "dependent Indian communities" such as federally recognized Pueblos, and non-reservation trust lands. Tribal laws and regulations apply in lieu of State law in Indian Country, except when a Federal statute or court decision provides otherwise. Federal laws and regulations generally apply. Consult the Solicitor's Office when in doubt.

EXAMPLE: Ascertain whether the tribe, State and/or Federal Government has regulatory authority over the activity in question (e.g. fishing, recreation, environmental) and work with that entity or entities.

EXAMPLE: Use tribal environmental codes for planning and operations when appropriate to do so.

EXAMPLE: Before carrying out on-reservation activities, coordinate with the tribal government or determine that it previously consented to the activity.

C. Design A Special Protocol

In determining what processes to use when working with tribes, Reclamation shall take into account that tribes as "domestic sovereigns" have a special relationship to the Federal Government. Reclamation shall:

1. Designate a Reclamation Native American Affairs Director and regional Native American program managers to facilitate Tribal-Reclamation communication. At the option of the area office manager, area offices may also designate similar positions. These positions shall, among other things, facilitate Tribal-Reclamation communications.
2. Coordinate with tribal officials to identify the communication channels to use in working with the tribe. When in doubt, Reclamation should formally address the tribal government and ask with whom it should be working on specified issues.
3. Evaluate the relevant process and modify as required to apply to tribes, while refraining from automatically using processes designed exclusively for states or local governments. Reclamation should never afford a tribal government less consideration than it would a similarly situated State government; sometimes, because of the different natures of tribal and State sovereignties, it will be appropriate to afford a tribe additional consideration.

EXAMPLE: Where a program requires that essential findings be made on matters of potential concern to a tribe, insure that the tribe is invited to provide input to be considered and to review draft documents before final findings are made.

EXAMPLE: In public involvement programs or processes, attempt to use processes that distinguish tribes from other "interest groups" by recognizing tribes as sovereign governmental entities possessing a special legal relationship with Federal bureaus and agencies.

4. Apply the requirements of appropriate Executive Orders, such as Orders 12875 ("Enhancing the Intergovernmental Partnership") and 12866 ("Regulatory Planning and Review"), to design solutions and tailor Federal programs to address specific or unique needs of tribal communities. (Copies of these Executive Orders are included with this plan as Exhibits A and B).
5. Refer to the additional Reclamation protocol guidelines as issued by Reclamation's NAAO. (These are expected to become available later in 1996).

D. Take a Proactive Approach to Working with Tribal Governments: Consultation; Insuring that Assistance being Offered Suits the Need

Reclamation shall:

1. Consult directly and formally with tribes when it appears they may have an interest in the outcome of a Reclamation action. Consult in a timely manner to maximize tribal opportunity to participate in the decisionmaking process, and not in a manner that merely informs the tribe of final agency decisions. When in doubt as to whether the tribe has an interest, contact the tribe. When appropriate, formalize the consultation agreement in a Memorandum of Agreement (MOA) or other appropriate instrument. (Contact the NAAO Office or regional Native American program manager to discuss appropriate models).
2. Seek to establish a good working relationship with tribes. Attempt to understand their view as to what a "good working relationship" encompasses.
3. Simplify Reclamation processes for tribal customers and improve the delivery of services when possible in recognition of the United States' special relationship to tribes and their members.
4. Provide tribes with technical, training and other assistance. Meet with tribal officials to understand tribal needs, then work together to determine how Reclamation can help address those needs. Examples of types of assistance that should be considered, include, but are not be limited, those listed below. All assistance is subject to budgetary, program, and authorization constraints.
 - a. Reclamation's Native American technical assistance programs, general investigations, and other programs and projects serving Indian tribes or having potential to do so.
 - b. Technology development and transfer. Development of new technology for use by tribes should be coordinated with the NAAO, which in turn will work with Reclamation's Research Director, to insure non-duplication of effort.
 - c. Training opportunities for tribes and tribal staff to assist the tribes to carry out their governmental responsibilities; training can be implemented through MOA's, Intergovernmental Personnel Act (IPA) agreements, workshops, etc.
5. Comply with Reclamation's Indian trust asset policy and procedures, as the trust relationship underlies all of Reclamation's actions having potential to affect trust assets.

E. Comply with Self-Determination and Self-Governance Policies and Programs

The Self-Determination ("638") and Self-Governance programs allow eligible tribes to take over Federal projects, programs, functions or activities (or components thereof) when certain requirements are met. The underlying policy of the Self-Determination and Self-Governance programs is to provide tribal governments with opportunities to exercise their governmental powers. In furtherance of these policies, Reclamation shall:

1. Familiarize employees working with potentially qualifying projects, programs, or activities with the 638 and Self-Governance programs. Potentially qualifying activities may include programs, projects, functions, or portions thereof, that are for Indians because of their status as Indians, otherwise "available" to Indians, or of special historic, cultural, or geographic significance to the tribe.
2. Provide employee training on 638 and Self-Governance programs so that Reclamation has knowledgeable staff to enter into and administer 638 contracts/grants and Self-Governance Annual Funding Agreements (AFAs). Reclamation's NAAO and regional Native American program managers can provide additional information on training opportunities.
3. Enter into 638 contracts and AFAs when requested by qualifying tribes and consistent with other applicable Self-Governance and Self-Determination law, regulations and policies.
4. Increase tribal awareness of 638, Self-Governance and other options to participate in various Reclamation programs, projects, functions, and activities. This will generally include contacting eligible tribes and providing information about Reclamation programs, projects and activities that may be of tribal interest.
5. When appropriate, assist tribes to develop technical expertise and infrastructure to execute 638 contracts and AFAs. Consider providing training through MOA's, IPA agreements, and workshops.

Attachments

- Exhibit A: Executive Orders 12875 ("Enhancing the Intergovernmental Partnership")
Exhibit B: Executive Order 12866 ("Regulatory Planning and Review")

programs and specifying the eligibility requirements for the materials being recycled.

Sec. 704. *Model Facility Programs.* Each Executive department and major procuring agency shall establish model facility demonstration programs that include comprehensive waste prevention and recycling programs and emphasize the procurement of recycled and environmentally preferable products and services using an electronic data interchange (EDI) system.

Sec. 705. *Recycling Programs.* Each Executive agency that has not already done so shall initiate a program to promote cost effective waste prevention and recycling of reusable materials in all of its facilities. The recycling programs implemented pursuant to this section must be compatible with applicable State and local recycling requirements. Federal agencies shall also consider cooperative ventures with State and local governments to promote recycling and waste reduction in the community.

PART 8—AWARENESS

Sec. 801. *Agency Awards Program.* A government-wide award will be presented annually by the White House to the best, most innovative program implementing the objectives of this order to give greater visibility to those efforts so that they can be incorporated government-wide.

Sec. 802. *Internal Agency Awards Programs.* Each agency shall develop an internal agency-wide awards program, as appropriate, to reward the most innovative environmental programs. Winners of agency-wide awards will be eligible for the White House award program.

PART 9—REVOCATION, LIMITATION AND IMPLEMENTATION

Sec. 901. Executive Order No. 12780, dated October 31, 1991, is hereby revoked.

Sec. 902. This order is intended only to improve the internal management of the executive branch and is not intended to create any right or benefit, substantive or procedural, enforceable at law by a party against the United States, its agencies, its officers, or any other person.

Sec. 903. The policies expressed in this order, including the requirements and elements for effective agency affirmative procurement programs, shall be implemented and incorporated in the Federal Acquisition Regulation (FAR) within 180 days after the effective date of this order. The implementation language shall consist of providing specific direction and guidance on agency programs for preference, promotion, estimation, certification, reviewing and monitoring.

Sec. 904. This order shall be effective immediately.

WILLIAM J. CLINTON

THE WHITE HOUSE,

October 20, 1993.

Editorial note: For the President's statement on signing this order, see the Weekly Compilation of Presidential Documents (vol. 29, p. 2115). For his strategy on the Federal Government's procurement and use of recycled products, see p. 214.

Executive Order 12874 of October 20, 1993

Establishing an Emergency Board To Investigate a Dispute Between The Long Island Rail Road and Certain of Its Employees Represented by the United Transportation Union

A dispute exists between The Long Island Rail Road and certain of its employees represented by the United Transportation Union.

The dispute has not heretofore been adjusted under the provisions of the Railway Labor Act, as amended (the "Act").

A party empowered by the Act has requested that the President establish an emergency board pursuant to section 9A of the Act (45 U.S.C. 159a).

Section 9A(c) of the Act provides that the President, upon such request, shall appoint an emergency board to investigate and report on the dispute NOW, THEREFORE, by the authority vested in me by section 9A of the Act, it is hereby ordered as follows:

Section 1. *Establishment of Board.* There is established, effective October 20, 1993, a board of three members to be appointed by the President to investigate this dispute. No member shall be peculiarly or otherwise interested in any organization of railroad employees or any carrier. The board shall perform its functions subject to the availability of funds.

Sec. 2. *Report.* The Board shall report its findings to the President with respect to the dispute within 30 days after the date of its creation.

Sec. 3. *Maintaining Conditions.* As provided by section 9A(c) of the Act from the date of the creation of the board and for 120 days thereafter, no change, except by agreement of the parties, shall be made by the carrier or the employees in the conditions out of which the dispute arose.

Sec. 4. *Expiration.* The board shall terminate upon the submission of the report provided for in Section 2 of this order.

THE WHITE HOUSE,

WILLIAM J. CLINTON

October 20, 1993.

Executive Order 12875 of October 26, 1993

Enhancing the Intergovernmental Partnership

The Federal Government is charged with protecting the health and safety, as well as promoting other national interests, of the American people. However, the cumulative effect of unfunded Federal mandates has increasingly strained the budgets of State, local, and tribal governments. In addition, the cost, complexity, and delay in applying for and receiving waivers from Federal requirements in appropriate cases have hindered State, local, and tribal governments in their efforts to meet their obligations to their citizens.

tribal governments from tailoring Federal programs to meet the specific or unique needs of their communities. These governments should have more flexibility to design solutions to the problems faced by citizens in this country without excessive micromanagement and unnecessary regulation from the Federal Government.

HEREFORE, by the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and the laws of the United States of America, and in order to reduce the imposition of unfunded mandates upon State, local, and tribal governments; to streamline the application process for and increase the availability of waivers to State, local, and tribal governments; and to establish regular and meaningful consultation and collaboration with State, local, and tribal governments on Federal matters that significantly or uniquely affect their communities, it is hereby ordered as follows:

Section 1. *Reduction of Unfunded Mandates.* (a) To the extent feasible and permitted by law, no executive department or agency ("agency") shall promulgate any regulation that is not required by statute and that creates a mandate upon a State, local, or tribal government, unless:

(1) funds necessary to pay the direct costs incurred by the State, local, or tribal government in complying with the mandate are provided by the Federal Government; or

(2) the agency, prior to the formal promulgation of regulations containing the proposed mandate, provides to the Director of the Office of Management and Budget a description of the extent of the agency's prior consultation with representatives of affected State, local, and tribal governments, the nature of their concerns, any written communications submitted to the agency by such units of government, and the agency's position supporting the need to issue the regulation containing the mandate.

(b) Each agency shall develop an effective process to permit elected officials and other representatives of State, local, and tribal governments to provide meaningful and timely input in the development of regulatory proposals containing significant unfunded mandates.

Sec. 2. *Increasing Flexibility for State and Local Waivers.* (a) Each agency shall review its waiver application process and take appropriate steps to streamline that process.

(b) Each agency shall, to the extent practicable and permitted by law, consider any application by a State, local, or tribal government for a waiver of statutory or regulatory requirements in connection with any program administered by that agency with a general view toward increasing opportunities for utilizing flexible policy approaches at the State, local, and tribal level in cases in which the proposed waiver is consistent with the applicable Federal policy objectives and is otherwise appropriate.

(c) Each agency shall, to the fullest extent practicable and permitted by law, render a decision upon a complete application for a waiver within 120 days of receipt of such application by the agency. If the application for a waiver is not granted, the agency shall provide the applicant with timely written notice of the decision and the reasons therefor.

(d) This section applies only to statutory or regulatory requirements of the programs that are discretionary and subject to waiver by the agency.

Sec. 3. *Responsibility for Agency Implementation.* The Chief Operating officer of each agency shall be responsible for ensuring the implementation of and compliance with this order.

Sec. 4. *Executive Order No. 12866.* This order shall supplement but not supersede the requirements contained in Executive Order No. 12866 ("Regulatory Planning and Review").

Sec. 5. *Scope.* (a) Executive agency means any authority of the United States that is an "agency" under 44 U.S.C. 3502(1), other than those considered to be independent regulatory agencies, as defined in 44 U.S.C. 3502(10).

(b) Independent agencies are requested to comply with the provision this order.

Sec. 6. *Judicial Review.* This order is intended only to improve the internal management of the executive branch and is not intended to, and does not create any right or benefit, substantive or procedural, enforceable at law, equity by a party against the United States, its agencies or instrumentalities, its officers or employees, or any other person.

Sec. 7. *Effective Date.* This order shall be effective 90 days after the date of this order.

THE WHITE HOUSE,

WILLIAM J. CLINTON

October 26, 1993.

Executive Order 12876 of November 1, 1993

Historically Black Colleges and Universities

By the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and the laws of the United States of America, in order to advance the development of human potential, to strengthen the capacity of historically Black colleges and universities to provide quality education, and to increase opportunities to participate in and benefit from Federal programs, it is hereby ordered as follows:

Section 1. There shall be established in the Department of Education the President's Board of Advisors on Historically Black Colleges and Universities ("Board of Advisors" or "Board"), a Presidential advisory committee. The Board of Advisors shall issue an annual report to the President on participation by historically Black colleges and universities in Federally sponsored programs. The Board of Advisors will also provide advice to the Secretary of Education ("Secretary") and in the annual report to the President on how to increase the private sector role in strengthening historically Black colleges and universities, with particular emphasis on enhancing institutional infrastructure and facilitating planning, development, and the use of new technologies to ensure the goal of long-term viability and enhancement of these institutions. Notwithstanding the provisions of any other Executive order, the responsibilities of the President under the Federal Advisory Committee Act, as amended (5 U.S.C. App. 2) which are applicable to the Board of Advisors shall be waived.

Including suspension or termination of licenses or other authorizations in effect as of the date of this order.

Sec. 6. Nothing contained in this order shall create any right or benefit, substantive or procedural, enforceable by any party against the United States, its agencies or instrumentalities, its officers or employees, or any other person.

Sec. 7. (a) This order shall take effect immediately.

(b) This order shall be transmitted to the Congress and published in the Federal Register.

WILLIAM J. CLINTON

THE WHITE HOUSE,

September 26, 1993.

Authorial note: For the President's message to the Congress on these sanctions, see the Weekly Compilation of Presidential Documents (vol. 29, p. 1990).

Executive Order 12866 of September 30, 1993

Regulatory Planning and Review

The American people deserve a regulatory system that works for them, not against them: a regulatory system that protects and improves their health, safety, environment, and well-being and improves the performance of the economy without imposing unacceptable or unreasonable costs on society; regulatory policies that recognize that the private sector and private markets are the best engine for economic growth; regulatory approaches that respect the role of State, local, and tribal governments; and regulations that are effective, consistent, sensible, and understandable. We do not have such a regulatory system today.

With this Executive order, the Federal Government begins a program to reform and make more efficient the regulatory process. The objectives of this Executive order are to enhance planning and coordination with respect to both new and existing regulations; to reaffirm the primacy of Federal agencies in the regulatory decision-making process; to restore the integrity and legitimacy of regulatory review and oversight; and to make the process more accessible and open to the public. In pursuing these objectives, the regulatory process shall be conducted so as to meet applicable statutory requirements and with due regard to the discretion that has been entrusted to the Federal agencies.

Accordingly, by the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and the laws of the United States of America, it is hereby ordered as follows:

Section 1. *Statement of Regulatory Philosophy and Principles.*

(a) *The Regulatory Philosophy.* Federal agencies should promulgate only such regulations as are required by law, are necessary to interpret the law, or are made necessary by compelling public need, such as national failures of private markets to protect or improve the health and safety of the public.

the environment, or the well-being of the American people. In deciding whether and how to regulate, agencies should assess all costs and benefits of available regulatory alternatives, including the alternative of not regulating. Costs and benefits shall be understood to include both quantifiable measures (to the fullest extent that these can be usefully estimated) and qualitative measures of costs and benefits that are difficult to quantify, but nevertheless essential to consider. Further, in choosing among alternative regulatory approaches, agencies should select those approaches that maximize net benefits (including potential economic, environmental, public health and safety, and other advantages; distributive impacts; and equity), unless a statute requires another regulatory approach.

(b) *The Principles of Regulation.* To ensure that the agencies' regulatory programs are consistent with the philosophy set forth above, agencies should adhere to the following principles, to the extent permitted by law and where applicable:

(1) Each agency shall identify the problem that it intends to address (including, where applicable, the failures of private markets or public institutions that warrant new agency action) as well as assess the significance of that problem.

(2) Each agency shall examine whether existing regulations (or other law) have created, or contributed to, the problem that a new regulation is intended to correct and whether those regulations (or other law) should be modified to achieve the intended goal of regulation more effectively.

(3) Each agency shall identify and assess available alternatives to direct regulation, including providing economic incentives to encourage the desired behavior, such as user fees or marketable permits, or providing information upon which choices can be made by the public.

(4) In setting regulatory priorities, each agency shall consider, to the extent reasonable, the degree and nature of the risks posed by various substances or activities within its jurisdiction.

(5) When an agency determines that a regulation is the best available method of achieving the regulatory objective, it shall design its regulations in the most cost-effective manner to achieve the regulatory objective. In doing so, each agency shall consider incentives for innovation, consistency, predictability, the costs of enforcement and compliance (to the government, regulated entities, and the public), flexibility, distributive impacts, and equity.

(6) Each agency shall assess both the costs and the benefits of the intended regulation and, recognizing that some costs and benefits are difficult to quantify, propose or adopt a regulation only upon a reasoned determination that the benefits of the intended regulation justify its costs.

(7) Each agency shall base its decisions on the best reasonably obtainable scientific, technical, economic, and other information concerning the need for, and consequences of, the intended regulation.

(8) Each agency shall identify and assess alternative forms of regulation and shall, to the extent feasible, specify performance objectives, rather than specifying the behavior or manner of compliance that regulated entities must adopt.

(9) Whenever feasible, agencies shall seek views of appropriate State, local, and tribal officials before imposing regulatory requirements that might significantly or uniquely affect those governmental entities. Each agency shall assess the effects of Federal regulations on State, local, and tribal governments, including specifically the availability of resources to carry out those mandates, and seek to minimize those burdens that uniquely or significantly affect such governmental entities, consistent with achieving regulatory objectives. In addition, as appropriate, agencies shall seek to harmonize Federal regulatory actions with related State, local, and tribal regulatory and other governmental functions.

(10) Each agency shall avoid regulations that are inconsistent, incompatible, or duplicative with its other regulations or those of other Federal agencies.

(11) Each agency shall tailor its regulations to impose the least burden on society, including individuals, businesses of differing sizes, and other entities (including small communities and governmental entities), consistent with obtaining the regulatory objectives, taking into account, among other things, and to the extent practicable, the costs of cumulative regulations.

(12) Each agency shall draft its regulations to be simple and easy to understand, with the goal of minimizing the potential for uncertainty and litigation arising from such uncertainty.

Sec. 2. Organization. An efficient regulatory planning and review process is vital to ensure that the Federal Government's regulatory system best serves the American people.

(a) *The Agencies.* Because Federal agencies are the repositories of significant substantive expertise and experience, they are responsible for developing regulations and ensuring that the regulations are consistent with applicable law, the President's priorities, and the principles set forth in this Executive order.

(b) *The Office of Management and Budget.* Coordinated review of agency rulemaking is necessary to ensure that regulations are consistent with applicable law, the President's priorities, and the principles set forth in this Executive order, and that decisions made by one agency do not conflict with the policies or actions taken or planned by another agency. The Office of Management and Budget (OMB) shall carry out that review function. Within OMB, the Office of Information and Regulatory Affairs (OIRA) is the repository of expertise concerning regulatory issues, including methodologies and procedures that affect more than one agency, this Executive order, and the President's regulatory policies. To the extent permitted by law, OMB shall provide guidance to agencies and assist the President, the Vice President, and other regulatory policy advisors to the President in regulatory planning and shall be the entity that reviews individual regulations, as provided by this Executive order.

(c) *The Vice President.* The Vice President is the principal advisor to the President on, and shall coordinate the development and presentation of recommendations concerning, regulatory policy, planning, and review, as set forth in this Executive order. In fulfilling their responsibilities under this Executive order, the President and the Vice President shall be assisted by the regulatory policy advisors within the Executive Office of the President and by such agency officials and personnel as the President and the Vice President may, from time to time, consult.

Sec. 3. Definitions. For purposes of this Executive order: (a) "Advisors" refers to such regulatory policy advisors to the President as the President and Vice President may from time to time consult, including, among others: (1) the Director of OMB; (2) the Chair (or another member) of the Council of Economic Advisors; (3) the Assistant to the President for Economic Policy; (4) the Assistant to the President for Domestic Policy; (5) the Assistant to the President for National Security Affairs; (6) the Assistant to the President for Science and Technology; (7) the Assistant to the President for Intergovernmental Affairs; (8) the Assistant to the President and Staff Secretary; (9) the Assistant to the President and Chief of Staff to the Vice President; (10) the Assistant to the President and Director of the White House Office on Environmental Policy; and (12) the Administrator of OIRA, who also shall coordinate communications relating to this Executive order among the agencies, OMB, the other Advisors, and the Office of the Vice President.

(b) "Agency," unless otherwise indicated, means any authority of the United States that is an "agency" under 44 U.S.C. 3502(1), other than those considered to be independent regulatory agencies, as defined in 44 U.S.C. 3502(10).

(c) "Director" means the Director of OMB.

(d) "Regulation" or "rule" means an agency statement of general applicability and future effect, which the agency intends to have the force and effect of law, that is designed to implement, interpret, or prescribe law or policy or to describe the procedure or practice requirements of an agency. It does not, however, include:

(1) Regulations or rules issued in accordance with the formal rulemaking provisions of 5 U.S.C. 556, 557;

(2) Regulations or rules that pertain to a military or foreign affairs function of the United States, other than government regulations and regulations involving the import or export of non-defense articles and services;

(3) Regulations or rules that are limited to agency organization, management, or personnel matters; or

(4) Any other category of regulations exempted by the Administrator of OIRA.

(e) "Regulatory action" means any substantive action by an agency (formally published in the Federal Register) that promulgates or is expected to lead to the promulgation of a final rule or regulation, including notices of inquiry, advance notices of proposed rulemaking, and notices of proposed rulemaking.

(f) "Significant regulatory action" means any regulatory action that is likely to result in a rule that may:

(1) Have an annual effect on the economy of \$100 million or more or adversely affect in a material way the economy, a sector of the economy, productivity, competition, jobs, the environment, public health or safety, or State, local, or tribal governments or communities;

(2) Create a serious inconsistency or otherwise interfere with an action taken or planned by another agency;

(3) Materially alter the budgetary impact of entitlements, grants, user fees, or loan programs or the rights and obligations of recipients thereof; or

(4) Raise novel legal or policy issues arising out of legal mandates, the President's priorities, or the principles set forth in this Executive order.

Sec. 4. Planning Mechanism. In order to have an effective regulatory program, to provide for coordination of regulations, to maximize consultation and the resolution of potential conflicts at an early stage, to involve the public and its State, local, and tribal officials in regulatory planning, and to ensure that new or revised regulations promote the President's priorities and the principles set forth in this Executive order, those procedures shall be followed, to the extent permitted by law:

(a) *Agencies' Policy Meeting.* Early in each year's planning cycle, the Vice President shall convene a meeting of the Advisors and the heads of agencies to seek a common understanding of priorities and to coordinate regulatory efforts to be accomplished in the upcoming year.

(b) *Unified Regulatory Agenda.* For purposes of this subsection, the term "agency" or "agencies" shall also include those considered to be independent regulatory agencies, as defined in 44 U.S.C. 3502(10). Each agency shall prepare an agenda of all regulations under development or review, at a time and in a manner specified by the Administrator of OIRA. The description of each regulatory action shall contain, at a minimum, a regulation identifier number, a brief summary of the action, the legal authority for the action, any legal deadline for the action, and the name and telephone number of a knowledgeable agency official. Agencies may incorporate the information required under 5 U.S.C. 602 and 41 U.S.C. 402 into those agendas.

(c) *The Regulatory Plan.* For purposes of this subsection, the term "agency" or "agencies" shall also include those considered to be independent regulatory agencies, as defined in 44 U.S.C. 3502(10). (1) As part of the Unified Regulatory Agenda, beginning in 1994, each agency shall prepare a Regulatory Plan (Plan) of the most important significant regulatory actions that the agency reasonably expects to issue in proposed or final form in that fiscal year or thereafter. The Plan shall be approved personally by the agency head and shall contain at a minimum:

(A) A statement of the agency's regulatory objectives and priorities and how they relate to the President's priorities;

(B) A summary of each planned significant regulatory action including, to the extent possible, alternatives to be considered and preliminary estimates of the anticipated costs and benefits;

(C) A summary of the legal basis, for each such action, including whether any aspect of the action is required by statute or court order;

(D) A statement of the need for each such action and, if applicable, how the action will reduce risks to public health, safety, or the environment, as well as how the magnitude of the risk addressed by the action relates to other risks within the jurisdiction of the agency;

(E) The agency's schedule for action, including a statement of any applicable statutory or judicial deadlines; and

(F) The name, address, and telephone number of a person the public may contact for additional information about the planned regulatory action.

(2) Each agency shall forward its Plan to OIRA by June 1st of each year.

(3) Within 10 calendar days after OIRA has received an agency's Plan, OIRA shall circulate it to other affected agencies, the Advisors, and the Vice President.

(4) An agency head who believes that a planned regulatory action of another agency may conflict with its own policy or action taken or planned shall promptly notify, in writing, the Administrator of OIRA, who shall forward that communication to the issuing agency, the Advisors, and the Vice President.

(5) If the Administrator of OIRA believes that a planned regulatory action of an agency may be inconsistent with the President's priorities or the principles set forth in this Executive order or may be in conflict with a policy or action taken or planned by another agency, the Administrator of OIRA shall promptly notify, in writing, the affected agencies, the Advisors, and the Vice President.

(6) The Vice President, with the Advisors' assistance, may consult with the heads of agencies with respect to their Plans and, in appropriate instances, request further consideration or inter-agency coordination.

(7) The Plans developed by the issuing agency shall be published annually in the October publication of the Unified Regulatory Agenda. The publication shall be made available to the Congress, State, local, and tribal governments; and the public. Any views on any aspect of any agency Plan, including whether any planned regulatory action might conflict with a policy or action taken or planned by another agency, the Administrator of OIRA shall promptly notify, in writing, the affected agencies, the Advisors, and the Vice President.

(8) *Regulatory Working Group.* Within 30 days of the date of this Executive order, the Administrator of OIRA shall convene a Regulatory Working Group ("Working Group"), which shall consist of representatives of the heads of each agency that the Administrator determines to have significant domestic regulatory responsibility, the Advisors, and the Vice President. The Administrator of OIRA shall chair the Working Group and shall periodically advise the Vice President on the activities of the Working Group. The Working Group shall serve as a forum to assist agencies in identifying and analyzing important regulatory issues (including, among others, (1) the development of comparative risk assessment in regulatory decision-making, and (2) the development of short forms and other streamlined regulatory approaches for small businesses and other entities). The Working Group shall meet at least quarterly and may meet as a whole or in subgroups with an interest in particular issues or subject areas. To inform discussions, the Working Group may commission analytical studies and reports by OIRA, the Administrative Conference of the United States, or another agency.

(9) *Conferences.* The Administrator of OIRA shall meet quarterly with representatives of State, local, and tribal governments to identify both existing and proposed regulations that may uniquely or significantly affect the

governmental entities. The Administrator of OIRA shall also convene, from time to time, conferences with representatives of businesses, nongovernmental organizations, and the public to discuss regulatory issues of common concern.

Sec. 5. *Existing Regulations.* In order to reduce the regulatory burden on the American people, their families, their communities, their State, local, and tribal governments, and their industries; to determine whether regulations promulgated by the executive branch of the Federal Government have become unjustified or unnecessary as a result of changed circumstances; to confirm that regulations are both compatible with each other and not duplicative or inappropriately burdensome in the aggregate; to ensure that all regulations are consistent with the President's priorities and the principles set forth in this Executive order, within applicable law; and to otherwise improve the effectiveness of existing regulations: (a) Within 90 days of the date of this Executive order, each agency shall submit to OIRA a program, consistent with its resources and regulatory priorities, under which the agency will periodically review its existing significant regulations to determine whether any such regulations should be modified or eliminated so as to make the agency's regulatory program more effective in achieving the regulatory objectives, less burdensome, or in greater alignment with the President's priorities and the principles set forth in this Executive order. Any significant regulations selected for review shall be included in the agency's annual plan. The agency shall also identify any legislative mandates that require the agency to promulgate or continue to impose regulations that the agency believes are unnecessary or outdated by reason of changed circumstances.

(b) The Administrator of OIRA shall work with the Regulatory Working Group and other interested entities to pursue the objectives of this section. State, local, and tribal governments are specifically encouraged to assist in the identification of regulations that impose significant or unique burdens on those governmental entities and that appear to have outlived their justification or be otherwise inconsistent with the public interest.

(c) The Vice President, in consultation with the Advisors, may identify for review by the appropriate agency or agencies other existing regulations of an agency or groups of regulations of more than one agency that affect a particular group, industry, or sector of the economy, or may identify legislative mandates that may be appropriate for reconsideration by the Congress.

Sec. 8. *Centralized Review of Regulations.* The guidelines set forth below shall apply to all regulatory actions, for both new and existing regulations, by agencies other than those agencies specifically exempted by the Administrator of OIRA:

(a) *Agency Responsibilities.* (1) Each agency shall (consistent with its own rules, regulations, or procedures) provide the public with meaningful participation in the regulatory process. In particular, before issuing a notice of proposed rulemaking, each agency should, where appropriate, seek the involvement of those who are intended to benefit from and those expected to be burdened by any regulation (including, specifically, State, local, and tribal officials). In addition, each agency should afford the public a meaningful opportunity to comment on any proposed regulation, which in most cases should include a comment period of not less than 60 days. Each

agency also is directed to explore and, where appropriate, use consensus mechanisms for developing regulations, including negotiated rulemaking.

(2) Within 60 days of the date of this Executive order, each agency shall designate a Regulatory Policy Officer who shall report to agency head. The Regulatory Policy Officer shall be involved at each step of the regulatory process to foster the development of effective, innovative and least burdensome regulations and to further the principles set forth in this Executive order.

(3) In addition to adhering to its own rules and procedures and the requirements of the Administrative Procedure Act, the Regulatory Flexibility Act, the Paperwork Reduction Act, and other applicable law, each agency shall develop its regulatory actions in a timely fashion and adhere to the following procedures with respect to a regulatory action:

(A) Each agency shall provide OIRA, at such times and in the manner specified by the Administrator of OIRA, with a list of its planned regulatory actions, indicating those which the agency believes are significant regulatory actions within the meaning of this Executive order. Absent a formal change in the development of the planned regulatory action, it shall not be designated as significant until it is subject to review under this section unless, within 10 working days of receipt of the list, the Administrator of OIRA notifies the agency that OIRA has determined that a planned regulatory action is a significant regulatory action within the meaning of this Executive order. The Administrator of OIRA may waive review of any plan regulatory action designated by the agency as significant, in which case the agency need not further comply with subsection (a)(3)(B) or subsection (a)(3)(C) of this section.

(B) For each matter identified as, or determined by the Administrator of OIRA to be, a significant regulatory action, the issuing agency shall provide to OIRA:

(i) The text of the draft regulatory action, together with a reasoned, detailed description of the need for the regulatory action and an explanation of how the regulatory action will meet that need; and

(ii) An assessment of the potential costs and benefits of the regulatory action, including an explanation of the manner in which the regulatory action is consistent with a statutory mandate and, to the extent permitted by law, promotes the President's priorities and avoids undue interference with State, local, and tribal governments in the exercise of their governmental functions.

(C) For those matters identified as, or determined by the Administrator of OIRA to be, a significant regulatory action within the scope of section 3(D)(1), the agency shall also provide to OIRA the following additional information developed as part of the agency's decision-making process (unless prohibited by law):

(i) An assessment, including the underlying analysis, of benefits anticipated from the regulatory action (such as, but not limited to, the promotion of the efficient functioning of the economy and private markets, the enhancement of health and safety, the protection of the natural environment, and the elimination or reduction of discrimination or bias) together with the extent feasible, a quantification of those benefits;

(ii) An assessment, including the underlying analysis, of costs anticipated from the regulatory action (such as, but not limited to, the direct cost both to the government in administering the regulation and to businesses and others in complying with the regulation, and any adverse effects on the efficient functioning of the economy, private markets (including productivity, employment, and competitiveness), health, safety, and the natural environment), together with, to the extent feasible, a quantification of those costs; and

(iii) An assessment, including the underlying analysis, of costs and benefits of potentially effective and reasonably feasible alternatives to the planned regulation. Identified by the agencies or the public (including improving the current regulation and reasonably viable nonregulatory actions), and an explanation why the planned regulatory action is preferable to the identified potential alternatives.

(D) In emergency situations or when an agency is obligated by law to act more quickly than normal review procedures allow, the agency shall notify OIRA as soon as possible and, to the extent practicable, comply with subsections (a)(3)(B) and (C) of this section. For those regulatory actions that are governed by a statutory or court-imposed deadline, the agency shall, to the extent practicable, schedule rulemaking proceedings so as to permit sufficient time for OIRA to conduct its review, as set forth below in subsection (b)(2) through (4) of this section.

(E) After the regulatory action has been published in the Federal Register or otherwise issued to the public, the agency shall:

(i) Make available to the public the information set forth in subsections (a)(3)(B) and (C);

(ii) Identify for the public, in a complete, clear, and simple manner, the substantive changes between the draft submitted to OIRA for review and the action subsequently announced; and

(iii) Identify for the public those changes in the regulatory action that were made at the suggestion or recommendation of OIRA.

(F) All information provided to the public by the agency shall be in plain, understandable language.

(b) *OIRA Responsibilities.* The Administrator of OIRA shall provide meaningful guidance and oversight so that each agency's regulatory actions are consistent with applicable law, the President's priorities, and the principles set forth in this Executive order and do not conflict with the policies or actions of another agency. OIRA shall, to the extent permitted by law, adhere to the following guidelines:

(1) OIRA may review only actions identified by the agency or by OIRA as significant regulatory actions under subsection (a)(3)(A) of this section.

(2) OIRA shall waive review or notify the agency in writing of the results of its review within the following time periods:

(A) For any notices of inquiry, advance notices of proposed rulemaking, or other preliminary regulatory actions prior to a Notice of Proposed Rulemaking, within 10 working days after the date of submission of the draft action to OIRA.

(B) For all other regulatory actions, within 90 calendar days after the date of submission of the information set forth in subsections (a)(3)(B) and (C) of this section, unless OIRA has previously reviewed this information, and, since that review, there has been no material change in the facts and circumstances upon which the regulatory action is based. In which case OIRA shall complete its review within 45 days; and

(C) The review process may be extended (1) once by no more than 3 calendar days upon the written approval of the Director and (2) at the request of the agency head.

(3) For each regulatory action that the Administrator of OIRA returns to an agency for further consideration of some or all of its provisions, the Administrator of OIRA shall provide the issuing agency a written explanation for such return, setting forth the pertinent provision of this Executive order on which OIRA is relying. If the agency head disagrees with some or all of the bases for the return, the agency head shall so inform the Administrator of OIRA in writing.

(4) Except as otherwise provided by law or required by a Court, in order to ensure greater openness, accessibility, and accountability in the regulatory review process, OIRA shall be governed by the following disclosure requirements:

(A) Only the Administrator of OIRA (or a particular designee) shall receive oral communications initiated by persons not employed by the executive branch of the Federal Government regarding the substance of a regulatory action under OIRA review;

(B) All substantive communications between OIRA personnel and persons not employed by the executive branch of the Federal Government regarding a regulatory action under review shall be governed by the following guidelines: (i) A representative from the issuing agency shall be invited to any meeting between OIRA personnel and such persons; and

(ii) OIRA shall forward to the issuing agency, within 10 working days of receipt of the communication(s), all written communications, regardless of format, between OIRA personnel and any person who is not employed by the executive branch of the Federal Government, and the dates and names of individuals involved in all substantive oral communications (including meetings to which an agency representative was invited, but did not attend, and telephone conversations between OIRA personnel and any such persons); and

(iii) OIRA shall publicly disclose relevant information about such communication(s), as set forth below in subsection (b)(4)(C) of this section.

(C) OIRA shall maintain a publicly available log that shall contain, as a minimum, the following information pertinent to regulatory actions under review:

(i) The status of all regulatory actions, including if (and if so, when, and by whom) Vice Presidential and Presidential consideration was requested;

(ii) A notation of all written communications forwarded to an issuing agency under subsection (i)(4)(i)(ii) of this section; and

(iii) The dates and names of individuals involved in all substantive oral communications, including meetings and telephone conversations, between OIRA personnel and any person not employed by the executive branch of the Federal Government, and the subject matter discussed during such communications.

(D) After the regulatory action has been published in the Federal Register or otherwise issued to the public, or after the agency has announced its decision not to publish or issue the regulatory action, OIRA shall make available to the public all documents exchanged between OIRA and the agency during the review by OIRA under this section.

(5) All information provided to the public by OIRA shall be in plain, understandable language.

Sec. 7. Resolution of Conflicts. To the extent permitted by law, disagreements or conflicts between or among agency heads or between OMB and any agency that cannot be resolved by the Administrator of OIRA shall be resolved by the President, or by the Vice President acting at the request of the President, with the relevant agency head (and, as appropriate, other interested government officials). Vice Presidential and Presidential consideration of such disagreements may be initiated only by the Director, by the head of the issuing agency, or by the head of an agency that has a significant interest in the regulatory action at issue. Such review will not be undertaken at the request of other persons, entities, or their agents.

Resolution of such conflicts shall be informed by recommendations developed by the Vice President, after consultation with the Advisors (and other executive branch officials or personnel whose responsibilities to the President include the subject matter at issue). The development of these recommendations shall be concluded within 60 days after review has been requested.

During the Vice Presidential and Presidential review period, communications with any person not employed by the Federal Government relating to the substance of the regulatory action under review and directed to the Advisors or their staffs or to the staff of the Vice President shall be in writing and shall be forwarded by the recipient to the affected agency(ies) for inclusion in the public docket(s). When the communication is not in writing, such Advisors or staff members shall inform the outside party that the matter is under review and that any comments should be submitted in writing.

At the end of this review process, the President, or the Vice President acting at the request of the President, shall notify the affected agency and the Administrator of OIRA of the President's decision with respect to the matter.

Sec. 8. Publication. Except to the extent required by law, an agency shall not publish in the Federal Register or otherwise issue to the public any regulatory action that is subject to review under section 6 of this Executive order until (1) the Administrator of OIRA notifies the agency that OIRA has waived its review of the action or has completed its review without any requests for further consideration, or (2) the applicable time period in section 6(b)(2) expires without OIRA having notified the agency that it is returning the regulatory action for further consideration under section 6(b)(3), whichever occurs first. If the terms of the preceding sentence have not been satisfied and an agency wants to publish or otherwise issue a regulatory ac-

tion, the head of that agency may request Presidential consideration through the Vice President, as provided under section 7 of this order. Upon receipt of this request, the Vice President shall notify OIRA and the Advisors. The guidelines and time period set forth in section 7 shall apply to the publication of regulatory actions for which Presidential consideration has been sought.

Sec. 9. Agency Authority. Nothing in this order shall be construed as displacing the agencies' authority or responsibilities, as authorized by law.

Sec. 10. Judicial Review. Nothing in this Executive order shall affect or otherwise available judicial review of agency action. This Executive order is intended only to improve the internal management of the Federal Government and does not create any right or benefit, substantive or procedural, enforceable at law or equity by a party against the United States, its agencies or instrumentalities, its officers or employees, or any other person.

Sec. 11. Revocations. Executive Orders Nos. 12291 and 12498; all amendments to those Executive orders; all guidelines issued under those orders and any exemptions from those orders heretofore granted for any category of rule are revoked.

THE WHITE HOUSE,
September 30, 1993.

WILLIAM J. CLINTON

Factual note: For the President's remarks on signing this Executive order, see the Weekly Compilation of Presidential Documents (vol. 29, p. 1023).

Executive Order 12867 of September 30, 1993

Termination of Emergency Authority for Certain Export Controls

By the authority vested in me as President by the Constitution and the laws of the United States of America, including section 203 of the International Emergency Economic Powers Act (50 U.S.C. 1702) ("the IEEPA"), the National Emergencies Act (50 U.S.C. 1601 et seq.), the Export Administration Act of 1979, as amended (50 U.S.C. App. 2401 et seq.) ("the Act"), and section 301 of title 3 of the United States Code, it is hereby ordered as follows:

Section 1. In view of the extension of the Act by Public Law 103-10 (March 27, 1993), Executive Order No. 12730 of September 30, 1990, which continued the effect of export control regulations under the IEEPA, is revoked, and the declaration of economic emergency is rescinded, as provided in this order.

Sec. 2. The revocation of Executive Order No. 12730 shall not affect any violation of any rules, regulations, orders, licenses, and other forms of administrative action under that Order that occurred during the period the order was in effect. All rules and regulations issued or continued in effect under the authority of the IEEPA and Executive Order No. 12735, including those conflict at 15 CFR Sections 758-760 (1993) and all other