

# **Rate Comparability Analysis Spanish Flat Resort**

**Bureau of Reclamation  
Mid-Pacific Region  
Solano Project  
Lake Berryessa, CA**





## **Preface to the Spanish Flat Resort Comparability Analysis**

In completing the comparability study for concession rates for Spanish Flat Resort and other concessionaires at Lake Berryessa 58 different properties were visited. These properties encompassed a north/south area from Lake Shasta to Midpines (Yosemite area) and an east/west area from Lake Tahoe to coastal sites north of San Francisco. Data was collected at each location and photographs were taken to assist in the overall display and analysis of information. Of the 58 properties visited 24 of them were areas submitted to Reclamation by Lake Berryessa concessionaires.

Obviously some of the properties visited had more similarities to Lake Berryessa concession operations than others. Some of the properties proved to have little in common with Lake Berryessa operations.

### **Determining ‘Actual Comparables’ from among the ‘Potential Comparables Visited**

To determine objectively which properties among the 58 ‘Potential Comparables’ would be used as ‘Actual Comparables’ they were all rated using a comparability matrix as per Reclamation Concession Management Guidelines. This is the same process utilized by the National Park Service for over 20 years in selecting comparables for similar concession rate approvals in that agency. The matrix was completed using data collected during the on site visits. This process is complex enough that it will be helpful for concessionaires and Reclamation officials reviewing this report to read the following couple of pages that explains how the matrix is completed and used to select the ‘Actual Comparables’. The matrix does not eliminate the need for good judgment and a thorough knowledge of the comparability process.

#### **What is the Comparability Matrix?**

The comparability matrix is a table that provides point values expressed as a level of similarity between a particular potential comparable and the concessionaire. The values are determined using the concessionaire’s current operating conditions as the base against which all others are compared. These values are assigned to each of the identified criteria for lodging, marinas, and campgrounds.

Numeric values can be assigned fairly easily to criteria such as number of rooms, percentage of occupancy, and number of boat slips. Assigning values to nominal criteria such as type of area, clientele, and facility characteristics is more problematic and requires judgment and analysis.

#### **How the matrix helps.**

Using a matrix provides a balanced procedure for rating similarities among potential comparables and the concessionaire in an unbiased manner. Determining an approved rate is not an exact science; the concessionaire’s rates are appropriate if most customers would expect to pay similar prices for similar services under similar conditions outside the recreation area (easy to say but difficult to determine).

**How is the matrix set up and compiled?**

The comparability matrix has a dual axis. The business properties measured (including the concessionaire) are listed down the left column. The criteria measured are listed across the top. When completed, this matrix will note the degree of similarity between the concessionaire and the potential comparables. **The matrix does not designate the properties as better or worse, but only shows the degree of similarity.** Quality and value are not analyzed thoroughly until after the selection of actual comparables.

Information on the criteria (lodging [7 criteria], marinas [6 criteria], and campgrounds [5 criteria]) must be collected during visits to all potential comparables to ensure a thorough review. These criteria are the only items measured to determine comparability. After the comparables are identified, extra quality features and additional analysis are used to determine final approved rates.

It is critical that the same person(s) evaluate all the properties in the comparability matrix to ensure consistency. The concessionaire is listed first on the matrix and is assigned a value of 10 points for each criterion. This format would result in a total of 70 points for the concessionaire in a lodging matrix because there are seven criteria (7 X 10 = 70). **The total does not signify a level of performance or quality but only similarity of operations compared to the concessionaire.** The qualified person completing the matrix will then determine point spreads for each of the criteria analyzed that reflect the differences between potential comparables. For example, if a concessionaire has 100 guest rooms, a potential comparable should have 95–105 guest rooms, to receive 10 points. A possible rating scenario on the criteria for the number of guest rooms follows:

95-105 rooms	10 points
85-94 and 106-115 rooms	9 points
75-84 and 116-125 rooms	8 points
65-74 and 126-135 rooms	7 points

ETC.

Some criteria may not be as varied and could result either in 10 (the same), 5 (partially the same), or 0 (completely different). The person completing the matrix should strive for consistency supported by knowledge and thoroughness.

This technique is valuable and easy to use because the final point scores for each potential comparable are not important alone—but only in relation to the other potential comparables. The most critical aspect of completing the matrix is maintaining program consistency by ensuring that the same person evaluates all the properties.

The matrix system can seem confusing and complicated at first, but with use, it becomes simple, easy to use, and productive. It contributes to an objective, analytical final rate decision. It brings together many disparate functions of the rate approval process to support operational activities that directly impacts area visitors.

**How are ‘Actual Comparables’ selected from the completed matrix?**

After the matrix is completed and the points are totaled for each property, the person completing the matrix looks for a natural break in the point spread. All properties above that number will be selected as actual comparables. If a break level is not apparent or provides too few or too many properties, a determination will be made that selects the top scoring properties to be used as the ‘Actual Comparables’. No specific number of comparables is required, but there should never be fewer than three actual comparables selected and normally not more than eight or nine.

In completing the comparability analysis for Spanish Flat Resort the number of Actual Comparables’ selected were:

Campground/RV Operations	7 Actual Comparables
Lodging Operations	9 Actual Comparables
Marina Operations	6 Actual Comparables

**What happens after the ‘Actual Comparables’ are identified?**

After the actual comparables are designated, further analysis considers ‘Extra Quality Features’ (EQF) to determine where the concession fits among the comparable properties and the range of rates. Following this analysis, other factors deemed significant are introduced that help define the comparative quality of the concessionaire’s goods and services. These factors impact the final rates to the user and should not be considered until a rate based on comparability has been determined. Examples of other factors deemed significant could be the cost of housing employees, utility costs above comparability, significant delivery costs above comparability, and additional costs caused by environmental concerns that are not present with the comparables. Such costs may be passed on to the customer, but it is extremely critical that the concessionaire be able to specifically and concretely substantiate them. Additional rates above comparability should never be authorized without written documentation. Sometimes there are operating costs that have risen in the last few years that do not result in increased rates because those same increases are a factor with the ‘Actual Comparables’ and have already been reflected in the comparable rates.

The following pages present the applicable matrixes for Campground/RV, Lodging, and Marina operations in regard to Spanish Flat Resort. Immediately following the matrixes is the evaluation of the ‘Extra Quality Features’ of the comparables selected and further analysis of those ‘Actual Comparables’. At the end of each section are the recommendations of the analyst in regard to how the various rates at Spanish Flat Resort should be addressed based upon this comparability analysis.

**Wheeler’s RV Resort & Campground Guide - Applicability to Lake Berryessa Concessionaire Comparability**

After thorough analysis of the 2005 Edition of the Wheeler’s Guide to consider its applicability to Lake Berryessa’s comparability study of its seven resorts, it has been concluded that the Wheeler’s Guide has no merit as a determinant in establishing rates to the public at Lake Berryessa.

The Wheelers Guide does not profess to be anything other than a 'guide'. As such, it provides a basic inventory of RV Parks and Campgrounds. It provides users with general resort information, and attempts to supply an overall quality evaluation through a 'Star' assignment system. It also provides some general rate information for low, mid and upper priced amenities: however, it does not provide direction or determination on what rates should be for these various price levels nor does it provide any specific training or direction on how to determine the number of stars a facility receives. The evaluation and star rating is provided by untrained volunteer users who complete a rating form available in the back of the guide book.

Therefore, while Wheelers does provide direction and steps that result in the gathering and analysis of data for comparable rates, the process utilized in complying with Reclamation concession guidelines for rate approval does not recognize 'Wheelers Guide' as part of the rate approval process.

# **CAMPGROUND & RV OPERATIONS**

# CAMPGROUND COMPARIBILITY MATRIX

## Spanish Flat

	Competition	Seasonality	Occupancy Rate	Similar Size	Site Type	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
<b>Spanish Flat Resort</b> 89 sites – 4fhu – 9partial 82% Occ Memorial Day thru Labor Day	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b> 82%	<b>10</b> 89 78 no/hu 4f + 9part	<b>10</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>BASE</b>
<b>Coloma Resort (American River)</b> 102 RV 50% w/fh + 50% w/h2O/elect Tent area also	<b>10</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>4 #1</b>
<b>Edgewater Resort - (Clearlake)</b> 61RV sites – no excl tent – all w/hu+tv	<b>10</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>37</b>	
<b>Olema Ranch Campground (Pt. Reyes)</b> 31fhu – 58partial – 175 tent	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>30</b>	
<b>Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe)</b> 35 total – 10 w/fh	<b>10</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>31</b>	
<b>Funtime RV Park (Clearlake)</b> 60 comb RV/Tent w/fh	<b>10</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>34</b>	
<b>American River Resort</b> 85 Sites – 35 w/full RV hu's	<b>10</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>4 #2</b>
<b>Anchor Bay Campground (Coast)</b> 29 RV/tent sites – 3 w/fhu	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>31</b>	
<b>Manchester Beach KOA (Coast)</b> 115 tot – 51tent – 36partial – 22full	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>37</b>	
<b>Petaluma KOA</b> 307tot – 124full – 39partial – 144none	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>29</b>	
<b>Placerville KOA</b> 104tot – 44full – 30partial – 30none	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>Sacramento KOA</b> 133tot – 85full – 48w/o phone & TV	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>33</b>	
<b>Stockton KOA</b> 100 w/fh – 20 tent sites	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>35</b>	
<b>Tahoe KOA</b> 85total – 49full – 36tent w/nohu	<b>10</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>38</b>	
<b>Willits KOA</b> 32h2O&Elec – 11full – 16tent	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>4 #3</b>
<b>Yosemite KOA</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>38</b>	

27full- 20partial – 26tent							
Snug Harbor (Delta) 28full or partial -	8	7	7	4	4	30	
Tahoe Pines 17full – 22partial – 90tent	10	5	8	8	9	40	4 #4
49er RV Ranch (Columbia/Sonora) 35full HU incl TV	9	8	6	4	4	31	
Collins Lake 150w/hu – 30 tent	8	9	7	4	6	34	
Holiday Harbor (Clearlake) 35 full hu	10	8	6	4	3	31	
Long Ravine CG (Rollins Lake) 12 w/elec – 64 w/o hu (tent)	10	9	7	8	8	42	2 #5
Orchard Spring Res (Rollins Lake) 90sites – 17w/fhu	10	9	7	10	8	44	1 #6
Pine Acres (Blue Lake) 29sites – 4w/fh – 21 partial – tent random	10	8	7	3	5	33	
Scotts Flat Lake 31tent sites – 136RV (+lg group sites)	8	7	6	5	4	30	
Tower Park (Delta) KOA 200 fhu	9	7	7	4	2	29	
Greenhorn CG (Rollins Lake) 40 sites w/no hu	10	9	7	5	5	36	
Peninsula Campground (Rollins Lake) 78 sites w/no hu	10	8	7	8	5	38	
Lake Francis 84 total sites 30 fhu – 17partial – 37 tent	8	9	7	9	8	41	3 #7
The Narrows Resort (Blue Lake) 15RV sites – all at least partial	10	8	6	2	3	29	
Delta Bay RV Resort (Delta) 150 RV w/fhu (w, s, e, tv)– no tent area	9	7	7	5	3	31	
Camanche Reservoir +/-300 tent/RV sites w/o hu 100RV sites w/fhu	8	9	5	1	4	27	
Emerald Cove (Bullard Bar Reservoir) 56 non hook-up sites – tent or RV	8	8	8	6	6	36	
Shasta Lake Marina 27 w/fhu	10	9	8	4	3	34	
Angels Camp RV 32 w/fhu – 16 partial – 14 tent 62 Total	9	8	7	7	6	37	

**Notes on the Preceding Chart** – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaire’s campground operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Tot = Total  
hu = Hook-ups  
fhu = Full hook-ups  
elec = Electric  
w/o = Without  
excl = Exclusive  
h20 = Water

## Campground - Extra Quality Features SPANISH FLAT RESORT

Features (check if present)	SPANISH FLAT		AMERICAN RIVER RESORT	LONG RAVINE CG	LAKE FRANCIS RESORT	ORCHARD SPRG RESORT	Tahoe Pines CG	Willits KOA	COLOMA RESORT	
Utility hookups (water, sewer, electric)	4 full 9 part		P	L	P	L-13	P	P&L	50%F 50%P	
Trash receptacles										
At site										
Centralized	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y--	Y	Y	
Dumping station	Y					N		Y	Y	
Included in campsite rate	Y		Y	Y	Y	RV-13	Y	Y	Y	
Extra charge (For Honey Wgn)	Y									
Showers	Y							Y		
Included in campsite rate	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Coin operated	Y									
Partitioned stalls	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Open/common area										
Heated	Y			Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	
Restroom service										
Pit toilets (CHEMICAL)	Y									
Flush toilets	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Hot and cold water	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Water										
At individual sites					Y&tent	RV-13	RV-Y	RV-Y	Y-All	
Scattered hydrants	Y		Y	Y		Y	T-Y	T-Y		
Central only										
<b>Site Characteristics</b>										
Site seclusion (utmost, moderate, limited)	Poor		M	L	M	M	L	M	M	
Separate area for tents	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Landscaping appropriate for natural	Poor		N	N	L	L	L-	Y	L	
Type of access										
Rough or gravel road			Y				Y-			
Paved	P		Y	Y	Y	Y		Y	Y	
Pull-through for RVs and trailers	N		L	L	Some	Some	FEW	Y	Some	
Compliance with ADA requirements	N		N	N	L	L	N	Some	L	
Lighted areas and paths	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	

Features (check if present)	SPANISH FLAT		AMERICAN RIVER RESORT	LONG RAVINE CG	LAKE FRANCIS RESORT	ORCHARD SPRG RESORT	Tahoe Pines CG	Willits KOA	COLOMA RESORT	
Picnic table at site	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Fireplace/grill at site	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Reservation system	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Public phone available	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Camper service store	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Food service	L		L	Y	L	L	N	N	L	
Gasoline service station	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	
Propane	N		N	Y	N	N	N	N	N	
24-hour onsite available	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	
Firewood available	Y		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Coin laundry available ( <i>Perms. Only*</i> )	N*		N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	
Ice available	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Vending machines	Y		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Interpretative programs	N		N	N	Y	N	N	Y	L	
Entertainment programs	N		N	N	Y	N	N	Y	Y	
Recreation room	N		N	N	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	
Swimming pool	N		N	N	Y	N	N	Y	Y	

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

- P = Partial (in re: to hook ups 'P' denotes that only some of the sites have hook-ups.
- L = Limited (in re: to hook ups 'L' means some sites have limited hook ups.
- Y = Yes
- N = No
- RV = Recreational Vehicle
- CG = Campground
- T = Tent
- M = Moderate
- = Somewhat less or worse
- + = Somewhat more or better

Spanish Flat Resort – Campground Operations - The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Spanish Flat Resort fits into the mix of ‘Actual Comparables’ for campground operations. This list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed among the comparables determined to be most similar to the concessionaire. This list of ‘Actual Comparables’ is not oriented in regards to price but in the level of apparent desirability, i.e., the property listed first is the most desirable and the one listed last is the least desirable within this group. Note that following the name of each property there is a number, i.e., ‘4<sup>th</sup>’ following Willits KOA. This number corresponds to the ranking on the ‘Comparability Matrix’ a few pages back so the lower the number the more similarity to Spanish Flat Resort.

**PROPERTY**

**RATES**

**1. Willits KOA (4<sup>th</sup>)**

**\$44 full hook up, \$40 partial, \$37 back-in  
\$32 Tent weekend, \$25 Sun-Thur.**

The Willits KOA campground is above average in respect to most KOA locations. There is a wide variety of on site amenities offered to RV’ers and campers, i.e., swimming pool, fishing pond, developed hiking trails, Old West theme throughout the park, cable TV as part of hook-up, 50 amp service, mini golf, established tours of area highlights (for charge), bicycle rentals, children’s playground, etc. This campground received the ‘Presidents Award’ which is the highest internal rating given within the family of KOA campgrounds.

**2. Coloma Resort (4<sup>th</sup>)**

**\$35 Fri-Sat nites all sites, \$33 Sun-Thur. (RV Only)**

Coloma is in the upper quality of RV resorts visited. There is a small tenting area w/o individual sites but just a general area where tent users can go for \$10 a tent. 50% of the sites have full hookups and the other 50% are partial. Most sites that are not well shaded by trees have an awning erected over the picnic table to improve the ambiance. The resort has many special activities from community BBQ’s to educational meetings that they sponsor for guests. There is a swimming pool, petting zoo and other internal activities.

**3. Lake Francis Resort (3<sup>rd</sup>)**

**\$27 Full, \$25 Water & Elec.  
\$23 Lg. Tent Site,  
\$21 Sm. Tent Site (both H20)**

The Lake Francis Resort RV Park/Campground is not a high end area but appears well run and in good condition. Facilities are a little dated and in some areas need replacement. A very nice feature is the availability of water in an outdoor sink arrangement at each tent campsite. Sites are moderately well distanced or separated from one another.

**4. Orchard Springs Res. (1<sup>st</sup>)**

**\$36 Full hook up – same price all year  
\$33 Tent Water Vu, \$29 Reg. Tent Site**

Orchard Springs Resort features fairly typical RV/Campground facilities. They are located in a heavily timbered area that provides good shade to most campsites. They feature a preponderance of tent sites and only 13 RV sites.

**5. Long Ravine CG (2<sup>nd</sup>)**

**\$29 for limited hookup site all days  
\$25 for tent sites all days**

Long Ravine Campground is a moderately nice tenting campground but a fairly inconvenient RV campground. It has 12 partial hook-up sites. All of the sites are in timber and have fairly good shade. Facilities and amenities adjacent to the CG area are minimal. Under the same ownership/management is a

nice little marina, store and beach area which are all available to the campground users but not without a substantial walk or getting in a vehicle and driving.

**6. American River CG (6<sup>th</sup>)    \$35 Full RV  
\$30 Riverside Tent Wkend, \$25 Wkday  
\$25 Reg. Tent Wkend, \$20 Wkday**

The American River CG is mainly used as a staging and overnight area for river running activities on the American River. There are a few awesome camp sites adjacent to the River that are extremely picturesque for either tenters or RV'ers. The main part of the campground is away from the river by 50-100 yards and although well spaced out tends to be dry, dusty and fairly dirty. It is not a CG where users that just wanted a camping experience would frequent.

**7. Tahoe Pines (4<sup>th</sup>)                    \$44 Full Hook up, \$43 Elec. & Water, \$41 Elec.  
\$34 Tent site.**

Tahoe Pines CG is the best example in this analysis of a property that is not high quality that is still charging a premium rate. The campground does have a lot of greenery and fairly good separation between sites and associated site privacy. The rate appears to be because of the general cost of living and location in the Tahoe area. The campground is also located adjacent to highway 50 so there is a noticeable constant hum during the day.

**\*\* Spanish Flat Resort                    \$29 RV w/Partial (Water & Elec)  
\$25 Tent**

The lower campground is close and has good access to the lake. This access does not mitigate many other problems that result in the Spanish Flat Resort campground being less physically appealing than all of the comparables. Both the lakeside and the Quail hill camping area are similarly tired and unattractive when viewed alongside the comparables. The infrastructure including the road, restrooms, and trash receptacles at the campgrounds are all in poor condition and detract from the camping experience. Sites are bare dirt with no wood chips, gravel or other more sanitary or appealing camping surface (The issue of bare dirt and repetitive use is also apparent at some of the comparables visited during this study but there are also several operations that make an effort to provide an appealing spot for tents, eating areas and general camp use). The placement of the dumpsters at the entry to the Quail Hill campground is stark, unappealing, and not managed with the experience of the campers in mind. There are no vegetative or other barriers between sites to provide campers with a minimum level of privacy. The sites located next to the lake between the marina and the store are adjacent to the main road and anyone traveling to long-term trailers, the store and other camping areas essentially passes through every camp in that area providing an unappealing constant flow of traffic.

The above list indicates that all seven of the comparables when comparatively assessed alongside Spanish Flat Resort are rated higher in regards to the combination of available amenities and observed operational conditions.

Other Comparable Notes of Interest – Some of the campground and/or RV properties visited had some special features or adaptations that displayed outstanding thought and concern for their customers. The following is a list of those noteworthy features that may not have been earlier mentioned.

- Camanche Reservoir (Family Camping Area) – A fairly large section of the campground that is signed as “Family Camping – No Alcohol”. This would seem to have outstanding appeal to many camping groups.

- Multiple Properties (Themes) – Many locations, especially the KOA campgrounds, did a good job of having their campground set up with a theme that was carried through in the design and construction of facilities, printed material and even special programs. Theme examples were “Old West” and “Gold Mining”.
- Antlers Resort Campground (Privacy Barriers) – This property did an out standing job of creating privacy barriers between camp or RV sites with a combination of vegetation and fairly simple fence like structures that seemed to fit in well (see photos).
- Multiple Properties (Screening Unattractive Areas) – Several areas did a good job of hiding or at least dressing up otherwise unattractive areas such as garbage receptacles, propane service and other maintenance or service type facilities. Again Antlers resort was especially good at screening.
- Multiple Properties (Wireless Computer Access) – Several campgrounds have taken the leap to provide an available wireless site on the property. The KOA campgrounds were especially aggressive on this. When tested they seemed to work fine by the compiler of this study.
- Multiple Properties (Swimming Areas) – Many areas associated with water recreation have developed very nice swimming areas at their lakes. The Long Ravine Campground, Collins Lake and Meeks Bay had particularly appealing areas but there were many others who had also made a special effort.
- Collins Lake (Signing) – Collins Lake had a very attractive and aggressive signing program throughout the campground area. Many questions were answered in advance through good signing. All signs were in the same style and professionally constructed.
- Scotts Flat Lake (Accessibility) – Scotts Flat did an outstanding job of going beyond just having nice restroom/shower facilities for the handicapped in the design and construction of a totally accessible pier for fishing or just getting out on the water. It is even more noteworthy that this was done on a fluctuating reservoir.
- Multiple Properties (Daily/Weekly Special Events) – Many areas, especially the KOA properties, have special events such as BBQ’s, pancake breakfasts, entertainment, hayrides, etc. that have only a marginal cost and provide an opportunity for families to meet others and get involved if they wish.
- Multiple Properties (Trails) – Many areas have developed short trails within their properties that either help people go from ‘Point A to Point B’ or have some type of specific destination, i.e., “Fishing Trail at Peninsula Campground (Lake

Rollins)”. This type of development is fairly easy to do and provides an added sense of being in a real camping area or some type of subliminal adventure to many campers who may never have been on a trail in the woods. Most of these trails are no longer than 100 yards to ¼ mile but they add an appropriate touch to the camping experience.

- Greenhorn Campground (Camping Dock) – This facility developed a small deck type structure shared by several tent sites that permitted actual access on the water and a place to sit and read, fish or enjoy the lake.

The preceding list demonstrates some unique efforts made by many of the campgrounds visited during this comparability analysis. These are all things that either add value and or increase the level of experience for campers.

The operation of and facilities for camping and RV public use areas at Spanish Flat Resort do not provide any of these or other noteworthy practices that could be identified as a unique positive feature.

**Analysts 2006 Rate Recommendations to Reclamation for Spanish Flat Resort  
Camping and RV Operations based upon data collected and conditions observed  
during compilation of ‘Comparability Analysis’**

The campground at Spanish Flat Resort is rated at the bottom of all the campgrounds visited during this analysis. There are some nice views of and access to the lake from the campground but that is not a mitigating factor in the condition of the facilities or in the comparability pricing practices. The individual sites are difficult to distinguish and offer no meaningful separation or privacy between groups. The overall condition is not a pleasing and functional campground, i.e., prepared area for tents or vegetative barriers. Campers must use chemical toilets on a full time basis and there are no shower facilities directly available at the campground. Each of the seven comparables provided normal restrooms and shower facilities in the campground. There is a shower/restroom facility at Spanish Flat but it is not convenient to most of the campsites. Large and unsightly dumpsters are located at the Quail Hill Campground near the portable toilets and the combined appearance is unsightly with no visual or sanitary screening from the campsites.

***The recommended rates for this campground based upon comparability are \$20-\$23 for double occupancy. This is a lower rate than any of the seven comparables but the camping facilities at Spanish Flat Resort are inferior to all of the comparables and this rate reflects those differences and the conditions at Spanish Flat campgrounds.***

*On September 23, 2005 Spanish Flat submitted a request for 2006 rates that included an increase in double occupancy tent camping fees from \$25 to \$32 (+28%). The request also included a fee for an extra camper of \$3. Based upon comparability the camping rates at Spanish Flat campgrounds are already in excess of an appropriate rate so further increases are not recommended. The \$3 fee for extra persons above 2 is recommended as appropriate.*

The RV facilities at Spanish Flat Resort are limited to only a few sites. None of them have full hook-ups and they are of the same approximate quality as the above described campground sites. Each of the seven comparables provides superior RV facilities in comparison to the concessionaire. The level of privacy available in the general area of the Spanish Flat RV sites is negligible as they are all located in busy public traffic areas. There are no traditional pull through sites.

***The recommended rates for these RV sites based upon comparability are \$25-\$28 for double occupancy. This rate is lower than six of the seven comparables and about the same as the lowest priced comparable (Lake Francis Resort). These are appropriate rates and reflect the comparative differences noted with the comparables for Spanish Flat Resort.***

*On September 23, 2005 Spanish Flat submitted a request for 2006 rates that included an increase in double occupancy RV camping fees from \$27 & \$29 (depending upon hook-*

*up level) to \$35 (+30%) & \$38 (+31%). The request also included a fee for an extra camper of \$3. Based upon comparability the RV camping rates at Spanish Flat are already in excess of an appropriate rate so further increases are not recommended. The \$3 fee for extra persons above two is recommended as appropriate.*

These recommended rates take into consideration statements from the comparables that indicated some would have a minor rate increase for 2006 and others not planning on any increase.

Spanish Flat Rate Appeal – The September 23, 2005 request letter from Spanish Flat included the following comment: *“With the extreme elevated cost of insurance, garbage, portable bathrooms, water and employee costs it is imperative that we have this increase.”*

*Analysts Response - In regard to comparability both insurance and employee costs are an expense that are reflected by all of the comparables and in fact by all businesses throughout the country and are not a unique factor to Spanish Flat. If these costs were demanding to the comparables to the extent that their rates were higher, then those comparable costs could result in appropriate higher rates for Spanish Flat. There is no indication that the water and garbage rates for Spanish Flat are more onerous than those rates among the comparables. The concessionaire would need to provide additional information (as outlined by Reclamation in advance of this analysis) displaying their specific costs for the last few years regarding water and garbage for Reclamation to evaluate before determining if higher rates were warranted. It is also apparent that many current Spanish Flat rates are already in excess of the level recognized by comparability. Consideration of increased costs for portable bathrooms in regard to higher rates would not be appropriate as ALL of the comparables provide fully developed restrooms and shower facilities providing an overall more costly service and a higher value to the public than portable toilets.*

# **LODGING OPERATIONS**

**LODGING - COMPARIBILITY MATRIX**  
**Spanish Flat Resort**

	Competition	Seasonality	Similar Area	Similar Clientele	Occupancy Rate	Facility Characteristics *	Similar Size **	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
L. B. Concessionaire	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	70	BASE
Spanish Flat Resort 82% Occ 5/30-Labor Day					82%		+/- 16 cabins	70	
Edgewater Resort (Clearlake) 9 cabs	10	7	7	7	7	6	8	52	3 #1
Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe) 10 mot – 9 cabs	10	4	4	8	7	5	7	45	
Funtime RV Park (Clearlake) 6 cabs	10	7	7	7	8	8	7	54	1 #2
Manchester Beach KOA (Coast) 27 cabs	9	6	5	6	8	8	5	47	
Petaluma KOA 33 cabs	10	6	4	5	7	8	5	45	
Placerville KOA 8 cabs	10	7	4	5	7	8	7	48	
Sacramento KOA	10	6	3	4	7	8	7	45	
Stockton KOA	10	6	3	4	7	8	6	44	
Willits KOA	9	6	5	5	7	8	8	48	
Yosemite KOA (Midpines)	9	6	6	6	6	8	9	50	5 #3
Snug Harbor (Delta) 16 cabs	8	6	5	8	7	7	8	49	
Carneros Inn (Napa)	10	7	7	1	6	5	3	39	
B&W Resort Marina (Delta)	9	6	5	7	6	4	5	42	
Collins Lake 2cabs + 4 trailers	8	8	7	7	7	5	4	46	
Pine Acres (Blue Lake) 11	9	7	7	7	6	4	8	48	

<b>cottages</b>									
<b>Lodge at Blue Lake 35 rooms +/-</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>40</b>	
<b>El Grande Clearlake</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>37</b>	
<b>Gold Country Inn (Angels Camp)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>37</b>	
<b>The Gold Lodge (Sonora)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>39</b>	
<b>Lake Escape Resort (Clearlake) 18 cottages</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>3 #4</b>
<b>Northern Queen Inn (Nevada City)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>Travelodge (Clearlake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>39</b>	
<b>Skylark Shores (Clearlake) 40rms + 5cot</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>41</b>	
<b>Indian Beach Resort (Clearlake) 9 cottages</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>4 #5</b>
<b>Antlers Resort &amp; Mar. (Shasta) 11 cabs w/K</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>4 #6</b>
<b>Bridge Bay Resort (Shasta) +/- 40 rms</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>42</b>	
<b>Silverthorn Resort (Shasta) 8 cabins</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>4 #7</b>
<b>Angels Camp RV 5 cabs</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>5 #8</b>
<b>Camanche Reservoir 18 cott/rms w/K + 4mot</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>53</b>	<b>2 #9</b>

**Notes on the Preceding Chart** – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaires lodging operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

w/k = With kitchen  
mot = Motel  
cabs = Cabins  
rms = Rooms  
cot = Cottage

## Lodging - Extra Quality Features SPANISH FLAT

Features (check if present) SPANISH FLAT	SPANISH FLAT		FUNTIME RV PARK	CAMANCHE RESERVOIR	EDGEWATER RESORT	LAKE ESCAPE RESORT	INDIAN BEACH	ANTLERS RESORT	SILVERTHORN RESORT	ANGELS CAMP RV	YOSEMITE KOA
Rooms	16 Cabin		6 cabs	22	9 cabs	18	9	11	8cabs	5cabs	15cab
Individual temperature cont.	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Suites				Y							
Compliance with ADA req.	L		N	L	L	Y	N	N	L	L	L+
Kitchenettes	N		Y	Y	Y	L	Y	Y	Y	N	Y-few
Television	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y-few
Free cable			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Pay per view movies											
Telephone	N		N	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N
Free local calls						Y		Y			
Vending											
In-room	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Common area	L		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Swimming pool or formal designated lake swim area	N		Y	Lake	Y	Y	Lake	N	N	Y	Y
Indoor											
Outdoor Heated			Y		Y	Y				Y	Y
Outdoor unheated											
Pool deck and/or patio area			Y		Y	Y	Y				
Retail facilities	L		Y	L	L	N	Y	L	L	L	Y
Restaurant/bar facilities	N		N	L	N	N	N	N	Y	N	N
Cafeteria	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Full-service Dining Room	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Bar	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Fireplace in common area	N		N	N	N	N	N	Yes in Room	N	N	N
Designated bus/camper parking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Children's play area	N		N	C.G.	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y
Recreation/weight room	N		N	N	N	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y
Marina	Y		Guest use dock	Y	Guest use dock	Privat guest use	Privat guest use	Y	Y	N	N
Beach	N		Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	N
Tennis courts	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Golf privileges	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N

Features (check if present) SPANISH FLAT	SPANISH FLAT		FUNTIME RV PARK	CAMANCHE RESERVOIR	EDGEWATER RESORT	LAKE ESCAPE RESORT	INDIAN BEACH	ANTLERS RESORT	SILVERTHORN RESORT	ANGELS CAMP RV	YOSEMITE KOA
<b>Convenience Comfort Related</b>											
Wall-to-wall carpet in rooms	N		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N
Grade-A furniture	B		'B'	Y	Y	Y+	'B'	Y	Y	Y Rustic	Y Rustic
Bedside lighting controls	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
<b>Service Related</b>											
Baggage (bell hop)	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Valet parking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Room service	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Entertainment	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	L
Medical assistance/RN on duty	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Audiovisual movies	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Make other reservations	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y
Rental cars available	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Major credit cards accepted	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Registration office open 24 hours	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
800 number available	N		N	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Y = Yes

N = No

L = Limited

B = Lower Quality than A

CG = Campground

Cabs = Cabins

Micro = Microwave Oven

Lake = Convenient swimming in the lake

Guest Use Dock = Not an actual public marina but provides same services to guests

Grade A Furniture = Based upon the type of room, i.e. standard hotel, rustic cabin, etc.

'Grade A' signifies what would be considered very nice for that style. If Grade B is noted then it signifies a lesser quality.

## **Discussion on Lodging Comparables and How Data is Compared**

The following section lists the facilities and rates of the nine properties judged to be 'Actual Comparables' for approving Lodging rates for Spanish Flat Resort. These properties are listed in the order of their apparent level and quantity of amenities offered. The order was not determined based upon any evaluation of a property's rates, i.e., the property listed first does not necessarily also display the highest prices. However, every thing being equal it is reasonable to assume that the properties higher on the list will have higher rates than those at the end of the list because they have more and/or nicer amenities.

Most comparable properties have and display rates for more than one type of lodging unit or facility. This list represent to the compiler of this 'Comparability Study' the ranking of these nine properties based upon actual visitation, observation and evaluation of the collected data. This listing takes into consideration general factors such as overall site appearance including the presence and appearance of landscaping and other support facilities, ease of use and access, apparent maintenance condition of facilities, appearance and conduct of employees, environmental sensitivity and awareness, and of course the type and quality of the various facilities.

Spanish Flat Resort is also displayed at the point in the list where it seems to naturally fit in regard to the level of amenities and condition of facilities as compared to the nine actual comparables. This information along with some additional comparison of the 'Extra Quality Features', and other rate impacting data provided by the concessionaire (if Reclamation agrees), provides Reclamation the logical reasoning and support data for making a decision on rate approval for Marina services and facilities at Spanish Flat Resort.

It may also be helpful for the reviewer of this section to review the 'Extra Quality Features' (lodging) compilation for each of the properties and for Spanish Flat Resort and also to review the photographic record provided in the photo section on the available CD.

**Spanish Flat Resort – Lodging Operations** – The list below indicates, based upon on site review and assessment of the comparability data, where Spanish Flat Resort fits into the mix of ‘Actual Comparables’ for Lodging operations. This list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed among the comparables determined to be most similar to the concessionaire. This list of ‘Actual Comparables’ is not oriented in regards to price but in the level of apparent desirability, i.e., the property listed first is the most desirable and the one listed last is the least desirable within this group. Note that following the name of each property there is a number, i.e., (3<sup>rd</sup>) following Lake Escape Resort. This number corresponds to the ranking on the ‘Comparability Matrix’ a few pages back so the lower the number the more similarity to Spanish Flat Resort.

- | <b><u>PROPERTY</u></b>  | <b><u>RATES</u></b>                                       |
|---|---|
| <b>1. Lake Escape Resort (3<sup>rd</sup>)</b>   | <b>\$109 - \$279</b>                                      |
| This resort has 18 separate cottages of varying levels of size and amenities. They feature 8 different rates for ‘Weekdays’ and a corresponding 8 rates for ‘Weekends’. At a minimum all the rooms include a refrigerator, microwave, and coffee maker. Five of the rooms have full kitchens and all but the least expensive room (\$109week & \$139wkend - there are five of these) accommodate 4 guests for the basic price. Rooms also include cable TV and all required bed/bath linens. The least expensive cottage is much nicer and includes significantly more amenities than the standard Park Model Cabin at Spanish Flat Resort. |   |
| <b>2. Edgewater Resort (3<sup>rd</sup>)</b>   | <b>\$140 Weekday &amp; \$165 Weekend (4 people)</b>       |
| This resort has 9 separate cabins/houses. The seven standard cabins are at the same rate (\$140/\$165) as identified above and cover for 4 people. The other two houses have rates of \$240/\$265 and \$350/\$400 and cover 8 and 12 people respectively. Standard cabins also include cable TV and all required bed/bath linens, full kitchens, and at least one bedroom separate from the living room and kitchen. This least expensive cabin is much roomier and nicer and includes significantly more amenities than the standard Park Model Cabin at Spanish Flat Resort.  |   |
| <b>3. Antlers Resort &amp; Marina (4<sup>th</sup>)</b>  | <b>\$145 - \$258 (\$1017 - \$1805) +\$12 extra person</b> |
| This resort has 11 separate cabins. During the summer they rent by the week only for the rates indicated in parenthesis. They have 4 cabin types (Studio, 1 Bedroom, 2 Bedroom, and 3 Bedroom) that rent between the rate ranges indicated. The two smaller cabin rates cover 3 people and the two larger cover 5 and 7 people respectively. All cabins include full kitchens, TV’s, decks, and some include wood burning stoves. These are nice spacious cabins that exceed in all amenity respects the Park Model Cabins at Spanish Flat Resort.  |   |
| <b>4. Silverthorn Resort (4<sup>th</sup>)</b>   | <b>\$115 - \$265 +\$10 extra person</b>                   |
| This resort has 8 rental units (cabins). One is priced at \$115 (2 people at the rate), five are priced at \$125 (4 people), one priced at \$165 (6 people), and one at \$265 (8 people). They all include a minimum of a kitchenette with the largest having a full kitchen. All linens are provided. They all have an outside porch and BBQ area. These are nice spacious cabins that exceed in all amenity respects the Park Model Cabins at Spanish Flat Resort.  |   |
| <b>5. Camanche Reservoir (2<sup>nd</sup>)</b>   | <b>\$64-83Motel &amp; \$126 Housekeeping Cottage</b>      |
| This resort has 18 cottages and 4 motel rooms. The motel rooms with twin beds are \$64 and those with Kings are \$83 and both rates are based upon double occupancy. The housekeeping cottages at \$126 are for 4 people and include kitchens and cable TV. They are all very nice with lake views, very attractive landscaping, and convenient porches for relaxing and enjoying the view. These are nice spacious facilities that exceed in all amenity respects the Park Model Cabins at Spanish Flat Resort.  |   |

**6. Indian Beach Resort (4<sup>th</sup>)      \$63-\$161 Housekeeping Cabins**

This is an older resort on the shores of Clearlake with 10 housekeeping cabins for rent. Design and furnishings are dated but quaint in a positive way and in fairly good condition. The lower rates, i.e., \$63 & \$78 for smaller units are for double occupancy. Middle size units rent for \$91 - \$110 for 4 persons, \$103-\$122 for 5 persons. Larger units rent for \$115 - \$161 for 6 to 9 people. These are nice cabins that exceed in all amenity respects the Park Model Cabins at Spanish Flat Resort.

**7. Funtime RV Park (1<sup>st</sup>)      \$60 - \$80 Stnd. Cabs. & \$125-\$160 Kitch. Cab.**

This resort has 5 cabins most of them are park models and the others are very similar to that design and style. The standard cabin interiors are similar to those at Spanish Flat Resort. Mid-week rates for four people in 4 of the cabins are \$60-\$70 and \$70-\$80 on weekends. The largest cabin that includes a kitchen and separate bedroom has rates of \$125 mid-week and \$160 weekend both covering 8 people. Sewage is plumbed directly into a sewer facility from each cabin. Units are not particularly attractively situated or landscaped.

**8. Yosemite KOA (5<sup>th</sup>)      \$54-\$60 Cabins & \$145 Lodge & \$5 extra person**

This is a fairly standard KOA campground with approximately 16 cabins and lodges. Cabins and lodges are of a design and construction specifically seen at many KOA campgrounds but fairly similar in general style to the park model cabins for rent at Spanish Flat Resort. The lodge facility is fairly large (over 400 sq. ft.) and includes a kitchen/living room and a separate bedroom and bathroom. The associated landscaping and general amenities in the immediate cabin area are more desirable here than at Spanish Flat Resort. All rates are for double occupancy.

**9. Angels Camp RV (5<sup>th</sup>)      \$49 one rm. cab. & \$59 two rm. cab. + \$5 ex. Per.**

This RV Park has 7 cabins. The park is a former KOA campground and all the facilities reflect KOA design. The cabins are nearly the same as #7 (Yosemite) and the rate for the one room cabin is for 4 persons and the two room cabin rate is for 6. The overall level of maintenance and landscaping is not as nice as current KOA facilities, however it still exceeds the immediate area setting and ambiance for the cabins at Spanish Flat Resort.

**\*\* SPANISH FLAT RESORT      \$89 (lakeside) & \$79 (hillside)**

The actual cabins offered by Spanish Flat Resort seem well maintained inside and out and most are located near the lake which undoubtedly appeals to guests. The primary situation observed that lowers the perceived value of the concessionaire facilities in relationship to the comparables is the physical setting of the units. They are mostly located in a portion of a parking lot with very little attention to landscaping or general visual and environmental appeal. Arranged in a row and/or placed a few feet from one another they have a fairly sterile appearance. Such a setting and arrangement may be the only option for the concessionaire at this stage of the contract but it does have an impact on the rates and comparative value to customers. These facilities at Spanish Flat Resort also require the need for holding tanks to be pumped out as the toilets and other domestic water services are not plumbed into a sewer system. Guests must bring their own linen and cooking utensils.

This analysis is based upon the on site visitation, collection, and review of all the collected information from the nine properties selected as actual comparables for Spanish Flat Resort's lodging operation. All nine actual comparables provide facilities, services, and amenities that deliver an overall better lodging product in 'side by side' comparisons with the concessionaire. See the photos on the following page for examples of how 'Cabins' are presented for rent at Spanish Flat Resort and at one of the comparables.

Spanish Flat Resort cabins for rent.



2005. 7. 25 Cabins on the hill.



2005. 7. 26 Cabins on the lake.

Below, similar style/quality small cabin for rent in an area where they have been landscaped and set in to provide a fairly nice physical separation from other units and attractive individual character and appeal to customers (Comparable – Yosemite KOA).



2005. 8. 16

**Analysts 2006 Rate Recommendations to Reclamation for Spanish Flat Resort Lodging Operations based upon data collected and conditions observed during compilation of ‘Comparability Analysis’**

The cabins at Spanish Flat Resort are adequate structures presented in a less than optimum manner. As identified they have been placed in close proximity to one another. They are on a par with the bottom two comparables (Angels Camp and Yosemite KOA) in regard to the design, size and features of the structure and the interior space. However, they fall back below these two because of the superior landscaping and setting of the comparables. The Spanish Flat Resort cabins also require a holding tank to be occasionally pumped out as there are no direct sewer hook-ups. Spanish Flat and most of the comparables (not Angels Camp or Yosemite KOA) also provide bathroom facilities in the cabin.

*The 2006 recommended rates for these cabins based upon comparability of the properties visited is \$75- \$80 for the hillside and \$80 - \$85 for lakeside based upon double occupancy. This pricing takes into consideration a very small combined increase in rates for the comparables. Some of the comparables indicated they might have a very small rate increase and some of them indicated no planned increase. Spanish Flat rates for 2005 are recommended to be unchanged for 2006. The current rates for Spanish Flat Cabins are based upon 4 person occupancy but the industry overwhelmingly quotes rates for double occupancy on cabins or rooms of this size and style. Ideally it would be best to lower the current rates a little and have the rates be for double occupancy. However, if the determination is to permit the concessionaire to at least stay at the current rate then it should still be based upon occupancy of 4 people.*

On September 23, 2005 Spanish Flat submitted a request for 2006 rates that included an increase in cabin lodging (for 4 guests) from \$89 & \$103 (weekday & weekend) to \$100 (+12%) & \$110 (+7%). The current rates are already in excess of a comparable rate for the type of facilities offered so a further increase is not recommended.

Spanish Flat Rate Appeal – The September 23, 2005 request letter from Spanish Flat included the following comment: “With the extreme elevated cost of insurance, garbage, portable bathrooms, water and employee costs it is imperative that we have this increase.”

Analysts Response - In regard to comparability both insurance and employee costs are an expense that are reflected by all of the comparables and in fact by all businesses throughout the country and are not a unique factor to Spanish Flat. If these costs were demanding to the comparables to the extent that their rates were higher then those comparable costs could result in appropriate higher rates for Spanish Flat. There is no indication that the water and garbage rates for Spanish Flat are more onerous than those rates among the comparables and the by concessionaire would need to provide additional information (as outlined by Reclamation in advance of this analysis) displaying their specific costs for the last

*few years regarding water and garbage for Reclamation to evaluate before determining if higher rates were warranted. It is also apparent that many current Spanish Flat rates are already in excess of the level recognized by comparability. Consideration of increased costs for portable bathrooms in regard to higher rates would not be appropriate as ALL of the comparables provide fully developed restrooms and shower facilities providing an overall more costly service and a higher value to the public than portable toilets.*

# MARINA OPERATIONS

**MARINA - COMPARABILITY MATRIX  
SPANISH FLAT RESORT**

	<b>Competition</b>	<b>Seasonality</b>	<b>Similar Area</b>	<b>Similar Clientele</b>	<b>Similarity of Operations</b>	<b>Construction Characteristics</b>	<b>Comparability TOTAL</b>	<b>Comparability RANKING</b>
<b>L. B. Concessionaire Spanish Flat</b> 178 slips-48 covered no util. age 10-14 Occ. 80%	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b> size repair util. sec/prot. Dry storage Transient use Boat rental	<b>10</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>BASE</b>
<b>Edgewater Resort (Clearlake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>35</b>	
<b>Lakeside Marina (Tahoe)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>33</b>	
<b>Obexters Marina (Tahoe)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>33</b>	
<b>Funtime RV Park (Clearlake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>Snug Harbor (Delta)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>B&amp;W Resort Marina (Delta)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>Collins Lake</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>42</b>	
<b>Holiday Harbor (Clearlake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>41</b>	
<b>Long Ravine CG (Rollins Lake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>45</b>	
<b>Orchard Spring Resort (Rollins Lake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>44</b>	

Scotts Flat Lake	7	7	7	6	5	5	37	
Tower Park Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	8	8	3	38	
Greenhorn CG (Rollins Lake)	10	7	7	6	6	8	44	
Lake Francis	7	7	7	5	3	3	32	
Delta Bay RV Resort (Delta)	10	6	3	7	7	3	36	
Willow Berm Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	6	5	3	33	
Emerald Cove (Bullards Bar Res.)	7	7	7	7	7	8	43	
Bidwell Canyon Marina (Lake Oroville)	9	8	8	9	8	8	50	1 #1
Camanche Reservoir	8	8	9	8	6	8	47	3 #2
Antlers Resort & Mar. (Shasta)	10	8	8	9	7	8	50	1 #3
Bridge Bay Resort (Shasta)	10	8	8	8	7	8	49	2 #4
Shasta Lake Marina	10	8	8	9	7	8	50	1 #5
Silverthorn Resort (Shasta)	10	8	8	8	7	8	49	2 #6
Tahoe Keys Marina	10	4	4	8	7	3	36	

**Notes on the Preceding Chart** – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaire’s marina operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

## Marina - Extra Quality Features SPANISH FLAT RESORT

Features (check if present)	SPANISH FLAT RESORT		BIDWELL CANYON	ANTLERS RESORT	SHASTA LAKE MARINA	BRIDGE BAY	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANCHE RESERVOIR			
Hotel/motel (Lodging) (CABINS)	Y		N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y			
Restaurant and/or bar	N		Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Groceries	Y		L	Y	Y	Y	L	Y			
Adequate water depth for draft of boats	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Secure boat tieup system	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fuel dock and other fuels, i.e., propane	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fire protection water and equipment	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dock utilities (H2O, elec, TV, phone)	N		N	N	N	Y	N	N			
Avail. and conven. of parking lot	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dock boxes and carts	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N			
Dinghy racks and boat storage	N		N	N	N	N	N	Y			
Restroom, showers, and laundry	Shore		REST	REST	REST	REST	REST	shore			
Ice and other vending machines	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fish cleaning station	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Parts and accessories store	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L			
Landscaping	L		N	N	L	L	N	L			
Picnic, swim pool, tennis areas	Picnic		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Recreation or lounge area	N		LNGE	shore	shore	Shore	Shore	Shore			
Posted marina rules	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Boat haul-out facilities	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Repair/maintenance (mechanical, hull, rigging, etc.)	N		L	L	L	L	L	N			
Transient berths/moorings	Y		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dry storage	Y		N	N	N	N	N	Y			
Trailer parking	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Compliance with ADA Requirements	N		N	N	N	N	N	L			
Sewage pumpout station	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Marine VHF monitoring	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Dock hands to assist in docking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Weather information	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			

Features (check if present)	SPANISH FLAT RESORT		BIDWELL CANYON	ANTLERS RESORT	SHASTA LAKE MARINA	BRIDGE BAY	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANICHE RESERVOIR			
Book/VCR library	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Charter boat operation	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Camping	Y		N	Y	Y	N	N	Y			
Swimming	L		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Water skiing	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fishing	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Beach rentals and/or water toys	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N			
Boat rentals	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fishing equipment	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

- Y = Yes
- N = No
- L = Limited

Restrooms/Shower/Laundry = In this section the notes refer to where the service is located or what the extent of the service is, i.e., 'REST' means a restroom on the dock and 'shore' means the services are provided on shore but not on the dock.

Shore – This comments identifies that the subject facilities are located on shore but not on the floating facilities.

## **Discussion on Marina Comparables and How Data is Compared**

The following several pages lists the services, facilities and rates of the six properties judged to be 'Actual Comparables' for approving Marina rates for Spanish Flat Resort. These properties are listed in the order of their apparent level and quantity of amenities offered. The order is not intended to reflect the corresponding level of their rates, i.e., the property listed first does not necessarily also display the highest prices. However, every thing being equal it is reasonable to assume that the properties higher on the list will have higher rates than those at the end of the list. Each property has numerous different rates for a wide variety of rental craft and for other services and facilities. The list represents to the compiler of this 'Comparability Study' the ranking of these six properties based upon actual observation during site visits and evaluation of the collected data. This listing takes into consideration general factors such as overall site appearance including the appearance of land based facilities support facilities, ease of use and access, apparent maintenance condition of facilities, appearance and conduct of employees, environmental sensitivity and awareness, and of course the type and quality of the various facilities.

At the end of the comparables data the same data is also presented for Spanish Flat Resort and a conclusion is reached as to where among these 'Actual Comparables' the similar products at Spanish Flat Resort would fit in relation to a similar assessment of their level of marina amenities and general factors as compared to the properties on the list. This information along with some additional comparison of the 'Extra Quality Features', and other rate impacting data provided by the concessionaire (if Reclamation agrees), provides Reclamation the logical reasoning and support data for making a decision on rate approval for Marina services and facilities at Spanish Flat Resort.

It may also be helpful for the reviewer of this section to review the 'Extra Quality Features' compilation for each of the properties and for Spanish Flat Resort and also to review the photographic record provided in the hard copy of this report and the expanded photo section on the available CD.

**Marina Comparability Approx. Amenity Level (Hi to Lo) and Base Rates**

**1. Shasta Lake Marina**

**2005 Houseboat Rental Information – Shasta Lake Marina**

			2- night	3- night	4- night	5- night	6- night	Weekly
<b>Diplomat</b> Sleeps 6 (37' x 14')		Off Season	\$425	\$585	\$655	\$815	\$980	\$1140
		Value Week	\$895	\$1040	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1460
		Summer	\$1055	\$1160	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1730
<b>Monarch</b> Sleeps 10 (47' x 14')		Off Season	\$480	\$675	\$745	\$930	\$1115	\$1300
		Value Week	\$945	\$1055	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1575
		Summer	\$1085	\$1180	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1825
<b>Premiere</b> Sleeps 10 (50' x 14')		Off Season	\$505	\$740	\$840	\$1050	\$1260	\$1470
		Value Week	\$1065	\$1235	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1830
		Summer	\$1265	\$1435	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2155
<b>Ambassador</b> Sleeps 8 (53' x 15')		Off Season	\$560	\$800	\$890	\$1110	\$1335	\$1555
		Value Week	\$1245	\$1405	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1935
		Summer	\$1445	\$1570	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2385
<b>Marquis</b> Sleeps 12 (53' x 15')		Off Season	\$630	\$880	\$990	\$1235	\$1485	\$1730
		Value Week	\$1325	\$1605	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2290
		Summer	\$1570	\$1690	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2890
<b>Empress</b> Sleeps 16 (56' x 15')		Off Season	N/A	\$1275	\$1505	\$1880	\$2255	\$2630
		Value Week	\$2275	\$2440	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$3660
		Summer	\$2390	\$2545	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$4565

**Small Rental Boats 2005 Rates – Shasta Lake Marina**

		hour	day	deposit
	Boat Only	\$6	\$29	\$145
<b>Fishing Boats</b>	10 HP	\$12	\$52	\$260
	25 HP	\$17	\$75	\$375
<b>Patio Boats</b>	Party Barge Patio Boat	\$35	\$150	\$750
	47' Party Cruiser	\$85	\$315	\$1,575
<b>Personal Water Craft</b>	Sea Doo 3 Person	\$85	\$275	\$1,375
<b>Ski Boats</b>	Ski Nautique	\$85	\$310	\$1,550
	Crownline	\$75	\$275	\$1,375
	Inner Tube (small)	\$20	\$80	
<b>Towables</b>	Inner Tube (large)	\$30	\$120	
	Kneeboard	\$25	\$90	
	Wakeboard	\$30	\$150	
	Hydrosled	\$20	\$50	\$200
	AirChair	\$20	\$75	\$250
	Water Skis (pair)	\$20	\$95	
	Demo Skis (pair)	\$25	\$100	

**2005 Moorage Rates – Shasta Lake Marina**

Covered Moorage

8X20	per month \$160	yearly \$1430
9X20	per month \$170	yearly \$1540
10X20	per month \$180	yearly \$1650

Covered Day Cruisers

12X24	per month \$245	yearly \$2255
-------	-----------------	---------------

Covered Cabin Cruisers

15X34	per month \$305	yearly \$3025
-------	-----------------	---------------

Patio Boat Slips

12 ft wide	per month \$175	yearly \$1485
------------	-----------------	---------------

Houseboat Slip

15 ft wide	per month \$240	yearly \$2266
20 ft wide	per month \$300	yearly \$2915

**2005 Other Marina Rates**

Sewage Pumpout	\$60 on craft not rented or stationed at the marina
Launch	\$No Launch unless you are member at the marina
Dry Storage	\$No Dry Storage

## 2. Silverthorn Resort

### 2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Silverthorn Resort

Silverthorn Queen I Houseboat				
	3 Nights	4 Nights	7 Nights	Addt Nights
October 1 thru May 26	\$1990	\$2590	\$3790	\$650
May 27 thru June 23	\$2690	\$3490	\$5890	\$850
June 24 thru August 25	Week Only		\$6990	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$2690	\$3490	\$5890	\$850

Silverthorn Queen II Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$1690	\$2290	\$3290	\$500
May 27 thru June 23	\$2490	\$3190	\$4990	\$800
June 24 thru August 25	Week Only		\$6190	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$2490	\$3190	\$4990	\$800

Presidential Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$990	\$1290	\$1890	\$300
May 27 thru June 23	\$1690	\$2190	\$3390	\$500
PRE SEASON SPECIAL Boarding Dates: June 24, 25, 26, 27	Week Only		<b>NOW \$3290</b>	N/A
June 28 thru August 25	Week Only		<b>NOW \$3590</b>	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$1690	\$2190	\$3390	\$500

Executive Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$790	\$890	\$1190	\$200
May 27 thru June 23	\$1190	\$1490	\$2190	\$350
PRE SEASON SPECIAL Boarding Dates: June 24, 25, 26, 27	Week Only		<b>NOW \$2090</b>	N/A
June 28 thru August 25	Week Only		<b>NOW \$2390</b>	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$1190	\$1490	\$2190	\$350

**2005 Small Boats and Personal Watercraft Rates – Silverthorn Resort**

<b>SMALL BOATS</b>			
	4 Hours	8 Hours	Weekly
Malibu Comp. Ski Boat	\$250	\$285	\$1700
Patio Boat	\$100	\$160	\$750
Fishing Boat	\$35	\$50	\$250

Sea Doo Rentals

Hour - \$65

Day - \$285

Week - \$1450

**2005 Moorage Rates – Silverthorn Resort**

Slip Rental

Houseboats Per Month \$155 or 1 month free on a pre paid year (\$1750).

Ski Boats \$110 per month or \$480 per each 6 months if pre paid

**2005 Other Marina Rates**

Sewage Pumpout                      \$60-65 for houseboats

Launch                                      \$FREE

Dry Storage                                \$None

### 3. Antlers Resort

#### 2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Antlers Resort

<b>Genesis (with Hot Tub and fireplace) (Sleeps 14)</b>				
	<b>Summer</b>	<b>Spring</b>	<b>Fall</b>	<b>Value</b>
Weekly	\$6795	\$5096	\$5334	\$3907
4 days	\$4077	\$3058	\$3200	\$2405
3 days	\$3567	\$2676	\$2700	\$2069
<b>Super Cruiser (with Hot Tub and fireplace) (sleeps 16)</b>				
Weekly	\$5595	\$3917	\$4056	\$3049
4 days	N/a	\$2434	\$2451	\$1830
3 days	N/a	\$1958	\$2028	\$1525
<b>Ultimate Cruiser (with Hot Tub) (sleeps 15)</b>				
Weekly	\$5395	\$3777	\$3911	\$2940
4 days	\$3237	\$2347	\$2363	\$1764
3 days	\$2698	\$1888	\$1956	\$1470
<b>Ultimate Cruiser (sleeps 15)</b>				
Weekly	\$4995	\$3497	\$3621	\$2722
4 days	n/a	\$2173	\$2188	\$1633
3 days	n/a	\$1748	\$1811	\$1361
<b>Flybridge (Sleeps 14)</b>				
Weekly	\$3880	\$3104	\$3104	\$2018
4 days	\$2328	\$1979	\$1979	\$1211
3 days	\$1940	\$1552	\$1552	\$1086
<b>Deluxe Lakecruiser (Sleeps 12)</b>				
Weekly	\$3360	\$2402	\$2386	\$1848
4 days	\$2016	\$1462	\$1431	\$1109
3 days	\$1680	\$1218	\$1218	\$1008
<b>Executive Cruiser (sleeps 8-10)</b>				
Weekly	\$2950	\$2109	\$2095	\$1623
4 days	N/a	\$1283	\$1257	\$920
3 days	N/a	\$1055	\$1069	\$826

## 2005 Small Boats and Personal Watercraft Rental Rates – Antlers Resort

Competition Ski Boats	½ Day 4 hours	Daily 10 hours	Weekly 7 full days
Malibu Sportster LX w/tower (20ft, inboard, V8, 8 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Malibu Sportster (20ft, inboard, V8, 6 person)	n/a	\$300	\$1500
Ski Boats			
Glastron (20ft I/O, V8, 10 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Four Winns Horizon LS (19ft, I/O, V8, 9 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Four Winns Horizon (19ft, I/O, V8, 8 person)	n/a	\$355	\$1775
Seaswirl - 180 (18ft, I/O, V6, 6 person)	\$193	\$275	\$1375
Sea Ray Cruiser (18ft, 4 cyl. & V6, 8 person, no bimini)	\$175(4cyl.) \$210 (V6)	\$250(4cyl.) \$300 (V6)	\$1250(4cyl.) \$1500 (V6)
Personal Water Craft			
Sea Doo GTX (155 hp)	n/a	\$325	n/a
Yamaha VX (110 hp)	n/a	\$295	n/a
Patio Boats			
<a href="#">Deluxe Party Cruiser (Restroom and Barbecue)</a>	n/a	\$425	\$2125
Party Cruiser LS (Restroom and Barbecue)	n/a	\$290	\$1450
Deluxe 12 Patio Boat (Restroom and Barbecue)	\$154	\$220	\$1100
Deluxe 10 Patio Boat (Restroom and Barbecue)	\$137	\$195	\$975
Standard Patio Boat	\$105	\$150	\$750
Fishing Boats			
Boat and Motor (14ft, 9.9hp outboard, 5 person, some w/bimini tops)	\$49	\$70	\$350
Canoes			
	\$25	\$40	\$175
Ski Packages			
Ski Package (\$100 deposit required)	\$25	\$25	\$125
Tubes (\$100 deposit required)	\$20	\$20	\$125
Wakeboards (\$300 deposit required)	\$35	\$35	\$175

**2005 Moorage Rates – Antlers Resort**

Slip Rental	\$200 per month with 3 month minimum
Overnight Slip	\$15.50 per night

**2005 Other Marina Rates – Antlers Resort**

Sewage Pumpout	Free for Marina boats \$40 for other
----------------	---

In/Out Launch	\$40
In Only	\$25
Out Only	\$25

Dry Storage	None
-------------	------

## 4. Bridge Bay

### 2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Bridge Bay



**Grand Sierra**

Sleeps 13  
56' x 15'  
Cabin 12' x 35'  
Penthouse (8'x14'x5')  
Generator & Air Conditioner

Summer –

**3day/2night - \$2250**

**4day/3night - \$2550**

**7day/6night - \$3050**



**Summit**

Sleeps 10-12  
47' x 14'  
Cabin 11'6" x 30'  
Generator & Air Conditioner  
\*Dual outboard motors or single I/O

Summer –

**3day/2night – \$1350**

**4day/3night – \$1800**

**7day/6night - \$2200**

### 2005 Small Boat Rental Rates – Bridge Bay

	<u>2Hrs.</u>	<u>1/2 Day/4 Hrs.</u>	<u>1 Day</u>	<u>Week</u>
<b>Commander 150 Ski Boat w/ Tower, Closed Bow</b> 20' 150 hp outboard motor Maximum 6 persons	<b>\$110</b>	<b>\$160</b>	<b>\$260</b>	<b>\$1075</b>
<b>Same w/o tower</b>	<b>\$90</b>	<b>\$145</b>	<b>\$240</b>	<b>\$1050</b>
<b>Patio Boat</b> 152 Qt. Ice Chest, No BBQ, 24' 40hp outboard motor Maximum 10 persons	<b>\$60</b>	<b>\$90</b>	<b>\$160</b>	<b>\$740</b>
<b>Fishing Boat</b> 16' Aluminum V-Hull, 15 hp outboard motor Maximum 5 persons	<b>\$26</b>	<b>\$45</b>	<b>\$75</b>	<b>\$250</b>
<b>Sea-Doo GTI (\$285 Deposit)</b> 10' / 85hp Maximum 2 persons		<b>\$110</b>	<b>\$160</b>	<b>\$285</b> NA

**2005 Moorage Rates – Bridge Bay**

	<u>Monthly</u>	<u>Annual</u>
COVERED MOORAGE		
9 x 22	\$155	No Annual Price Break
10 x 22	\$165	
10 x 26	\$180	
10 x 28	\$190	
11 x 28	\$195	
12 x 28	\$200	

HOUSEBOAT SLIPS

Bow Tie	\$5.25 per foot
Slips with power	\$7.00 per foot
End Tie Slips	\$6.00 per foot
Minimum Moorage	\$200 per month

All include unlimited pumpouts

**2005 Other Marina Rates – Bridge Bay**

Launch	\$10
Overnight Slip	\$25
Houseboat Launch	\$100
Locker Rental	\$5 per day
Auto Entry Fee	\$5 per day
Annual Park & Launch	\$135
Sewage Pump Out	\$65 for private or non marina rented boats

## 5. Camanche Reservoir

### 2005 Rental Boat Rates – Camanche Reservoir

#### April thru September

Reservations Recommended.		3-5 hours	5+ hours	Deposit
	Motor Boat	\$46.00	\$60.00	\$60.00
	Pontoon Patio Boats (8 passenger)	\$110.00	\$160.00	\$160.00
	Pontoon Patio Boats (12 passenger)	\$125.00	\$185.00	\$190.00
	*Deluxe Motor Boats	\$68.00	\$90.00	\$90.00
	*Deluxe Motor Boats	\$45.00	\$58.00	\$90.00
<b>2005 - Boat Launch &amp; Marina Service Rates</b> Both north and south marinas provide 6 lane launch ramps				
	Daily	Weekly	Monthly	Calendar Year
Boat Launch	\$6.50			\$92.00
Senior Boat Launch				\$46.00
Dry Storage		\$22.00	\$48.00	\$400.00
Mooring Buoy Houseboat Moorage over 30'	\$7.50	\$45.00	\$130.00 \$180.00	\$825.00 \$1025.00
Open Slip	\$13.00	\$78.00	\$168.00	\$935.00
Covered Slip	\$12.00	\$72.00	\$210.00	\$975.00

<b>2005 - Day Uses, Annual Pass Rates and Fishing Fees</b>	
Day use entry fee per vehicle	\$8.00
Annual Pass per vehicle	\$106.00
Car passes for seniors and disabled	\$53.00
Boat entry launch fee	\$6.50
Annual Pass per boat	\$92.00
Boat passes for seniors and disabled	\$46.00



**BIDWELL MARINA  
2005 MOORING RATES**

<b>Open Moorings – Buoys      Annual Contract Rates      Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005</b>					
Payment Schedule	Boats Under 45 feet	Boats Under 55 feet	Boats Under 60 feet	Boats Under 65 feet	Boats Under 68 feet
Month	\$172	\$178	\$186	\$210	\$228
Quarter	472	491	513	577	621
Semi-Annual	873	907	947	1066	1148
Annual	1540	1600	1670	1880	2025
<b>Continuous Walkway      Two Boats To A Section      Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005</b>					
Payment Schedule	Boats Under 55'	Boats Under 60'	Boats Under 65'	Boats Over 65'	
Month	\$190	\$214	\$227	\$268	
Quarter	522	589	625	737	
Semi-Annual	964	1088	1154	1361	
Annual	1700	1920	2035	2400	
<b>Covered Slips      Annual Contract Rates      Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005</b>					
Payment Schedule	1 <sup>st</sup> or 800 Row (10X24)	#63 to #83 12X30	500 Row 10'9"X24'	600 Row 12X24	700 Row 9X20
Month	\$186	\$194	\$194	\$201	\$171
Quarter	513	534	534	554	472
Semi-Annual	948	096	986	1024	871
Annual	1672	1739	1739	1805	1537

**BIDWELL MARINA  
2005 MOORING RATES**

<b>Open Slips Annual</b>		<b>Dry Boat Storage Garage &amp; Outside Storage</b>				
Payment Schedule	All Open Slips	Payment Schedule	Garage #3-10 10X30	Garage #11-80 (10X24)	Trlr Storage to 35 feet	Trlr. Storage over 35 feet
Month	\$160	Month	\$ 98	\$ 87	\$ 56	\$ 63
Quarter	440	Quarter	269	241	155	173
Semi - Annual	814	Semi - Annual	497	445	287	319
Annual	1435	Annual	877	784	506	563
<b>Temporary Contract Term Covered Slips Open Slip</b>						
1 night any day/night			\$ 28	\$ 20	Temporary rates are for renters who prefer to rent a slip or buoy for less than a full year	
1 week any 7 consecutive days			125	100		
1 month any 30 consecutive days			300	250		
7 months any 210 consecutive days			1200	1100		

Dry Storage None  
Launch Ramp None

**Spanish Flat Resort** - The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Spanish Flat fits into the mix of 'Actual Comparables'. As identified earlier this list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed.

Shasta Lake Marina

Silverthorn Resort

Antlers Resort

Bridge Bay

Camanche Reservoir

Bidwell Canyon

**SPANISH FLAT RESORT**

The above list indicates that all six of the comparables when comparatively assessed alongside Spanish Flat have an overall higher rating in regards to the combination of available amenities and observed operational conditions. Spanish Flat may have been higher in regard to observed condition if the overall ease of access/egress to and on the docks were better. It is also apparent that those properties listed above Spanish Flat have invested in much more significant support infrastructure on the marinas themselves and, with the exception of Camanche Reservoir, they generally provide a wider range of marina based services and facilities.

### **Current Spanish Flat Marina Rates**

<u>Miscellaneous</u>	<u>2005 Rates</u>	<u>2006 Request</u>
Day Use (4 per vehicle)	\$12.50	\$20 (+60%)
Boat Launch (4 per boat)	\$16.00	\$25 (+56%)
Extra Person both above	\$ 3.00	\$ 3
Dry Storage Garage	\$1200 yr.*	No change
*The Spanish Flat web page shows a rate of \$1350 for a garage so there is a conflict here with their submitted rate?		
Dry Storage Uncovered	\$600 yr.	No change

*All miscellaneous rates above except the requested 'Day Use Fee' and 'Boat Launch' are appropriate based upon comparability. The 'Day Use Fee' is recommended to remain the same as for 2005 at \$12.50 per vehicle for up to 4 people and the 'Launch Fee' is recommended to be no higher than \$20.00 based upon comparability.*

### **Boat Rentals**

Paddle Boats =	\$15 per hour
Kayaks &	\$25 for 2 hours
Canoes	\$40 for 4 hours
	\$50 for 6 hours
	\$60 for 8 hours

*Paddle Boats, Kayaks, & Canoes are appropriately priced based upon comparability. No increases in rates were requested for these rentals in 2006.*

Jet Ski/PWC	Yamaha Waverunners
	\$65 for one hour
	\$125 for 2 hours
	\$230 for 4 hours
	\$275 for 6 hours
	\$325 for 8 hours
	Sea Doo GTX 4-TEC Supercharged
	\$90 for 1 hour
	\$170 for 2 hours
	\$320 for 4 hours
	No rates for 6 hours
	\$380 for 8 hours

*Jet Ski/PWC's are comparable on the lower priced end and somewhat high on the upper end. However, it is a reasonable mix and people have a choice so approval of the rates displayed above is recommended but not any higher for 2006. No increases in rates were requested for these rentals in 2006.*

Fishing Boat	\$66 for half day	No Change for 2006
	\$86 for full day	\$90 (+4.7%) for 2006

***Fishing Boat rate requests are appropriate (rates shown include appropriate tax and fuel costs) based upon comparability.***

The requested rates for Pontoon/Patio boats from Spanish Flats September 23<sup>rd</sup> rate request are incomplete as they show a plus sign (+) after the rate, i.e., \$125.00+. It is not clear what this means but it appears they have simply shown the half day and full day rates for the lowest priced craft with no specific reference to the several other available boats? It is not possible to provide a recommendation without the exact current rates and the exact requested rates for specific boats. The rates displayed (\$125 & \$175) correspond to the rates for the 16 foot Bass Tracker displayed on the Spanish Flat website, [www.spanishflatresort.com/rates.shtml](http://www.spanishflatresort.com/rates.shtml). The analyst made a call to the Spanish Flat sub-concessionaire (Wet Dawg) and verified that the rates shown on the website are current. The website rates are what will be used for this analysis and since the concessionaire was not requesting an increase in rates for 2006 the following comments refer to both 2005/2006 rates. Following is what is on the website:

**Pontoon/Patio Boat Rates**

24’/40HP (Bass Buggy) Patio Boat – Rates do not include tax or fuel costs.

\$125 for 2 hours	\$ 88 recommended
150 for 4 hours	105 recom.
175 for 6 hours	123 recom.
200 for Full Day	140 recom

25’/I/O Sun Tracker Patio Boat - Rates do not include tax or fuel costs.

\$275 for 2 hours	\$165 recommended
350 for 4 hours	210 recom.
400 for 6 hours	240 recom.
450 for Full Day	270 recom.

22’/50 or 60HP Patio Boat - Rates do not include tax or fuel costs.

\$175 for 2 hours	\$105 recommended
250 for 4 hours	150 recom.
300 for 6 hours	180 recom.
350 for Full Day	210 recom.

28’/50HP Patio Boat - Rates do not include tax or fuel costs.

\$175 for 2 hours	\$105 recommended
250 for 4 hours	150 recom.
300 for 6 hours	180 recom.
350 for Full Day	210 recom.

16’/40HP Bass Tracker - Rates do not include tax or fuel costs

\$100 for 2 hours	\$ 70 recommended
125 for 4 hours	88 recom.
150 for 6 hours	105 recom.
175 for Full Day	123 recom.

*The rates for the above craft are all in excess of comparable rates. The 16 foot Bass Tracker and the 24 foot Bass Buggy are less off the comparable mark than the others. Besides being significantly less expensive many of the comparables also offer restrooms and BBQ's on board. The Spanish Flat Patio Boats do not include either of these features so the existing rates are higher than the comparables with less available amenities. Shaded and shown to the right of the requested rates are recommendations of the approximate highest rates appropriate based upon comparability, for these boats.*

Rental Slips (From Spanish Flat website)

Covered Berth on "F" Dock	\$1350 annually w/\$50 cash or check discount
Open Berth	\$1050 annually w/\$50 cash or check discount
One Day Berth (Request)	\$ 10
Weekend Berth (Request)	\$ 20

*These rates are provided without an indication of the size of the slips. It appears that the rates are OK but full information would be helpful. Recommend approval.*

Below are the Spanish Flat 2005 rates (they did not submit any request for 2006) on Ski Boats and their website does not indicate availability or pricing of these boats. The below rates are provided as the 2005 rates by the sub-concessionaire (Wet Dawg) in a handout provided at the marina.

Ski Boats =	18FT Crownline Open Bow Pleasure Boat
	\$165 for 2 hrs
	\$320 for 4 hrs
	\$415 for 6 hrs
	\$480 for 8 hrs

	202 Crownline (Lilly)
	\$195 for 2 hrs
	\$370 for 4 hrs
	\$475 for 6 hrs
	\$585 for 8 hrs

	Toyota Epic & Moomba Kamberra (Tourn. Ski/Wakeboard Boats)
	\$210 for 2 hrs
	\$375 for 4 hrs
	\$495 for 6 hrs
	\$610 for 8 hrs

*Ski Boat rates are appropriate for 2006 based upon comparability.*

PWC's = Yamaha Waverunners  
 \$65 for one hour  
 \$125 for 2 hours  
 \$230 for 4 hours  
 \$275 for 6 hours  
 \$325 for 8 hours

Sea Doo GTX 4-TEC Supercharged  
 \$90 for 1 hour  
 \$170 for 2 hours  
 \$320 for 4 hours  
 No rates for 6 hours  
 \$380 for 8 hours

***PWC's are comparable on the lower priced end and somewhat high on the upper end. However, it is a reasonable mix and people have a choice so approval of the rates displayed above is recommended but not any higher for 2006.***

Paddle Boats = \$15 per hour  
 Kayaks & \$25 for 2 hours  
 Canoes \$40 for 4 hours  
 \$50 for 6 hours  
 \$60 for 8 hours

***Paddle Boats, Kayaks, & Canoes are appropriately priced based upon comparability.***

Other

Launch =	\$16	2006 Request \$25
Day Use =	\$12.50 per vehicle for 4 persons	2006 Request \$20
Extra Person =	(above 4 people)	2006 Request \$3
Walk in =	\$ 5.00	
Pet =	\$ 2.00	

***All 'Other' rates except the requested 'Day Use Fee' and 'Launch Fee' are appropriate based upon comparability. The 'Day Use Fee' is recommended to remain the same as for 2005 at \$12.50 per vehicle for up to 4 people and the 'Launch Fee' is recommended to be no higher than \$20.00 based upon comparability.***

Spanish Flat Rate Appeal – The September 23, 2005 request letter from Spanish Flat included the following comment: “With the extreme elevated cost of insurance, garbage, portable bathrooms, water and employee costs it is imperative that we have this increase.”

***Analysts Response - In regard to comparability both insurance and employee costs are an expense that are reflected by all of the comparables and in fact by all***

*businesses throughout the country and are not a unique factor to Spanish Flat. If these costs were demanding to the comparables to the extent that their rates were higher than those comparable costs could result in appropriate higher rates for Spanish Flat. There is no indication that the water and garbage rates for Spanish Flat are more onerous than those rates among the comparables and the by concessionaire would need to provide additional information (as outlined by Reclamation in advance of this analysis) displaying their specific costs for the last few years regarding water and garbage for Reclamation to evaluate before determining if higher rates were warranted. It is also apparent that many current Spanish Flat rates are already in excess of the level recognized by comparability. Consideration of increased costs for portable bathrooms in regard to higher rates would not be appropriate as ALL of the comparables provide fully developed restrooms and shower facilities providing an overall more costly service and a higher value to the public than portable toilets.*

## **How this Comparability Analysis was Conducted**

This analysis was conducted in compliance with Chapter 7 of Reclamation's 'Concessions Management Guidelines'. Chapter 7 focuses only on the establishing and approval of rates to be charged by Reclamation concessionaires throughout the agency. The direction provided by 'Chapter 7' is nearly a mirror image of the long-term practices and methods utilized by the National Park Service (NPS). The NPS has nearly 700 concessionaires throughout the country and has used this comparability approach for lodging, camping, and marinas (and others) for over 20 years.

The introduction of and requirement to use this specific process for determining comparable rates in Reclamation has occurred since the last rate approval action at Lake Berryessa. It was apparent from written and verbal comments of concessionaires at Lake Berryessa that they were uncomfortable and dissatisfied with previous efforts by Reclamation regarding the approval of their requested rates.

To assure that the new process was properly introduced to Lake Berryessa Reclamation contracted with Mr. Bruce Wadlington who had prior extensive experience with the NPS in actually conducting or overseeing numerous similar comparability studies for that agency. Mr. Wadlington not only had prior experience with the NPS in conducting such studies but he was the key person for that agency in actually developing the approach and implementing it nationwide. He was the primary instructor for the 'Rate Approval Process' for over 15 years in the NPS and during that time taught hundreds of others how to accomplish this type of work. The last 20 years of Mr. Wadlington's NPS career were as follows:

- 1980-1985 Concessions Management Specialist – Yellowstone N.P.
- 1986-1994 Chief of Concessions Management – Grand Canyon N.P.
- 1995-2000 Manager National Concessions Program Center – Denver

In 2000 Mr. Wadlington accepted an offer to assist the Bureau of Reclamation in efforts to upgrade the concessions management program in partial response to the Office of Inspector General's audit that highlighted the need for numerous improvements. He worked for two years out of the Mid Pacific Regional Office on many concession projects throughout Reclamation including Lake Berryessa. Since his retirement in 2002 he has remained involved with Reclamations national program and Lake Berryessa as a contractor providing concessions management expertise. One of the projects he has worked on was the development of the aforementioned 'Concessions Management Guidelines'. Mr. Wadlington's ability, past experience and expertise in concessions management and overall familiarity with Lake Berryessa definitely qualifies him to accomplish this project. This analysis will provide the foundation for concessionaire rate approval not only for 2006 and a guide for future year's efforts.