

# RECLAMATION

*Managing Water in the West*

## Rate Comparability Analysis Rancho Monticello Resort

Bureau of Reclamation  
Mid-Pacific Region  
Solano Project  
Lake Berryessa, CA





## **Preface to the Rancho Monticello Comparability Analysis**

In completing the comparability study for concession rates for Rancho Monticello and other concessionaires at Lake Berryessa 58 different properties were visited. These properties encompassed a north/south area from Lake Shasta to Midpines (Yosemite area) and an east/west area from Lake Tahoe to coastal sites north of San Francisco. Data was collected at each location and photographs were taken to assist in the overall display and analysis of information. Of the 58 properties visited 24 of them were areas submitted to Reclamation by Lake Berryessa concessionaires.

Obviously some of the properties visited had more similarities to Lake Berryessa concession operations than others. Some of the properties proved to have little in common with Lake Berryessa operations.

### **Determining ‘Actual Comparables’ from among the ‘Potential Comparables Visited**

To determine objectively which properties among the 58 ‘Potential Comparables’ would be used as ‘Actual Comparables’ they were all rated using a comparability matrix as per Reclamation Concession Management Guidelines. This is the same process utilized by the National Park Service for over 20 years in selecting comparables for similar concession rate approvals in that agency. The matrix was completed using data collected during the on site visits. This process is complex enough that it will be helpful for concessionaires and Reclamation officials reviewing this report to read the following couple of pages that explains how the matrix is completed and used to select the ‘Actual Comparables’. The matrix does not eliminate the need for good judgment and a thorough knowledge of the comparability process.

#### **What is the Comparability Matrix?**

The comparability matrix is a table that provides point values expressed as a level of similarity between a particular potential comparable and the concessionaire. The values are determined using the concessionaire’s current operating conditions as the base against which all others are compared. These values are assigned to each of the identified criteria for lodging, marinas, and campgrounds.

Numeric values can be assigned fairly easily to criteria such as number of rooms, percentage of occupancy, and number of boat slips. Assigning values to nominal criteria such as type of area, clientele, and facility characteristics is more problematic and requires judgment and analysis.

#### **How the matrix helps.**

Using a matrix provides a balanced procedure for rating similarities among potential comparables and the concessionaire in an unbiased manner. Determining an approved rate is not an exact science; the concessionaire’s rates are appropriate if most customers would expect to pay similar prices for similar services under similar conditions outside the recreation area (easy to say but difficult to determine).

**How is the matrix set up and compiled?**

The comparability matrix has a dual axis. The business properties measured (including the concessionaire) are listed down the left column. The criteria measured are listed across the top. When completed, this matrix will note the degree of similarity between the concessionaire and the potential comparables. **The matrix does not designate the properties as better or worse, but only shows the degree of similarity.** Quality and value are not analyzed thoroughly until after the selection of actual comparables.

Information on the criteria (lodging [7 criteria], marinas [6 criteria], and campgrounds [5 criteria]) must be collected during visits to all potential comparables to ensure a thorough review. These criteria are the only items measured to determine comparability. After the comparables are identified, extra quality features and additional analysis are used to determine final approved rates.

It is critical that the same person(s) evaluate all the properties in the comparability matrix to ensure consistency. The concessionaire is listed first on the matrix and is assigned a value of 10 points for each criterion. This format would result in a total of 70 points for the concessionaire in a lodging matrix because there are seven criteria (7 X 10 = 70). **The total does not signify a level of performance or quality but only similarity of operations compared to the concessionaire.** The qualified person completing the matrix will then determine point spreads for each of the criteria analyzed that reflect the differences between potential comparables. For example, if a concessionaire has 100 guest rooms, a potential comparable should have 95–105 guest rooms, to receive 10 points. A possible rating scenario on the criteria for the number of guest rooms follows:

95-105 rooms	10 points
85-94 and 106-115 rooms	9 points
75-84 and 116-125 rooms	8 points
65-74 and 126-135 rooms	7 points

ETC.

Some criteria may not be as varied and could result either in 10 (the same), 5 (partially the same), or 0 (completely different). The person completing the matrix should strive for consistency supported by knowledge and thoroughness.

This technique is valuable and easy to use because the final point scores for each potential comparable are not important alone—but only in relation to the other potential comparables. The most critical aspect of completing the matrix is maintaining program consistency by ensuring that the same person evaluates all the properties.

The matrix system can seem confusing and complicated at first, but with use, it becomes simple, easy to use, and productive. It contributes to an objective, analytical final rate decision. It brings together many disparate functions of the rate approval process to support operational activities that directly impacts area visitors.

**How are ‘Actual Comparables’ selected from the completed matrix?**

After the matrix is completed and the points are totaled for each property, the person completing the matrix looks for a natural break in the point spread. All properties above that number will be selected as actual comparables. If a break level is not apparent or provides too few or too many properties, a determination will be made that selects the top scoring properties to be used as the ‘Actual Comparables’. No specific number of comparables is required, but there should never be fewer than three actual comparables selected and normally not more than eight or nine.

In completing the comparability analysis for Rancho Monticello the number of Actual Comparables’ selected were:

Campground/RV Operations	9 Actual Comparables
Lodging Operations	7 Actual Comparables
Marina Operations	6 Actual Comparables

**What happens after the ‘Actual Comparables’ are identified?**

After the actual comparables are designated, further analysis considers ‘**Extra Quality Features**’ (EQF) to determine where the concession fits among the comparable properties and the range of rates. Following this analysis, other factors deemed significant are introduced that help define the comparative quality of the concessionaire’s goods and services. These factors impact the final rates to the user and should not be considered until a rate based on comparability has been determined. Examples of other factors deemed significant could be the cost of housing employees, utility costs above comparability, significant delivery costs above comparability, and additional costs caused by environmental concerns that are not present with the comparables. Such costs may be passed on to the customer, but it is extremely critical that the concessionaire be able to specifically and concretely substantiate them. Additional rates above comparability should never be authorized without written documentation. Sometimes there are operating costs that have risen in the last few years that do not result in increased rates because those same increases are a factor with the ‘Actual Comparables’ and have already been reflected in the comparable rates.

The following pages present the applicable matrixes for Campground/RV, Lodging, and Marina operations in regard to Rancho Monticello. Immediately following the matrixes is the evaluation of the ‘Extra Quality Features’ of the comparables selected and further analysis of those ‘Actual Comparables’. At the end of each section are the recommendations of the analyst in regard to how the various rates at Rancho Monticello should be addressed based upon this comparability analysis.

**Whealers RV Resort & Campground Guide - Applicability to Lake Berryessa Concessionaire Comparability**

After thorough analysis of the 2005 Edition of the Wheelers Guide to consider its applicability to Lake Berryessa’s comparability study of its seven resorts, it has been

concluded that the Wheelers Guide has no merit as a determinant in establishing rates to the public at Lake Berryessa.

The Wheelers Guide does not profess to be anything other than a 'guide'. As such, it provides a basic inventory of RV Parks and Campgrounds. It provides users with general resort information, and attempts to supply an overall quality evaluation through a 'Star' assignment system. It also provides some general rate information for low, mid and upper priced amenities: however, it does not provide direction or determination on what rates should be for these various price levels nor does it provide any specific training or direction on how to determine the number of stars a facility receives. The evaluation and star rating is provided by untrained volunteer users who complete a rating form available in the back of the guide book.

Therefore, while Wheelers does provide direction and steps that result in the gathering and analysis of data for comparable rates, the process utilized in complying with Reclamation concession guidelines for rate approval does not recognize 'Wheelers Guide' as part of the rate approval process.

# **CAMPGROUND & RV OPERATIONS**

# CAMPGROUND COMPARIBILITY MATRIX

## Rancho Monticello

	Competition	Seasonality	Occupancy Rate	Similar Size	Site Type	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
<b>L. B. Concessionaire - RANCHO</b> 86 site - 20fhu - 20part - 46 none 38% Memorial Day thru Labor Day	10	10	10 38%	10	10	50	BASE
<b>Coloma Resort (American River)</b> 102 RV 50% w/fh + 50% w/h2O/elect Tent area also	10	9	6	8	7	40	4 #1
<b>Edgewater Resort - (Clearlake)</b> 61RV sites - no excl tent - all w/hu+tv	10	8	5	7	5	35	
<b>Olema Ranch Campground (Pt. Reyes)</b> 31fhu - 58partial - 175 tent	9	7	7	2	8	33	
<b>Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe)</b> 35 total - 10 w/fh	10	5	5	3	7	30	
<b>Funtime RV Park (Clearlake)</b> 60 comb RV/ Tent w/fh	10	8	8	7	5	38	6 #2
<b>American River Resort</b> 85 Sites - 35 w/full RV hu's	10	9	8	10	7	44	1 #3
<b>Anchor Bay Campground (Coast)</b> 29 RV/tent sites - 3 w/fhu	8	6	5	3	6	28	
<b>Manchester Beach KOA (Coast)</b> 115 tot - 51tent - 36partial - 22full	8	7	5	7	9	36	
<b>Petaluma KOA</b> 307tot - 124full - 39partial - 144none	8	8	7	2	8	33	
<b>Placerville KOA</b> 104tot - 44full - 30partial - 30none	8	8	8	8	7	39	5 #4
<b>Sacramento KOA</b> 133tot - 85full - 48w/o phone & TV	8	7	8	6	6	35	
<b>Stockton KOA</b> 100 w/fh - 20 tent sites	9	7	7	7	5	35	
<b>Tahoe KOA</b> 85total - 49full - 36tent w/nohu	10	5	5	10	6	36	
<b>Willits KOA</b> 32h2O&Elec - 11full - 16tent	9	8	5	7	6	35	
<b>Yosemite KOA</b> 27full- 20partial - 26tent	9	7	5	9	8	38	6 #5

Snug Harbor (Delta) 28full or partial -	8	7	7	5	4	31	
Tahoe Pines 17full – 22partial – 90tent	10	5	5	6	8	34	
49er RV Ranch (Columbia/Sonora) 35full HU incl TV	9	8	6	5	4	32	
Collins Lake 150w/hu – 30 tent	8	9	6	2	3	28	
Holiday Harbor (Clearlake) 35 full hu	10	8	8	5	3	34	
Long Ravine CG (Rollins Lake) 12 w/elec – 64 w/o hu (tent)	10	9	8	9	7	43	2 #6
Orchard Spring Res (Rollins Lake) 90sites – 17w/fhu	10	9	7	7	7	40	4 #7
Pine Acres (Blue Lake) 29sites – 4w/fh – 21 partial – tent random	10	8	6	5	6	35	
Scotts Flat Lake 31tent sites – 136RV (+lg group sites) No hook ups	8	7	7	3	4	29	
Tower Park (Delta) KOA 200 fhu	9	7	8	2	3	29	
Greenhorn CG (Rollins Lake) 40 sites w/no hu	10	9	7	6	3	35	
Peninsula Campground (Rollins Lake) 78 sites w/no hu	10	8	7	9	3	37	
Lake Francis 84 total sites 30 fhu – 17partial – 37 tent	8	9	7	9	8	41	3 #8
The Narrows Resort (Blue Lake) 15RV sites – all at least partial	10	8	6	3	3	30	
Delta Bay RV Resort (Delta) 150 RV w/fhu (w, s, e, tv)– no tent area	9	7	6	5	3	30	
Camanche Reservoir +/-300 tent/RV sites w/o hu 100RV sites w/fhu	8	9	8	1	6	32	
Emerald Cove (Bullard Bar Reservoir) 56 non hook-up sites – tent or RV	8	8	7	7	3	33	
Shasta Lake Marina 27 w/fhu	10	9	5	5	3	32	
Angels Camp RV 32 w/fhu – 16 partial – 14 tent 62 Total	9	8	8	6	7	38	5 #9

**Notes on the Preceding Chart** – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaire’s campground operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Tot = Total  
hu = Hook-ups  
fhu = Full hook-ups  
elec = Electric  
w/o = Without  
excl = Exclusive  
h20 = Water

# CAMPGROUND - EXTRA QUALITY FEATURES

## Rancho Monticello

Features (check if present)	RANCHO MONT.		AMERICAN RIV. RESORT	LONG RAVINE CG	LAKE FRANCIS RESORT	COLOMA RESORT	PLACERVILLE KOA	FUNTIME RV PARK	YOSEMITE KOA	ORCHARD SPGS RESORT	ANGELS CAMP
Utility hookups (water, sewer, electric)	20 P 20 F		P	L	P	50%F 50%p	P	Y	P	L-13	P & L
Trash receptacles											
At site											
Centralized	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Dumping station	Y					Y	Y				
Included in campsite rate	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y-13	Y
Extra charge											
Showers	Y										
Included in campsite rate	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Coin operated											
Partitioned stalls			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Open/common area											
Heated				Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		Y
Restroom service											Y
Pit toilets CHEMICAL	Y										
Flush toilets			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	RV-Y
Hot and cold water			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	T-Y
Water											
At individual sites					Y&tent	Y-All	RV-Y	Y	RV-Y	Y-13	RV-Y
Scattered hydrants	Y		Y	Y			T-Y	Y	T-Y	Y	T-Y
Central only											

Site Characteristics											
Site seclusion (utmost, moderate, limited)	N		M	L	M	M	M	L	M	M	L
Separate area for tents	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y
Landscaping appropriate for natural	N		N	N	L	L	Y	N	Y	L	L
Type of access											
Rough or gravel road	Y		Y			Y		Y			
Paved			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Pull-through for RVs and trailers	Few		L	L	Some	Some	Y	L	Some	L	Paved

Features (check if present)	RANCHO MONT.		AMERICAN RIV. RESORT	LONG RAVINE CG	LAKE FRANCIS RESORT	COLOMA RESORT	PLACERVILLE KOA	FUNTIME RV PARK	YOSEMITE KOA	ORCHARD SPGS RESORT	ANGELS CAMP
Compliance with ADA requirements	N		N	N	L	L	L	N	L	L	L
Lighted areas and paths	N		N	N	N	N		N	N	N	N
Picnic table at site	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	Y	Y
Fireplace/grill at site	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	Y	Y
<b>Service Related</b>											
Reservation system	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Public phone available	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Camper service store	L-Far away		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Food service	L		L	Y	L	L	N	N	N	Y	N
Gasoline service station	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Propane	Y		N	Y	N	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y
24-hour onsite available	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y
Firewood available	Y		N	Y	N	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	N
Coin laundry available	Y		N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y
Ice available	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Vending machines	Y		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interpretative programs	N		N	N	Y	L	L	N	L	N	N
Entertainment programs	N		N	N	Y	Y	Y	N	L	N	N
Recreation room	N		N	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y
Swimming Pool	N		N	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Lake	Y

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

- P = Partial (in re: to hook ups 'P' denotes that only some of the sites have hook-ups.
- L = Limited (in re: to hook ups 'L' means some sites have limited hook ups.
- Y = Yes
- N = No
- RV = Recreational Vehicle
- CG = Campground
- T = Tent
- M = Moderate
- = Somewhat less or worse
- + = Somewhat more or better
- Lake = Convenient designated swimming area in the lake

Rancho Monticello – Campground Operations - The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Rancho Monticello fits into the mix of ‘Actual Comparables’ for campground operations. This list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed among the comparables determined to be most similar to the concessionaire. This list of ‘Actual Comparables’ is not oriented in regards to price but in the level of apparent desirability, i.e., the property listed first is the most desirable and the one listed last is the least desirable within this group. Note that following the name of each property there is a number, i.e., (3<sup>rd</sup>) following Lake Francis Resort. This number corresponds to the ranking on the ‘Comparability Matrix’ a few pages back so the lower the number the more similarity to Rancho Monticello Resort.

**PROPERTY**

**RATES**

- 1. Placerville KOA (5<sup>th</sup>)      \$36 Full hook up (Limited Spec. sites \$45-38)  
\$22 Tent (\$25 w/elec.)**

The Placerville KOA Seems to be a slightly above average KOA unit. There are a wide range of facilities and activities that go along with staying at the campground, i.e., pull throughs for trailers, pool & hot tub, mini golf, horseshoes, petting barn volleyball, rental bikes, fishing pond, propane outlet, children’s playground, family/group facilities, etc. Management has done a good job of landscaping and providing some level of soft vegetative barriers between camp sites and maintaining as much grass as possible.

- 2. Coloma Resort (4<sup>th</sup>)      \$35 Fri-Sat nites all sites, \$33 Sun-Thur. (RV Only)**

Coloma is in the upper quality of RV resorts visited. There is a small tenting area w/o individual sites but with a general area where tent users can go for \$10 a tent. 50% of the sites have full hookups and the other 50% are partial. Most sites that are not well shaded by trees have an awning erected over the picnic table to improve the ambiance. The resort has many special activities from community BBQ’s to educational meetings that they sponsor for guests or special conferences. There is a swimming pool, petting zoo and other internal activities.

- 3. Yosemite KOA (6<sup>th</sup>)      \$42 fhu, \$40 partial \$28 Lowest Off Season  
\$28 for Tent**

The Yosemite KOA is a typical KOA property. There is a variety of on site amenities offered to RV’ers and campers, i.e., swimming pool, mini golf, hiking trail, fishing pond, game arcade, group/family use facilities, cable TV as standard part of hook-up, 50 amp service, etc. This site also has well designed tent camp sites that provide a maximum of privacy between sites.

- 4. Lake Francis Res. (3<sup>rd</sup>)      \$27 Full, \$25 Water & Elec.  
\$23 Lg. Tent Site, \$21 Sm. Tent Site (both H20)**

The Lake Francis Resort RV Park/Campground is not a high end area but appears well run and in good condition. Facilities are a little dated and in some areas need replacement. A very nice feature is the availability of water in an outdoor sink arrangement at each tent campsite. Sites are moderately well distanced or separated from one another.

- 5. Angels Camp RV (6<sup>th</sup>)      \$49 full & partial hu,  
\$25 Tent**

This is a former KOA campground with associated amenities similar to KOA, i.e., swimming pool, horseshoe pit, fishing pond, group/family meeting or event room, some 50 amp service. This facility appears to have a somewhat lower level of care than KOA would allow in their current franchises.

**6. Funtime RV Park (6<sup>th</sup>) \$22 & 26(lake) fhu F& Sat, \$20 & 24 wkday  
No tent sites but same rate if tent used.**

The Funtime RV Park is one of the lower end RV parks visited. It has convenient hook ups but most of the external facilities are in need of upgrading or redesign after many years of use. It does feature a nice beach on Clearlake for swimming and launching of RV customer boats. It also has a private small pier that customers may use. There are some 50 amp services available.

**7. Orchard Springs Res. (4<sup>th</sup>) \$36 Full hook up – same price all year  
\$33 Tent Water Vu, \$29 Reg. Tent Site**

Orchard Springs Resort features fairly typical RV/Campground facilities. They are located in a heavily timbered area that provides good shade to most campsites. They feature a preponderance of tent sites and only 13 RV sites.

**8. Long Ravine CG (2<sup>nd</sup>) \$29 for limited hookup site all days  
\$25 for tent sites all days**

Long Ravine Campground is a moderately nice tenting campground but a fairly inconvenient RV campground. It has 12 partial hook-up sites. All of the sites are in timber and have fairly good shade. Facilities and amenities adjacent to the CG area are minimal. Under the same ownership/management is a nice little marina, store and beach area which are all available to the campground users but not without a substantial walk or getting in a vehicle and driving.

**9. American River CG(1<sup>st</sup>) \$35 Full RV  
\$30 Riverside Tent Wkend, \$25 Wkday  
\$25 Reg. Tent Wkend, \$20 Wkday**

The American River CG is mainly used as a staging and overnight area for river running activities on the American River. There are a few awesome camp sites adjacent to the River that are extremely picturesque for either tenters or RV'ers. The main part of the campground is away from the river by 50-100 yards and although well spaced out tends to be dry, dusty and fairly dirty. It is not a CG where users that just wanted a camping experience would frequent.

**\*\* Rancho Monticello \$29 Full RV \$28 Electric Only  
\$25 Campsite \$28 Camp w/electric  
\$2 Additional Persons over 2**

Rancho Monticello's campground is located near the lake and that is a positive aspect of camping there. They are also fairly large individual campsites. However, the campground lacks specific aesthetic appeal. The infrastructure at the campground including the road, restrooms, picnic tables, and trash receptacles are all in poor condition and detract from campers experience in comparison to the comparables. Sites are bare dirt with no wood chips, gravel or other more sanitary or appealing camping surface (The issue of bare dirt and repetitive use is also apparent at some of the comparables visited during this study but there are also several areas that make an effort to provide an appealing spot for tents, eating areas and general camp use). With the exception of barrier logs for site delineation there is no demarcation between sites to provide campers with a minimum level of privacy. The RV sites located among the long-term use area are proving problematic to use because of the difficult parking challenge. The restrooms at this RV location are being updated and improved.

The above list indicates that all nine of the comparables when comparatively assessed alongside Rancho Monticello are rated higher in regards to the combination of available amenities and observed operational conditions.

Other Comparable Notes of Interest – Some of the campground and/or RV properties visited had some special features or adaptations that displayed outstanding thought and

concern for their customers. The following is a list of those noteworthy features that may not have been earlier mentioned.

- Camanche Reservoir (Family Camping Area) – A fairly large section of the campground that is signed as “Family Camping – No Alcohol”. This would seem to have outstanding appeal to many camping groups.
- Multiple Properties (Themes) – Many locations, especially the KOA campgrounds, did a good job of having their campground set up with a theme that was carried through in the design and construction of facilities, printed material and even special programs. Theme examples were “Old West” and “Gold Mining”.
- Antlers Resort Campground (Privacy Barriers) – This property did an outstanding job of creating privacy barriers between camp or RV sites with a combination of vegetation and fairly simple fence like structures that seemed to fit in well (see photos).
- Multiple Properties (Screening Unattractive Areas) – Several areas did a good job of hiding or at least dressing up otherwise unattractive areas such as garbage receptacles, propane service and other maintenance or service type facilities. Again Antlers resort was especially good at screening.
- Multiple Properties (Wireless Computer Access) – Several campgrounds have taken the leap to provide an available wireless site on the property. The KOA campgrounds were especially aggressive on this. When tested they seemed to work fine by the compiler of this study.
- Multiple Properties (Swimming Areas) – Many areas associated with water recreation have developed very nice swimming areas at their lakes. The Long Ravine Campground, Collins Lake and Meeks Bay had particularly appealing areas but there were many others who had also made a special effort.
- Collins Lake (Signing) – Collins Lake had a very attractive and aggressive signing program throughout the campground area. Many questions were answered in advance through good signing. All signs were in the same style and professionally constructed.
- Scotts Flat Lake (Accessibility) – Scotts Flat did an outstanding job of going beyond just having nice restroom/shower facilities for the handicapped in the design and construction of a totally accessible pier for fishing or just getting out on the water. It is even more noteworthy that this was done on a fluctuating reservoir.
- Multiple Properties (Daily/Weekly Special Events) – Many areas, especially the KOA properties, have special events such as BBQ’s, pancake breakfasts,

entertainment, hayrides, etc. that have only a marginal cost and provide an opportunity for families to meet others and get involved if they wish.

- Multiple Properties (Trails) – Many areas have developed short trails within their properties that either help people go from ‘Point A to Point B’ or have some type of specific destination, i.e., “Fishing Trail at Peninsula Campground (Lake Rollins)”. This type of development is fairly easy to do and provides an added sense of being in a real camping area or some type of subliminal adventure to many campers who may never have been on a trail in the woods. Most of these trails are no longer than 100 yards to ¼ mile but they add an appropriate touch to the camping experience.
- Greenhorn Campground (Camping Dock) – This facility developed a small deck type structure shared by several tent sites that permitted actual access on the water and a place to sit and read, fish or enjoy the lake.

The preceding list demonstrates some unique efforts made by many of the campgrounds visited during this comparability analysis. These are all things that either add value and or increase the level of experience for campers.

The facilities and their operation for camping and RV public use areas at Rancho Monticello do not provide any of these or other noteworthy practices that could be identified as a unique positive feature.

**Analysts 2006 Rate Recommendations to Reclamation for Rancho Monticello Camping and RV Operations based upon data collected and conditions observed during compilation of ‘Comparability Analysis’**

The campground at Rancho Monticello is rated below the actual comparable campgrounds visited during this analysis. There are some nice views of and access to the lake from the campground but that is not a factor that mitigates the condition of the support facilities or impacts the comparability pricing practices. The individual sites, although fairly large, are not attractive nor do they provide support facilities and camping infrastructure that compare favorably with most of the comparables. There is no meaningful privacy or separation between camping parties. The campground does not aid in providing a quality experience for campers, i.e., no prepared area for tents or vegetative barriers. Campers must use chemical toilets on a full time basis and there are no shower facilities available in the campground. Each of the nine actual comparables provided on-site standard flush toilets and restrooms with running water sinks and shower facilities. Unattractive garbage containers and eroded areas also detract from the Rancho Monticello campground area.

*The recommended rate for this campground, based upon comparability, is \$20-\$23 based upon occupancy of 2 people. This rate is similar to rates for the lower priced comparables and reflects the differences between the concessionaire and the overall quality and amenities provided by the comparables in their campgrounds. The concessionaire could likely justify a higher rate if facilities were improved, i.e., some attractive vegetative or other barriers between sites, repair of the roadway, upgrade of restroom facilities, replacement of damaged/unattractive picnic tables, upgrade of garbage receptacles and more appealing placement, development of parking vs. camping/‘living’ areas.*

*On October 14, 2005 Rancho Monticello submitted a 2006 rate request for tent camping that is an increase from the present 2005 rate of \$25 to \$27 for 2 people and an associated increase from \$2 to \$4 for extra persons over 2. Based upon comparability the increase for extra persons from \$2 to \$4 is supportable. The current base rate of \$25 is high in comparison to the preceding comparables and an increase is not recommended.*

The RV facilities at Rancho Monticello are a higher quality than the campground identified above. There are both full and partial hook-ups available. Some of the sites are difficult for RV’ers to maneuver into because of the proximity of trees. There are a few pull through sites available.

*The recommended rates for these RV sites based upon comparability is \$28-\$31 for the partial hook-up sites and \$30-32 for the full hook-up sites based on double occupancy. This rate would be in the low-mid range of the eight comparables and is a reasonable position. The concessionaire could improve this area and perhaps realize a higher rate on these sites if some selective*

***removal and pruning of trees occurred and the general parking area was improved to reduce dust and improve overall appearance.***

*On October 14, 2005 Rancho Monticello submitted a 2006 rate request for RV camping that is an increase from the present 2005 rate of \$28/29 (partial hook-up/full hook-up) to \$30/35 for 2 people and an associated increase from \$2 to \$4 for extra persons over 2. Based upon comparability these requests are not fully supportable. The \$30 rate for partial hook-ups is appropriate based upon comparability but the \$35 dollar request for full hook-ups is not appropriate and a maximum of \$32 is recommended. The increase to \$4 for extra persons is appropriate and recommended.*

These recommended rates take into consideration statements from the comparables that indicated some would have a minor rate increase for 2006 and others not planning on any increase.

# **LODGING OPERATIONS**

# LODGING COMPARABILITY MATRIX

## Rancho Monticello

	Competition	Seasonality	Similar Area	Similar Clientele	Occupancy Rate	Facility Characteristics	Similar Size **	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
<b>L. B. Concessionaires Rancho Monticello</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b> 34%	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b> 8cabs	<b>70</b>	<b>BASE</b>

*This lodging matrix is only for Rancho Monticello and provides analysis of those criteria (Facility Characteristics and Similar Size) that are different for Rancho than the other properties at Lake Berryessa.*

<b>Edgewater Resort (Clearlake) 9 cabs</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>2 #1</b>
<b>Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe) 10 mot – 9 cabs</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>46</b>	
<b>Funtime RV Park (Clearlake) 6 cabs</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>1 #2</b>
<b>Manchester Beach KOA-(Coast) 27 cabs</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>48</b>	
<b>Petaluma KOA 33 cabs</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>46</b>	
<b>Placerville KOA 8 cabs</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>3 #3</b>
<b>Sacramento KOA</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>41</b>	
<b>Stockton KOA</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>41</b>	
<b>Willits KOA</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>45</b>	
<b>Yosemite KOA (Midpines)</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>45</b>	
<b>Snug Harbor (Delta) 16 cabs</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>49</b>	

<b>Carneros Inn (Napa)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>37</b>	
<b>B&amp;W Resort Marina (Delta)</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>43</b>	
<b>Collins Lake 2cabs + 4 trailers</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>3 #4</b>
<b>Pine Acres (Blue Lake) 11 cottages</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>48</b>	
<b>Lodge at Blue Lake 35 rooms +/-</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>42</b>	
<b>El Grande Clearlake</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>40</b>	
<b>Gold Country Inn (Angels Camp)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>40</b>	
<b>The Gold Lodge (Sonora)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>40</b>	
<b>Lake Escape Resort (Clearlake) 18 cottages</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>49</b>	
<b>Northern Queen Inn (Nevada City)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>40</b>	
<b>Travelodge (Clearlake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>41</b>	
<b>Skylark Shores (Clearlake) 40rms + 5cot</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>2</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>47</b>	
<b>Indian Beach Resort (Clearlake) 9 cottages w/k</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>49</b>	

Antlers Resort & Marina (Shasta) 11 cabs w/k	9	8	8	8	5	6	6	50	4 #5
Bridge Bay Resort (Shasta) +/- 40 rms	9	8	8	7	6	2	3	43	
Silverthorn Resort (Shasta) 8 cabins	9	8	8	8	5	6	6	50	4 #6
Angels Camp RV 5 cabs	10	7	6	6	7	8	4	48	
Camanche Reservoir 18 cott/rms w/K + 4mot	9	8	9	7	7	6	5	51	3 #7

**Notes on the Preceding Chart** – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaires lodging operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

- w/k = With kitchen
- mot = Motel
- cabs = Cabins
- rms = Rooms
- cot = Cottage

## Lodging - Extra Quality Features RANCHO MONTICELLO

Features (check if present)	RANCHO MONT.		FUNTIME RV PARK	EDGEWATER RESORT	PLACERVILLE KOA	COLLINS LAKE	ANTLERS RESORT	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANCHE RESERVOIR		
Rooms	8 cabs		6 cabs	9 cabs	8cabs	6 mix	11 cots	8cabs	22cots		
Individual temperature cont.	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		
Suites									Y		
Compliance with ADA req.	N		N	L	L	L	N	L	L		
Kitchenettes	N		Y	Y	N	Y some	Y	Y	Y		
Television	N		Y	Y	N	Y-1	Y	Y	Y		
Free cable			Y	Y		SAT.	Y	Y	Y		
Pay per view movies											
Telephone	N		N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N		
Free local calls							Y				
Vending	N										
In-room			N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Common area			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		
Swimming pool	N		Y	Y	Y	Lake	N	N	Lake		
Indoor											
Outdoor Heated			Y	Y	Y						
Outdoor unheated											
Pool deck and/or patio area			Y	Y	Y						
Retail facilities	L-Far		Y	L	Y	Y	L	L	L		
Restaurant/bar facilities	L-Far		N	N	N	N	N	Y	L		
Cafeteria	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Full-service Dining Room	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Bar	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Fireplace in common area	N		N	N	N	N	Yes in Room	N	N		
Designated bus/camper parking	N		N	N	Y	N	N	Y	N		
Children's play area	N		N	N	Y	Y	N	N	C.G.		
Recreation room	N		N	N	N	N	Y	N	N		
Marina	Y		Y Guest use dock	Y Guest use dock	N	Y	Y	Y	Y		
Beach	N		Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N		
Tennis courts	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Golf privileges	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		

Features (check if present)	RANCHO MONT.		FUNTIME RV PARK	EDGEWATER RESORT	PLACERVILLE KOA	COLLINS LAKE	ANTLERS RESORT	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANICHE RESERVOIR		
-----------------------------	--------------	--	--------------------	---------------------	--------------------	--------------	-------------------	-----------------------	------------------------	--	--

**Convenience/Comfort Related**

Wall-to-wall carpet in rooms	N		N	Y	N	N	N	Y	N		
Grade-A furniture **	N		'B'	Y	Y Rustic	Y Rustic	Y	Y	Y		
Bedside lighting controls	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		

Service Related											
Baggage (bell hop)	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Valet parking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Room service	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Entertainment	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Medical assistance/RN on duty	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Audiovisual movies	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Make other reservations	N		N	N	Y	N	N	N	N		
Rental cars available	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
Major credit cards accepted	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		
Registration office open 24 hours	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N		
800 number available	N		N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y		

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Y = Yes

N = No

L = Limited

B = Lower Quality than 'A'

CG = Campground

Cabs = Cabins

Micro = Microwave Oven

Lake = Convenient swimming in the lake

Grade A Furniture = Based upon the type of room, i.e. standard hotel, rustic cabin, etc.

'Grade A' signifies what would be considered very nice for that style. If Grade B is noted then it signifies a lesser quality.

Guest Use Dock – Not a full marina but provides that service to lodging guests w/boats

## **Discussion on Lodging Comparables and How Data is Compared**

The following section lists the facilities and rates of the seven properties judged to be 'Actual Comparables' for approving Lodging rates for Rancho Monticello. These properties are listed in the order of their apparent level and quantity of amenities offered as observed during the collection of information. The order was not determined based upon any evaluation of a property's rates, i.e., the property listed first does not necessarily also display the highest prices. However, every thing being equal it is reasonable to assume that the properties higher on the list will have higher rates than those at the end of the list because they have more and/or nicer amenities.

Most comparable properties have and display rates for more than one type of lodging unit or facility. Again this list represents to the compiler of this 'Comparability Study' the ranking of these seven properties based upon actual visitation and evaluation of the collected data. This listing takes into consideration general factors such as overall site appearance including the presence and appearance of landscaping and other support facilities, ease of use and access, apparent maintenance condition of facilities, appearance and conduct of employees, environmental sensitivity and awareness, and of course the type and quality of the various facilities.

Rancho Monticello is also displayed at the point in the list where it seems to naturally fit in regard to the level of amenities and condition of facilities as compared to the seven actual comparables. This information along with some additional comparison of the 'Extra Quality Features', and other rate impacting data provided by the concessionaire (if Reclamation agrees), provides Reclamation the logical reasoning and support data for making a decision on rate approval for Marina services and facilities at Rancho Monticello.

It may also be helpful for the reviewer of this section to review the 'Extra Quality Features' (lodging) compilation for each of the properties and for Rancho Monticello and also to review the photographic record provided in the photo section on the available CD.

**Rancho Monticello Resort – Lodging Operations** – The list below indicates, based upon site review and assessment of the comparability data, where Rancho Monticello Resort fits into the mix of ‘Actual Comparables’ for Lodging operations. This list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed among the comparables determined to be most similar to the concessionaire. This list of ‘Actual Comparables’ is not oriented in regards to price but in the level of apparent desirability, i.e., the property listed first is the most desirable and the one listed last is the least desirable within this group. Note that following the name of each property there is a number, i.e., (4<sup>th</sup>) following Antlers Resort & Marina. This number corresponds to the ranking on the ‘Comparability Matrix’ a few pages back so the lower the number the more similarity to Rancho Monticello.

- | <b><u>PROPERTY</u></b>   | <b><u>RATES</u></b>   |
|--|---|
| <p><b>1. Edgewater Resort (2<sup>nd</sup>)</b><br/>           This resort has 9 separate cabins/houses. The seven standard cabins are at the same rate (\$140/\$165) as identified above and cover for 4 people. The other two houses have rates of \$240/\$265 and \$350/\$400 and cover 8 and 12 people respectively. Standard cabins also include cable TV and all required bed/bath linens, full kitchens, and at least one bedroom separate from the living room and kitchen. This least expensive cabin is much roomier and nicer and includes significantly more amenities than the standard cabin at Rancho Monticello Resort. The larger cabins/houses for rent here are overall more appealing at a lower rate than the 1,2, &amp; 3 bedroom trailers for rent by Rancho Monticello.</p> | <p><b>\$140 Weekday &amp; \$165 Weekend (4 people)</b></p>  |
| <p><b>2. Antlers Resort &amp; Marina (4<sup>th</sup>)</b><br/>           This resort has 11 separate cabins. During the summer they rent by the week only for the rates indicated in parenthesis. They have 4 cabin types (Studio, 1 Bedroom, 2 Bedroom, and 3 Bedroom) that rent between the rate ranges indicated. The two smaller cabin rates cover 3 people and the two larger cover 5 and 7 people respectively. All cabins include full kitchens, TV’s, decks, and some include wood burning stoves. These are nice spacious cabins that exceed in all amenity respects the cabins at Rancho Monticello Resort. The larger cabins/houses for rent here are overall more appealing at a lower rate than the 1,2, &amp; 3 bedroom trailers for rent by Rancho Monticello.</p>                  | <p><b>\$145 - \$258 (\$1017 - \$1805) +\$12 extra person</b></p>  |
| <p><b>3. Silverthorn Resort (4<sup>th</sup>)</b><br/>           This resort has 8 rental units (cabins). One is priced at \$115 (2 people at the rate), five are priced at \$125 (4 people), one priced at \$165 (6 people), and one at \$265 (8 people). They all include a minimum of a kitchenette with the largest having a full kitchen. All linens are provided. They all have an outside porch and BBQ area. These are nice spacious cabins that exceed in all amenity respects the cabins at Rancho Monticello Resort. These facilities compare favorably with the trailer rentals at Rancho and at a lower rate per person.</p>   | <p><b>\$115 - \$265 +\$10 extra person</b></p>  |
| <p><b>4. Camanche Reservoir (3<sup>rd</sup>)</b><br/>           This resort has 18 cottages and 4 motel rooms. The motel rooms with twin beds are \$64 and those with Kings are \$83 and both rates are based upon double occupancy. The housekeeping cottages at \$126 are for 4 people and include kitchens and cable TV. There is one large housekeeping cottage that is priced at \$263 for up to 10 persons. They are all very nice with lake views, very attractive landscaping, and convenient porches for relaxing and enjoying the view. These are nice spacious facilities that exceed in all amenity respects the cabins at Rancho Monticello Resort and compare favorably with the rental trailers in a nicer setting at a lower rate.</p>   | <p><b>\$64-83Motel &amp; \$126 Housekeeping Cottage<br/>           \$263 10 Person housekeeping Cottage</b></p> |
| <p><b>5. Placerville KOA (3<sup>rd</sup>)</b></p>  | <p><b>\$50 Sm. Cabin &amp; \$60 Lrg Cabin + \$4 xtra. per.</b></p>  |

This KOA has 8 cabins. They are all of a typical KOA designed variety and are landscaped in a moderately attractive manner. The general ambiance and immediate vicinity around these cabins present a more favorable ambiance than the cabins at Rancho Monticello.

**6. Collins Lake Resort (3<sup>rd</sup>)      \$80 - \$160 Small & Large Cabins**

This resort has 6 lodging units. There are only 2 cabins and the other units are converted travel trailers set up as rental units. The large cabin (400 sq. ft.) is \$135 per night during the week and \$160 per night during the weekend and includes a bathroom with the guest providing their own bedding. It also includes satellite TV and a kitchen. The small cabin (200 sq. ft.) is \$80 per night during the week and \$95 per night during the weekend with out a private restroom. All rates are for 4 people.

**7. Funtime RV Park (1<sup>st</sup>)      \$60 - \$80 Stnd. Cabs. & \$125-\$160 Kitch. Cab.**

This resort has 5 cabins most of them are park models and the others are very similar to that design and style. The standard cabin interiors are similar to those at Rancho Monticello Resort. Mid-week rates for four people in 4 of the cabins are \$60-\$70 and \$70-\$80 on weekends. The largest cabin that includes a kitchen and separate bedroom has rates of \$125 mid-week and \$160 weekend both covering 8 people. Sewage is plumbed directly into a sewer facility from each cabin. Units are not particularly attractively situated or landscaped.

**\*\* RANCHO MONTICELLO      \$75 for Sleeping Cabins (dbl. occupancy)  
\$175 1 Bdrm Mobile (dbl. occupancy)  
\$250 2 Bdrm Mobile (4 people)  
\$300 3 Bdrm Mobile (6 people)**

The actual cabins offered by Rancho Monticello seem well maintained and recently upgraded. They do not include any water or sanitary facilities without visiting the separate restroom that serves all of the cabins. Cabins are very small. They have a nice view of the lake. Based upon on-site visits the cabin facilities at Rancho Monticello are at the lower end of probable rates among the actual comparables because of their small size and limited amenities. The rental mobiles are fully equipped including kitchens, bathrooms, separate living areas and the typical amenities of a mobile home. They have nice lake views. Their siting among the exclusive use long-term trailers detract somewhat from their value and appeal in the same way that having a motel, campground or other short term facilities within the long-term use area would be less desirable to potential users.

This analysis is based upon the on site visitation, collection, and review of all the collected information from the seven properties selected as actual comparables for Rancho Monticello's lodging operation. All seven actual comparables provide facilities, services, and amenities that deliver an overall superior lodging product in 'side by side' comparisons with the concessionaire. See the photos on the following page for examples of how 'Cabins' are presented for rent at Rancho Monticello and at the Placerville KOA one of the actual comparables.

Rancho Monticello cabin.



Small one room rental cabin at Placerville KOA



**Analysts 2006 Rate Recommendations to Reclamation for Rancho Monticello Lodging Operations based upon data collected and conditions observed during compilation of 'Comparability Analysis'**

The cabins at Rancho Monticello have recently been rehabbed with new interiors and sprucing up on the exterior also. They are very small cabins and do not include any plumbing or restroom facilities. As specific units they compare most closely to the 'Kamp Kabins' provided by KOA. There is no landscaping adjacent or near the cabins. All the cabins have very nice views of the lake as they are essentially on the shoreline.

*The recommended rates, for these cabins based upon comparability of the properties visited, is \$60-\$65 based upon double occupancy. This pricing takes into consideration a very small combined increase in rates for the comparables. Some of the comparables indicated they might have a small rate increase and some of them indicated no planned increase for lodging facilities.*

*The recommended rates for the 1,2, & 3 bedroom trailers based upon comparability is 20% less than the current rate being charged, i.e.,*

*1 Bedroom \$140*

*2 Bedroom \$200*

*3 Bedroom \$240*

*At the present rates of \$175, \$250, and \$300 respectively are in excess of the highest reasonable comparables and the comparables are more attractively sited.*

*On October 14, 2005 Rancho Monticello submitted a rate request for the 2006 season that indicated an increase from the current \$75 to \$85 for the cabins. This increase is not supportable based upon comparability and is not recommended. The current rates are already approximately \$10 to \$15 higher than comparable rates. There was not a requested increase for the 1, 2, & 3 bedroom trailers.*

*There was a requested rate of \$160 for a non-existent Cabin with a bath and kitchen and a current rate of \$150 was displayed. This can not be addressed until the construction and/or placement of the cabin is approved and the actual amenities are evaluated.*

*Furthermore any past approval at \$150 should be rescinded as inappropriate and a misunderstanding. It may be appropriate to provide a rate in advance of construction so a concessionaire can determine if it is economically feasible to proceed but it is not appropriate to approve a rate in advance of reviewing and approving a proposal to build.*



# **MARINA OPERATIONS**

## MARINA COMPARIBILITY MATRIX

### Rancho Monticello

	<b>Competition</b>	<b>Seasonality</b>	<b>Similar Area</b>	<b>Similar Clientele</b>	<b>Similarity of Operations</b>	<b>Construction Characteristics</b>	<b>Comparability TOTAL</b>	<b>Comparability RANKING</b>
<b>L. B. Concessionaires</b> Rancho Monticello 60 rental slips 8 overnight slips no util 100 % occ	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>10</b> size repair util. sec/prot. Dry storage Transient use Boat rental	<b>10</b>	<b>60</b>	<b>BASE</b>  Left No.
<b>Edgewater Resort (Clearlake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>37</b>	
<b>Lakeside Marina (Tahoe)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>34</b>	
<b>Obexters Marina (Tahoe)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>33</b>	
<b>Funtime RV Park (Clearlake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>38</b>	
<b>Snug Harbor (Delta)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>37</b>	
<b>B&amp;W Resort Marina (Delta)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>36</b>	
<b>Collins Lake</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>43</b>	
<b>Holiday Harbor (Clearlake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>41</b>	
<b>Long Ravine CG (Rollins Lake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>45</b>	
<b>Orchard Spring Resort (Rollins Lake)</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>8</b>	<b>43</b>	

Scotts Flat Lake	7	7	7	6	5	5	37	
Tower Park Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	8	6	3	36	
Greenhorn CG (Rollins Lake)	10	7	7	7	7	8	46	3 #1
Lake Francis	7	7	7	5	4	3	37	
Delta Bay RV Resort (Delta)	10	6	3	7	6	3	35	
Willow Berm Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	6	5	3	33	
Emerald Cove (Bullards Bar Res.)	7	7	7	7	8	8	44	
Bidwell Canyon Marina (Lake Oroville)	9	8	8	9	6	8	48	2 #2
Camanche Reservoir	8	8	9	8	8	8	49	1 #3
Antlers Resort & Mar. (Shasta)	10	8	8	9	6	8	49	1 #4
Bridge Bay Resort (Shasta)	10	8	8	8	6	8	48	2 #5
Shasta Lake Marina	10	8	8	9	6	8	49	1 #6
Silverthorn Resort (Shasta)	10	8	8	8	7	8	49	1 #7
Tahoe Keys Marina	10	4	4	8	6	3	35	

**Notes on the Preceding Chart** – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaire’s marina operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

## Marinas - Extra Quality Features RANCHO MONTICELLO

Features (check if present)	RANCHO MONT.		BIDWELL CANYON	ANTLERS RESORT	SHASTA LAKE MARINA	BRIDGE BAY	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANCHE RESERVOIR			
Hotel/motel (Lodging)	L		N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y			
Restaurant and/or bar	Y		Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Groceries	L		L	Y	Y	Y	L	Y			
Adequate water depth for draft of boats	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Secure boat tieup system	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fuel dock and other fuels, i.e., propane	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fire protection water and equipment	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dock utilities (H2O, elec, TV, phone)	N		N	N	N	Y	N	N			
Avail. and conven. of parking lot	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dock boxes and carts	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N			
Dinghy racks and boat storage	Y		N	N	N	N	N	Y			
Restroom, showers, and laundry	Shore		REST	REST	REST	REST	REST	shore			
Ice and other vending machines	N?		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fish cleaning station	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Parts and accessories store	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L			
Landscaping	L		N	N	L	L	N	L			
Picnic, swim pool, tennis areas	Pic		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Recreation or lounge area	Shore		LNGE	shore	shore	Shore	Shore	Shore			
Posted marina rules	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Boat haul-out facilities	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Repair/maintenance (mechanical, hull, rigging, etc.)	N		L	L	L	L	L	N			
Transient berths/moorings	Y		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dry storage	Y		N	N	N	N	N	Y			
Trailer parking	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Compliance with ADA Requirements	N		N	N	N	N	N	L			
Sewage pumpout station	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Marine VHF monitoring	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Dock hands to assist in docking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Weather information	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			

Features (check if present)	RANCHO MONT.		BIDWELL CANYON	ANTLERS RESORT	SHASTA LAKE MARINA	BRIDGE BAY	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANICHE RESERVOIR			
Book/VCR library	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Charter boat operation	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Camping	Y		N	Y	Y	N	N	Y			
Swimming	L		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Water skiing	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fishing	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Beach rentals and/or water toys	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N			
Boat rentals	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fishing equipment	N?		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations or words used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Y = Yes

N = No

L = Limited

Shore = Identified facilities are not available on the marina but on shore

## **Discussion on Marina Comparables and How Data is Compared**

The following several pages lists the services, facilities and rates of the six properties judged to be 'Actual Comparables' for approving Marina rates for Rancho Monticello. These properties are listed in the order of their apparent level and quantity of amenities offered. The order is not intended to reflect the corresponding level of their rates, i.e., the property listed first does not necessarily also display the highest prices. However, every thing being equal it is reasonable to assume that the properties higher on the list will have higher rates than those at the end of the list. Each property has numerous different rates for a wide variety of rental craft and for other services and facilities. The list represents to the compiler of this 'Comparability Study' the ranking of these six properties based upon actual observation during site visits and evaluation of the collected data. This listing takes into consideration general factors such as overall site appearance including the appearance of land based facilities support facilities, ease of use and access, apparent maintenance condition of facilities, appearance and conduct of employees, environmental sensitivity and awareness, and of course the type and quality of the various facilities.

At the end of the comparables data the same data is also presented for Rancho Monticello and a conclusion is reached as to where among these 'Actual Comparables' the similar products at Rancho Monticello would fit in relation to a similar assessment of their level of marina amenities and general factors as compared to the properties on the list. This information along with some additional comparison of the 'Extra Quality Features', and other rate impacting data provided by the concessionaire (if Reclamation agrees), provides Reclamation the logical reasoning and support data for making a decision on rate approval for Marina services and facilities at Rancho Monticello.

It may also be helpful for the reviewer of this section to review the 'Extra Quality Features' compilation for each of the properties and for Rancho Monticello and also to review the photographic record provided in the hard copy of this report and the expanded photo section on the available CD.

**Marina Comparability Approx. Amenity Level (Hi to Lo) and Base Rates**

**1. Shasta Lake Marina**

**2005 Houseboat Rental Information – Shasta Lake Marina**

			2- night	3- night	4- night	5- night	6- night	Weekly
<b>Diplomat</b> Sleeps 6 (37' x 14')		Off Season	\$425	\$585	\$655	\$815	\$980	\$1140
		Value Week	\$895	\$1040	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1460
		Summer	\$1055	\$1160	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1730
<b>Monarch</b> Sleeps 10 (47' x 14')		Off Season	\$480	\$675	\$745	\$930	\$1115	\$1300
		Value Week	\$945	\$1055	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1575
		Summer	\$1085	\$1180	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1825
<b>Premiere</b> Sleeps 10 (50' x 14')		Off Season	\$505	\$740	\$840	\$1050	\$1260	\$1470
		Value Week	\$1065	\$1235	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1830
		Summer	\$1265	\$1435	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2155
<b>Ambassador</b> Sleeps 8 (53' x 15')		Off Season	\$560	\$800	\$890	\$1110	\$1335	\$1555
		Value Week	\$1245	\$1405	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1935
		Summer	\$1445	\$1570	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2385
<b>Marquis</b> Sleeps 12 (53' x 15')		Off Season	\$630	\$880	\$990	\$1235	\$1485	\$1730
		Value Week	\$1325	\$1605	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2290
		Summer	\$1570	\$1690	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2890
<b>Empress</b> Sleeps 16 (56' x 15')		Off Season	N/A	\$1275	\$1505	\$1880	\$2255	\$2630
		Value Week	\$2275	\$2440	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$3660
		Summer	\$2390	\$2545	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$4565

**Small Rental Boats 2005 Rates – Shasta Lake Marina**

		hour	day	Deposit
	Boat Only	\$6	\$29	\$145
<b>Fishing Boats</b>	10 HP	\$12	\$52	\$260
	25 HP	\$17	\$75	\$375
	Party Barge Patio Boat	\$35	\$150	\$750
<b>Patio Boats</b>	47' Party Cruiser	\$85	\$315	\$1,575
	Sea Doo 3 Person	\$85	\$275	\$1,375
<b>Personal Water Craft</b>	Ski Nautique	\$85	\$310	\$1,550
	Crownline	\$75	\$275	\$1,375
<b>Ski Boats</b>	Inner Tube (small)		\$20	\$80
	Inner Tube (large)		\$30	\$120
	Kneeboard		\$25	\$90
	Wakeboard		\$30	\$150
	Hydrosled	\$20	\$50	\$200
	AirChair	\$20	\$75	\$250
	Water Skis (pair)		\$20	\$95
	Demo Skis (pair)		\$25	\$100

**2005 Moorage Rates – Shasta Lake Marina**

Covered Moorage

8X20	per month \$160	yearly \$1430
9X20	per month \$170	yearly \$1540
10X20	per month \$180	yearly \$1650

Covered Day Cruisers

12X24	per month \$245	yearly \$2255
-------	-----------------	---------------

Covered Cabin Cruisers

15X34	per month \$305	yearly \$3025
-------	-----------------	---------------

Patio Boat Slips

12 ft wide	per month \$175	yearly \$1485
------------	-----------------	---------------

Houseboat Slip

15 ft wide	per month \$240	yearly \$2266
20 ft wide	per month \$300	yearly \$2915

**2005 Other Marina Rates**

Sewage Pumpout	\$60 on craft not rented or stationed at the marina
Launch	\$No Launch unless you are member at the marina
Dry Storage	\$No Dry Storage

## 2. Silverthorn Resort

### 2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Silverthorn Resort

Silverthorn Queen I Houseboat				
	3 Nights	4 Nights	7 Nights	Addt Nights
October 1 thru May 26	\$1990	\$2590	\$3790	\$650
May 27 thru June 23	\$2690	\$3490	\$5890	\$850
June 24 thru August 25	Week Only		\$6990	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$2690	\$3490	\$5890	\$850

Silverthorn Queen II Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$1690	\$2290	\$3290	\$500
May 27 thru June 23	\$2490	\$3190	\$4990	\$800
June 24 thru August 25	Week Only		\$6190	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$2490	\$3190	\$4990	\$800

Presidential Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$990	\$1290	\$1890	\$300
May 27 thru June 23	\$1690	\$2190	\$3390	\$500
PRE SEASON SPECIAL Boarding Dates: June 24, 25, 26, 27	Week Only		<b>NOW \$3290</b>	N/A
June 28 thru August 25	Week Only		<b>NOW \$3590</b>	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$1690	\$2190	\$3390	\$500

Executive Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$790	\$890	\$1190	\$200
May 27 thru June 23	\$1190	\$1490	\$2190	\$350
PRE SEASON SPECIAL Boarding Dates: June 24, 25, 26, 27	Week Only		<b>NOW \$2090</b>	N/A
June 28 thru August 25	Week Only		<b>NOW \$2390</b>	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$1190	\$1490	\$2190	\$350

**2005 Small Boats and Personal Watercraft Rates – Silverthorn Resort**

<b>SMALL BOATS</b>			
	4 Hours	8 Hours	Weekly
Malibu Comp. Ski Boat	\$250	\$285	\$1700
Patio Boat	\$100	\$160	\$750
Fishing Boat	\$35	\$50	\$250

Sea Doo Rentals

Hour - \$65

Day - \$285

Week - \$1450

**2005 Moorage Rates – Silverthorn Resort**

Slip Rental

Houseboats Per Month \$155 or 1 month free on a pre paid year (\$1750).

Ski Boats \$110 per month or \$480 per each 6 months if pre paid

**2005 Other Marina Rates**

Sewage Pumpout                      \$60-65 for houseboats

Launch                                      \$FREE

Dry Storage                                \$None

### 3. Antlers Resort

#### 2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Antlers Resort

<b>Genesis (with Hot Tub and fireplace) (Sleeps 14)</b>				
	<b>Summer</b>	<b>Spring</b>	<b>Fall</b>	<b>Value</b>
Weekly	\$6795	\$5096	\$5334	\$3907
4 days	\$4077	\$3058	\$3200	\$2405
3 days	\$3567	\$2676	\$2700	\$2069
<b>Super Cruiser (with Hot Tub and fireplace) (sleeps 16)</b>				
Weekly	\$5595	\$3917	\$4056	\$3049
4 days	N/a	\$2434	\$2451	\$1830
3 days	N/a	\$1958	\$2028	\$1525
<b>Ultimate Cruiser (with Hot Tub) (sleeps 15)</b>				
Weekly	\$5395	\$3777	\$3911	\$2940
4 days	\$3237	\$2347	\$2363	\$1764
3 days	\$2698	\$1888	\$1956	\$1470
<b>Ultimate Cruiser (sleeps 15)</b>				
Weekly	\$4995	\$3497	\$3621	\$2722
4 days	n/a	\$2173	\$2188	\$1633
3 days	n/a	\$1748	\$1811	\$1361
<b>Flybridge (Sleeps 14)</b>				
Weekly	\$3880	\$3104	\$3104	\$2018
4 days	\$2328	\$1979	\$1979	\$1211
3 days	\$1940	\$1552	\$1552	\$1086
<b>Deluxe Lakecruiser (Sleeps 12)</b>				
Weekly	\$3360	\$2402	\$2386	\$1848
4 days	\$2016	\$1462	\$1431	\$1109
3 days	\$1680	\$1218	\$1218	\$1008
<b>Executive Cruiser (sleeps 8-10)</b>				
Weekly	\$2950	\$2109	\$2095	\$1623
4 days	N/a	\$1283	\$1257	\$920
3 days	N/a	\$1055	\$1069	\$826

## 2005 Small Boats and Personal Watercraft Rental Rates – Antlers Resort

Competition Ski Boats	½ Day 4 hours	Daily 10 hours	Weekly 7 full days
Malibu Sportster LX w/tower (20ft, inboard, V8, 8 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Malibu Sportster (20ft, inboard, V8, 6 person)	n/a	\$300	\$1500
Ski Boats			
Glastron (20ft I/O, V8, 10 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Four Winns Horizon LS (19ft, I/O, V8, 9 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Four Winns Horizon (19ft, I/O, V8, 8 person)	n/a	\$355	\$1775
Seaswirl - 180 (18ft, I/O, V6, 6 person)	\$193	\$275	\$1375
Sea Ray Cruiser (18ft, 4 cyl. & V6, 8 person, no bimini)	\$175(4cyl.) \$210 (V6)	\$250(4cyl.) \$300 (V6)	\$1250(4cyl.) \$1500 (V6)
Personal Water Craft			
Sea Doo GTX (155 hp)	n/a	\$325	n/a
Yamaha VX (110 hp)	n/a	\$295	n/a
Patio Boats			
<a href="#">Deluxe Party Cruiser (Restroom and Barbecue)</a>	n/a	\$425	\$2125
Party Cruiser LS (Restroom and Barbecue)	n/a	\$290	\$1450
Deluxe 12 Patio Boat (Restroom and Barbecue)	\$154	\$220	\$1100
Deluxe 10 Patio Boat (Restroom and Barbecue)	\$137	\$195	\$975
Standard Patio Boat	\$105	\$150	\$750
Fishing Boats			
Boat and Motor (14ft, 9.9hp outboard, 5 person, some w/bimini tops)	\$49	\$70	\$350
Canoes			
	\$25	\$40	\$175
Ski Packages			
Ski Package (\$100 deposit required)	\$25	\$25	\$125
Tubes (\$100 deposit required)	\$20	\$20	\$125
Wakeboards (\$300 deposit required)	\$35	\$35	\$175

**2005 Moorage Rates – Antlers Resort**

Slip Rental	\$200 per month with 3 month minimum
Overnight Slip	\$15.50 per night

**2005 Other Marina Rates – Antlers Resort**

Sewage Pumpout	Free for Marina boats \$40 for other
----------------	---

In/Out Launch	\$40
In Only	\$25
Out Only	\$25

Dry Storage	None
-------------	------

## 4. Bridge Bay

### 2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Bridge Bay



**Grand Sierra**  
 Sleeps 13  
 56' x 15'  
 Cabin 12' x 35'  
 Penthouse (8'x14'x5')  
 Generator & Air Conditioner

**Summer –**  
**3day/2night - \$2250**  
**4day/3night - \$2550**  
**7day/6night - \$3050**



**Summit**  
 Sleeps 10-12  
 47' x 14'  
 Cabin 11'6" x 30'  
 Generator & Air Conditioner  
 \*Dual outboard motors or single  
 I/O

**Summer –**  
**3day/2night – \$1350**  
**4day/3night – \$1800**  
**7day/6night - \$2200**

### 2005 Small Boat Rental Rates – Bridge Bay

	<u>2Hrs.</u>	<u>1/2 Day/4 Hrs.</u>	<u>1 Day</u>	<u>Week</u>
<b>Commander 150 Ski Boat w/ Tower, Closed Bow</b> 20' 150 hp outboard motor Maximum 6 persons	<b>\$110</b>	<b>\$160</b>	<b>\$260</b>	<b>\$1075</b>
<b>Same w/o tower</b>	<b>\$90</b>	<b>\$145</b>	<b>\$240</b>	<b>\$1050</b>
<b>Patio Boat</b> 152 Qt. Ice Chest, No BBQ, 24' 40hp outboard motor Maximum 10 persons	<b>\$60</b>	<b>\$90</b>	<b>\$160</b>	<b>\$740</b>
<b>Fishing Boat</b> 16' Aluminum V-Hull, 15 hp outboard motor Maximum 5 persons	<b>\$26</b>	<b>\$45</b>	<b>\$75</b>	<b>\$250</b>
<b>Sea-Doo GTI (\$285 Deposit)</b> 10' / 85hp Maximum 2 persons		<b>\$110</b>	<b>\$160</b>	<b>\$285</b> <b>NA</b>

**2005 Moorage Rates – Bridge Bay**

	<b><u>Monthly</u></b>	<b><u>Annual</u></b>
COVERED MOORAGE		
9 x 22	\$155	No Annual Price Break
10 x 22	\$165	
10 x 26	\$180	
10 x 28	\$190	
11 x 28	\$195	
12 x 28	\$200	

HOUSEBOAT SLIPS

Bow Tie	\$5.25 per foot
Slips with power	\$7.00 per foot
End Tie Slips	\$6.00 per foot
Minimum Moorage	\$200 per month

All include unlimited pumpouts

**2005 Other Marina Rates – Bridge Bay**

Launch	\$10
Overnight Slip	\$25
Houseboat Launch	\$100
Locker Rental	\$5 per day
Auto Entry Fee	\$5 per day
Annual Park & Launch	\$135
Sewage Pump Out	\$65 for private or non marina rented boats

## 5. Camanche Reservoir

### 2005 Rental Boat Rates – Camanche Reservoir

#### April thru September

Reservations Recommended.		3-5 hours	5+ hours	Deposit
	Motor Boat	\$46.00	\$60.00	\$60.00
	Pontoon Patio Boats (8 passenger)	\$110.00	\$160.00	\$160.00
	Pontoon Patio Boats (12 passenger)	\$125.00	\$185.00	\$190.00
	*Deluxe Motor Boats	\$68.00	\$90.00	\$90.00
	*Deluxe Motor Boats	\$45.00	\$58.00	\$90.00
<b>2005 - Boat Launch &amp; Marina Service Rates</b> Both north and south marinas provide 6 lane launch ramps				
	Daily	Weekly	Monthly	Calendar Year
Boat Launch	\$6.50			\$92.00
Senior Boat Launch				\$46.00
Dry Storage		\$22.00	\$48.00	\$400.00
Mooring Buoy Houseboat Moorage over 30'	\$7.50	\$45.00	\$130.00 \$180.00	\$825.00 \$1025.00
Open Slip	\$13.00	\$78.00	\$168.00	\$935.00
Covered Slip	\$12.00	\$72.00	\$210.00	\$975.00

<b>2005 - Day Uses, Annual Pass Rates and Fishing Fees</b>	
Day use entry fee per vehicle	\$8.00
Annual Pass per vehicle	\$106.00
Car passes for seniors and disabled	\$53.00
Boat entry launch fee	\$6.50
Annual Pass per boat	\$92.00
Boat passes for seniors and disabled	\$46.00



**BIDWELL MARINA  
2005 MOORING RATES**

<b>Open Moorings – Buoys    Annual Contract Rates    Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005</b>					
Payment Schedule	Boats Under 45 feet	Boats Under 55 feet	Boats Under 60 feet	Boats Under 65 feet	Boats Under 68 feet
Month	\$172	\$178	\$186	\$210	\$228
Quarter	472	491	513	577	621
Semi-Annual	873	907	947	1066	1148
Annual	1540	1600	1670	1880	2025
<b>Continuous Walkway    Two Boats To A Section    Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005</b>					
Payment Schedule	Boats Under 55'	Boats Under 60'	Boats Under 65'	Boats Over 65'	
Month	\$190	\$214	\$227	\$268	
Quarter	522	589	625	737	
Semi-Annual	964	1088	1154	1361	
Annual	1700	1920	2035	2400	
<b>Covered Slips    Annual Contract Rates    Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005</b>					
Payment Schedule	1 <sup>st</sup> or 800 Row (10X24)	#63 to #83 12X30	500 Row 10'9"X24'	600 Row 12X24	700 Row 9X20
Month	\$186	\$194	\$194	\$201	\$171
Quarter	513	534	534	554	472
Semi-Annual	948	096	986	1024	871
Annual	1672	1739	1739	1805	1537

**BIDWELL MARINA  
2005 MOORING RATES**

<b>Open Slips Annual</b>		<b>Dry Boat Storage Garage &amp; Outside Storage</b>				
Payment Schedule	All Open Slips	Payment Schedule	Garage #3-10 10X30	Garage #11-80 (10X24)	Trlr Storage to 35 feet	Trlr. Storage over 35 feet
Month	\$160	Month	\$ 98	\$ 87	\$ 56	\$ 63
Quarter	440	Quarter	269	241	155	173
Semi - Annual	814	Semi - Annual	497	445	287	319
Annual	1435	Annual	877	784	506	563
<b>Temporary Contract Term Covered Slips Open Slip</b>						
1 night any day/night			\$ 28	\$ 20	Temporary rates are for renters who prefer to rent a slip or buoy for less than a full year	
1 week any 7 consecutive days			125	100		
1 month any 30 consecutive days			300	250		
7 months any 210 consecutive days			1200	1100		

Dry Storage None  
Launch Ramp None

**Rancho Monticello** - The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Rancho Monticello fits into the mix of 'Actual Comparables'. As identified earlier this list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed.

Shasta Lake Marina  
Silverthorn Resort  
Antlers Resort  
Bridge Bay  
Camanche Reservoir  
Bidwell Canyon  
Rancho Monticello

*The above list indicates that all six of the marina comparables when comparatively assessed alongside Rancho Monticello have an overall higher rating in regards to the combination of available amenities and observed operational conditions. Rancho Monticello may have been higher in regard to observed condition if the overall ease of access/egress to and from the docks were better. It is also apparent that those properties listed above Rancho Monticello have invested in much more significant support infrastructure on the marinas themselves and they mostly provide a wider range of services, i.e., repairs, houseboat and other rentals.*

## Current Rancho Monticello Marina Rates

### Slip Rentals

\$1000 a year or \$1050 if paid in quarterly increments (10X24)

\$600 a year moorage of private docks

\$20 per night for Transient Moorage

*Based upon comparability the above rates are appropriate.*

<u>Fishing Boats</u>	<u>14 foot w/15HP engines</u>
Weekday	\$30 per hour \$20 per hour for ½ day (\$80 for 4 hours) \$15 per hour for all day (\$120 for 8 hours)
Weekends & Holidays	\$40 per hour \$25 per hour for ½ day (\$100 for 4 hours) \$17.50 per hour for all day (\$140 for 8hours)

*Based on comparability these rates for fishing boats are too high by 40-50%. The weekday rate should not be higher than \$70-\$80 for all day based upon comparability. The hourly rate for a couple of hours should be no more than \$20 per hour.*

*On October 14, 2005 Rancho Monticello submitted a rate request for 2006 Fishing Boat rates that are not a change from the existing rates and still much higher than supported by comparability.*

<u>Pontoon Boats</u>	<u>24 foot w/60HP (accessories available for rent)</u>
Weekdays	\$80 per hour \$55 per hour for ½ days (\$220 for 4 hours) \$40 per hr. for all day on weekdays (\$320 8 Hrs.)
Weekend & Holidays	\$90 per hour \$65 per hour on ½ day (\$260 4 Hrs.) \$55 per hour all day on weekends (\$440 8 Hrs.)

*Current pontoon boat rates are much higher than comparables for similar craft. The current rates also do not include any extra accessories such as water toys or ice coolers. Coolers are part of the package on several of the comparables. The highest priced comparables boats include a restroom and BBQ and are still slightly less than the current rates on Rancho's pontoon boats. Based upon comparability the recommended rates here are approximately 40-50% less than current and resulting in a daily rate recommendation of approximately \$180-200 and a half day rate of approximately \$100.*

*On October 14, 2005 Rancho Monticello submitted a rate request for 2006 Pontoon Boat rates. In this request they also displayed their 2005 rates for this craft. Those 2005 rates do not correspond to any data available when reviewing the rates for comparability. A check of the web site for Rancho Monticello also does not reveal the subject 2005 rates. However, the information indicates higher rates than Reclamation was aware of and a requested increase for 2006. Since the rate information on hand (outlined above is already substantially in excess of comparability no increase based upon this request is recommended.*

Other Rates

Boat Launch	\$15
Long-Term Permittee Launch	\$ 4
Day Use	\$11 (1-4 persons in vehicle)
Addtl. Persons over 4	\$ 4

***Based upon comparability these other rates seem appropriate with the exception of the Day Use fee which is higher by \$1 than any of the similar rates currently charged by comparables.***

*On October 14, 2005 Rancho Monticello submitted a rate request for 2006 that indicated an increase to \$20 for a boat launch. Based upon comparability this request is appropriate and is recommended as are the requests for Annual Boat Launch passes. They also requested an increase from \$11 to \$15 (+36%) for a day use fee and a corresponding increase for an annual Day Use pass from \$120 to \$150 (+25%) that are not recommended for approval. Their existing rates are already higher than any similar rates charged by any of the actual comparables.*

## **How this Comparability Analysis was Conducted**

This analysis was conducted in compliance with Chapter 7 of Reclamation's 'Concessions Management Guidelines'. Chapter 7 focuses only on the establishing and approval of rates to be charged by Reclamation concessionaires throughout the agency. The direction provided by 'Chapter 7' is nearly a mirror image of the long-term practices and methods utilized by the National Park Service (NPS). The NPS has nearly 700 concessionaires throughout the country and has used this comparability approach for lodging, camping, and marinas (and others) for over 20 years.

The introduction of and requirement to use this specific process for determining comparable rates in Reclamation has occurred since the last rate approval action at Lake Berryessa. It was apparent from written and verbal comments of concessionaires at Lake Berryessa that they were uncomfortable and dissatisfied with previous efforts by Reclamation regarding the approval of their requested rates.

To assure that the new process was properly introduced to Lake Berryessa Reclamation contracted with Mr. Bruce Wadlington who had prior extensive experience with the NPS in actually conducting or overseeing numerous similar comparability studies for that agency. Mr. Wadlington not only had prior experience with the NPS in conducting such studies but he was the key person for that agency in actually developing the approach and implementing it nationwide. He was the primary instructor for the 'Rate Approval Process' for over 15 years in the NPS and during that time taught hundreds of others how to accomplish this type of work. The last 20 years of Mr. Wadlington's NPS career were as follows:

- 1980-1985 Concessions Management Specialist – Yellowstone N.P.
- 1986-1994 Chief of Concessions Management – Grand Canyon N.P.
- 1995-2000 Manager National Concessions Program Center – Denver

In 2000 Mr. Wadlington accepted an offer to assist the Bureau of Reclamation in efforts to upgrade the concessions management program in partial response to the Office of Inspector General's audit that highlighted the need for numerous improvements. He worked for two years out of the Mid Pacific Regional Office on many concession projects throughout Reclamation including Lake Berryessa. Since his retirement in 2002 he has remained involved with Reclamations national program and Lake Berryessa as a contractor providing concessions management expertise. One of the projects he has worked on was the development of the aforementioned 'Concessions Management Guidelines'. Mr. Wadlington's ability, past experience and expertise in concessions management and overall familiarity with Lake Berryessa definitely qualifies him to accomplish this project. This analysis will provide the foundation for concessionaire rate approval not only for 2006 and a guide for future year's efforts.