



Rate Comparability Analysis Berryessa Marina Resort

**Bureau of Reclamation
Mid-Pacific Region
Solano Project
Lake Berryessa, CA**



Preface to the Lake Berryessa Marina Comparability Analysis

In completing the comparability study for concession rates for Lake Berryessa Marina and other concessionaires at Lake Berryessa, 58 different properties were visited. These properties encompassed a north/south area from Lake Shasta to Midpines (Yosemite area) and an east/west area from Lake Tahoe to coastal sites north of San Francisco. Data was collected at each location and photographs were taken to assist in the overall display and analysis of information. Of the 58 properties visited 24 of them were areas submitted to Reclamation by Lake Berryessa concessionaires.

Obviously some of the properties visited had more similarities to Lake Berryessa concession operations than others. Some of the properties proved to have little in common with Lake Berryessa operations.

Determining ‘Actual Comparables’ from among the ‘Potential Comparables Visited

To determine objectively which properties among the 58 ‘Potential Comparables’ would be used as ‘Actual Comparables’ they were all rated using a comparability matrix as per Reclamation Concession Management Guidelines. This is the same process utilized by the National Park Service for over 20 years in selecting comparables for similar concession rate approvals in that agency. The matrix was completed using data collected during the on site visits. This process is complex enough that it will be helpful for concessionaires and Reclamation officials reviewing this report to read the following couple of pages that explains how the matrix is completed and used to select the ‘Actual Comparables’. The matrix does not eliminate the need for good judgment and a thorough knowledge of the comparability process.

What is the Comparability Matrix?

The comparability matrix is a table that provides point values expressed as a level of similarity between a particular potential comparable and the concessionaire. The values are determined using the concessionaire’s current operating conditions as the base against which all others are compared. These values are assigned to each of the identified criteria for lodging, marinas, and campgrounds.

Numeric values can be assigned fairly easily to criteria such as number of rooms, percentage of occupancy, and number of boat slips. Assigning values to nominal criteria such as type of area, clientele, and facility characteristics is more problematic and requires judgment and analysis.

How the matrix helps.

Using a matrix provides a balanced procedure for rating similarities among potential comparables and the concessionaire in an unbiased manner. Determining an approved rate is not an exact science; the concessionaire’s rates are appropriate if most customers would expect to pay similar prices for similar services under similar conditions outside the recreation area (easy to say but difficult to determine).

How is the matrix set up and compiled?

The comparability matrix has a dual axis. The business properties measured (including the concessionaire) are listed down the left column. The criteria measured are listed across the top. When completed, this matrix will note the degree of similarity between the concessionaire and the potential comparables. **The matrix does not designate the properties as better or worse, but only shows the degree of similarity.** Quality and value are not analyzed thoroughly until after the selection of actual comparables.

Information on the criteria (lodging [7 criteria], marinas [6 criteria], and campgrounds [5 criteria]) must be collected during visits to all potential comparables to ensure a thorough review. These criteria are the only items measured to determine comparability. After the comparables are identified, extra quality features and additional analysis are used to determine final approved rates.

It is critical that the same person(s) evaluate all the properties in the comparability matrix to ensure consistency. The concessionaire is listed first on the matrix and is assigned a value of 10 points for each criterion. This format would result in a total of 70 points for the concessionaire in a lodging matrix because there are seven criteria ($7 \times 10 = 70$). **The total does not signify a level of performance or quality but only similarity of operations compared to the concessionaire.** The qualified person completing the matrix will then determine point spreads for each of the criteria analyzed that reflect the differences between potential comparables. For example, if a concessionaire has 100 guest rooms, a potential comparable should have 95–105 guest rooms, to receive 10 points. A possible rating scenario on the criteria for the number of guest rooms follows:

95-105 rooms	10 points
85-94 and 106-115 rooms	9 points
75-84 and 116-125 rooms	8 points
65-74 and 126-135 rooms	7 points

ETC.

Some criteria may not be as varied and could result either in 10 (the same), 5 (partially the same), or 0 (completely different). The person completing the matrix should strive for consistency supported by knowledge and thoroughness.

This technique is valuable and easy to use because the final point scores for each potential comparable are not important alone—but only in relation to the other potential comparables. The most critical aspect of completing the matrix is maintaining program consistency by ensuring that the same person evaluates all the properties.

The matrix system can seem confusing and complicated at first, but with use, it becomes simple, easy to use, and productive. It contributes to an objective, analytical final rate decision. It brings together many disparate functions of the rate approval process to support operational activities that directly impacts area visitors.

How are ‘Actual Comparables’ selected from the completed matrix?

After the matrix is completed and the points are totaled for each property, the person completing the matrix looks for a natural break in the point spread. All properties above that number will be selected as actual comparables. If a break level is not apparent or provides too few or too many properties, a determination will be made that selects the top scoring properties to be used as the ‘Actual Comparables’. No specific number of comparables is required, but there should never be fewer than three actual comparables selected and normally not more than eight or nine.

In completing the comparability analysis for Lake Berryessa Marina the number of Actual Comparables’ selected were:

Campground/RV Operations	9 Actual Comparables
Lodging Operations	9 Actual Comparables
Marina Operations	6 Actual Comparables

What happens after the ‘Actual Comparables’ are identified?

After the actual comparables are designated, further analysis considers ‘Extra Quality Features’ (EQF) to determine where the concession fits among the comparable properties and the range of rates. Following this analysis, other factors deemed significant are introduced that help define the comparative quality of the concessionaire’s goods and services. These factors impact the final rates to the user and should not be considered until a rate based on comparability has been determined. Examples of other factors deemed significant could be the cost of housing employees, utility costs above comparability, significant delivery costs above comparability, and additional costs caused by environmental concerns that are not present with the comparables. Such costs may be passed on to the customer, but it is extremely critical that the concessionaire be able to specifically and concretely substantiate them. Additional rates above comparability should never be authorized without written documentation. Sometimes there are operating costs that have risen in the last few years that do not result in increased rates because those same increases are a factor with the ‘Actual Comparables’ and have already been reflected in the comparable rates.

The following pages present the applicable matrixes for Campground/RV, Lodging, and Marina operations in regard to Lake Berryessa Marina. Immediately following the matrixes is the evaluation of the ‘Extra Quality Features’ of the comparables selected and further analysis of those ‘Actual Comparables’. At the end of each section are the recommendations of the analyst in regard to how the various rates at Lake Berryessa Marina should be addressed based upon this comparability analysis.

Wheeler’s RV Resort & Campground Guide - Applicability to Lake Berryessa Concessionaire Comparability

After thorough analysis of the 2005 Edition of the Wheeler’s Guide to consider its applicability to Lake Berryessa’s comparability study of its seven resorts, it has been

concluded that the Wheelers Guide has no merit as a determinant in establishing rates to the public at Lake Berryessa.

The Wheelers Guide does not profess to be anything other than a 'guide'. As such, it provides a basic inventory of RV Parks and Campgrounds. It provides users with general resort information, and attempts to supply an overall quality evaluation through a 'Star' assignment system. It also provides some general rate information for low, mid and upper priced amenities: however, it does not provide direction or determination on what rates should be for these various price levels nor does it provide any specific training or direction on how to determine the number of stars a facility receives. The evaluation and star rating is provided by untrained volunteer users who complete a rating form available in the back of the guide book.

Therefore, while Wheelers does provide direction and steps that result in the gathering and analysis of data for comparable rates, the process utilized in complying with Reclamation concession guidelines for rate approval does not recognize 'Wheelers Guide' as part of the rate approval process.

CAMPING & RV OPERATIONS

CAMPGROUND COMPARIBILITY MATRIX

Lake Berryessa Marina Resort

	Competition	Seasonality	Occupancy Rate	Similar Size	Site Type	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
Lake Berryessa Marina 48 tent sites w/limited group sites 29 RVs w/partial hus 53% Occ 5/30-Labor Day	10	10	10	10 77Tot	10 48 tent 29 RV-P	50	BASE Left No.
Coloma Resort (American River) 102 RV 50% w/fh + 50% w/h2O/elec Tent area also	10	9	8	7 102 Tot	3	36	
Edgewater Resort - (Clearlake) 61RV sites – no excl tent – all w/hu+tv	10	8	8	8 61 Tot	4	38	6 #1
Olema Ranch Campground (Pt. Reyes) 89RV w/31fhu – 58partial – 175 tent	9	7	6	2 264 Tot	4	28	
Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe) 35 total – 10 w/fh	10	5	7	5 35 Tot	5	32	
Funtime RV Park (Clearlake) 60 comb RV/Tent w/fh	10	8	8	8 60 Tot	4	38	6 #2
American River Resort 85 Sites – 35 w/full RV hu's	10	9	7	9 85 Tot	8	43	2 #3
Anchor Bay Campground (Coast) 29 RV/tent sites – 3 w/fhu	8	6	6	4 29 Tot	5	29	
Manchester Beach KOA (Coast) 115 tot – 51tent – 36partial – 22full	8	7	7	6 115 Tot	5	33	
Petaluma KOA 307tot – 124full – 39partial – 144none	8	8	6	1 307 Tot	3	26	
Placerville KOA 104tot – 44full – 30partial – 30none	8	8	7	7 104 Tot	5	35	
Sacramento KOA 133tot – 85full – 48w/o phone & TV	8	7	7	5 115 Tot	4	31	
Stockton KOA 100 w/fh – 20 tent sites	9	7	6	5 120 Tot	3	30	
Tahoe KOA 85total – 49full – 36tent w/nohu	10	5	5	9 85 Tot	7	36	
Willits KOA 32h2O&Elec – 11full – 16tent	9	8	7	7 59 Tot	7	38	6 #4

Snug Harbor (Delta) 28full or partial -	8	7	6	4 28 Tot	5	30	
Yosemite KOA 27full- 20partial – 26tent	9	7	6+	9 73 Tot	7	38	6 #5
Tahoe Pines 17full – 22partial – 90tent	10	5	8	4 129 Tot	4	31	
49er RV Ranch (Columbia/Sonora) 35full HU incl TV	9	8	8	5 35 Tot	4	34	
Collins Lake 150w/hu – 30 tent	8	9	7	3 180 Tot	3	30	
Holiday Harbor (Clearlake) 35 full hu	10	8	7	5 35 Tot	4	34	
Long Ravine CG (Rollins Lake) 12 w/elec – 64 w/o hu (tent)	10	9	8	10 76 Tot	8	45	1 #6
Orchard Spring Res (Rollins Lake) 90sites – 13w/fhu	10	9	8	8 90 Tot	7	42	3 #7
Pine Acres (Blue Lake) 29sites – 4w/fh – 21 partial – tent random	10	8	6	4 29 Tot	4	32	
Scotts Flat Lake 31tent sites – 136RV (+lg group sites)	8	7	7	3 167 Tot	3	28	
Tower Park (Delta) KOA 200 fhu	9	7	7	3 200 Tot	2	28	
Greenhorn CG (Rollins Lake) 40 sites w/no hu	10	9	6	6 40 Tot	3	34	
Peninsula Campground (Rollins Lake) 78 sites w/no hu	10	8	6	10 78 Tot	3	37	
Lake Francis 84 total sites 30 fhu – 17partial – 37 tent	8	9	7	9 84 tot	8	41	4 #8
The Narrows Resort (Blue Lake) 15RV sites – all at least partial	10	8	7	2 15 Tot	4	31	
Delta Bay RV Resort (Delta) 150 RV w/fhu (w, s, e, tv)– no tent area	9	7	7	4 150 Tot	3	30	
Camanche Reservoir +/-300 tent/RV sites w/o hu 100RV sites w/fhu	8	9	6	1 400 Tot	3	27	
Emerald Cove (Bullard Bar Reservoir) 56 non hook-up sites – tent or RV	8	8	6	8 56 Tot	4	34	
Shasta Lake Marina 27 w/fhu	10	9	7	4 27 Tot	5	35	
Angels Camp RV 32 w/fhu – 16 partial – 14 tent 62 Total	9	8	8	8 62 Tot	6	39	5 #9

Notes on the Preceding Chart – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaire’s campground operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Tot	= Total
hu	= Hook-ups
fhu	= Full hook-ups
elec	= Electric
w/o	= Without
excl	= Exclusive
h20	= Water

Extra Quality Features

Lake Berryessa Campgrounds

Lake Berryessa Marina

Features (check if present)	LB MARINA		LONG RAVINE CG	AMERICAN RIVER RESORT	ORCHARD SPRING RESORT	LAKE FRANCIS RESORT	EDGEWATER RESORT	FUNTIME RV PARK	WILLITS KOA	YOSEMITE KOA	ANGELS CAMP RV
Utility hookups (water, sewer, electric)	P & L 29-RV		P & L	P & L	P & L	P & L	Y+TV	Y	P & L	P & L	P & L
Trash receptacles											
At site											
Centralized	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Dumping station	Y				N						
Included in campsite rate	Y		Y	Y	At RV sites	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Extra charge											
Showers	N										
Included in campsite rate			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Coin operated											
Partitioned stalls			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Open/common area											
Heated			N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Restroom service											
Pit toilets – CHEMICAL	Y										
Flush toilets	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Hot and cold water	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Water											
At individual sites	Y-RV				RV-13	Y&tent	Y	Y	RV-Y	RV-Y	RV-Y
Scattered hydrants	Y-CG		Y	Y	Y				T-Y	T-Y	T-Y
Central only											

Site Characteristics											
Site seclusion (utmost, moderate, limited)	L--		L	M	M	M	L	L	L	M	L
Separate area for tents	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Landscaping appropriate for natural terrain	N		N	L	L	L	Y	N	Y	Y	L
Type of access											
Rough or gravel road	Y			Y			Y	Y	Y		

Features (check if present)	LB MARINA		LONG RAVINE CG	AMERICAN RIVER RESORT	ORCHARD SPRING RESORT	LAKE FRANCIS RESORT	EDGEWATER RESORT	FUNTIME RV PARK	WILLITS KOA	YOSEMITE KOA	ANGELS CAMP RV
Paved	Y--		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L		Y	Y
Pull-through for RVs and trailers	N		Few	Few	Some	Some	L	L	Y	Some	Some
Compliance with ADA requirements	N		N	N	L	L	N	N	L+	L	L
Lighted areas and paths	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Picnic table at site	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	Y	Y
Fireplace/grill at site	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	Y	Y
Service Related											
Reservation system	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Public phone available	Y-		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Camper service store	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	L	Y	Y	Y	Y
Food service	N		Y	L	L	L	N	N	N	N	N
Gasoline service station	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Propane	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
24-hour onsite available	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y
Firewood available	Y		Y	N	Y	N	Y	N	Y	Y	N
Coin laundry available	Y		N	Y	N	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Ice available	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Vending machines	Y		Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Interpretative programs	N		Y	N	N	Y	N	N	Y	L	N
Entertainment programs	N		Y	N	N	Y	N	N	Y	L	N
Recreation room	N		N	N	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y
Swimming pool	N		Lake	N	Lake	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

- P = Partial (in re: to hook ups ‘P’ denotes that only some of the sites have hook-ups.
- L = Limited (in re: to hook ups ‘L’ means some sites have limited hook ups.
- Y = Yes
- N = No
- RV = Recreational Vehicle
- CG = Campground
- T = Tent

M = Moderate
- = Somewhat less or worse
+ = Somewhat more or better
Lake = Convenient designated swimming area in the lake

Lake Berryessa Marina – Campground Operations - The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Lake Berryessa Marina (LBM) fits into the mix of ‘Actual Comparables’ for campground operations. This list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed among the comparables determined to be most similar to the concessionaire. This list of ‘Actual Comparables’ is not oriented in regards to price but in the level of apparent desirability, i.e., the property listed first is the most desirable and the one listed last is the least desirable within this group. Note that following the name of each property there is a number, i.e., (6th) following Willits KOA. This number corresponds to the ranking on the ‘Comparability Matrix’ a few pages back so the lower the number the more similarity to LBM.

PROPERTY

RATES

1. Willits KOA (6th)

**\$44 full hook up, \$40 partial, \$37 back-in
\$32 Tent weekend, \$25 Sun-Thur.**

The Willits KOA campground is above average in respect to most KOA locations. There is a wide variety of on site amenities offered to RV’ers and campers, i.e., swimming pool, fishing pond, developed hiking trails, Old West theme throughout the park, cable TV as part of hook-up, 50 amp service, mini golf, established tours of area highlights (for charge), bicycle rentals, children’s playground, etc. This campground received the ‘Presidents Award’ which is the highest internal rating given within the family of KOA campgrounds.

2. Yosemite KOA (6th)

**\$42 fhu, \$40 partial \$28 Lowest Off Season
\$28 for Tent**

The Yosemite KOA is a typical KOA property. There is a variety of on site amenities offered to RV’ers and campers, i.e., swimming pool, mini golf, hiking trail, fishing pond, game arcade, group/family use facilities, cable TV as standard part of hook-up, 50 amp service, etc. This site also has well designed tent camp sites that provide a maximum of privacy between sites.

3. Edgewater Resort (6th)

\$30 fhu w/TV, \$40 hol. & lakeside all days

The Edgewater is mainly an RV and lodging installation with no areas established as just tent sites. All RV sites have full hook-ups that include cable TV and access to an array of amenities at the resort including, swimming pool, horseshoe pit area, group/family recreation room, private dock and swimming area, etc. This area displays a high level of maintenance and day to day care.

4. Angels Camp RV (5th)

**\$49 full & partial hu,
\$25 Tent**

This is a former KOA campground with associated amenities similar to KOA, i.e., swimming pool, horseshoe pit, fishing pond, group/family meeting or event room, some 50 amp service. This facility appears to have a somewhat lower level of care under current management than KOA would allow in their franchises.

5. Lake Francis Resort (4th)

**\$27 Full, \$25 Water & Elec.
\$23 Lg. Tent Site, \$21 Sm. Tent Site (both H20)**

The Lake Francis Resort RV Park/Campground is not a high end area but appears well run and in good condition. Facilities are a little dated and in some areas need replacement. A very nice feature is the availability of water in an outdoor sink arrangement at each tent campsite. Sites are moderately well distanced or separated from one another.

**6. Orchard Springs Res (3rd) \$36 Full hook up – same price all year
\$33 Tent Water Vu, \$29 Reg. Tent Site**

Orchard Springs Resort features fairly typical RV/Campground facilities. They are located in a heavily timbered area that provides good shade to most campsites. They feature a preponderance of tent sites and only 13 RV sites.

**7. Funtime RV Park (6th) \$22 & 26(lake) fhu F& Sat, \$20 & 24 wkday
Dbl. occup. With a\$3 per person charge
No tent sites but same rate if tent used.**

The Funtime RV Park is one of the lower end RV parks visited. It has convenient hook ups but most of the external facilities are in need of upgrading or redesign after many years of use. It does feature a nice beach on Clearlake for swimming and launching of RV customer boats. It also has a private small pier that customers may use. There are some 50 amp services available.

**8. Long Ravine CG (1st) \$29 for limited hookup site all days
\$25 for tent sites all days**

Long Ravine Campground is a moderately nice tenting campground but a fairly inconvenient RV campground. It has 12 partial hook-up sites. All of the sites are in timber and have fairly good shade. Facilities and amenities adjacent to the CG area are minimal. Under the same ownership/management is a nice little marina, store and outstanding formal 'lake swim area'. All these facilities are available to the campground users but not without a substantial walk or getting in a vehicle and driving.

**9. American River CG (2nd) \$35 Full RV
\$30 Riverside Tent Wkend, \$25 Wkday
\$25 Reg. Tent Wkend, \$20 Wkday**

The American River CG is mainly used as a staging and overnight area for river running activities on the American River. There are a few awesome camp sites adjacent to the River that are extremely picturesque for either tenters or RV'ers. The main part of the campground is away from the river by 50-100 yards and although well spaced out tends to be dry, dusty and fairly dirty. It is not a CG where users that just wanted a camping experience would frequent.

**** L. B. MARINA \$30 Partial hook-up
\$25 Tent Camping**

There are good views of the lake from the campground however; the LBM campground is unattractive and severely impacted. Sites are bare dirt with no wood chips, gravel or other more sanitary or appealing camping surface (The issue of bare dirt and repetitive use is also apparent at some of the comparables visited during this study but there are also areas that obviously make an effort to provide an appealing spot for tents, eating areas and general camp use). Support infrastructure for the LBM campground is in dilapidated condition and in comparison to any of the comparables the camping experience associated with the facilities is poor. The RV sites located on the man made land spit provides popular and moderately nice RV sites with very good lake views and access.

The above list indicates that all nine of the comparables when comparatively assessed alongside LBM rate higher in regards to the combination of available amenities and observed operational conditions. A review of the photos taken during the actual visits to the above and other properties demonstrates that many other RV areas and all campgrounds visited display a greater level of amenities and overall user preference in a side-by-side comparison.

Other Comparable Notes of Interest – Some of the campground and/or RV properties visited had some special features or adaptations that displayed outstanding thought and concern for their customers. The following is a list of those noteworthy features that may not have been earlier mentioned.

- Camanche Reservoir (Family Camping Area) – A fairly large section of the campground that is signed as “Family Camping – No Alcohol”. This would seem to have outstanding appeal to many camping groups.
- Multiple Properties (Themes) – Many locations, especially the KOA campgrounds, did a good job of having their campground set up with a theme that was carried through in the design and construction of facilities, printed material and even special programs. Theme examples were “Old West”, “Gold Mining” and other local cultural highlights.
- Antlers Resort Campground (Privacy Barriers) – This property did an outstanding job of creating privacy barriers between camp or RV sites with a combination of vegetation and fairly simple fence like structures that seemed to fit in well (see photos).
- Multiple Properties (Screening Unattractive Areas) – Several areas did a good job of hiding or at least dressing up otherwise unattractive areas such as garbage receptacles, propane service and other maintenance or service type facilities. Again Antlers resort was especially good at screening.
- Multiple Properties (Wireless Computer Access) – Several campgrounds have taken the leap to provide an available wireless site on the property. The KOA campgrounds were especially aggressive on this. When tested they seemed to work fine by the compiler of this study.
- Multiple Properties (Swimming Areas) – Many areas associated with water recreation have developed very nice swimming areas at their lakes. The Long Ravine Campground, Collins Lake and Meeks Bay had particularly appealing areas but there were many others who had also made a special effort.
- Collins Lake (Signing) – Collins Lake had a very attractive and aggressive signing program throughout the campground area. Many questions were answered in advance through good signing. All signs were in the same style and professionally constructed.
- Scotts Flat Lake (Accessibility) – Scotts Flat did an outstanding job of going beyond just having nice restroom/shower facilities for the handicapped in the design and construction of a totally accessible pier for fishing or just getting out on the water. It is even more noteworthy that this was done on a fluctuating reservoir.

- Multiple Properties (Daily/Weekly Special Events) – Many areas, especially the KOA properties, have special events such as BBQ's, pancake breakfasts, entertainment, hayrides, etc. that have only a marginal cost and provide an opportunity for families to meet others and get involved if they wish.
- Multiple Properties (Trails) – Many areas have developed short trails within their properties that either help people go from 'Point A to Point B' or have some type of specific destination, i.e., "Fishing Trail at Peninsula Campground (Lake Rollins)". This type of development is fairly easy to do and provides an added sense of being in a real camping area or some type of subliminal adventure to many campers who may never have been on a trail in the woods. Most of these trails are no longer than 100 yards to ¼ mile but they add an appropriate touch to the camping experience.
- Greenhorn Campground (Camping Dock) – This facility developed a small deck type structure shared by several tent sites that permitted actual access on the water and a place to sit and read, fish or enjoy the lake.

The preceding list demonstrates some unique efforts made by many of the campgrounds visited during this comparability analysis. These are all things that either add value and or increase the level of experience for campers.

The operation of and facilities for camping and RV public use areas at LBM do not provide any of these or other noteworthy practices that could be identified as a unique positive feature.

Analysts 2006 Rate Recommendations to Reclamation for Lake Berryessa Marina Camping and RV Operations based upon data collected and conditions observed during compilation of 'Comparability Analysis'

The campground at LBM is rated at the bottom of all the campgrounds visited during this analysis. There are some nice views of and access to the lake from the campground but that is not a mitigating factor in regard to the condition of the facilities or in the comparability pricing practices. The individual sites are very difficult to distinguish and offer no meaningful separation or privacy between groups. There is no indication of efforts to create a pleasing and functional campground, i.e., prepared area for tents or vegetative barriers. Campers must use chemical toilets on a full time basis and there are no shower facilities available at the campground. Each of the nine comparables provided normal restrooms and shower facilities. Large and unsightly dumpsters are located in the campground near the toilets and the combined appearance is unsightly.

The recommended rate for this campground based upon comparability is \$17-\$20 for double occupancy. This is a lower rate than any of the nine comparables but the camping facilities at LBM are inferior to all of the comparables and this rate reflects those differences. Improved rates would be possible following a significant rehabilitation and improvement in facilities, i.e. restrooms, roads, spatial arrangement, enhanced privacy, etc. Such a significant effort is probably not advisable at this stage of the contract because of an inability to realize an appropriate return plus the basic need to relocate to some other locations or significantly reduce the number of campsites.

On September 22, 2005 Reclamation received from LBM requested increases for tent camping from \$25 to \$30. Since the rate of \$25 is not supportable an increase should not be considered and is not recommended.

The RV facilities at LBM are of a higher quality than the campground identified above. The sites are located on a man made jetty adjacent to the marina operations. They are very popular because of their proximity to the lake and the marina. The support facilities are adequate but not outstanding. Trees were planted on the jetty years ago and do provide some separation between the sites and a little shade. The RV hook-ups do not include a sewer hook-up but the resort provides a 'Honey Wagon' service that will come by and empty the holding tanks of any RV's. There are no pull through sites.

The recommended rate for these RV sites based upon comparability is \$28-\$31 based upon double occupancy. This rate would be in the mid range of the nine comparables and is a reasonable position.

These recommended rates take into consideration statements from the comparables that indicated some would have a minor rate increase for 2006 and others not planning on any increase.

LODGING OPERATIONS

LODGING COMPARABILITY MATRIX

Lake Berryessa Marina

	Competition	Seasonality	Similar Area	Similar Clientele	Occupancy Rate	Facility Characteristics *	Similar Size **	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
L. B. Concessionaires	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	70	BASE
L. B. Marina 93% Occ 5/30-Labor Day					93%		+/- 13 cabins	70	
Edgewater Resort (Clearlake) 9 cabs	10	7	7	7	7	6	8	52	3 #1
Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe) 10 mot – 9 cabs	10	4	4	8	7	5	7	45	
Funtime RV Park (Clearlake) 6 cabs	10	7	7	7	8	8	7	54	1 #2
Manchester Beach KOA (Coast) 27 cabs	9	6	5	6	8	8	5	47	
Petaluma KOA 33 cabs	10	6	4	5	7	8	5	45	
Placerville KOA 8 cabs	10	7	4	5	7	8	7	48	
Sacramento KOA	10	6	3	4	7	8	7	45	
Stockton KOA	10	6	3	4	7	8	6	44	
Willits KOA	9	6	5	5	7	8	8	48	
Yosemite KOA (Midpines)	9	6	6	6	6	8	9	50	5 #3
Snug Harbor (Delta) 16 cabs	8	6	5	8	7	7	8	49	
Carneros Inn (Napa)	10	7	7	1	6	5	3	39	
B&W Resort Marina (Delta)	9	6	5	7	6	4	5	42	
Collins Lake 2cabs + 4 trailers	8	8	7	7	7	5	4	46	

Pine Acres (Blue Lake) 11 cottages	9	7	7	7	6	4	8	48	
Lodge at Blue Lake 35 rooms +/-	9	7	7	5	6	2	4	40	
El Grande Clearlake	10	7	7	4	6	1	2	37	
Gold Country Inn (Angels Camp)	10	7	6	3	7	1	3	37	
The Gold Lodge (Sonora)	10	7	6	3	7	2	4	39	
Lake Escape Resort (Clearlake) 18 cottages	10	7	7	7	7	6	8	52	3 #4
Northern Queen Inn (Nevada City)	10	7	6	3	7	1	2	36	
Travelodge (Clearlake)	10	7	7	4	7	1	3	39	
Skylark Shores (Clearlake) 40rms + 5cot	10	7	7	7	6	1	3	41	
Indian Beach Resort (Clearlake) 9 cottages	10	7	7	8	6	6	7	51	4 #5
Antlers Resort & Mar. (Shasta) 11 cabs w/K	9	8	8	8	6	5	7	51	4 #6
Bridge Bay Resort (Shasta) +/- 40 rms	9	8	8	7	6	1	3	42	
Silverthorn Resort (Shasta) 8 cabins	9	8	8	8	6	5	7	51	4 #7
Angels Camp RV 5 cabs	10	7	6	6	7	8	6	50	5 #8
Camanche Reservoir 18 cott/rms w/K + 4mot	9	8	9	7	7	5	8	53	2 #9

Notes on the Preceding Chart – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaires lodging operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

w/k = With kitchen
mot = Motel
cabs = Cabins

ms = Rooms
cot = Cottage

Extra Quality Features Overnight Accommodations Lake Berryessa Marina

Features (check if present) LAKE BERRYESSA MARINA	LB MARINA		FUNTIME RV PARK	CAMANCHE RESERVOIR	EDGEWATER RESORT	LAKE ESCAPE RESORT	INDIAN BEACH	ANTLERS RESORT	SILVERTHORN RESORT	ANGELS CAMP RV	YOSEMITE KOA
Rooms	15 Cabin		6 cabs	22	9 cabs	18	9	11	8cabs	5cabs	15cab
Individual temperature cont.	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Suites				Y							
Compliance with ADA req.	L		N	L	L	Y	N	N	L	L	L+
Kitchenettes	Y Micro		Y	Y	Y	L	Y	Y	Y	N	Y-3
Television	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y-3
Free cable			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Pay per view movies											
Telephone	N		N	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N
Free local calls						Y		Y			
Vending											
In-room	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Common area	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Swimming pool	N		Y	Lake	Y	Y	Lake	N	N	Y	Y
Indoor											
Outdoor Heated			Y		Y	Y				Y	Y
Outdoor unheated											
Pool deck and/or patio area			Y		Y	Y	Y				
Retail facilities	Y		Y	L	L	N	Y	L	L	L	Y
Restaurant/bar facilities	N		N	L	N	N	N	N	Y	N	N
Cafeteria	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Full-service Dining Room	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Bar	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Fireplace in common area	N		N	N	N	N	N	Y- in guest Room	N	N	N
Designated bus/camper parking	L		N	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y	Y
Children's play area	N		N	C.G.	N	N	N	N	N	Y	Y
Recreation/weight room	N		N	N	N	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y
Marina	Y		Guest use dock	Y	Guest use dock	Privat guest use	Privat guest use	Y	Y	N	N
Beach	N		Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N	N	N

Features (check if present) LAKE BERRYESSA MARINA	LB MARINA		FUNTIME RV PARK	CAMANCHE RESERVOIR	EDGEWATER RESORT	LAKE ESCAPE RESORT	INDIAN BEACH	ANTLERS RESORT	SILVERTHORN RESORT	ANGELS CAMP RV	YOSEMITE KOA
Tennis courts	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Golf privileges	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Convenience Comfort Related											
Wall-to-wall carpet in rooms	N		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N	N
Grade-A furniture	N		'B'	Y	Y	Y+	Dated but nice	Y	Y	Rustic	Rustic
Bedside lighting controls	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Service Related											
Baggage (bell hop)	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Valet parking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Room service	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Entertainment	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	L
Medical assistance/RN on duty	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Audiovisual movies	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Make other reservations	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	Y
Rental cars available	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
Major credit cards accepted	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y
Registration office open 24 hours	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N
800 number available	N		N	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Y = Yes

N = No

L = Limited

B = Lower Quality than 'A'

CG = Campground

Cabs = Cabins

Micro = Microwave Oven

Lake = Convenient swimming in the lake

Guest Use Dock = Not an actual public marina but provides same services to guests

Grade A Furniture = Based upon the type of room, i.e. standard hotel, rustic cabin, etc. 'Grade A' signifies what would be considered very nice for that style. If Grade B is noted then it signifies a lesser quality.

Discussion on Lodging Comparables and How Data is Compared

The following section lists the facilities and rates of the nine properties judged to be 'Actual Comparables' for approving Lodging rates for Lake Berryessa Marina. These properties are listed in the order of their apparent level and quantity of amenities offered. The order was not determined based upon any evaluation of a property's rates, i.e., the property listed first does not necessarily also display the highest prices. However, every thing being equal it is reasonable to assume that the properties higher on the list will have higher rates than those at the end of the list because they have more and/or nicer amenities.

Most comparable properties have and display rates for more than one type of lodging unit or facility. This list is only approximate as some evaluators could value various features differently. However, it does represent to the compiler of this 'Comparability Study' the ranking of these nine properties based upon actual visitation and evaluation of the collected data. This listing takes into consideration general factors such as overall site appearance including the presence and appearance of landscaping and other support facilities, ease of use and access, apparent maintenance condition of facilities, appearance and conduct of employees, environmental sensitivity and awareness, and of course the type and quality of the various facilities.

Lake Berryessa Marina is also displayed at the point in the list where it seems to naturally fit in regard to the level of amenities and condition of facilities as compared to the nine actual comparables. This information along with some additional comparison of the 'Extra Quality Features', and other rate impacting data provided by the concessionaire (if Reclamation agrees), provides Reclamation the logical reasoning and support data for making a decision on rate approval for Marina services and facilities at Lake Berryessa Marina.

It may also be helpful for the reviewer of this section to review the 'Extra Quality Features' (lodging) compilation for each of the properties and for LBM and also to review the photographic record provided in the photo section on the available CD.

Lake Berryessa Marina – Lodging Operations – The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Lake Berryessa Marina fits into the mix of ‘Actual Comparables’ for Lodging operations. This list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed among the comparables determined to be most similar to the concessionaire. This list of ‘Actual Comparables’ is not oriented in regards to price but in the level of apparent desirability, i.e., the property listed first is the most desirable and the one listed last is the least desirable within this group. Note that following the name of each property there is a number, i.e., (3rd) following Edgewater Resort. This number corresponds to the ranking on the ‘Comparability Matrix’ a few pages back so the lower the number the more similarity to LBM.

PROPERTY

RATES

1. Lake Escape Resort (3rd)

\$109 - \$279

This resort has 18 separate cottages of varying levels of size and amenities. They feature 8 different rates for ‘Weekdays’ and a corresponding 8 rates for ‘Weekends’. At a minimum all the rooms include a refrigerator, microwave, and coffee maker. Five of the rooms have full kitchens and all but the least expensive room (\$109/week & \$139/weekend - there are five of these) accommodate 4 guests for the basic price. Rooms also include cable TV and all required bed/bath linens. The least expensive cottage is much nicer and includes significantly more amenities than the standard Park Model Cabin at Lake Berryessa Marina.

2. Edgewater Resort (3rd)

\$140 Weekday & \$165 Weekend (4 people)

This resort has 9 separate cabins/houses. The seven standard cabins are at the same rate (\$140/\$165) as identified above and cover 4 people. The other two houses have rates of \$240/\$265 and \$350/\$400 and cover 8 and 12 people respectively. Standard cabins also include cable TV and all required bed/bath linens, full kitchens, and at least one bedroom separate from the living room and kitchen. This least expensive cabin is much roomier and nicer and includes significantly more amenities than the standard Park Model Cabin at Lake Berryessa Marina.

3. Antlers Resort & Marina (4th) \$145 - \$258 (\$1017 - \$1805) +\$12 extra person

This resort has 11 separate cabins. During the summer they rent by the week only for the rates indicated in parenthesis. They have 4 cabin types (Studio, 1 Bedroom, 2 Bedroom, and 3 Bedroom) that rent between the rate ranges indicated. The two smaller cabin rates cover 3 people and the two larger cover 5 and 7 people respectively. All cabins include full kitchens, TV’s, decks, and some include wood burning stoves. These are nice spacious cabins that exceed in all amenity respects the Park Model Cabins at Lake Berryessa Marina.

4. Silverthorn Resort (4th)

\$115 - \$265 +\$10 extra person

This resort has 8 rental units (cabins). One is priced at \$115 (2 people at the rate), five are priced at \$125 (4 people), one priced at \$165 (6 people), and one at \$265 (8 people). They all include a minimum of a kitchenette with the largest having a full kitchen. All linens are provided. They all have an outside porch and BBQ area. These are nice spacious cabins that exceed in all amenity respects the Park Model Cabins at Lake Berryessa Marina.

5. Camanche Reservoir (2nd)

\$64-83Motel & \$126 Housekeeping Cottage

This resort has 18 cottages and 4 motel rooms. The motel rooms with twin beds are \$64 and those with Kings are \$83 and both rates are based upon double occupancy. The housekeeping cottages at \$126 are for 4 people and include kitchens and cable TV. They are all very nice with lake views, very attractive landscaping, and convenient porches for relaxing and enjoying the view. These are nice spacious facilities that exceed in all amenity respects the Park Model Cabins at Lake Berryessa Marina.

6. Indian Beach Resort (4th) \$63-\$161 Housekeeping Cabins

This is an older resort on the shores of Clearlake with 10 housekeeping cabins for rent. Design and furnishings are dated but quaint in a positive way and in fairly good condition. The lower rates, i.e., \$63 & \$78 for smaller units are for double occupancy. Middle size units rent for \$91 - \$110 for 4 persons, \$103-\$122 for 5 persons. Larger units rent for \$115 - \$161 for 6 to 9 people. These are nice cabins that exceed in all amenity respects the Park Model Cabins at Lake Berryessa Marina.

7. Funtime RV Park (1st) \$60 - \$80 Std. Cabs. & \$125-\$160 Kitch. Cab.

This resort has 5 cabins most of them are park models and the others are very similar to that design and style. The standard cabin interiors are similar to those at Lake Berryessa Marina. Mid-week rates for four people in 4 of the cabins are \$60-\$70 and \$70-\$80 on weekends. The largest cabin that includes a kitchen and separate bedroom has rates of \$125 mid-week and \$160 weekend both covering 8 people. Sewage is plumbed directly into a sewer facility from each cabin. Units are not particularly attractively situated or landscaped.

8. Yosemite KOA (5th) \$54-\$60 Cabins & \$145 Lodge & \$5 extra person

This is a fairly standard KOA campground with approximately 16 cabins and lodges. Cabins and lodges are of a design and construction specifically seen at many KOA campgrounds but fairly similar in general style to the park model cabins for rent at Lake Berryessa Marina. The lodge facility is fairly large (over 400 sq. ft.) and includes a kitchen/living room and a separate bedroom and bathroom. The associated landscaping and general amenities in the immediate cabin area are more desirable here than at Lake Berryessa Marina. All rates are for double occupancy.

9. Angels Camp RV (5th) \$49 one rm. cab. & \$59 two rm. cab. + \$5 ex. Per.

This RV Park has 7 cabins. The park is a former KOA campground and all the facilities reflect KOA design. The cabins are nearly the same as #7 (Yosemite) and the rate for the one room cabin is for 4 persons and the two room cabin rate is for 6. The overall level of maintenance and landscaping is not as nice as current KOA facilities, however it still exceeds the immediate area setting and ambiance for the cabins at Lake Berryessa Marina.

**** L. B. MARINA**

**\$100 Cozy Cabin (Single Room +restroom)
\$150 Deluxe Lodge, Super Deluxe Cabin and
Handicap Cabin (Two Rooms +loft)**

The actual cabins offered by Lake Berryessa Marina seem well maintained and physically attractive inside and out. They all have a view of the lake. A detraction from the perceived value observed regarding the concessionaire facilities in comparison to the comparables is the physical setting of the units. They are located in a parking lot with very little attention to landscaping or general visual and environmental appeal. Arranged in a row placed a few feet from one another they have a fairly sterile appearance. Such a setting and arrangement may be the only option for the concessionaire at this stage of the contract but it does have an impact on the rates and comparative value to customers. No bedding, utensils, pots & pans etc. are provided and must be brought in by guests. These facilities at Lake Berryessa Marina also require the need for a holding tank to be pumped out as the toilets and other domestic water services are not plumbed into a sewer system.

This analysis is based upon the on site visitation, collection, and review of all the information from the nine properties selected as actual comparables for Lake Berryessa Marina's lodging operation. All nine actual comparables provide facilities, services, and amenities that deliver an overall better value in 'side by side' comparisons with the concessionaire. See the photos on the following page for examples of how 'Cabins' are presented for rent at Lake Berryessa Marina and at one of the comparables.

Lake Berryessa Marina cabins for rent.



Below, similar style/quality cabin for rent in an area where they have been landscaped and set in to provide a fairly nice physical separation from other units and attractive individual character and appeal to customers (Comparable – Yosemite KOA).



Analysts 2006 Rate Recommendations to Reclamation for Lake Berryessa Marina Lodging Operations based upon data collected and conditions observed during compilation of 'Comparability Analysis'

The cabins at Lake Berryessa Marina are adequate structures presented in a less than optimum manner. As identified they have been placed in a portion of the existing parking lot in close proximity to one another. They are on a par with the bottom two comparables (Angels Camp and Yosemite KOA) in regard to the design, size and features of the structure and the interior space. However, they fall back below these two because of the superior landscaping and setting of the comparables. The LBM cabins also require a holding tank to be occasionally pumped out as there are no direct sewer hook-ups. All of the comparables except Angels Camp and Yosemite KOA also provide bedding and other necessary equipment for using kitchen facilities.

The recommended rates for these cabins based upon comparability of the properties visited is \$65-\$75 for the smaller units and \$95-\$105 for the larger units based upon double occupancy. This pricing takes into consideration a very small combined increase in rates for the comparables. Some of the comparables indicated they might have a very small rate increase and some of them indicated no planned increase. Higher rates would only be supportable if the siting of cabins was improved. This would include a lower density arrangement and some attractive landscaping.

LBM, in a document received on September 22, 2005, is not requesting any increase in these rates for 2006.

MARINA OPERATIONS

MARINA COMPARABILITY MATRIX

Lake Berryessa Marina

	Competition	Seasonality	Similar Area	Similar Clientele	Similarity of Operations	Construction Characteristics	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
Lake Berryessa Marina 219 slips w/119 covered mix of open&closed foam age mix 4yr to +10yr 1dock w/elect 28 foot avg. slip length 96% occ summer	10	10	10	10	10 size repair util. sec/prot. Dry storage Transient use Boat rental	10	60	BASE Left No.
Edgewater Resort (Clearlake)	10	7	7	6	2	3	35	
Lakeside Marina (Tahoe)	10	4	4	8	7	3	36	
Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe)	10	4	4	7	4	3	32	
Obexters Marina (Tahoe)	10	4	4	7	5	3	33	
Funtime RV Park (Clearlake)	10	7	7	6	4	3	37	
Snug Harbor (Delta)	10	6	3	8	6	3	36	
B&W Resort Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	8	6	3	36	
Collins Lake	7	8	7	7	6	8	43	
Holiday Harbor (Clearlake)	10	7	7	8	7	3	42	
Long Ravine CG (Rollins Lake)	10	7	7	7	7	8	46	

Orchard Spring Resort (Rollins Lake)	10	7	7	7	6	8	45	
Scotts Flat Lake	7	7	7	6	5	5	35	
Tower Park Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	8	8	3	38	
Greenhorn CG (Rollins Lake)	10	7	7	7	7	8	46	
Lake Francis	7	7	7	5	4	3	37	
Delta Bay RV Resort (Delta)	10	6	3	7	7	3	36	
Willow Berm Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	6	5	3	33	
Emerald Cove (Bullards Bar Res.)	7	7	7	7	8	8	44	
Bidwell Canyon Marina (Lake Oroville)	9	8	8	9	9	8	51	1 #1
Camanche Reservoir	8	8	9	8	7	8	48	3 #2
Antlers Resort & Mar. (Shasta)	10	8	8	9	8	8	51	1 #3
Bridge Bay Resort (Shasta)	10	8	8	8	8	8	50	2 #4
Shasta Lake Marina	10	8	8	9	8	8	51	1 #5
Silverthorn Resort (Shasta)	10	8	8	8	8	8	50	2 #6
Tahoe Keys Marina	10	4	4	8	7	3	36	

Notes on the Preceding Chart – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaires’ marina operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

Extra Quality Features Marina Facilities

Features (check if present)	LB MARINA		BIDWELL CANYON	ANTLERS RESORT	SHASTA LAKE MARINA	BRIDGE BAY	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANACHE RESERVOIR			
Hotel/motel (Lodging)	Y		N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y			
Restaurant and/or bar	N		Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Groceries	L		L	Y	Y	Y	L	Y			
Adequate water depth for draft of boats	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Secure boat tieup system	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fuel dock and other fuels, i.e., propane	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fire protection water and equipment	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dock utilities (H2O, elec, TV, phone)	N		N	N	N	Y	N	N			
Avail. and conven. of parking lot	L		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dock boxes and carts	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N			
Dinghy racks and boat storage	N		N	N	N	N	N	Y			
Restroom, showers, and laundry	Shore		REST	REST	REST	REST	REST	shore			
Ice and other vending machines	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fish cleaning station	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Parts and accessories store	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L			
Landscaping	L		N	N	L	L	N	L			
Picnic, swim pool, tennis areas	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Recreation or lounge area	N		Y	shore	shore	Shore	Shore	Shore			
Posted marina rules	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Boat haul-out facilities	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Repair/maintenance (mechanical, hull, rigging, etc.)	N		L	L	L	L	L	N			
Transient berths/moorings	Y		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dry storage	Y		N	N	N	N	N	Y			
Trailer parking	L		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Compliance with ADA Requirements	N		N	N	N	N	N	L			
Sewage pumpout station	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Marine VHF monitoring	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Dock hands to assist in docking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			

	LB MARINA		BIDWELL CANYON	ANTLERS RESORT	SHASTA LAKE MARINA	BRIDGE BAY	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANICHE RESERVOIR			
Features (check if present)											
Weather information	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Book/VCR library	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Charter boat operation	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Camping	Y		N	Y	Y	N	N	Y			
Swimming	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Water skiing	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fishing	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Beach rentals and/or water toys	N		Y	Y	Y	N	Y	N			
Boat rentals	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fishing equipment	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Y = Yes
N = No
L = Limited

Restrooms/Shower/Laundry = In this section the notes refer to where the service is located or what the extent of the service is, i.e., 'REST' means a restroom on the dock and 'shore' means the services are provided on shore but not on the dock.

Discussion on Marina Comparables and How Data is Compared

The following several pages lists the services, facilities and rates of the six properties judged to be 'Actual Comparables' for approving Marina rates for Lake Berryessa Marina. These properties are listed in the order of their apparent level and quantity of amenities offered. The order is not intended to reflect the corresponding level of their rates, i.e., the property listed first does not necessarily also display the highest prices. However, every thing being equal it is reasonable to assume that the properties higher on the list will have higher rates than those at the end of the list. Each property has numerous different rates for a wide variety of rental craft and for other services and facilities. The list represents to the compiler of this 'Comparability Study' the ranking of these six properties based upon actual observation during site visits and evaluation of the collected data. This listing takes into consideration general factors such as overall site appearance including the appearance of land based facilities support facilities, ease of use and access, apparent maintenance condition of facilities, appearance and conduct of employees, environmental sensitivity and awareness, and of course the type and quality of the various facilities.

At the end of the comparables data the same data is also presented for Lake Berryessa Marina and a conclusion is reached as to where among these 'Actual Comparables' the similar products at Lake Berryessa Marina would fit in relation to a similar assessment of their level of marina amenities and general factors as compared to the properties on the list. This information along with some additional comparison of the 'Extra Quality Features', and other rate impacting data provided by the concessionaire (if Reclamation agrees), provides Reclamation the logical reasoning and support data for making a decision on rate approval for Marina services and facilities at Lake Berryessa Marina.

It may also be helpful for the reviewer of this section to review the preceding 'Extra Quality Features' compilation for each of the properties and for Lake Berryessa Marina and also to review the photographic record provided on the available CD.

Marina Comparability Approx. Amenity Level (Hi to Lo) and Base Rates

1. Shasta Lake Marina

2005 Houseboat Rental Information – Shasta Lake Marina

			2- night	3- night	4- night	5- night	6- night	Weekly
Diplomat Sleeps 6 (37' x 14')		Off Season	\$425	\$585	\$655	\$815	\$980	\$1140
		Value Week	\$895	\$1040	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1460
		Summer	\$1055	\$1160	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1730
Monarch Sleeps 10 (47' x 14')		Off Season	\$480	\$675	\$745	\$930	\$1115	\$1300
		Value Week	\$945	\$1055	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1575
		Summer	\$1085	\$1180	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1825
Premiere Sleeps 10 (50' x 14')		Off Season	\$505	\$740	\$840	\$1050	\$1260	\$1470
		Value Week	\$1065	\$1235	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1830
		Summer	\$1265	\$1435	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2155
Ambassador Sleeps 8 (53' x 15')		Off Season	\$560	\$800	\$890	\$1110	\$1335	\$1555
		Value Week	\$1245	\$1405	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1935
		Summer	\$1445	\$1570	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2385
Marquis Sleeps 12 (53' x 15')		Off Season	\$630	\$880	\$990	\$1235	\$1485	\$1730
		Value Week	\$1325	\$1605	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2290
		Summer	\$1570	\$1690	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2890
Empress Sleeps 16 (56' x 15')		Off Season	N/A	\$1275	\$1505	\$1880	\$2255	\$2630
		Value Week	\$2275	\$2440	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$3660
		Summer	\$2390	\$2545	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$4565

Small Rental Boats 2005 Rates – Shasta Lake Marina

		hour	day	deposit
Fishing Boats	Boat Only	\$6	\$29	\$145
	10 HP	\$12	\$52	\$260
	25 HP	\$17	\$75	\$375
Patio Boats	Party Barge Patio Boat	\$35	\$150	\$750
	47' Party Cruiser	\$85	\$315	\$1,575
Personal Water Craft	Sea Doo 3 Person	\$85	\$275	\$1,375
Ski Boats	Ski Nautique	\$85	\$310	\$1,550
	Crownline	\$75	\$275	\$1,375
Towables	Inner Tube (small)		\$20	\$80
	Inner Tube (large)		\$30	\$120
	Kneeboard		\$25	\$90
	Wakeboard		\$30	\$150
	Hydrosled	\$20	\$50	\$200
	AirChair	\$20	\$75	\$250
	Water Skis (pair)		\$20	\$95
	Demo Skis (pair)		\$25	\$100

2005 Moorage Rates – Shasta Lake Marina

Covered Moorage

8X20	per month	\$160	yearly	\$1430
9X20	per month	\$170	yearly	\$1540
10X20	per month	\$180	yearly	\$1650

Covered Day Cruisers

12X24	per month	\$245	yearly	\$2255
-------	-----------	-------	--------	--------

Covered Cabin Cruisers

15X34	per month	\$305	yearly	\$3025
-------	-----------	-------	--------	--------

Patio Boat Slips

12 ft wide	per month	\$175	yearly	\$1485
------------	-----------	-------	--------	--------

Houseboat Slip

15 ft wide	per month	\$240	yearly	\$2266
20 ft wide	per month	\$300	yearly	\$2915

2005 Other Marina Rates

Sewage Pumpout	\$60 on craft not rented or stationed at the marina
Launch	\$No Launch unless you are member at the marina
Dry Storage	\$No Dry Storage

2. Silverthorn Resort

2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Silverthorn Resort

Silverthorn Queen I Houseboat				
	3 Nights	4 Nights	7 Nights	Addt Nights
October 1 thru May 26	\$1990	\$2590	\$3790	\$650
May 27 thru June 23	\$2690	\$3490	\$5890	\$850
June 24 thru August 25	Week Only		\$6990	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$2690	\$3490	\$5890	\$850
Silverthorn Queen II Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$1690	\$2290	\$3290	\$500
May 27 thru June 23	\$2490	\$3190	\$4990	\$800
June 24 thru August 25	Week Only		\$6190	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$2490	\$3190	\$4990	\$800
Presidential Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$990	\$1290	\$1890	\$300
May 27 thru June 23	\$1690	\$2190	\$3390	\$500
PRE SEASON SPECIAL Boarding Dates: June 24, 25, 26, 27	Week Only		NOW \$3290	N/A
June 28 thru August 25	Week Only		NOW \$3590	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$1690	\$2190	\$3390	\$500
Executive Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$790	\$890	\$1190	\$200
May 27 thru June 23	\$1190	\$1490	\$2190	\$350
PRE SEASON SPECIAL Boarding Dates: June 24, 25, 26, 27	Week Only		NOW \$2090	N/A
June 28 thru August 25	Week Only		NOW \$2390	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$1190	\$1490	\$2190	\$350

2005 Small Boats and Personal Watercraft Rates – Silverthorn Resort

SMALL BOATS			
	4 Hours	8 Hours	Weekly
Malibu Comp. Ski Boat	\$250	\$285	\$1700
Patio Boat	\$100	\$160	\$750
Fishing Boat	\$35	\$50	\$250

Sea Doo Rentals

Hour - \$65

Day - \$285

Week - \$1450

2005 Moorage Rates – Silverthorn Resort

Slip Rental

Houseboats Per Month \$155 or 1 month free on a pre paid year (\$1750).

Ski Boats \$110 per month or \$480 per each 6 months if pre paid

2005 Other Marina Rates

Sewage Pumpout \$60-65 for houseboats

Launch \$FREE

Dry Storage \$None

3. Antlers Resort

2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Antlers Resort

Genesis (with Hot Tub and fireplace) (Sleeps 14)				
	Summer	Spring	Fall	Value
Weekly	\$6795	\$5096	\$5334	\$3907
4 days	\$4077	\$3058	\$3200	\$2405
3 days	\$3567	\$2676	\$2700	\$2069
Super Cruiser (with Hot Tub and fireplace) (sleeps 16)				
Weekly	\$5595	\$3917	\$4056	\$3049
4 days	N/a	\$2434	\$2451	\$1830
3 days	N/a	\$1958	\$2028	\$1525
Ultimate Cruiser (with Hot Tub) (sleeps 15)				
Weekly	\$5395	\$3777	\$3911	\$2940
4 days	\$3237	\$2347	\$2363	\$1764
3 days	\$2698	\$1888	\$1956	\$1470
Ultimate Cruiser (sleeps 15)				
Weekly	\$4995	\$3497	\$3621	\$2722
4 days	n/a	\$2173	\$2188	\$1633
3 days	n/a	\$1748	\$1811	\$1361
Flybridge (Sleeps 14)				
Weekly	\$3880	\$3104	\$3104	\$2018
4 days	\$2328	\$1979	\$1979	\$1211
3 days	\$1940	\$1552	\$1552	\$1086
Deluxe Lakecruiser (Sleeps 12)				
Weekly	\$3360	\$2402	\$2386	\$1848
4 days	\$2016	\$1462	\$1431	\$1109
3 days	\$1680	\$1218	\$1218	\$1008
Executive Cruiser (sleeps 8-10)				
Weekly	\$2950	\$2109	\$2095	\$1623
4 days	N/a	\$1283	\$1257	\$920
3 days	N/a	\$1055	\$1069	\$826

2005 Small Boats and Personal Watercraft Rental Rates – Antlers Resort

Competition Ski Boats	½ Day 4 hours	Daily 10 hours	Weekly 7 full days
Malibu Sportster LX w/tower (20ft, inboard, V8, 8 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Malibu Sportster (20ft, inboard, V8, 6 person)	n/a	\$300	\$1500
Ski Boats			
Glastron (20ft I/O, V8, 10 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Four Winns Horizon LS (19ft, I/O, V8, 9 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Four Winns Horizon (19ft, I/O, V8, 8 person)	n/a	\$355	\$1775
Seaswirl – 180 (18ft, I/O, V6, 6 person)	\$193	\$275	\$1375
Sea Ray Cruiser (18ft, 4 cyl. & V6, 8 person, no bimini)	\$175(4cyl.) \$210 (V6)	\$250(4cyl.) \$300 (V6)	\$1250(4cyl.) \$1500 (V6)
Personal Water Craft			
Sea Doo GTX (155 hp)	n/a	\$325	n/a
Yamaha VX (110 hp)	n/a	\$295	n/a
Patio Boats			
Deluxe Party Cruiser (Restroom and Barbecue)	n/a	\$425	\$2125
Party Cruiser LS (Restroom and Barbecue)	n/a	\$290	\$1450
Deluxe 12 Patio Boat (Restroom and Barbecue)	\$154	\$220	\$1100
Deluxe 10 Patio Boat (Restroom and Barbecue)	\$137	\$195	\$975
Standard Patio Boat	\$105	\$150	\$750
Fishing Boats			
Boat and Motor (14ft, 9.9hp outboard, 5 person, some w/bimini tops)	\$49	\$70	\$350
Canoes			
	\$25	\$40	\$175
Ski Packages			
Ski Package (\$100 deposit required)	\$25	\$25	\$125
Tubes (\$100 deposit required)	\$20	\$20	\$125
Wakeboards (\$300 deposit required)	\$35	\$35	\$175

2005 Moorage Rates – Antlers Resort

Slip Rental	\$200 per month with 3 month minimum
Overnight Slip	\$15.50 per night

2005 Other Marina Rates – Antlers Resort

Sewage Pumpout	Free for Marina boats \$40 for other
----------------	---

In/Out Launch	\$40
In Only	\$25
Out Only	\$25

Dry Storage	None
-------------	------

4. Bridge Bay

2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Bridge Bay



Grand Sierra

Sleeps 13
56' x 15'
Cabin 12' x 35'
Penthouse (8'x14'x5')
Generator & Air Conditioner

Summer –

3day/2night - \$2250

4day/3night - \$2550

7day/6night - \$3050



Summit

Sleeps 10-12
47' x 14'
Cabin 11'6" x 30'
Generator & Air Conditioner
*Dual outboard motors or single
I/O

Summer –

3day/2night – \$1350

4day/3night – \$1800

7day/6night - \$2200

2005 Small Boat Rental Rates – Bridge Bay

	<u>2Hrs.</u>	<u>½ Day/4 Hrs.</u>	<u>1 Day</u>	<u>Week</u>
Commander 150 Ski Boat w/ Tower, Closed Bow	\$110	\$160	\$260	\$1075
20' 150 hp outboard motor Maximum 6 persons				
Same w/o tower	\$90	\$145	\$240	\$1050
Patio Boat	\$60	\$90	\$160	\$740
152 Qt. Ice Chest, No BBQ, 24' 40hp outboard motor Maximum 10 persons				
Fishing Boat	\$26	\$45	\$75	\$250
16' Aluminum V-Hull, 15 hp outboard motor Maximum 5 persons				
Sea-Doo GTI (\$285 Deposit)	\$110	\$160	\$285	NA
10' / 85hp Maximum 2 persons				

2005 Moorage Rates – Bridge Bay

	<u>Monthly</u>	<u>Annual</u>
COVERED MOORAGE		
9 x 22	\$155	No Annual Price Break
10 x 22	\$165	
10 x 26	\$180	
10 x 28	\$190	
11 x 28	\$195	
12 x 28	\$200	

HOUSEBOAT SLIPS

Bow Tie	\$5.25 per foot
Slips with power	\$7.00 per foot
End Tie Slips	\$6.00 per foot
Minimum Moorage	\$200 per month

All include unlimited pumpouts

2005 Other Marina Rates – Bridge Bay

Launch	\$10
Overnight Slip	\$25
Houseboat Launch	\$100
Locker Rental	\$5 per day
Auto Entry Fee	\$5 per day
Annual Park & Launch	\$135
Sewage Pump Out	\$65 for private or non marina rented boats

5. Camanche Reservoir

2005 Rental Boat Rates – Camanche Reservoir

April thru September

Reservations Recommended.		3-5 hours	5+ hours	Deposit
	Motor Boat	\$46.00	\$60.00	\$60.00
	Pontoon Patio Boats (8 passenger)	\$110.00	\$160.00	\$160.00
	Pontoon Patio Boats (12 passenger)	\$125.00	\$185.00	\$190.00
	*Deluxe Motor Boats	\$68.00	\$90.00	\$90.00
	*Deluxe Motor Boats	\$45.00	\$58.00	\$90.00
2005 - Boat Launch & Marina Service Rates Both north and south marinas provide 6 lane launch ramps				
	Daily	Weekly	Monthly	Calendar Year
Boat Launch	\$6.50			\$92.00
Senior Boat Launch				\$46.00
Dry Storage		\$22.00	\$48.00	\$400.00
Mooring Buoy Houseboat Moorage over 30'	\$7.50	\$45.00	\$130.00 \$180.00	\$825.00 \$1025.00
Open Slip	\$13.00	\$78.00	\$168.00	\$935.00
Covered Slip	\$12.00	\$72.00	\$210.00	\$975.00

2005 - Day Uses, Annual Pass Rates and Fishing Fees	
Day use entry fee per vehicle	\$8.00
Annual Pass per vehicle	\$106.00
Car passes for seniors and disabled	\$53.00
Boat entry launch fee	\$6.50
Annual Pass per boat	\$92.00
Boat passes for seniors and disabled	\$46.00

6. Bidwell Canyon

2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Bidwell Canyon Marina

<u>Boat</u>	<u>Wkend 3 nites</u>	<u>Midwk 4 nites</u>	<u>Week 7 nites</u>
10 SLEEPER BOAT	\$1450	1450	2125
10 SLEEPER DELUXE	\$1575	1575	2525
12 SLEEPER DELUXE	\$1925	1925	2925
16 SLEEPER DELUXE	\$2250	2250	3525

2005 Small Boat Rental Rates – Bidwell Canyon Marina

<u>Boat Type</u>	<u>½ Day</u>	<u>Full Day</u>	<u>2 Days</u>
Patio A (30ft.)	\$150	225	400
Patio B (20-28 ft.)	\$90	150	300
Patio C (24ft.)	\$80	130	260

Deposit

Ski Boat - 2003 Bayliner 2050 Capri w/5.0L EFI 260HP Mercury & Tower, Bimini top, seats 6

\$300 500 600 dep

Ski Boat – Astro Open Bow, V-8 engine, 250HP, Tower seats 8

\$300 500 600 dep

Ski Boat – Crownline Open Bow, V-6 190HP, Seats 6

\$250 400 500 dep

Fish Boat – 10HP, 15 Ft. w/rear rudder steering & rope start, seats 4

\$25 40 50 dep

Fish Boat – 40HP, 15 Ft. w/console steering & electric start, seats 4

\$65 100 100 dep

Hourly

Waverunner (PWC) – 2003 FX – 140 Cruiser – 4 stroke – seats 3

\$185 \$275 400 500 dep

**BIDWELL MARINA
2005 MOORING RATES**

Open Moorings – Buoys Annual Contract Rates Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005					
Payment Schedule	Boats Under 45 feet	Boats Under 55 feet	Boats Under 60 feet	Boats Under 65 feet	Boats Under 68 feet
Month	\$172	\$178	\$186	\$210	\$228
Quarter	472	491	513	577	621
Semi-Annual	873	907	947	1066	1148
Annual	1540	1600	1670	1880	2025
Continuous Walkway Two Boats To A Section Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005					
Payment Schedule	Boats Under 55’	Boats Under 60’	Boats Under 65’	Boats Over 65’	
Month	\$190	\$214	\$227	\$268	
Quarter	522	589	625	737	
Semi-Annual	964	1088	1154	1361	
Annual	1700	1920	2035	2400	
Covered Slips Annual Contract Rates Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005					
Payment Schedule	1 st or 800 Row (10X24)	#63 to #83 12X30	500 Row 10’9”X24’	600 Row 12X24	700 Row 9X20
Month	\$186	\$194	\$194	\$201	\$171
Quarter	513	534	534	554	472
Semi-Annual	948	096	986	1024	871
Annual	1672	1739	1739	1805	1537

BIDWELL MARINA 2005 MOORING RATES						
Open Slips Annual			Dry Boat Storage Garage & Outside Storage			
Payment Schedule	All Open Slips		Payment Schedule	Garage #3-10 10X30	Garage #11- 80 (10X24)	Trlr Storage to 35 feet Trlr. Storage over 35 feet
Month	\$160		Month	\$ 98	\$ 87	\$ 56 \$ 63
Quarter	440		Quarter	269	241	155 173
Semi- Annual	814		Semi - Annual	497	445	287 319
Annual	1435		Annual	877	784	506 563
Temporary Contract Term			Covered Slips	Open Slip		
1 night any day/night			\$ 28	\$ 20	Temporary rates are for renters who prefer to rent a slip or buoy for less than a full year	
1 week any 7 consecutive days			125	100		
1 month any 30 consecutive days			300	250		
7 months any 210 consecutive days			1200	1100		

Dry Storage None
Launch Ramp None

Lake Berryessa Marina - The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Lake Berryessa Marina (LBM) fits into the mix of 'Actual Comparables'. As identified earlier this list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed.

Shasta Lake Marina

Silverthorn Resort

Antlers Resort

Bridge Bay

Camanche Reservoir

Bidwell Canyon

LAKE BERRYESSA MARINA

The above list indicates that all six of the comparables when comparatively assessed alongside LBM have an overall higher rating in regards to the combination of available amenities and observed operational conditions. LBM may have been higher in regard to observed condition and rated ahead of at least one or two of the comparables if the overall access and egress to and from the docks were better. The walking surfaces on the LBM docks are good. However, the transition from the shore to the dock and vice versa requires traversing steep steps or uneven ground. Although most users can negotiate this transition it is a challenge for those with disabilities and general mobility problems and impossible if the user requires a wheelchair, walker or scooter. Several of the comparables also have some challenges in this respect but not to the extent as LBM.

LAKE BERRYESSA MARINA 2005 RATES

<u>Activity/Service</u>	<u>2005 Rates</u>	<u>2006 Rate request (9/22/05)</u>
Day Use	\$10	\$15 (+50%)

The 2005 'Day Use' fee is at the high end of the comparables who have similar type rates but is recommended as appropriate providing that it is unlikely to raise over the remaining term of the contract. The increase to \$15 is not supportable or recommended based upon comparability.

Boat Launch	\$15	\$20
-------------	------	------

Based upon comparability the requested increase to \$20 is justified and recommended. Before receipt of this rate request on 9/22/05 LBM indicated a combination 'Launch/Parking Fee' that was \$15 if the user parked the vehicle and trailer outside the resort and \$25 if they parked inside the resort. It is unclear what the intent of the concessionaire is now since this combination was not identified in their request. Since the \$20 fee is approved it is recommended that the difference between inside and outside parking be eliminated and that outside parking only be necessary once inside parking is full. It should also be the responsibility of the concessionaire to monitor and control the outside parking of their customers to assure safety and some level of coordination.

Boat Rentals	SEE BELOW	SEE BELOW
--------------	-----------	-----------

The 'Boat Rental' section of the LBM 2006 rate request is confusing. It appears to have been submitted by the sub-concession (Wet Pleasure) through the concessionaire in a manner that seeks a \$5 per hour increase on all rates up to the all day rate and then a \$25 increase for any all day rates. The following charts for all rental boats have been compiled using that direction as displayed in the LBM 2006 rate request submittal.

<u>Personal Watercraft</u>	<u>2005 Rates</u>	<u>2006 Request</u>	<u>2006 Recom.</u>
1 weekday hour	\$75	\$80	\$80
1 weekend hour	\$85	\$90	\$90
2 weekday hours	\$145	\$155	\$150
2 weekend hours	\$155	\$165	\$160
3 weekday hours	\$215	\$230	\$220
3 weekend hours	\$225	\$240	\$230
4 weekday hours	\$255	\$275	\$260
4 weekend hours	\$265	\$285	\$270
6 weekday hours	\$330	\$360	\$335
6 weekend hours	\$340	\$370	\$345
8 weekday hours	\$400	\$425	\$405
8 weekend hours	\$425	\$450	\$430

Based upon comparability the above rates for 2005/2006 are appropriate for the 1 Hour level only. The rate request from '2Hours' through '8Hours' are too high based upon comparability. The rates shown shaded are the recommended maximum for 2006. None of the comparables have a 6 hour rate but reasonable inferences can be made by reviewing the 4 and 8 hour rates. Some of the comparables all day rate is for 10 hours and not 8 which increases the value.

<u>Ski Boats</u>	<u>2005 Rate</u>	<u>2006 Request</u>	<u>2006 Recom.</u>
<u>Ski Sanger Competition Tow Boats</u>			
1 Weekday Hour	\$ 85	\$ 90	\$90
1 Weekend Hour	95	100	\$100
2 Weekday Hours	155	165	\$160
2 Weekend Hours	175	185	\$180
3 Weekday Hours	220	235	\$225
3 Weekend Hours	250	265	\$255
4 Weekday Hours	285	305	\$290
4 Weekend Hours	325	345	\$330
6 Weekday Hours	390	420	\$395
6 Weekend Hours	465	495	\$470
8 Weekday Hours	440	465	\$445
8 Weekend Hours	525	550	\$530
<u>Open Bow Ski Boats</u>			
1 Weekday Hour	\$110	\$ 115	\$115
1 Weekend Hour	125	130	\$130
2 Weekday Hours	175	185	\$180
2 Weekend Hours	200	210	\$205
3 Weekday Hours	245	260	\$250
3 Weekend Hours	290	315	\$295
4 Weekday Hours	310	330	\$315
4 Weekend Hours	375	395	\$380
6 Weekday Hours	430	460	\$435
6 Weekend Hours	530	560	\$535
8 Weekday Hours	495	520	\$500
8 Weekend Hours	625	650	\$630

The current rates for ski boats are already higher than any of the comparables. The craft at LBM appear to be at the higher performance end among the comparables so a very small increase is recommended for 2006 but not the level of increase requested.

<u>Houseboats</u>	<u>2005</u>	<u>2006 Request</u>	<u>2006 Recom.</u>
35' Pontoon Full Day	\$450	No Change (NC)	\$450
35' Pontoon Weekend	\$1150	NC	\$1150
35' Pontoon All Week	\$2250	NC	\$2250

45' Houseboat Full Day	\$850	NC	\$850
45' Houseboat Weekend	\$1850	NC	\$1850
45' Houseboat All Week	\$3250	NC	\$3250
47' Houseboat Full Day	\$950	NC	\$950
47' Houseboat Weekend	\$2350	NC	\$2350
47' Houseboat All Week	\$3550	NC	\$3550
50' Houseboat Full Day	\$1050	NC	\$1050
50' Houseboat Weekend	\$2650	NC	\$2650
50' Houseboat All Week	\$3850	NC	\$3850
60' Houseboat Full Day	\$1150	NC	\$1150
60' Houseboat Weekend	\$3150	NC	\$3150
60' Houseboat All Week	\$4350	NC	\$4350

All of the above rates as outlined are supportable based upon comparability and are recommended for approval. There are also 'Off Peak' rates provided that are not addressed in this analysis as the concessionaire is permitted to charge anything under the maximum approved rate at any time providing they do not exceed any rates they have printed or made available to the public.

<u>Patio Boats</u>	<u>2005 Rates</u>	<u>2006 Request</u>
1 Weekday Hour	\$ 85	\$ 90
1 Weekend Hour	95	100
2 Weekday Hours	150	160
2 Weekend Hours	165	175
3 Weekday Hours	195	210
3 Weekend Hours	210	225
4 Weekday Hours	265	285
4 Weekend Hours	295	315
6 Weekday Hours	355	385
6 Weekend Hours	435	465
8 Weekday Hours	390	415
8 Weekend Hours	470	495
12 Weekday Hours	490	515
12 Weekend Hours	625	650
24 Weekday Hours	600	625
24 Weekend Hours	640	665

The current rates for patio boats are already much higher than any of the comparables. None of the comparables rent out these boats for any less than ½ day so the rates for 1 and 2 hours might be OK just because of the overhead and being taken out of service. There is no indication that these patio boats are any nicer than those at 'Holiday Harbor' on Shasta Lake which is the highest priced comparable for Patio Boats rents a 47' Patio Boat with a restroom for \$315 for all day (compare to \$470 for

the LBM 8 hour weekend rate). It appears that from the 4 hour through the 24 hour rates that the current level at LBM is approximately 35% higher than supported by comparability.

<u>Fishing Boats</u>	<u>2005 Rates</u>	<u>2006 Request</u>	<u>Recommended</u>
4 Hr Fish Rate	\$70	\$90	Max of \$60 +fuel cost
4 Hr. Non-Fish Rate	\$105	\$125	Incongruous
8 Hr. Fish Rate	\$105	\$130	Max of \$105 +fuel
8 Hr. Non-Fish Rate	\$150	\$175	Incongruous
12 Hr. Fish Rate	\$150	\$175	Max of \$125 +fuel
12 Hr. Non-Fish Rate	\$195	\$220	Incongruous

These rates are very high based upon comparables for only 15HP. There does not seem to be a reasonable justification or reasoning presented for charging significantly more if a renter chooses not to fish and just to boat. Comparables do not note any difference in how a boat is actually used. Recommended rates for fishing boats based upon comparability is \$40-45 for ½ day and \$70-80 for a full day. Fuel would be extra as it likely is now although that is not identified on the rate sheets or on the web site for Lake Berryessa Marina. The concessionaire at Bridge Bay Marina on Lake Shasta offers a nearly identical size and engine for \$45 for ½ day and \$75 for all day. A slight premium of a few dollars might be supportable because of the 4 stroke engine but not to the degree shown in the current rates. The rate request for 2006 identifies an increase which is also not recommended. The rates indicated above in the shaded 'Recommended' column are supported by comparability and still provide a premium for the 4 stroke engine.

<u>Craft</u>	<u>1 Hour</u>	<u>2 Hour</u>	<u>4 Hour</u>	<u>6 Hour</u>	<u>8 Hrs.</u>
Single Kayak	\$10	20	35	40	50
Double Kayak	\$15	25	40	50	60

These rates from the LBM website appear high for the ½ and full day rates but there are not good comparisons amongst the comparables so approval at these rates are recommended providing they remain the same for the remaining years of the contract.

Uncovered Dry Storage = \$30 per month with no requested increase.

This rate is recommended for approval based upon comparability.

SLIP RENTALS

\$640.66 uncovered small slip per year \$743.66 request for 2006

\$826.06 covered small slip per year \$882.71 request for 2006

\$697.31 uncovered large slip per year \$748.81 request for 2006

\$1390.50 covered plus electric large houseboat slip per year
\$1545 Request for 2006

All the above slip rate requests received on September 22, 2005 are appropriate based upon comparability and are recommended for approval.

How this Comparability Analysis was Conducted

This analysis was conducted in compliance with Chapter 7 of Reclamation's 'Concessions Management Guidelines'. Chapter 7 focuses only on the establishing and approval of rates to be charged by Reclamation concessionaires throughout the agency. The direction provided by 'Chapter 7' is nearly a mirror image of the long-term practices and methods utilized by the National Park Service (NPS). The NPS has nearly 700 concessionaires throughout the country and has used this comparability approach for lodging, camping, and marinas (and others) for over 20 years.

The introduction of and requirement to use this specific process for determining comparable rates in Reclamation has occurred since the last rate approval action at Lake Berryessa. It was apparent from written and verbal comments of concessionaires at Lake Berryessa that they were uncomfortable and dissatisfied with previous efforts by Reclamation regarding the approval of their requested rates.

To assure that the new process was properly introduced to Lake Berryessa Reclamation contracted with Mr. Bruce Wadlington who had prior extensive experience with the NPS in actually conducting or overseeing numerous similar comparability studies for that agency. Mr. Wadlington not only had prior experience with the NPS in conducting such studies but he was the key person for that agency in actually developing the approach and implementing it nationwide. He was the primary instructor for the 'Rate Approval Process' for over 15 years in the NPS and during that time taught hundreds of others how to accomplish this type of work. The last 20 years of Mr. Wadlington's NPS career were as follows:

- 1980-1985 Concessions Management Specialist – Yellowstone N.P.
- 1986-1994 Chief of Concessions Management – Grand Canyon N.P.
- 1995-2000 Manager National Concessions Program Center – Denver

In 2000 Mr. Wadlington accepted an offer to assist the Bureau of Reclamation in efforts to upgrade the concessions management program in partial response to the Office of Inspector General's audit that highlighted the need for numerous improvements. He worked for two years out of the Mid Pacific Regional Office on many concession projects throughout Reclamation including Lake Berryessa. Since his retirement in 2002 he has remained involved with Reclamations national program and Lake Berryessa as a contractor providing concessions management expertise. One of the projects he has worked on was the development of the aforementioned 'Concessions Management Guidelines'. Mr. Wadlington's ability, past experience and expertise in concessions management and overall familiarity with Lake Berryessa definitely qualifies him to accomplish this project. This analysis will provide the foundation for concessionaire rate approval not only for 2006 and a guide for future year's efforts.