

Rate Comparability Analysis Putah Creek Resort

**Bureau of Reclamation
Mid-Pacific Region
Solano Project
Lake Berryessa, CA**



Preface to the Putah Creek Resort Comparability Analysis

In completing the comparability study for concession rates for Putah Creek Resort and other concessionaires at Lake Berryessa 58 different properties were visited. These properties encompassed a north/south area from Lake Shasta to Midpines (Yosemite area) and an east/west area from Lake Tahoe to coastal sites north of San Francisco. Data was collected at each location and photographs were taken to assist in the overall display and analysis of information. Of the 58 properties visited 24 of them were areas submitted to Reclamation by Lake Berryessa concessionaires.

Obviously some of the properties visited had more similarities to Lake Berryessa concession operations than others. Some of the properties proved to have little in common with Lake Berryessa operations.

Determining ‘Actual Comparables’ from among the ‘Potential Comparables Visited

To determine objectively which properties among the 58 ‘Potential Comparables’ would be used as ‘Actual Comparables’ they were all rated using a comparability matrix as per Reclamation Concession Management Guidelines. This is the same process utilized by the National Park Service for over 20 years in selecting comparables for similar concession rate approvals in that agency. The matrix was completed using data collected during the on site visits. This process is complex enough that it will be helpful for concessionaires and Reclamation officials reviewing this report to read the following couple of pages that explains how the matrix is completed and used to select the ‘Actual Comparables’. The matrix does not eliminate the need for good judgment and a thorough knowledge of the comparability process.

What is the Comparability Matrix?

The comparability matrix is a table that provides point values expressed as a level of similarity between a particular potential comparable and the concessionaire. The values are determined using the concessionaire’s current operating conditions as the base against which all others are compared. These values are assigned to each of the identified criteria for lodging, marinas, and campgrounds.

Numeric values can be assigned fairly easily to criteria such as number of rooms, percentage of occupancy, and number of boat slips. Assigning values to nominal criteria such as type of area, clientele, and facility characteristics is more problematic and requires judgment and analysis.

How the matrix helps.

Using a matrix provides a balanced procedure for rating similarities among potential comparables and the concessionaire in an unbiased manner. Determining an approved rate is not an exact science; the concessionaire’s rates are appropriate if most customers would expect to pay similar prices for similar services under similar conditions outside the recreation area (easy to say but difficult to determine).

How is the matrix set up and compiled?

The comparability matrix has a dual axis. The business properties measured (including the concessionaire) are listed down the left column. The criteria measured are listed across the top. When completed, this matrix will note the degree of similarity between the concessionaire and the potential comparables. **The matrix does not designate the properties as better or worse, but only shows the degree of similarity.** Quality and value are not analyzed thoroughly until after the selection of actual comparables.

Information on the criteria (lodging [7 criteria], marinas [6 criteria], and campgrounds [5 criteria]), must be collected during visits to all potential comparables visited to ensure a thorough review. These criteria are the only items measured to determine comparability. After the comparables are identified, extra quality features and additional analysis are used to determine final approved rates.

It is critical that the same person(s) evaluate all the properties in the comparability matrix to ensure consistency. The concessionaire is listed first on the matrix and is assigned a value of 10 points for each criterion. This format would result in a total of 70 points for the concessionaire in a lodging matrix because there are seven criteria (7 X 10 = 70). **The total does not signify a level of performance or quality but only similarity of operations compared to the concessionaire.** The qualified person completing the matrix will then determine point spreads for each of the criteria analyzed that reflect the differences between potential comparables. For example, if a concessionaire has 100 guest rooms, a potential comparable should have 95–105 guest rooms, to receive 10 points. A possible rating scenario on the criteria for the number of guest rooms follows:

95-105 rooms	10 points
85-94 and 106-115 rooms	9 points
75-84 and 116-125 rooms	8 points
65-74 and 126-135 rooms	7 points

ETC.

Some criteria may not be as varied and could result either in 10 (the same), 5 (partially the same), or 0 (completely different). The person completing the matrix should strive for consistency supported by knowledge and thoroughness.

This technique is valuable and easy to use because the final point scores for each potential comparable are not important alone—but only in relation to the other potential comparables. The most critical aspect of completing the matrix is maintaining program consistency by ensuring that the same person evaluates all the properties.

The matrix system can seem confusing and complicated at first, but with use, it becomes simple, easy to use, and productive. It contributes to an objective, analytical final rate decision. It brings together many disparate functions of the rate approval process to support operational activities that directly impacts area visitors.

How are ‘Actual Comparables’ selected from the completed matrix?

After the matrix is completed and the points are totaled for each property, the person completing the matrix looks for a natural break in the point spread. All properties above that number will be selected as actual comparables. If a break level is not apparent or provides too few or too many properties, a determination will be made that selects the top scoring properties to be used as the ‘Actual Comparables’. No specific number of comparables is required, but there should never be fewer than three actual comparables selected and normally not more than eight or nine.

In completing the comparability analysis for Putah Creek Resort the number of Actual Comparables’ selected were:

Campground/RV Operations	8 Actual Comparables
Lodging Operations	6 Actual Comparables
Marina Operations	6 Actual Comparables

What happens after the ‘Actual Comparables’ are identified?

After the actual comparables are designated, further analysis considers ‘Extra Quality Features’ (EQF) to determine where the concession fits among the comparable properties and the range of rates. Following this analysis, other factors deemed significant are introduced that help define the comparative quality of the concessionaire’s goods and services. These factors impact the final rates to the user and should not be considered until a rate based on comparability has been determined. Examples of other factors deemed significant could be the cost of housing employees, utility costs above comparability, significant delivery costs above comparability, and additional costs caused by environmental concerns that are not present with the comparables. Such costs may be passed on to the customer, but it is extremely critical that the concessionaire be able to specifically and concretely substantiate them. Additional rates above comparability should never be authorized without written documentation. Sometimes there are operating costs that have risen in the last few years that do not result in increased rates because those same increases are a factor with the ‘Actual Comparables’ and have already been reflected in the comparable rates.

The following pages present the applicable matrixes for Campground/RV, Lodging, and Marina operations in regard to Putah Creek Resort. Immediately following the matrixes is the evaluation of the ‘Extra Quality Features’ of the comparables selected and further analysis of those ‘Actual Comparables’. At the end of each section is the recommendations of the analyst in regard to how the various rates at Putah Creek Resort should be addressed based upon this comparability analysis.

Wheeler’s RV Resort & Campground Guide - Applicability to Lake Berryessa Concessionaire Comparability

After thorough analysis of the 2005 Edition of the Wheeler’s Guide to consider its applicability to Lake Berryessa’s comparability study of its seven resorts, it has been concluded that the Wheeler’s Guide has no merit as a determinant in establishing rates to the public at Lake Berryessa.

The Wheelers Guide does not profess to be anything other than a 'guide'. As such, it provides a basic inventory of RV Parks and Campgrounds. It provides users with general resort information, and attempts to supply an overall quality evaluation through a 'Star' assignment system. It also provides some general rate information for low, mid and upper priced amenities: however, it does not provide direction or determination on what rates should be for these various price levels nor does it provide any specific training or direction on how to determine the number of stars a facility receives. The evaluation and star rating is provided by untrained volunteer users who complete a rating form available in the back of the guide book.

Therefore, while Wheelers does provide direction and steps that result in the gathering and analysis of data for comparable rates, the process utilized in complying with Reclamation concession guidelines for rate approval does not recognize 'Wheelers Guide' as part of the rate approval process.

CAMPGROUND & RV OPERATIONS

CAMPGROUND COMPARIBILITY MATRIX

Putah Creek Resort

	Competition	Seasonality	Occupancy Rate	Similar Size	Site Type	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
PUTAH CREEK CG 112 tent sites 55RV sites – 35 fhu – 20partial 39% Occ 5/30 – Labor Day	10	10	10	10 167 Tot	10 112 Tent 35 FHU 20 Partial	50	BASE Left No.
Coloma Resort (American River) 102 RV 50% w/fh + 50% w/h2O/elect Tent area also	10	9	5+	6	4	34	
Edgewater Resort - (Clearlake) 61RV sites – no excl tent – all w/hu+tv	10	8	4+	3	3	28	
Olema Ranch Campground (Pt. Reyes) 31fhu – 58partial – 175 tent	9	7	6+	3	6	31	
Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe) 35 total – 10 w/fh	10	5	4+	2	6	27	
Funtime RV Park (Clearlake) 60 comb RV/Tent w/fh	10	8	6+	3	4	31	
American River Resort 85 Sites – 35 w/full RV hu's	10	9	7+	5	7	38	1 #1
Anchor Bay Campground (Coast) 29 RV/tent sites – 3 w/fhu	8	6	4+	2	6	26	
Manchester Beach KOA (Coast) 115 tot – 51tent – 36partial – 22full	8	7	4+	7	6	34	
Petaluma KOA 307tot – 124full – 39partial – 144none	8	8	3+	2	7	28	
Placerville KOA 104tot – 44full – 30partial – 30none	8	8	6+	6	6	34	
Sacramento KOA 133tot – 85full – 48w/o phone & TV	8	7	7+	8	6	36	3 #2
Stockton KOA 100 w/fh – 20 tent sites	9	7	4+	7	6	33	
Tahoe KOA 85total – 49full – 36tent w/nohu	10	5	2+	5	6	28	
Willits KOA 32h2O&Elec – 11full – 16tent	9	8	4+	4	6	31	
Yosemite KOA 27full- 20partial – 26tent	9	7	3+	4	7	30	

Snug Harbor (Delta) 28full or partial -	8	7	5+	2	5	27	
Tahoe Pines 17full – 22partial – 90tent	10	5	6+	8	9	38	1 #3
49er RV Ranch (Columbia/Sonora) 35full HU incl TV	9	8	5+	2	4	28	
Collins Lake 150w/hu – 30 tent	8	9	4+	9	5	35	4 #4
Holiday Harbor (Clearlake) 35 full hu	10	8	6+	2	3	29	
Long Ravine CG (Rollins Lake) 12 w/elec – 64 w/o hu (tent)	10	9	4+	5	7	35	4 #5
Orchard Spring Res (Rollins Lake) 90sites – 13w/fhu	10	9	6+	5	6	36	3 #6
Pine Acres (Blue Lake) 29sites – 4w/fh – 21 partial – tent random	10	8	4+	2	5	29	
Scotts Flat Lake 31tent sites – 136RV (+lg group sites) 530-265-5302	8	7	6+	10	4	35	4 #7
Tower Park (Delta) KOA 200 fhu	9	7	5+	8	2	31	
Greenhorn CG (Rollins Lake) 40 sites w/no hu	10	9	6+	3	2	30	
Peninsula Campground (Rollins Lake) 78 sites w/no hu	10	8	7+	5	2	32	
Lake Francis 84 total sites 30 fhu – 17partial – 37 tent	8	9	7+	7	6	37	2 #8
The Narrows Resort (Blue Lake) 15RV sites – all at least partial	10	8	8+	1	3	30	
Delta Bay RV Resort (Delta) 150 RV w/fhu (w, s, e, tv)– no tent area	9	7	5+	9	3	33	
Camanche Reservoir +/-300 tent/RV sites w/o hu 100RV sites w/fhu	8	9	8+	1	6	32	
Emerald Cove (Bullard Bar Reservoir) 56 non hook-up sites – tent or RV	8	8	5+	3	4	32	
Shasta Lake Marina 27 w/fhu	10	9	4+	2	3	28	
Angels Camp RV 32 w/fhu – 16 partial – 14 tent 62 Total	9	8	5+	4	7	33	

Notes on the Preceding Chart – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaire’s camp ground operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

Tot = Total
Hu = Hook-ups
Fhu = Full hook-ups
Elec = Electric
w/o = Without
Excl = Exclusive
h20 = Water

**Extra Quality Features
Lake Berryessa Campgrounds
PUTAH CREEK**

Features (check if present)	PUTAH CREEK		TAHOE PINES	AMERICAN RIVER RESORT	LAKE FRANCIS RESORT	ORCHARD SPRGS RESORT	SACRAMENTO KOA	COLLINS LAKE RESORT	LONG RAVINE CG	SCOTTS FLAT LAKE	
Utility hookups (water, sewer, electric)	55RV Partial & full		P	P	P	L	P	P	L	P	
Trash receptacles											
At site											
Centralized	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Dumping station	Y										
Included in campsite rate	Y		Y-RV	Y	Y	Y-13	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Extra charge											
Showers (Not at CG – Putah)	Y										
Included in campsite rate	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N	
Coin operated										Y	
Partitioned stalls	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Open/common area											
Heated					Y		Y		Y	Y	
Restroom service											
Pit toilets CHEMICAL	Y										
Flush toilets			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Hot and cold water			Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Water											
At individual sites	Y-RV		RV-Y		Y&tent	Y-13	RV-Y	RV-Y		RV-Y	
Scattered hydrants	Y		Y-T	Y		Y	Y-T	Y-T	Y	Y-T	
Central only											

Site Characteristics											
Site seclusion (utmost, moderate, limited)	N		L	M	M	M	L	M	L	U	
Separate area for tents	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Landscaping appropriate for natural	N		N	N	L	L	L	L	N	L	
Type of access											
Rough or gravel road	Poor		Poor	Y				Y			
Paved				Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	

Features (check if present)	PUTAH CREEK		TAHOE PINES	AMERICAN RIVER RESORT	LAKE FRANCIS RESORT	ORCHARD SPRGS RESORT	SACRAMENTO KOA	COLLINS LAKE RESORT	LONG RAVINE CG	SCOTTS FLAT LAKE	
Pull-through for RVs and trailers	N		N	L	Y	L	Y	L	L	Few	
Compliance with ADA requirements	N		N	N	L	L	L	L+	N	Y+	
Lighted areas and paths	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	
Picnic table at site	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	
Fireplace/grill at site	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	
Service Related											
Reservation system	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Public phone available	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Camper s service store	L		L	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Food service	L		N	Y	L	Y	N	N	Y	N	
Gasoline service station	Y		N	N	N	N	N	Y	N	N	
Propane	N		N	N	N	N	Y	Y	N	Y	
24-hour onsite available	N		N	N	N	N	N	N	N	N	
Firewood available	Y		Y	N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y	
Coin laundry available	L--		N	N	Y	N	Y	Y	N	N	
Ice available	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Vending machines	Y		Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	
Interpretative programs	N		N	N	Y	N	N	N	N	N	
Entertainment programs	N		N	N	Y	N	N	N	N	N	
Recreation room	N		N	N	Y	Y	Y	N	N	N	
Swimming pool	N		N	N	Y	Lake	Y	Lake	Lake	Lake	

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties. A few abbreviations used in the above chart and their meanings are as follows:

- P = Partial (in re: to hook ups 'P' denotes that only some of the sites have hook-ups.
- L = Limited (in re: to hook ups 'L' means some sites have limited hook ups.
- Y = Yes
- N = No
- RV = Recreational Vehicle
- CG = Campground
- T = Tent
- M = Moderate
- = Somewhat less or worse
- + = Somewhat more or better
- Lake = Convenient swimming in the lake

Putah Creek Resort – Campground Operations - The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Putah Creek Resort fits into the mix of ‘Actual Comparables’ for campground operations. This list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed among the comparables determined to be most similar to the concessionaire. This list of ‘Actual Comparables’ is not oriented in regards to price but in the level of apparent desirability, i.e., the property listed first is the most desirable and the one listed last is the least desirable within this group. Note that following the name of each property there is a number, i.e., (4th) following Collins Lake. This number corresponds to the ranking on the ‘Comparability Matrix’ a few pages back so the lower the number the more similarity to PUTAH CREEK RESORT.

PROPERTY

RATES

1. Collins Lake (4th)

**\$39 Full hook up, \$33-29 Partial
\$29 Tent – no hook ups**

Collins Lake Resort is a very nice RVPark/CG with great access to Collins Lake for fishing, water skiing, swimming and boating. Camp and RV sites are well designed and laid out and the CG is very family friendly with no tolerance for inappropriate activities. Adjacent to the camping areas they have a very nice formal swimming beach, children’s playground, beach volleyball, etc.

2. Scotts Flat Lake (4th)

**NO Hookups for any sites
\$27 Premium tent site, \$22 Reg. tent site (for 4 occ.)**

Scotts Flat Lake is a campground of nearly 170 sites. Over 130 of them are suitable for RV’s but there are no hook-ups. It is a very nice campground with well developed sites and plenty of shade. It is the most proactive location visited for developing handicapped facilities. It has a fishing pier that is entirely handicapped accessible and several of the restrooms and showers are fully accessible. There are also some group facilities for families or other groups.

3. Lake Francis Resort (2nd)

**\$27 Full, \$25 Water & Elec.
\$23 Lg. Tent Site, \$21 Sm. Tent Site (both H20)**

The Lake Francis Resort RV Park/Campground is not a high end area but appears well run and in good condition. Facilities are a little dated and in some areas need replacement. A very nice feature is the availability of water in an outdoor sink arrangement at each tent campsite. Sites are moderately well distanced or separated from one another.

4. Orchard Springs Res. (3rd)

**\$36 Full hook up – same price all year
\$33 Tent Water Vu, \$29 Reg. Tent Site**

Orchard Springs Resort features fairly typical RV/Campground facilities. They are located in a heavily timbered area that provides good shade to most campsites. They feature a preponderance of tent sites and only 13 RV sites.

5. Long Ravine CG (4th)

**\$29 for limited hookup site all days
\$25 for tent sites all days**

Long Ravine Campground is a moderately nice tenting campground but a fairly inconvenient RV campground. It has 12 partial hook-up sites. All of the sites are in timber and have fairly good shade. Facilities and amenities adjacent to the CG area are minimal. Under the same ownership/management is a nice little marina, store and great formal swimming beach area, all available to the campground users but not without a substantial walk or getting in a vehicle and driving.

**6. Sacramento KOA (3rd) \$45 Full hook up, \$40 Elec. & Water
\$30 Tent w/no hook-up**

The Sacramento KOA was one of the least desirable of the many KOA's visited as part of this project. There were plenty of facilities, i.e., pool, recreation/meeting room, Cable TV as part of hook-up, and general scheduled activities. However, there was not much shade or green or helpful landscaping to make this Sacramento Valley location more appealing. It was not very suitable to summertime outdoor activities. The maximum electric service is 30 amps.

**7. American River CG (1st) \$35 Full RV
\$30 Riverside Tent Wkend, \$25 Wkday
\$25 Reg. Tent Wkend, \$20 Wkday**

The American River CG is mainly used as a staging and overnight area for river running activities on the American River. There are a few awesome camp sites adjacent to the River that are extremely picturesque for either tenters or RV'ers. The main part of the campground is away from the river by 50-100 yards and although well spaced out tends to be dry, dusty and fairly dirty. It is not a CG where users that just wanted a camping experience would frequent.

**8. Tahoe Pines (1st) \$44 Full Hook up, \$43 Elec. & Water, \$41 Elec.
\$34 Tent site.**

Tahoe Pines CG is the best example in this analysis of a property that is not high quality that is still charging a premium rate. The campground does have a lot of greenery and fairly good separation between sites and associated site privacy. The rate appears to be because of the general cost of living and location in the Tahoe area. The campground is also located adjacent to highway 50 so there is a noticeable constant hum during the day.

**** Putah Creek Resort \$25 RV Partial \$28 RV Full
\$23 Tent Camping**

Campsites and RV sites at Putah Creek are near the lake and provide good access to the water for campers. However, the campground is very unattractive and severely impacted. Sites are bare dirt with no wood chips, gravel or other more sanitary or appealing camping surface (The issue of bare dirt and repetitive use is also apparent at some of the comparables visited during this study but there are also operations that make an effort to provide an appealing spot for tents, eating areas and general camp use). The RV section at Putah Creek near the launch ramp is moderately better but still less desirable than the comparables. Support infrastructure for the RV and campground areas is in a degraded condition and in a side-by-side comparison to any of the comparables the camping experience associated with the Putah Creek facilities is poor.

The above list indicates that all eight of the comparables when comparatively assessed alongside Putah Creek Resort rate higher in regards to the combination of available amenities and observed operational conditions.

Other Comparable Notes of Interest – Some of the campground and/or RV properties visited had some special features or adaptations that displayed outstanding thought and concern for their customers. The following is a list of those noteworthy features that may not have been earlier mentioned.

- Camanche Reservoir (Family Camping Area) – A fairly large section of the campground that is signed as “Family Camping – No Alcohol”. This would seem to have outstanding appeal to many camping groups.

- Multiple Properties (Themes) – Many locations, especially the KOA campgrounds, did a good job of having their campground set up with a theme that was carried through in the design and construction of facilities, printed material and even special programs. Theme examples were “Old West” and “Gold Mining”.
- Antlers Resort Campground (Privacy Barriers) – This property did an outstanding job of creating privacy barriers between camp or RV sites with a combination of vegetation and fairly simple fence like structures that seemed to fit in well (see photos).
- Multiple Properties (Screening Unattractive Areas) – Several areas did a good job of hiding or at least dressing up otherwise unattractive areas such as garbage receptacles, propane service and other maintenance or service type facilities. Again Antlers resort was especially good at screening.
- Multiple Properties (Wireless Computer Access) – Several campgrounds have taken the leap to provide an available wireless site on the property. The KOA campgrounds were especially aggressive on this. When tested they seemed to work fine by the compiler of this study.
- Multiple Properties (Swimming Areas) – Many areas associated with water recreation have developed very nice swimming areas at their lakes. The Long Ravine Campground, Collins Lake and Meeks Bay had particularly appealing areas but there were many others who had also made a special effort.
- Collins Lake (Signing) – Collins Lake had a very attractive and aggressive signing program throughout the campground area. Many questions were answered in advance through good signing. All signs were in the same style and professionally constructed.
- Scotts Flat Lake (Accessibility) – Scotts Flat did an outstanding job of going beyond just having nice restroom/shower facilities for the handicapped in the design and construction of a totally accessible pier for fishing or just getting out on the water. It is even more noteworthy that this was done on a fluctuating reservoir.
- Multiple Properties (Daily/Weekly Special Events) – Many areas, especially the KOA properties, have special events such as BBQ’s, pancake breakfasts, entertainment, hayrides, etc. that have only a marginal cost and provide an opportunity for families to meet others and get involved if they wish.
- Multiple Properties (Trails) – Many areas have developed short trails within their properties that either help people go from ‘Point A to Point B’ or have some type of specific destination, i.e., “Fishing Trail at Peninsula Campground (Lake Rollins)”. This type of development is fairly easy to do and provides an added

sense of being in a real camping area or some type of subliminal adventure to many campers who may never have been on a trail in the woods. Most of these trails are no longer than 100 yards to ¼ mile but they add an appropriate touch to the camping experience.

- Greenhorn Campground (Camping Dock) – This facility developed a small deck type structure shared by several tent sites that permitted actual access on the water and a place to sit and read, fish or enjoy the lake.

The preceding list demonstrates some unique efforts made by many of the campgrounds visited during this comparability analysis. These are all things that either add value and or increase the level of experience for campers.

The operation of and facilities for camping and RV public use areas at Putah Creek Resort do not provide any of these or other noteworthy practices that could be identified as a unique positive feature.

**Analysts 2006 Rate Recommendations to Reclamation for Putah Creek Resort
Camping and RV Operations based upon data collected and conditions observed
during compilation of ‘Comparability Analysis’**

The campground at Putah Creek Resort would have to be rated at the bottom of all the campgrounds visited during this analysis. Access to the lake from the campground is good but that is not a factor in the condition of the facilities or in the comparability pricing practices. The individual sites are very small and difficult to distinguish when the campground has many campers. The sites do not offer any meaningful separation or privacy between groups. There is no indication of efforts to create a pleasing and functional campground, i.e., prepared area for tents or vegetative barriers. Campers must use chemical toilets on a full time basis and there are no shower facilities available at the campground. Each of the eight comparables provided normal restrooms and shower facilities.

The recommended rates for this campground based upon comparability are \$18-\$21 based upon double occupancy. This is a lower rate than any of the eight comparables as the camping facilities at Putah Creek Resort are inferior to all of the comparables.

The RV facilities at Putah Creek Resort are of a little higher quality than the campground identified above. The sites are located in two different areas. One area is behind the restaurant building and adjacent to the lake and is the nicer of the two but the associated facilities and infrastructure are not in good repair. Full hook-ups are not available but water and electric are. The other RV area is adjacent but separate from the campground and demonstrates similar conditions as the campground except the sites are better delineated and have a higher level of privacy. The associated facilities are not in good condition.

The recommended rates for these RV sites based upon comparability are \$22-24 for partial hook-ups and \$25-\$28 for full hook-ups based upon double occupancy. This rate is lower than any of the eight comparables and reflects the comparative level of amenities, infrastructure condition and camping experience. Higher rates could be realized if significant improvements were made to the CG/RV sites through better delineation of sites, larger sites, and improvement of support facilities.

These recommended rates take into consideration statements from the comparables that indicated some would have a minor rate increase for 2006 and others not planning on any increase.

The compiler of this comparability study did not receive or see any formal rate request for 2006 from Putah Creek Resort. All of the comments and associated recommendations are in relation to the 2005 rates and maximum acceptable rates based upon comparability.

LODGING OPERATIONS

LODGING COMPARIBILITY MATRIX

Putah Creek

	Competition	Seasonality	Similar Area	Similar Clientele	Occupancy Rate	Facility Characteristics *	Similar Size **	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
L. B. Concessionaires	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	70	BASE
<i>Putah Creek</i> 27 motel rooms 36% Occ 5/30 – Labor Day					36%				Left No.
<i>This lodging matrix only measures comparability for Putah Creek Resort and recognizes the 'Facility Characteristics and Size' that are different at Putah Creek from the other concessionaires at Lake Berryessa.</i>									
Edgewater Resort (Clearlake) 9 cabs	10	7	7	7	7	2	4	44	
Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe) 10 mot – 9 cabs	10	4	4	8	7	5	7	45	
Funtime RV Park (Clearlake) 6 cabs	10	7	7	7	8	2	3	44	
Manchester Beach KOA (Coast) 27 cabs	9	6	5	6	6	2	10	44	
Petaluma KOA 33 cabs	10	6	4	5	7	2	8	42	
Placerville KOA 8 cabs	10	7	4	5	7	2	4	39	
Sacramento KOA	10	6	3	4	7	2	3	35	
Stockton KOA	10	6	3	4	7	2	3	35	
Willits KOA	9	6	5	5	7	2	6	40	
Yosemite KOA (Midpines)	9	6	6	6	6	2	4	39	
Snug Harbor (Delta) 16 cabs	8	6	5	8	7	2	5	41	
Carneros Inn (Napa)	10	7	7	1	6	2	3	36	

B&W Resort Marina (Delta)	9	6	5	7	6	4	6	43	
Collins Lake 2cabs + 4 trailers	8	8	7	7	7	2	3	42	
Pine Acres (Blue Lake) 11 cottages	9	7	7	7	6	3	4	43	
Lodge at Blue Lake 35 rooms +/-	9	7	7	5	6	8	7	49	2 #1
El Grande Clearlake	10	7	7	4	6	4	2	43	
Gold Country Inn (Angels Camp) 40RMS	10	7	6	3	7	6	5	44	
The Gold Lodge (Sonora) 42RMS	10	7	6	3	7	8	5	46	4 #2
Lake Escape Resort (Clearlake) 18 cottages	10	7	7	7	7	2	6	46	4 #3
Northern Queen Inn (Nevada City)	10	7	6	3	7	5	3	41	
Travelodge (Clearlake)	10	7	7	4	7	6	4	45	
Skylark Shores (Clearlake) 40rms + 5cot	10	7	7	7	6	6	3	46	4 #4
Indian Beach Resort (Clearlake) 9 cottages	10	7	7	8	6	2	4	44	
Antlers Resort & Marina (Shasta) 11 cabs	9	8	8	8	6	2	4	45	
Bridge Bay Resort (Shasta) +/- 50-60 rms	9	8	8	7	6	6	4	48	3 #5
Silverthorn Resort (Shasta) 8 cabins	9	8	8	8	6	2	3	44	
Angels Camp RV 5 cabs	10	7	6	6	7	3	4	43	
Camanche Reservoir 18 cott/rms w/K + 4mot	9	8	9	7	7	3	7	50	1 #6

Notes on the Preceding Chart – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaires lodging operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

w/k = With kitchen
mot = Motel
cabs = Cabins
rms = Rooms
cot = Cottage

**Extra Quality Features
Lake Berryessa Overnight Accommodations
PUTAH CREEK**

Features (check if present)	PUTAH CREEK		CAMANACHE RESERVOIR	LODGE AT BLUE LAKE	BRIDGE BAY	GOLD LODGE	LAKE ESCAPE RESORT	SKYLARK SHORES			
Rooms	27		22	35	40	42	18	45			
Individual temperature cont.	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Suites											
Compliance with ADA req.	N		L	L++	L++	N	Y	Y			
Kitchenettes	Y-4		Y	Y	Y	N	L	Y			
Television	N		Y		Y	Y	Y	Y			
Free cable			Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Pay per view movies											
Telephone	N		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Free local calls				Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Vending											
In-room	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Common area	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Swimming pool	N		Lake	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Indoor											
Outdoor Heated				Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Outdoor unheated											
Pool deck and/or patio area			Deck	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Retail facilities	L		L	L	Y	N	N	N			
Restaurant/bar facilities	L*		L	Y	Y	N	N	N			
Cafeteria	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Full-service Dining Room	N		N	Y	Y	N	N	N			
Bar	N		N	Y	Y	N	N	N			
Fireplace in common area	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Designated bus/camper parking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Children's play area	N		C.G.	N	N	N	N	Y			
Recreation room	N		N	N	N	Y	N	N			
Marina	Y		Y	Lake	Y	N	Privat guest use	Privat guest use			
Beach	N		Y	Y	N	N	N	N			
Tennis courts	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Golf privileges	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			

Features (check if present)	PUTAH CREEK		CAMANACHE RESERVOIR	LODGE AT BLUE LAKE	BRIDGE BAY	GOLD LODGE	LAKE ESCAPE RESORT	SKYLARK SHORES			
-----------------------------	-------------	--	---------------------	--------------------	------------	------------	--------------------	----------------	--	--	--

Convenience/Comfort Related

Wall-to-wall carpet in rooms	Y		N	Y	Y	Y-old	Y	Y			
Grade-A furniture	'B'		Y	Y-A+	Y	'B'	Y+	Y			
Bedside lighting controls	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			

Service Related											
Baggage (bell hop)	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Valet parking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Room service	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Entertainment	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Medical assistance/RN on duty	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Audiovisual movies	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Make other reservations	N		N	N	Y	N	N	N			
Rental cars available	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Major credit cards accepted	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Registration office open 24 hours	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
800 number available	Y		Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y			

The above chart is a side by side comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as 'Actual Comparables' in regard to various levels of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

- Y = Yes
- N = No
- L = Limited
- B = Lower Quality than 'A'
- CG = Campground
- Cabs = Cabins
- Micro = Microwave Oven
- Lake = Convenient designated swimming area in the lake
- Guest Use Dock = Not an actual public marina but provides same services to guests

Discussion on Lodging Comparables and How Data is Compared

The following section lists the facilities and rates of the six properties judged to be 'Actual Comparables' for approving Lodging rates for Putah Creek Resort. These properties are listed in the order of their apparent level and quantity of amenities offered. The order was not determined based upon any evaluation of a property's rates, i.e., the property listed first does not necessarily also display the highest prices. However, every thing being equal it is reasonable to assume that the properties higher on the list will have higher rates than those at the end of the list because they have more and/or nicer amenities.

Most comparable properties have and display rates for more than one type of lodging unit or facility. This list represent to the compiler of this 'Comparability Study' the ranking of these six properties based upon actual visitation, observation and evaluation of the collected data. This listing takes into consideration general factors such as overall site appearance including the presence and appearance of landscaping and other support facilities, ease of use and access, apparent maintenance condition of facilities, appearance and conduct of employees, environmental sensitivity and awareness, and of course the type and quality of the various facilities.

Putah Creek Resort is also displayed at the point in the list where it seems to naturally fit in regard to the level of amenities and condition of facilities as compared to the six actual comparables. This information along with some additional comparison of the 'Extra Quality Features', and other rate impacting data provided by the concessionaire (if Reclamation agrees), provides Reclamation the logical reasoning and support data for making a decision on rate approval for Marina services and facilities at Putah Creek Resort.

It may also be helpful for the reviewer of this section to review the 'Extra Quality Features' (lodging) compilation for each of the properties and for Putah Creek Resort and also to review the photographic record provided in the photo section on the available CD.

Putah Creek Resort – Lodging Operations – The list below indicates, based upon on-site review and assessment of the comparability data, where Putah Creek Resort fits into the mix of ‘Actual Comparables’ for Lodging operations. This list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed among the comparables determined to be most similar to the concessionaire.

<u>PROPERTY</u>	<u>RATES</u>
1. Lake Escape Resort (4th)	\$109 - \$279
This resort has 18 separate cottages of varying levels of size and amenities. They feature 8 different rates for ‘Weekdays’ and a corresponding 8 rates for ‘Weekends’. At a minimum all the rooms include a refrigerator, microwave, and coffee maker. Five of the rooms have full kitchens and all but the least expensive room (\$109week & \$139wkend - there are five of these) accommodate 4 guests for the basic price. Rooms also include cable TV and all required bed/bath linens. The least expensive cottage is much nicer and includes significantly more amenities than the motel rooms at Putah Creek Resort.	
2. Skylark Shores (4th)	\$91 - \$139 Mix of Motel Rooms & Suites
This property has 40 motel rooms and 5 cottages. Regular motel rooms range from \$91 to \$106 double occupancy, depending on whether they are adjacent to the lake or not. Suites, some with kitchens, range from \$101 to \$139 depending upon accommodations. All rooms have cable TV, telephones, and air conditioning. The rooms are very nice and spacious and the grounds and immediate landscaping are extremely attractive. In all respects these rooms and the associated amenities are better than those available at Putah Creek Resort.	
3. The Lodge at Blue Lake (2nd)	\$85 - \$125 Motel Rms. For 2 + \$5 xtra person
The Lodge at Blue Lake is under new management and is in the process of renovation. All the rooms are completed and work has begun on the landscaping and external facilities. Regular motel rooms are extremely well appointed with very hi quality furniture upgrades and are either \$85 (parking lot side) or \$99 (lakeside). There are also a Jacuzzi Suite and a Kitchenette Suite for \$125 each. Each room has satellite TV. It is likely that once the upgrades to the grounds and exterior facilities are complete that the rates will rise slightly. In all respects these rooms and the associated amenities are better than those available at Putah Creek Resort.	
4. Camanche Reservoir (1st)	\$64-83Motel & \$126 Housekeeping Cottage
This resort has 18 cottages and 4 motel rooms. The motel rooms with twin beds are \$64 and those with Kings are \$83 and both rates are based upon double occupancy. The housekeeping cottages at \$126 are for 4 people and include kitchens and cable TV. They are all very nice with lake views, very attractive landscaping, and convenient porches for relaxing and enjoying the view.	
5. Bridge Bay Resort (3rd)	\$103 - \$165 Various Motel Rms. + \$10 xtra pers.
This location has 40 motel rooms with various levels of amenities. The standard room is \$103 double occupancy. These rooms are well appointed and comfortable. There are also some kitchen suites from \$135 to \$145 for 4 persons. The area around the motel is well landscaped and also features individual BBQ areas for some of the rooms. Televisions and telephones are standard.	
6. The Gold Lodge (4th)	\$49 - \$89 Various Motel Rms. + \$9 xtra person
The Gold Lodge is similarly appointed as the Putah Creek Resort motel. The grounds and parking area are nicer at the Gold Lodge. The rates are initially based upon single occupancy. One person midweek is \$49 and two are \$58 for the least expensive room. Weekend for the same room is \$59 and \$68. Rooms with a Kitchenette are \$79 and \$89 for one and two people respectively. The Gold Lodge is ‘One Diamond’ rated by AAA, the lowest rating given.	

****Putah Creek Resort**

\$ 66.15 Single \$77.80 Single Weekend
\$ 80.40 Double \$94.60 Double Weekend
\$104.75 Kitchenette \$123.23 Kitch. Weekend

The interior of the motel rooms offered at Putah Creek Resort would probably be considered at about the 'One Diamond' rating by 'AAA' as they are moderately well appointed and comfortable. However, the exterior of the building and associated lack of landscaping is very unattractive and far below the condition observed in side-by-side comparisons with the comparables visited.

This analysis is based upon the on-site visitation, collection, and review of all the collected information from the six properties selected as actual comparables for Putah Creek Resort's motel lodging operation. All six actual comparables provide facilities, services, and amenities that deliver an overall better value in 'side by side' comparisons with the concessionaire. See the photos on the following page for examples of the exterior of the front of the Putah Creek Resort Motel and the front of 'The Gold Lodge' in Sonora, which was the overall lowest priced lodging comparable for Putah Creek.

External view of the front of the Putah Creek Resort Motel



Front of "The Gold Lodge" (Sonora) the lowest rated actual comparable.



Analysts 2006 Rate Recommendations to Reclamation for Putah Creek Resort Lodging Operations based upon data collected and conditions observed during compilation of 'Comparability Analysis'

The motel facilities at Putah Creek Resort are marginally adequate. The interior of the room's are OK with some cosmetic and minor maintenance needs present. The external condition and appearance is very poor and much below the combined appearance of all the comparable properties visited. The grounds and associated facilities and infrastructure are very unattractive.

The recommended rates for this motel based upon comparability of the properties visited are \$55-\$60 (Double Occupancy) for the standard rooms and \$90-\$95 (for 4 persons) for the rooms with kitchens. This pricing takes into consideration a very small combined increase in rates for the comparables. Some of the comparables indicated they might have a minor rate increase and some of them indicated no planned increase.

These recommended rates take into consideration statements from the comparables that indicated some would have a minor rate increase for 2006 and others not planning on any increase.

The compiler of this comparability study did not receive or see any formal rate request for 2006 from Putah Creek Resort. All of the comments and associated recommendations are in relation to the 2005 rates and maximum acceptable rates based upon comparability.

MARINA OPERATIONS

MARINA COMPARIBILITY MATRIX

Putah Creek

	Competition	Seasonality	Similar Area	Similar Clientele	Similarity of Operations	Construction Characteristics	Comparability TOTAL	Comparability RANKING
L. B. Concessionaire Putah Creek 100 slips – 26covered 96% occ. 5/30- Labor	10	10	10	10	10 size repair util. Sec/prot. Dry storage Transient use Boat rental	10 open foam no util +/-20 yr old	60	BASE Left No.
Edgewater Resort (Clearlake)	10	7	7	6	3	3	36	
Lakeside Marina (Tahoe)	10	4	4	8	8	3	37	
Meeks Bay Marina (Tahoe)	10	4	4	7	5	3	33	
Obexters Marina (Tahoe)	10	4	4	7	5	3	34	
Funtime RV Park (Clearlake)	10	7	7	6	4	3	37	
Snug Harbor (Delta)	10	6	3	8	6	3	36	
B&W Resort Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	8	6	3	36	
Collins Lake	7	8	7	7	5	8	42	
Holiday Harbor (Clearlake)	10	7	7	8	6	3	41	
Long Ravine CG (Rollins Lake)	10	7	7	7	7	8	46	
Orchard Spring Resort (Rollins Lake)	10	7	7	7	6	8	45	

Scotts Flat Lake	7	7	7	6	5	5	37	
Tower Park Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	8	6	3	36	
Greenhorn CG (Rollins Lake)	10	7	7	7	7	8	46	
Lake Francis	7	7	7	5	4	3	33	
Delta Bay RV Resort (Delta)	10	6	3	7	6	3	35	
Willow Berm Marina (Delta)	10	6	3	6	5	3	33	
Emerald Cove (Bullards Bar Res.)	7	7	7	7	7	8	43	
Bidwell Canyon Marina (Lake Oroville)	9	8	8	9	6	8	48	3 #1
Camanche Reservoir	8	8	9	8	8	8	49	2 #2
Antlers Resort & Mar. (Shasta)	10	8	8	9	7	8	50	1 #3
Bridge Bay Resort (Shasta)	10	8	8	8	7	8	49	2 #4
Shasta Lake Marina	10	8	8	9	7	8	50	1 #5
Silverthorn Resort (Shasta)	10	8	8	8	7	8	49	2 #6
Tahoe Keys Marina	10	4	4	8	7	3	36	

Notes on the Preceding Chart – The preceding chart evaluates the similarity of potential comparables visited to the concessionaire’s marina operations. Those properties that are shaded have been selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ and are further evaluated in the following pages. The column on the farthest right contains two numbers. The first shaded number indicates the ranking level of comparability as compared to the concessionaire. The second number (un-shaded) simply denotes in chronological order how many properties there are that were selected.

**Extra Quality Features
Lake Berryessa - Marina Facilities
PUTAH CREEK RESORT**

Features (check if present)	PUTAH CREEK RESORT		BIDWELL CANYON	ANTLERS RESORT	SHASTA LAKE MARINA	BRIDGE BAY	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANCHE RESERVOIR			
Hotel/motel (Lodging)	Y		N	Y	N	Y	Y	Y			
Restaurant and/or bar	L*		Y	N	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Groceries	Y		L	Y	Y	Y	L	Y			
Adequate water depth for draft of boats	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Secure boat tieup system	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fuel dock and other fuels, i.e., propane	L*		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fire protection water and equipment	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dock utilities (H2O, elec, TV, phone)	N		N	N	N	Y	N	N			
Avail. and conven. of parking lot	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dock boxes and carts	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	N			
Dinghy racks and boat storage	N		N	N	N	N	N	Y			
Restroom, showers, and laundry	Shore		REST	REST	REST	REST	REST	shore			
Ice and other vending machines	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fish cleaning station	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Parts and accessories store	L		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	L			
Landscaping	N		N	N	L	L	N	L			
Picnic, swim pool, tennis areas	Pic		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Recreation or lounge area	N		lounge	shore	shore	Shore	Shore	Shore			
Posted marina rules	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Boat haul-out facilities	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Repair/maintenance (mechanical, hull, rigging, etc.)	N		L	L	L	L	L	N			
Transient berths/moorings	N		N	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Dry storage	N		N	N	N	N	N	Y			
Trailer parking	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Compliance with ADA Requirements	N		N	N	N	N	N	L			
Sewage pumpout station	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Marine VHF monitoring	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Dock hands to assist in docking	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			

Features (check if present)	PUTAH CREEK RESORT		BIDWELL CANYON	ANTLERS RESORT	SHASTA LAKE MARINA	BRIDGE BAY	SILVERTHORN RESORT	CAMANICHE RESERVOIR			
Weather information	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Book/VCR library	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Charter boat operation	N		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Camping	Y		N	Y	Y	N	N	Y			
Swimming	Y		N	N	N	N	N	N			
Water skiing	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fishing	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Beach rentals and/or water toys	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	N	N			
Boat rentals	N		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			
Fishing equipment	Y		Y	Y	Y	Y	Y	Y			

*Restaurant and Bar – (Putah Creek) This is only open intermittently and not every day.

*Fuel Dock & Propane – No (Putah Creek) fuel dock but propane is available on site. Marine fuel is available on land

The above chart is a ‘side by side’ comparison of the concessionaire to those properties selected as ‘Actual Comparables’ in regard to various level of facilities, services and amenities. This chart helps measure the apparent value among different properties.

There are a few abbreviations used in the above chart and they and their meanings are as follows:

- Y = Yes
- N = No
- L = Limited

Restrooms/Shower/Laundry = In this section the notes refer to where the service is located or what the extent of the service is, i.e., ‘REST’ means a restroom on the dock and ‘shore’ means the services are provided on shore but not on the dock.

Shore = This refers to the identified services or facilities being available on shore but not on the floating marina.

Discussion on Marina Comparables and How Data is Compared

The following several pages lists the services, facilities and rates of the six properties judged to be 'Actual Comparables' for approving Marina rates for Putah Creek Resort. These properties are listed in the order of their apparent level and quantity of amenities offered. The order is not intended to reflect the corresponding level of their rates, i.e., the property listed first does not necessarily also display the highest prices. However, every thing being equal it is reasonable to assume that the properties higher on the list will have higher rates than those at the end of the list. Each property has numerous different rates for a wide variety of rental craft and for other services and facilities. The list represents to the compiler of this 'Comparability Study' the ranking of these six properties based upon actual observation during site visits and evaluation of the collected data. This listing takes into consideration general factors such as overall site appearance including the appearance of land based facilities support facilities, ease of use and access, apparent maintenance condition of facilities, appearance and conduct of employees, environmental sensitivity and awareness, and of course the type and quality of the various facilities.

At the end of the comparables data the same data is also presented for Putah Creek Resort and a conclusion is reached as to where among these 'Actual Comparables' the similar products at Putah Creek Resort would fit in relation to a similar assessment of their level of marina amenities and general factors as compared to the properties on the list. This information along with some additional comparison of the 'Extra Quality Features', and other rate impacting data provided by the concessionaire (if Reclamation agrees), provides Reclamation the logical reasoning and support data for making a decision on rate approval for Marina services and facilities at Putah Creek Resort.

It may also be helpful for the reviewer of this section to review the 'Extra Quality Features' compilation for each of the properties and for Putah Creek Resort and also to review the photographic record provided in the hard copy of this report and the expanded photo section on the available CD.

Marina Comparability Approx. Amenity Level (Hi to Lo) and Base Rates

1. Shasta Lake Marina

2005 Houseboat Rental Information – Shasta Lake Marina

			2- night	3- night	4- night	5- night	6- night	Weekly
Diplomat Sleeps 6 (37' x 14')		Off Season	\$425	\$585	\$655	\$815	\$980	\$1140
		Value Week	\$895	\$1040	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1460
		Summer	\$1055	\$1160	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1730
Monarch Sleeps 10 (47' x 14')		Off Season	\$480	\$675	\$745	\$930	\$1115	\$1300
		Value Week	\$945	\$1055	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1575
		Summer	\$1085	\$1180	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1825
Premiere Sleeps 10 (50' x 14')		Off Season	\$505	\$740	\$840	\$1050	\$1260	\$1470
		Value Week	\$1065	\$1235	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1830
		Summer	\$1265	\$1435	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2155
Ambassador Sleeps 8 (53' x 15')		Off Season	\$560	\$800	\$890	\$1110	\$1335	\$1555
		Value Week	\$1245	\$1405	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$1935
		Summer	\$1445	\$1570	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2385
Marquis Sleeps 12 (53' x 15')		Off Season	\$630	\$880	\$990	\$1235	\$1485	\$1730
		Value Week	\$1325	\$1605	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2290
		Summer	\$1570	\$1690	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$2890
Empress Sleeps 16 (56' x 15')		Off Season	N/A	\$1275	\$1505	\$1880	\$2255	\$2630
		Value Week	\$2275	\$2440	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$3660
		Summer	\$2390	\$2545	N/A	N/A	N/A	\$4565

Small Rental Boats 2005 Rates – Shasta Lake Marina

		hour	day	deposit
Fishing Boats	Boat Only	\$6	\$29	\$145
	10 HP	\$12	\$52	\$260
	25 HP	\$17	\$75	\$375
Patio Boats	Party Barge Patio Boat	\$35	\$150	\$750
	47' Party Cruiser	\$85	\$315	\$1,575
Personal Water Craft	Sea Doo 3 Person	\$85	\$275	\$1,375
Ski Boats	Ski Nautique	\$85	\$310	\$1,550
	Crownline	\$75	\$275	\$1,375
Towables	Inner Tube (small)	\$20	\$80	
	Inner Tube (large)	\$30	\$120	
	Kneeboard	\$25	\$90	
	Wakeboard	\$30	\$150	
	Hydrosled	\$20	\$50	\$200
	AirChair	\$20	\$75	\$250
	Water Skis (pair)	\$20	\$95	
Demo Skis (pair)	\$25	\$100		

2005 Moorage Rates – Shasta Lake Marina

Covered Moorage

8X20	per month \$160	yearly \$1430
9X20	per month \$170	yearly \$1540
10X20	per month \$180	yearly \$1650

Covered Day Cruisers

12X24	per month \$245	yearly \$2255
-------	-----------------	---------------

Covered Cabin Cruisers

15X34	per month \$305	yearly \$3025
-------	-----------------	---------------

Patio Boat Slips

12 ft wide	per month \$175	yearly \$1485
------------	-----------------	---------------

Houseboat Slip

15 ft wide	per month \$240	yearly \$2266
20 ft wide	per month \$300	yearly \$2915

2005 Other Marina Rates

Sewage Pumpout	\$60 on craft not rented or stationed at the marina
Launch	\$No Launch unless you are member at the marina
Dry Storage	\$No Dry Storage

2. Silverthorn Resort

2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Silverthorn Resort

Silverthorn Queen I Houseboat				
	3 Nights	4 Nights	7 Nights	Addt Nights
October 1 thru May 26	\$1990	\$2590	\$3790	\$650
May 27 thru June 23	\$2690	\$3490	\$5890	\$850
June 24 thru August 25	Week Only		\$6990	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$2690	\$3490	\$5890	\$850

Silverthorn Queen II Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$1690	\$2290	\$3290	\$500
May 27 thru June 23	\$2490	\$3190	\$4990	\$800
June 24 thru August 25	Week Only		\$6190	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$2490	\$3190	\$4990	\$800

Presidential Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$990	\$1290	\$1890	\$300
May 27 thru June 23	\$1690	\$2190	\$3390	\$500
PRE SEASON SPECIAL Boarding Dates: June 24, 25, 26, 27	Week Only		NOW \$3290	N/A
June 28 thru August 25	Week Only		NOW \$3590	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$1690	\$2190	\$3390	\$500

Executive Houseboat				
October 1 thru May 26	\$790	\$890	\$1190	\$200
May 27 thru June 23	\$1190	\$1490	\$2190	\$350
PRE SEASON SPECIAL Boarding Dates: June 24, 25, 26, 27	Week Only		NOW \$2090	N/A
June 28 thru August 25	Week Only		NOW \$2390	N/A
August 26 thru September 30	\$1190	\$1490	\$2190	\$350

2005 Small Boats and Personal Watercraft Rates – Silverthorn Resort

SMALL BOATS			
	4 Hours	8 Hours	Weekly
Malibu Comp. Ski Boat	\$250	\$285	\$1700
Patio Boat	\$100	\$160	\$750
Fishing Boat	\$35	\$50	\$250

Sea Doo Rentals

Hour - \$65

Day - \$285

Week - \$1450

2005 Moorage Rates – Silverthorn Resort

Slip Rental

Houseboats Per Month \$155 or 1 month free on a pre paid year (\$1750).

Ski Boats \$110 per month or \$480 per each 6 months if pre paid

2005 Other Marina Rates

Sewage Pumpout \$60-65 for houseboats

Launch \$FREE

Dry Storage \$None

3. Antlers Resort

2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Antlers Resort

Genesis (with Hot Tub and fireplace) (Sleeps 14)				
	Summer	Spring	Fall	Value
Weekly	\$6795	\$5096	\$5334	\$3907
4 days	\$4077	\$3058	\$3200	\$2405
3 days	\$3567	\$2676	\$2700	\$2069
Super Cruiser (with Hot Tub and fireplace) (sleeps 16)				
Weekly	\$5595	\$3917	\$4056	\$3049
4 days	N/a	\$2434	\$2451	\$1830
3 days	N/a	\$1958	\$2028	\$1525
Ultimate Cruiser (with Hot Tub) (sleeps 15)				
Weekly	\$5395	\$3777	\$3911	\$2940
4 days	\$3237	\$2347	\$2363	\$1764
3 days	\$2698	\$1888	\$1956	\$1470
Ultimate Cruiser (sleeps 15)				
Weekly	\$4995	\$3497	\$3621	\$2722
4 days	n/a	\$2173	\$2188	\$1633
3 days	n/a	\$1748	\$1811	\$1361
Flybridge (Sleeps 14)				
Weekly	\$3880	\$3104	\$3104	\$2018
4 days	\$2328	\$1979	\$1979	\$1211
3 days	\$1940	\$1552	\$1552	\$1086
Deluxe Lakecruiser (Sleeps 12)				
Weekly	\$3360	\$2402	\$2386	\$1848
4 days	\$2016	\$1462	\$1431	\$1109
3 days	\$1680	\$1218	\$1218	\$1008
Executive Cruiser (sleeps 8-10)				
Weekly	\$2950	\$2109	\$2095	\$1623
4 days	N/a	\$1283	\$1257	\$920
3 days	N/a	\$1055	\$1069	\$826

2005 Small Boats and Personal Watercraft Rental Rates – Antlers Resort

Competition Ski Boats	½ Day 4 hours	Daily 10 hours	Weekly 7 full days
Malibu Sportster LX w/tower (20ft, inboard, V8, 8 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Malibu Sportster (20ft, inboard, V8, 6 person)	n/a	\$300	\$1500
Ski Boats			
Glastron (20ft I/O, V8, 10 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Four Winns Horizon LS (19ft, I/O, V8, 9 person)	n/a	\$395	\$1975
Four Winns Horizon (19ft, I/O, V8, 8 person)	n/a	\$355	\$1775
Seaswirl - 180 (18ft, I/O, V6, 6 person)	\$193	\$275	\$1375
Sea Ray Cruiser (18ft, 4 cyl. & V6, 8 person, no bimini)	\$175(4cyl.) \$210 (V6)	\$250(4cyl.) \$300 (V6)	\$1250(4cyl.) \$1500 (V6)
Personal Water Craft			
Sea Doo GTX (155 hp)	n/a	\$325	n/a
Yamaha VX (110 hp)	n/a	\$295	n/a
Patio Boats			
Deluxe Party Cruiser (Restroom and Barbecue)	n/a	\$425	\$2125
Party Cruiser LS (Restroom and Barbecue)	n/a	\$290	\$1450
Deluxe 12 Patio Boat (Restroom and Barbecue)	\$154	\$220	\$1100
Deluxe 10 Patio Boat (Restroom and Barbecue)	\$137	\$195	\$975
Standard Patio Boat	\$105	\$150	\$750
Fishing Boats			
Boat and Motor (14ft, 9.9hp outboard, 5 person, some w/bimini tops)	\$49	\$70	\$350
Canoes			
	\$25	\$40	\$175
Ski Packages			
Ski Package (\$100 deposit required)	\$25	\$25	\$125
Tubes (\$100 deposit required)	\$20	\$20	\$125
Wakeboards (\$300 deposit required)	\$35	\$35	\$175

2005 Moorage Rates – Antlers Resort

Slip Rental	\$200 per month with 3 month minimum
Overnight Slip	\$15.50 per night

2005 Other Marina Rates – Antlers Resort

Sewage Pumpout	Free for Marina boats \$40 for other
----------------	---

In/Out Launch	\$40
In Only	\$25
Out Only	\$25

Dry Storage	None
-------------	------

4. Bridge Bay

2005 Houseboat Rental Rates – Bridge Bay



Grand Sierra
 Sleeps 13
 56' x 15'
 Cabin 12' x 35'
 Penthouse (8'x14'x5')
 Generator & Air Conditioner

Summer –
3day/2night - \$2250
4day/3night - \$2550
7day/6night - \$3050



Summit
 Sleeps 10-12
 47' x 14'
 Cabin 11'6" x 30'
 Generator & Air Conditioner
 *Dual outboard motors or single I/O

Summer –
3day/2night – \$1350
4day/3night – \$1800
7day/6night - \$2200

2005 Small Boat Rental Rates – Bridge Bay

	<u>2Hrs.</u>	<u>1/2 Day/4 Hrs.</u>	<u>1 Day</u>	<u>Week</u>
Commander 150 Ski Boat w/ Tower, Closed Bow 20' 150 hp outboard motor Maximum 6 persons	\$110	\$160	\$260	\$1075
Same w/o tower	\$90	\$145	\$240	\$1050
Patio Boat 152 Qt. Ice Chest, No BBQ, 24' 40hp outboard motor Maximum 10 persons	\$60	\$90	\$160	\$740
Fishing Boat 16' Aluminum V-Hull, 15 hp outboard motor Maximum 5 persons	\$26	\$45	\$75	\$250
Sea-Doo GTI (\$285 Deposit) 10' / 85hp Maximum 2 persons		\$110	\$160	\$285 NA

2005 Moorage Rates – Bridge Bay

	<u>Monthly</u>	<u>Annual</u>
COVERED MOORAGE		
9 x 22	\$155	No Annual Price Break
10 x 22	\$165	
10 x 26	\$180	
10 x 28	\$190	
11 x 28	\$195	
12 x 28	\$200	

HOUSEBOAT SLIPS

Bow Tie	\$5.25 per foot
Slips with power	\$7.00 per foot
End Tie Slips	\$6.00 per foot
Minimum Moorage	\$200 per month

All include unlimited pumpouts

2005 Other Marina Rates – Bridge Bay

Launch	\$10
Overnight Slip	\$25
Houseboat Launch	\$100
Locker Rental	\$5 per day
Auto Entry Fee	\$5 per day
Annual Park & Launch	\$135
Sewage Pump Out	\$65 for private or non marina rented boats

5. Camanche Reservoir

2005 Rental Boat Rates – Camanche Reservoir

April thru September

Reservations Recommended.		3-5 hours	5+ hours	Deposit
	Motor Boat	\$46.00	\$60.00	\$60.00
	Pontoon Patio Boats (8 passenger)	\$110.00	\$160.00	\$160.00
	Pontoon Patio Boats (12 passenger)	\$125.00	\$185.00	\$190.00
	*Deluxe Motor Boats	\$68.00	\$90.00	\$90.00
	*Deluxe Motor Boats	\$45.00	\$58.00	\$90.00
2005 - Boat Launch & Marina Service Rates Both north and south marinas provide 6 lane launch ramps				
	Daily	Weekly	Monthly	Calendar Year
Boat Launch	\$6.50			\$92.00
Senior Boat Launch				\$46.00
Dry Storage		\$22.00	\$48.00	\$400.00
Mooring Buoy Houseboat Moorage over 30'	\$7.50	\$45.00	\$130.00 \$180.00	\$825.00 \$1025.00
Open Slip	\$13.00	\$78.00	\$168.00	\$935.00
Covered Slip	\$12.00	\$72.00	\$210.00	\$975.00

2005 - Day Uses, Annual Pass Rates and Fishing Fees	
Day use entry fee per vehicle	\$8.00
Annual Pass per vehicle	\$106.00
Car passes for seniors and disabled	\$53.00
Boat entry launch fee	\$6.50
Annual Pass per boat	\$92.00
Boat passes for seniors and disabled	\$46.00

**BIDWELL MARINA
2005 MOORING RATES**

Open Moorings – Buoys Annual Contract Rates Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005					
Payment Schedule	Boats Under 45 feet	Boats Under 55 feet	Boats Under 60 feet	Boats Under 65 feet	Boats Under 68 feet
Month	\$172	\$178	\$186	\$210	\$228
Quarter	472	491	513	577	621
Semi-Annual	873	907	947	1066	1148
Annual	1540	1600	1670	1880	2025
Continuous Walkway Two Boats To A Section Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005					
Payment Schedule	Boats Under 55'	Boats Under 60'	Boats Under 65'	Boats Over 65'	
Month	\$190	\$214	\$227	\$268	
Quarter	522	589	625	737	
Semi-Annual	964	1088	1154	1361	
Annual	1700	1920	2035	2400	
Covered Slips Annual Contract Rates Dec. 1, 2004 – Dec. 1, 2005					
Payment Schedule	1 st or 800 Row (10X24)	#63 to #83 12X30	500 Row 10'9"X24'	600 Row 12X24	700 Row 9X20
Month	\$186	\$194	\$194	\$201	\$171
Quarter	513	534	534	554	472
Semi-Annual	948	096	986	1024	871
Annual	1672	1739	1739	1805	1537

**BIDWELL MARINA
2005 MOORING RATES**

Open Slips Annual		Dry Boat Storage Garage & Outside Storage				
Payment Schedule	All Open Slips	Payment Schedule	Garage #3-10 10X30	Garage #11-80 (10X24)	Trlr Storage to 35 feet	Trlr. Storage over 35 feet
Month	\$160	Month	\$ 98	\$ 87	\$ 56	\$ 63
Quarter	440	Quarter	269	241	155	173
Semi - Annual	814	Semi - Annual	497	445	287	319
Annual	1435	Annual	877	784	506	563
Temporary Contract Term Covered Slips Open Slip						
1 night any day/night			\$ 28	\$ 20	Temporary rates are for renters who prefer to rent a slip or buoy for less than a full year	
1 week any 7 consecutive days			125	100		
1 month any 30 consecutive days			300	250		
7 months any 210 consecutive days			1200	1100		

Dry Storage None
Launch Ramp None

Putah Creek Resort - The list below indicates, based upon review and assessment of the comparability data, where Putah Creek fits into the mix of 'Actual Comparables'. As identified earlier this list is in the approximate order of the combination of overall amenities provided and general operational condition observed.

Shasta Lake Marina

Silverthorn Resort

Antlers Resort

Bridge Bay

Camanche Reservoir

Bidwell Canyon

PUTAH CREEK RESORT

The above list indicates that all of the comparables when comparatively assessed alongside Putah Creek have an overall higher rating in regards to the combination of available amenities and observed operational conditions. Putah Creek really does not have a fully functioning marina operation beyond the effort to permit boat launches and rental of some boat slips. The general condition of floating facilities is fair to poor with all of the docks being fairly old and all with environmentally insensitive open foam flotation that add to the Styrofoam debris on the lake caused by material break-up in winds and general use deterioration.

Current Putah Creek Resort Marina Rates

8' wide/uncovered: \$435 for 6 months/\$675 for 1 year

uncovered pontoon: \$500 for 6 months/\$750 a year

covered/8' wide: \$850 a year

All these slip rates are appropriate based upon comparability and are recommended for approval.

The compiler of this comparability study did not receive or see any formal rate request for 2006 from Putah Creek Resort. All of the comments and associated recommendations are in relation to the 2005 rates and maximum acceptable rates based upon comparability.

How this Comparability Analysis was Conducted

This analysis was conducted in compliance with Chapter 7 of Reclamation's 'Concessions Management Guidelines'. Chapter 7 focuses only on the establishing and approval of rates to be charged by Reclamation concessionaires throughout the agency. The direction provided by 'Chapter 7' is nearly a mirror image of the long-term practices and methods utilized by the National Park Service (NPS). The NPS has nearly 700 concessionaires throughout the country and has used this comparability approach for lodging, camping, and marinas (and others) for over 20 years.

The introduction of and requirement to use this specific process for determining comparable rates in Reclamation has occurred since the last rate approval action at Lake Berryessa. It was apparent from written and verbal comments of concessionaires at Lake Berryessa that they were uncomfortable and dissatisfied with previous efforts by Reclamation regarding the approval of their requested rates.

To assure that the new process was properly introduced to Lake Berryessa Reclamation contracted with Mr. Bruce Wadlington who had prior extensive experience with the NPS in actually conducting or overseeing numerous similar comparability studies for that agency. Mr. Wadlington not only had prior experience with the NPS in conducting such studies but he was the key person for that agency in actually developing the approach and implementing it nationwide. He was the primary instructor for the 'Rate Approval Process' for over 15 years in the NPS and during that time taught hundreds of others how to accomplish this type of work. The last 20 years of Mr. Wadlington's NPS career were as follows:

- 1980-1985 Concessions Management Specialist – Yellowstone N.P.
- 1986-1994 Chief of Concessions Management – Grand Canyon N.P.
- 1995-2000 Manager National Concessions Program Center – Denver

In 2000 Mr. Wadlington accepted an offer to assist the Bureau of Reclamation in efforts to upgrade the concessions management program in partial response to the Office of Inspector General's audit that highlighted the need for numerous improvements. He worked for two years out of the Mid Pacific Regional Office on many concession projects throughout Reclamation including Lake Berryessa. Since his retirement in 2002 he has remained involved with Reclamations national program and Lake Berryessa as a contractor providing concessions management expertise. One of the projects he has worked on was the development of the aforementioned 'Concessions Management Guidelines'. Mr. Wadlington's ability, past experience and expertise in concessions management and overall familiarity with Lake Berryessa definitely qualifies him to accomplish this project. This analysis will provide the foundation for concessionaire rate approval not only for 2006 and a guide for future year's efforts.