



Contents

Page

Summary

Chapter I – Introduction: Purpose of and Need for the Action

I. Introduction	I-1
Proposed Action	I-1
Scope of the Proposed Action	I-2
Purpose of and Need for the Proposed Action	I-2
II. Background	I-4
Initial Operation	I-4
ESA Consultations	I-4
San Juan River Basin Recovery Implementation Program	I-6
San Juan River Channel Capacity	I-8
III. Issues and Concerns	I-9
IV. Cooperating Agencies	I-9
V. Connected and Related Actions	I-10
VI. Responsibilities and Compliance	I-11
Environmental	I-11
Cultural Preservation	I-12
American Indian	I-13
Other	I-13
VII. Document Review	I-13
VIII. Document Organization	I-14

Chapter II – Proposed Action and Alternatives

I. Introduction	II-1
II. Alternatives Formulation	II-2
Formulation and Evaluation Criteria	II-2
III. Alternatives Development	II-3
Introduction	II-3
IV. Alternatives Description	II-4
Introduction	II-4
No Action Alternative	II-4
Action Alternatives	II-5
250/5000 Alternative (Flow Recommendations)	II-8
500/5000 Alternative	II-9
250 Variable/5000 Alternative	II-9
250/6000 and 500/6000 Alternatives	II-9

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
Decommission and Breach Navajo Dam	II-9
Characteristics Common to Action Alternatives	II-10
Interim Operation	II-10
Participation in SJRBRIP	II-10
Adaptive Management	II-11
Emergency/Unforeseen Conditions	II-11
Endangered Fish Releases	II-11
Variables Inherent in the Operation of Navajo Dam	II-11
V. Alternatives Evaluation	II-12
Introduction	II-12
Hydrology Considerations	II-13
Hydrology Model – No Action Alternative	II-15
Hydrology Model – 250/5000 and 500/5000 Alternatives	II-15
Alternatives Retained for Further Consideration	II-22
No Action Alternative	II-22
250/5000 Alternative (Flow Recommendations)	II-23
500/5000 Alternative	II-24
VI. Alternatives Considered but Eliminated	II-24
250 Variable/5000 Alternative	II-24
250/6000 Alternative	II-25
500/6000 Alternative	II-25
Decommission and Breach Navajo Dam	II-26
VII. Preferred Alternative	II-26
Future Water Development	II-27

Chapter III – Affected Environment/Environmental Consequences

I. Introduction	III-1
II. Setting	III-2
III. Affected Resources	III-5
Water Uses and Water Resources	III-3
Affected Environment	III-5
Navajo Reservoir	III-5
San Juan River	III-5
Water Rights Background	III-6
American Indian (Indian) Trust Water Rights	III-6
Non-Indian Trust Water Rights	III-7
New Mexico	III-8
New Mexico Water Law	III-8
Navajo Nation and Jicarilla Apache Nation Uses	III-8

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
Water Permits Held by the United States	III-9
Other Water Rights on the Mainstem downstream of Navajo Dam	III-9
Colorado	III-10
Arizona	III-11
Utah	III-11
Methodology	III-12
Impact Indicators	III-13
Impacts Analysis	III-15
No Action Alternative	III-15
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-16
500/5000 Alternative	III-17
Indian Trust Assets and Environmental Justice	III-18
Indian Trust Assets	III-19
Introduction	III-19
Affected Environment	III-21
Navajo Nation	III-21
Navajo Indian Irrigation Project	III-25
San Juan River Irrigation Projects	III-26
Navajo Nation Municipal Pipeline	III-27
Navajo-Gallup Water Supply Project	III-27
Jicarilla Apache Nation	III-27
Colorado Ute Tribes	III-29
Methodology	III-30
Indian Trust Assets Impacts Analysis	III-30
No Action Alternative	III-30
Navajo Nation	III-31
Jicarilla Apache Nation	III-31
Colorado Ute Tribes	III-31
Other Projects	III-32
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-32
500/5000 Alternative	III-33
Indian Trust Assets Economic Impacts Summary	III-33
ALP Project Construction	III-35
Navajo Indian Irrigation Project (NIIP) (Blocks 9-11)	III-36
Water Contracts Associated with the Jicarilla Apache Nation	III-36
Mitigation/ Environmental Commitments	III-37

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
Environmental Justice	III-38
Introduction	III-38
Affected Environment	III-39
Navajo Nation	III-39
Jicarilla Apache Nation	III-41
Colorado Ute Tribes	III-42
Ute Mountain Ute Tribe	III-42
Southern Ute Indian Tribe	III-42
Methodology	III-43
Impacts Analysis – Environmental Justice	III-43
Methodology	III-43
No Action Alternative	III-44
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-44
500/5000 Alternative	III-44
Aquatic Resources	III-44
Affected Environment	III-46
Navajo Reservoir	III-46
Game Fish	III-46
Nongame Fish	III-47
Native Fish	III-47
Non-Native Fish	III-47
San Juan River-Navajo Dam to Animas River	III-47
Navajo Dam to Archuleta, New Mexico	III-47
Archuleta to Hammond Diversion	III-48
Hammond Diversion to the Animas River	III-48
San Juan River-Animas River to Lake Powell	III-48
Methodology	III-49
Impacts Analysis	III-50
No Action Alternative	III-50
Navajo Reservoir	III-50
San Juan River – Navajo Dam to Archuleta, New Mexico	III-50
San Juan River – Archuleta to Hammond Diversion	III-50
San Juan River – Hammond Diversion to Animas River	III-50
San Juan River – Animas River to Lake Powell	III-51
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-51
Navajo Reservoir	III-51
San Juan River – Navajo Dam to Archuleta, New Mexico	III-51

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
San Juan River – Archuleta to Hammond Diversion	III-54
San Juan River – Hammond Diversion to Animas River	III-55
San Juan River – Animas River to Lake Powell	III-55
500/5000 Alternative	III-56
Navajo Reservoir	III-56
San Juan River – Navajo Dam to Archuleta, New Mexico	III-56
San Juan River – Archuleta to Hammond Diversion	III-56
San Juan River – Hammond Diversion to Animas River	III-57
San Juan River – Animas River to Lake Powell	III-57
Recreation	III-57
Affected Environment	III-58
Navajo Reservoir	III-58
Developed Recreation	III-59
Undeveloped Recreation	III-59
Visitation Levels	III-59
Visitor Profile	III-61
Visitor Activities and Satisfaction Levels	III-61
San Juan River	III-62
Trout Fishing Area (Navajo Dam to Hammond Diversion)	III-62
Hammond Diversion to Montezuma Creek	III-64
Montezuma Creek to Clay Hills	III-64
Commercial Rafting	III-65
Private Rafting	III-65
Methodology	III-65
Impacts Analysis	III-66
No Action Alternative	III-66
Reservoir Recreation	III-66
River Recreation	III-67
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow	
Recommendations)	III-67
Reservoir Recreation	III-67
River Recreation	III-68
Trout Fishing	III-68
Rafting	III-70
500/5000 Alternative	III-71
Reservoir Recreation	III-72
River Recreation	III-72
Trout Fishing	III-72
Rafting	III-72

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
Hydropower	III-73
Affected Environment	III-74
Licenses and Other Agreements	III-75
Navajo Nation	III-75
Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC)	III-75
Reclamation	III-76
Methodology	III-76
Impacts Analysis	III-76
Impacts Summary	III-78
No Action Alternative	III-78
Action Alternatives	III-78
250/5000 Alternative (Flow Recommendations) (Preferred Alternative)	III-78
500/5000 Alternative	III-79
Diversion Structures	III-79
Affected Environment	III-80
Navajo Reservoir Water Diversions	III-80
San Juan River Water Diversions (Downstream of Navajo Dam to Animas River Confluence)	III-80
San Juan River Water Diversions (Downstream of the San Juan- Animas Rivers Confluence)	III-82
Methodology	III-82
Impacts Analysis	III-83
No Action Alternative	III-83
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-83
500/5000 Alternative	III-87
Technical Assistance	III-87
Monitoring	III-88
Water Quality	III-88
Affected Environment	III-89
Previous Water Quality Studies	III-89
Methodology	III-93
Water Quality Standards	III-94
State and Tribal	III-95
Impacts Analysis	III-95
No Action Alternative	III-95
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-96

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
500/5000 Alternative	III-97
Impacts Summary	III-97
Limnology	III-98
Affected Environment	III-99
Navajo Reservoir	III-99
Existing Reservoir Characteristics	III-99
Nutrients	III-99
Biological Productivity	III-102
Trophic State Indices	III-102
Temperature and Dissolved Oxygen (DO)	III-105
Other Parameters	III-106
San Juan River Arm of the Reservoir	III-107
Pine River Arm of the Reservoir	III-108
Piedra River Arm of the Reservoir	III-108
Methodology	III-108
Impacts Analysis	III-110
No Action Alternative	III-110
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-110
500/5000 Alternative	III-110
Socioeconomics	III-110
Affected Environment	III-111
San Juan County, New Mexico	III-112
Tourism/Recreation	III-112
Agriculture	III-114
Retail Sales	III-114
San Juan County, Utah	III-114
Tourism/Recreation	III-114
Agriculture	III-114
Retail Sales	III-115
Archuleta County, Colorado	III-117
Tourism/Recreation	III-117
Agriculture	III-117
Retail Sales	III-117
Methodology	III-117
Impacts Analysis	III-120
No Action Alternative	III-121
Navajo Indian Irrigation Project (NIIP)	III-121

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
Animas-La Plata Project (ALP Project)	III-122
Jicarilla Apache Nation Third-party Contract with PNM	III-122
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow	
Recommendations)	III-122
Recreation/Tourism	III-123
San Juan River Fishing – Navajo State Park	III-123
San Juan River Rafting	III-125
Agriculture	III-126
500/5000 Alternative	III-127
Recreation/Tourism	III-127
Agriculture	III-127
Animas-La Plata Project (ALP Project)	III-127
Jicarilla Apache Nation Third-party Contract with PNM	III-128
Other Socioeconomic Impacts	III-128
Diversions	III-128
Water Quality	III-128
Hydropower	III-129
Special Status Species	III-129
Affected Environment	III-130
Threatened or Endangered Species	III-131
Colorado Pikeminnow and Razorback Sucker	III-131
Bald Eagle	III-133
Southwestern Willow Flycatcher	III-133
Interior Least Tern and Black Tern	III-134
Species of Concern	III-134
Roundtail Chub and Bluehead Sucker	III-134
Mottled Sculpin	III-134
Gunnison Sage Grouse	III-135
American and Arctic Peregrine Falcon	III-135
Golden Eagle	III-135
White-Faced Ibis	III-135
Yellow-Billed Cuckoo	III-135
California Condor	III-136
Mexican Spotted Owl	III-136
Northern Leopard Frog	III-136
Bighorn Sheep	III-136
Black-Footed Ferret	III-136
New Mexico Silverspot and San Juan Checkerspot Butterflies and San Juan Tiger Beetle	III-136

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
Navajo Sedge and Alcove Rock Daisy	III-137
Methodology	III-137
Impacts Analysis	III-137
No Action Alternative	III-137
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-138
500/5000 Alternative	III-139
Vegetation and Wildlife Resources	III-140
Affected Environment	III-141
Navajo Reservoir	III-141
San Juan River	III-142
Navajo Dam to Archuleta, New Mexico	III-142
Archuleta to the Animas River	III-142
Animas River to Lake Powell	III-143
Methodology	III-143
Impacts Analysis	III-144
Navajo Reservoir	III-144
No Action Alternative	III-144
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-144
500/5000 Alternative	III-144
San Juan River	III-144
No Action Alternative	III-144
Navajo Dam to Archuleta, New Mexico	III-144
Archuleta to the Animas River	III-145
Animas River to Lake Powell	III-145
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-145
Navajo Dam to Archuleta, New Mexico	III-145
Archuleta to the Animas River	III-145
Animas River to Lake Powell	III-146
500/5000 Alternative	III-146
Navajo Dam to Archuleta, New Mexico	III-146
Archuleta to the Animas River	III-146
Animas River to Lake Powell	III-146
Land Use	III-146
Affected Environment	III-147
Navajo Reservoir	III-147
Indian Reservations	III-147

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
San Juan Corridor	III-148
Methodology	III-148
Impacts Analysis	III-148
No Action Alternative	III-148
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-148
500/5000 Alternative	III-148
Cultural Resources	III-149
Affected Environment	III-150
Archaic	III-151
Pre-Puebloan and Puebloan	III-151
Protohistoric/Early Historic	III-151
Euroamerican Historic	III-152
Traditional Cultural Properties (TCPs)/Native American Graves Protection and Repatriation Act (NAGPRA)	III-153
Methodology	III-153
Impacts Analysis	III-153
No Action Alternative	III-154
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-155
500/5000 Alternative	III-155
Summary	III-155
Flood Control	III-157
Affected Environment	III-157
Methodology	III-158
Impacts Analysis	III-158
No Action Alternative	III-158
250/5000 Alternative (Flow Recommendations) (Preferred Alternative)	III-158
500/5000 Alternative	III-159
Navajo Dam Operations and Maintenance	III-159
Affected Environment	III-159
Methodology	III-160
Impacts Analysis	III-160
No Action Alternative	III-160
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-160
500/5000 Alternative	III-161
Safety of Dams	III-161

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
Affected Environment	III-161
Methodology	III-162
Impacts Analysis	III-162
No Action Alternative	III-162
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-162
500/5000 Alternative	III-162
Hazardous Materials	III-163
Affected Environment	III-164
Methodology	III-164
Impacts Analysis	III-164
No Action Alternative	III-164
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-164
Petroleum Facilities	III-164
Sewage Treatment Facilities	III-165
Radioactive Waste	III-165
500/5000 Alternative	III-165
Soils	III-166
Affected Environment	III-167
Soil Types	III-167
Erosion	III-167
Methodology	III-169
Impacts Analysis	III-169
No Action Alternative	III-170
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-170
500/5000 Alternative	III-171
Geology	III-171
Affected Environment	III-172
Methodology	III-172
Impacts Analysis	III-173
No Action Alternative	III-173
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-174
500/5000 Alternative	III-174
Air Quality	III-174
Affected Environment	III-175
Methodology	III-176

Contents (continued)

	<i>Page</i>
Impacts Analysis	III-176
No Action	III-176
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-176
500/5000 Alternative	III-177
Noise	III-177
Affected Environment	III-178
Methodology	III-179
Impacts Analysis	III-180
No Action Alternative	III-180
250/5000 Alternative (Preferred Alternative) (Flow Recommendations)	III-180
500/5000 Alternative	III-180
IV. Summary	III-180
Other Impact Considerations	III-180
Environmental Resources Summary	III-182
Biodiversity	III-182
Chapter IV – Environmental Commitments and Mitigation Measures	
I. Environmental Commitments and Mitigation Measures	IV-1
Reservoir Operations	IV-1
Fish and Wildlife	IV-2
Indian Trust Assets	IV-3
Cultural Resources	IV-3
Water Diversion Structures	IV-3
Chapter V – Consultation and Coordination	
I. Introduction	V-1
II. Public Involvement Activities	V-1
Public Scoping Process	V-1
Project Newsletters	V-5
Project Website	V-5
III. Consultation and Coordination Process	V-5
Coordination Activities	V-5
Consultation Activities	V-6
Public Hearings on the DEIS	V-7
IV. Distribution List	V-8

Contents (continued)

List of Preparers**Bibliography****Glossary****Tables**

<i>Table</i>	<i>Page</i>
I-1 Various authorities under which the Navajo Unit is operated	I-12
II-1 Summary of San Juan River Basin depletions for each alternative	II-6
II-2 The alternatives arrayed by evaluation criteria	II-14
II-3 Summary statistics of meeting Flow Recommendations criteria for alternatives retained for further analysis	II-16
II-4 San Juan River flows at Archuleta summary statistics for the No Action, 250/5000, and 500/5000 Alternatives (1929-93 data)	II-18
II-5 San Juan River flows at Bluff, Utah, summary statistics for the No Action, 250/5000, and 500/5000 Alternatives (1929-93 data)	II-19
II-6 Seasonal frequency distribution of monthly Navajo Reservoir releases for the three alternatives (based on 1929 – 93 hydrology)	II-20
II-7 San Juan River at Bluff – distribution frequency of monthly flow 1929 – 93	II-21
II-8 Summary of streamflows measured during the 2001 Summer Low Flow Test	II-21
II-9 Summary comparison of alternatives retained for further analysis	II-29
III-1 New Mexico permits held by Reclamation	III-10
III-2 List of water diversion rights and priority dates in New Mexico	III-11
III-3 Summary of existing and future Tribal uses of San Juan River Basin water	III-22
III-4 Navajo Reservoir annual visitation for Colorado and New Mexico	III-61
III-5 Creel census and pressure counts for July 1998-2001 and the 2001 Summer Low Flow Test	III-69
III-6 Navajo power plant annual production	III-74
III-7 Flow versus output	III-75
III-8 Summary of annual impacts upon the operation and performance of the San Juan River and Navajo Reservoir water diversion structures and water user entities from high or low releases	III-85
III-9 Historical (1950-1998) water quality measurements on the San Juan River	III-91
III-10 Navajo Reservoir water elevations and storage capacities	III-100
III-11 Nutrient summary data for 2000	III-100

Contents (continued)

Tables (continued)

<i>Table</i>	<i>Page</i>
III-12 Chlorophyll <i>a</i> summary for Navajo Reservoir, in µg/L	III-102
III-13 Comparison of Navajo Reservoir's trophic state indices to similar reservoirs	III-105
III-14 Major ions and solids summary data for 2000	III-106
III-15 Navajo Reservoir Secchi depth measurements (meters) and the solids fractions	III-107
III-16 Summary of effects on limnological indicators from proposed alternatives compared to the No Action Alternative	III-109
III-17 Comparison of retail sales sectors in San Juan County, New Mexico (1997)	III-116
III-18 Comparison of retail sales sectors in San Juan County, Utah	III-116
III-19 Comparison of retail sales sectors in Archuleta County, Colorado, in 1997	III-119
III-20 Baseline data for Archuleta County, Colorado, San Juan County, New Mexico, and San Juan County, Utah	III-120
III-21 Projected lost annual crop revenues (gross) without future completion of NIIP	III-121
III-22 Additional crop revenues (gross) from completion of NIIP (\$)	III-127
III-23 Properties of soil map units potentially affected by project implementation	III-168
III-24 Varying formations along the San Juan River	III-173
III-25 Criteria pollutants and regulatory limits	III-177

Figures

<i>Figure</i>	<i>Page</i>
I-1 General NEPA process	I-3
I-2 Colorado pikeminnow and razorback sucker	I-7
II-1 San Juan River near Bluff, Utah – U.S. Geological Survey average daily flow ..	II-2
II-2 Navajo Reservoir average monthly release comparing three alternatives	II-17
II-3 Monthly average water surface elevations for Navajo Reservoir projected for three Navajo Dam operating alternatives (1929-93 data)	II-17
III-1 River mile locations and gaging stations	III-4
III-2 Degree to which viable alternatives meet Flow Recommendations	III-14
III-3 Navajo State Park at Arboles, Colorado	III-60

Contents (continued)

Figures (continued)

<i>Figure</i>	<i>Page</i>
III-4 Recreational activities in the project area	III-61
III-5 Navajo Lake (Reservoir) State Park	III-63
III-6 Spillway tailwater at Navajo Dam	III-70
III-7 Primary water diversions downstream from Navajo Reservoir	III-81
III-8 Map of Navajo Reservoir, including the limnological sampling locations	III-101
III-9 Average phytoplankton structure for Navajo Reservoir, in cells/mL	III-103
III-10 Average zooplankton structure for Navajo Reservoir	III-104
III-11 Lands, demographics, and employment (San Juan County, New Mexico)	III-113
III-12 Lands, demographics, and employment (San Juan County, New Mexico)	III-113
III-13 Lands, demographics, and employment (San Juan County, New Mexico)	III-113
III-14 Lands and demographics (San Juan County, Utah)	III-115
III-15 Lands and demographics (San Juan County, Utah)	III-115
III-16 Lands and demographics (Archuleta County, Colorado)	III-118
III-17 Lands and demographics (Archuleta County, Colorado)	III-118
III-18 Total expenditure	III-124
III-19 Southwestern willow flycatcher	III-133
III-20 Wildlife nesting areas on the San Juan River	III-183